

The Moderate Bolshevik

Historical Materialism Book Series

Editorial Board

Loren Balhorn (*Berlin*)
David Broder (*Rome*)
Sebastian Budgen (*Paris*)
Steve Edwards (*London*)
Juan Grigera (*London*)
Marcel van der Linden (*Amsterdam*)
Peter Thomas (*London*)

VOLUME 253

The titles published in this series are listed at brill.com/hm

The Moderate Bolshevik

*Mikhail Tomsky from the Factory to the Kremlin,
1880–1936*

By

Charters Wynn



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Wynn, Charters, 1953- author.

Title: The moderate Bolshevik : Mikhail Tomsky from the factory to the Kremlin, 1880-1936 / by Charters Wynn.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, [2022] | Series: Historical materialism book series, 1570-1522 ; volume 253 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022002810 (print) | LCCN 2022002811 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004514966 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004514973 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Tomskii, M. P. (Mikhail Pavlovich), 1880-1936. | Statesmen--Soviet Union--Biography. | Revolutionaries--Soviet Union--Biography. | Soviet Union--Politics and government--1917-1936. | Labor unions and communism--Soviet Union. | Soviet Union--Economic policy--1917-1928. | Agriculture and state--Soviet Union--History. | Labor movement--Soviet Union--History. | Working class--Soviet Union--History.

Classification: LCC DK268.T64 W96 2022 (print) | LCC DK268.T64 (ebook) | DDC 947.084092 [B]-dc23/eng/20220127

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022002810>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022002811>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1570-1522

ISBN 978-90-04-51496-6 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51497-3 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Acknowledgements VII

List of Illustrations IX

Introduction 1

1 Note on Transliteration 9

1 The Making of a Moderate Working-Class Bolshevik Leader 10

2 Balancing Act: Tomsky during War Communism and the Trade-Union Debate 59

3 Detour East: From Disgraced Exile in Tashkent to Redemption inside the Kremlin 116

4 Getting Together then Falling Apart: Tomsky and British Trade Unionists 170

5 Tomsky during NEP: Trade Unions and the Intra-Party Struggle 214

6 NEP's Last Stand: The Eighth Trade-Union Congress 280

7 Tomsky Outcast: Tormenting a 'Right Deviationist' 314

Conclusion 381

Bibliography 391

Index 433

Acknowledgements

Many years have passed since I first began to study Tomsky. It is a pleasure to thank the sources of funding for the research and writing of this book I received along the way. From outside the University of Texas at Austin I received a grant from the International Research and Exchanges Board (IREX), a Kennan Institute for Advanced Russian Studies Research Scholarship, and a National Council for Soviet and East European Research Award. Sources of support from within the university included a University Research Institute Grant, a Dean's Fellowship, and an Institute of Historical Studies Fellowship.

My research took me to various archives and libraries a number of times. In particular, I appreciate all the archivists and staff members who assisted me at the Russian State Archive of Social-Political History (RGASPI), the State Archive of the Russian Federation (GARF), and the Hoover Institution Archives. I am also particularly indebted to the Inter-Library Loan staff at the University of Texas Libraries who tracked down nearly everything I requested, no matter how rare or obscure.

All the chapters of this project have benefitted from helpful questions and comments from colleagues at innumerable conferences, including the one I hosted at the University of Texas. I thank Alexis Pogorelskin for turning the papers at that conference into a special issue of *Canadian-American Slavic Studies*. Barbara Allen, Clayton Black, and William Chase, among others, offered useful suggestions as commentators on panels at the Association for Slavic, East European & Eurasian Studies. I have also received helpful feedback on all the various parts of this book at the wonderfully collegial conferences of the Study Group on Revolutionary Russia. In addition, Judith Coffin and Leone Musgrave provided useful feedback on individual chapters, while Lars Lih caught an error in one of my articles on Tomsky. Barbara Allen generously shared some of the notes she took in the Federal Security Service (FSB) archives.

Earlier drafts of parts of this book have been previously published as articles. I am grateful for their editors' permission to include them here. Part of Chapter 1 appeared in 'Young Tomsky: The Making of a Working-Class Bolshevik Leader', *Revolutionary Russia*, 25, 2: 119–40. Part of Chapter 4 appeared in 'Getting Together and then Falling Apart: Tomsky and British Trade Unionism during NEP', *Russian Review*, 73, 4: 571–95. Part of Chapter 6 appeared in 'NEP's Last Stand: Mikhail Tomsky and the Eighth Trade Union Congress', *Canadian-American Slavic Studies*, 53, 1–2: 149–75. And a part of Chapter 7 appeared in 'The "Right Opposition" and the "Smirnov-Eismont-Tolmachev Affair"' in *The 'Lost' Politburo Stenograms: From Collective Rule to Stalin's Dictatorship*, edited

by Paul Gregory and Norman Naimark, New Haven: Yale University Press, pp. 97–117. I am grateful to all the ‘anonymous’ reviewers who provided editorial suggestions on these earlier drafts, especially Barbara Allen. Two reviewers of the entire manuscript for the Historical Materialism Book Series, one of whom was Clayton Black, also provided helpful comments.

I have been fortunate in the Department of History at the University of Texas to have worked with helpful colleagues and dear friends, especially Judith Coffin, David Crew, Tatjana Lichtenstein, and Michael Stoff. My deepest thanks go to Joan Neuberger, always my first reader and always full of valuable suggestions. She has been my best friend, a wise colleague, and an endless source of encouragement. Together we share a love for our wonderful sons, Max and Joel. It is to them I dedicate this book.

Illustrations

- 1 Mikhail Tomsky 46
- 2 Tomsky and Zinoviev en route to meeting 64
- 3 Tomsky with Delegates of the Eighth Party Congress 80
- 4 Alexander Shlyapnikov 82
- 5 Tomsky, on the far right, behind Stalin and Lenin, with Trotsky 88
- 6 Tomsky, seated fourth from the left, at the Presidium of the Ninth Party Congress 90
- 7 David Ryazanov 109
- 8 Yan Rudzutak 118
- 9 Negotiations with Basmachi 131
- 10 Grigory Safarov 137
- 11 Settlers' homestead in Turkestan 141
- 12 Tomsky wearing Turkish sheepskin hat 152
- 13 Tomsky in the Kremlin 162
- 14 Alexander Lozovsky 174
- 15 Tomsky at British Trades Union Congress in Hull 182
- 16 Tomsky with Alf Purcell 189
- 17 Walter Citrine 191
- 18 Composite Poster of Soviet Officials in 1924 with Tomsky in top row, far right 217
- 19 Leon Trotsky in 1925 227
- 20 Stalin, Rykov, Zinoviev, and Bukharin relaxing together 230
- 21 Tomsky with Nadezhda Krupskaya at Lenin's funeral 234
- 22 Nikolai Bukharin 241
- 23 Stalin with Tomsky and Kalinin in 1926 247
- 24 Tomsky with Rykov at the Seventh Trade-Union Congress 249
- 25 United Opposition leaders Trotsky, Kamenev, and Zinoviev 254
- 26 Tomsky on the Lenin Mausoleum in November 1927 260
- 27 Interrogation protocols for the Shakhty Trial 276
- 28 Tomsky and Tomskaya socialising with Gorky and Yagoda 291
- 29 Stalin with Kaganovich 303
- 30 Tomsky and Kalinin with party functionaries 335
- 31 Same photo with Tomsky's face blacked out 336
- 32 Tomsky in 1936 360