Book Reviews

- E. Allard, H.G. Schulte Nordholt, M.P.M. Muskens, Indonesië. Een strijd om nationale identiteit. Nationalisten, Islamieten, Katholieken. P. Brand, Bussum 1969. 598 p.
- A. Teeuw, H. Penth, Hikajat Atjéh, Die Erzählung von der Abkunft und den Jugendjahren des Sultan Iskandar Muda von Atjeh (Sumatra), von Hans Penth. Veröffentlichungen des Ostasiatischen Seminars der Johann-Wolfgang-Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt/Main. Reihe A: Südostasienkunde. Band 2. Otto Harrassowitz - Wiesbaden. 1969. 207 pp.
- C.H.M. Nooy-Palm, Andrew Sharp, The journal of Jacob Roggeveen. Clarendon Press: Oxford University Press, Oxford 1970. Illustrations and maps, bibliography, index, 193 pp.
In: Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 127 (1971), no: 4, Leiden, 497-512

This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>

BOEKBESPREKINGEN

M. P. M. MUSKENS, *Indonesië. Een strijd om nationale identiteit. Nationalisten, Islamieten, Katholieken*. P. Brand, Bussum 1969. 598 p., Fls. 25,—.

I

The central problem presented by the author of this large volume of nearly 600 pages is: "Why is the Catholic Church so well integrated in Indonesia in contrast to the situation of the same church in Pakistan, India and Thailand?" In Pakistan, India and Thailand the Catholics seem to live outside the cultural traditions which are completely dominated by Islam, Hinduism and Buddhism respectively. Which culture or dominating culture complex has enabled the Catholic Church in Indonesia to acquire its fully established position in this country?

Whilst searching for the essential characteristics of Indonesian culture the author was confronted with the following problem: the struggle between the Moslems demanding an Islamic state on the one hand and the nationalists defending the national culture on the other hand. In other words: shall Islam or the national culture be a common bond between the people of Indonesia (page 481)?

The book — written in Dutch with a summary of ten pages in English — is composed of three parts. The first part which is entitled "Islam versus Indonesian indigenous culture" provides some data on the country, its language and people. This is followed by a survey of the most important aspects of the cosmological Old-Indonesian culture (p. 28-32) and of the ancient Buddhist and Hindu states (p. 43-53). It is pointed out that the Old-Indonesian cosmological culture has remained in existence everywhere in spite of the influences of the three world religions mentioned above. Among the Javanese the Hindu-Javanese culture named "agama djawa" continued to dominate the life of the agrarian masses (abangan) and of the nobility and government officials (priajaji). The traders and the well-to-do farmers on the contrary are staunch Moslems.

Moreover, the Javanese as well as the other peoples of Indonesia

are since olden times familiar with Messianistic expectations about a period of peace and prosperity for everyone.

A survey is given of the present-day situation: the old Indonesian culture is still everywhere present in the village community as being a religious community, the communalistic and cosmological character of which is manifest in the three aspects: "gotong-rojong", "musjawarah" and "mufakat".

Following some brief remarks on the cosmological character of Hindu-Bali is an explanation of "agama djawa", the religion of the "abangan" and "priajati". (63-82).

On the other side are the traditional and the reformatory Moslems, who accept Islam as the basis of their lives (p. 82-95).

In their struggle against the national cosmological structure the Moslems are aiming at the foundation of an Islamic state.

In the second part of the book the conflicts are described between the large political parties of the Moslems who are aiming at an Islamic state and those of the nationalists who are striving after a state based on the national culture.

Already before the first public appearance of Sukarno in 1926 the most important and fundamental decisions had been taken: the "priajati" had taken up a position in the cultural and political society "Budi Utomo", the Moslems in the political party "Sarekat Islam" and the "abangan" with their Messianistic expectations in the prophecies of Djajabhaja. In this period Sukarno (1926-34) for the first time launched the idea that the various political organisations, which were aiming at an independent Indonesia, should cooperate through "musjawarah" (the usual way of deliberation in most Indonesian villages) and in doing this they should arrive at a common decision: "mufakat". During the months of June to August 1945 (p. 149-165) the Moslems and nationalists succeeded in finding each other in the national philosophy of "Pantja-Sila" and in the constitution of the Republic of Indonesia. A compromise with Islam was arrived at in the "Piagam Djakarta".

The so-called Konstitusi Proklamasi which was read out in public on August 18th, 1945, bears the stamp of the Old-Indonesian cosmological culture of the Indonesian village community. The first place is given to the Indonesian people with whom sovereignty rests. Authority is exercised by the People's Congress, which should arrive at "mufakat" (decision) by way of "musjawarah" (deliberation).

On the initiative of Moh. Hatta and Sutan Sjahrir the Konstitusi Proklamasi is replaced in November 1945 by a Western parliamentary

system (pag. 165-169). During 1945-'49 the Moslems attempt to establish an Islamic state in Western Java, Atjeh and South Sulawesi. A coup d'état of the Communists fails in 1948.

Since the government of the R.I. resided in Jogjakarta from 1946-1949, the various ministerial posts are occupied by Javanese. In this way the Hindu-Javanese culture acquires numerous supporters in the offices of the government.

The period 1950-'59 (p. 182-228) is marked by a total failure of the Western parliamentary system. Various cabinets succeed each other in rapid succession. At the first general elections in 1955 a parliament and constituent assembly are successively elected. The population organises itself again as in the heyday of the independence movement, 1908-1934. Sukarno continues to advocate Pantja-Sila, which he summarises in the concept of "gotong-rojong" (working together). He repudiates any form of class struggle. By decree of July 5th, 1959, Sukarno declares the Konstitusi Proklamasi to be in force again. The Moslems strive to realise the Islamic state, the other parties reject it.

In the period 1959-'65 (p. 229-247) the power of the Partai Komunis Indonesia is growing. It recognises Pantja-Sila and accepts the Nasakom ideology (Nationalism - Agama i.e. religion - Communism) of Sukarno, which is in essence purely nationalistic. According to this philosophy all parties should cooperate, no party should dominate. Because the Islamic party Masjumi is not willing to conform to this it is banned. The Communist party (P.K.I.) uses "Pantja-Sila" and "Nasakom" in order to achieve its own ends.

In the end tension between the parties grows to such an extent, that in 1965 P.K.I. is disbanded.

The new leaders President Suharto and Nasution hold the view of the nationalists.

However, the struggle of the Moslems to turn Indonesia into an Islamic state is flaring up again after 1965 (p. 258-268).

The author analyses the way in which Sukarno was culture bound, the way in which he wholly entered into the task of the classical Hindu-Javanese Messianic princes: by restoring the unity which existed in the glorious past, i.e. in the Hindu-Javanese realm of Madjapahit (p. 269-279).

At the end of Part II two concrete aspects of the struggle between nationalists and Moslems are treated:

a) from 1946 onward the Moslems were expected to be content with

the Ministry of Religion because an Islamic state does not appear to be attainable;

b) as far as the education of youth is concerned the antithesis between Moslems and nationalists appeared in the rivalry between the Islamic Ministry of Religions and the nationalist Ministry of Education and Culture (p. 289-300).

In the third and last part of the book the author demonstrates that the cosmological character of the Old-Indonesian culture has remained the dominating culture complex in Indonesia, and this enabled the Catholic Church to find a place in this country.

The condition of acceptance of the Catholic Church by the Indonesian people was that the Church would above all be prepared to visualise the Indonesian people in its totality and that it would be willing to cooperate with other groups of the population according to the principle of "gotong-rojong".

In this third part the author describes in which way the Catholic Church has fulfilled these conditions.

He offers a historical survey of the establishment of the Catholic Church among the non-Islamised peoples outside Java and among the "abangan" and "priajai" in Java (p. 303-317).

Next the situation of the Catholics on the various islands is described (p. 319-374).

The important aspect which appears here is that — excepting the situation among the Javanese — being a Christian (Protestant or Catholic) coincides with belonging to a particular tribe, whilst being Moslem and belonging to a particular tribe coincides as well.

In this way the rivalries between tribes are often identified with the rivalries between Christians and Moslems.

Among the Javanese also the contrast between Moslems and Christians often coincides with the religious-cultural contrast between "abangan" and "priajai" on the one side and the Javanese Moslem middle class and the well-to-do farmers on the other side.

The author points out that the Rev. van Lith (1863-1926) guarded the Catholic Church in the period of the independence movement against being identified by the Indonesian leaders with the West or with the colonial power (p. 375-384).

As a member of a Government Committee in 1918-1920 and later on again in a pamphlet of 1920 van Lith pleads that the Indonesians should obtain an adequate place in the newly planned administrative organisation. One of the Indonesians inspired by Rev. van Lith's

program was I. Kasimo, leader of the Indonesian Catholics in the independence movement. He found a congenial partner in Rev. Soegijapranata, another former pupil of van Lith, who in 1940 became bishop of Semarang. In the period 1945-1949, I. Kasimo and Mgr. Soegijapranata again supported the independence of Indonesia. After 1949 they have continually supported the claim that Western New Guinea should be handed over to Indonesia.

I. Kasimo was the president of the Partai Katolik, which had always included Pantja-Sila in its program and which at the same time rejected both an Islamic state and a Communist state.

In the declarations of the Indonesian episcopates of 1955 and more so after 1965 the accent is laid on the necessity of socio-economic development. In the Pantja-Sila labour union led by Catholics, in socio-economic projects, in programmes for radio and t.v., in the Catholic press and the work of Catholic artists and authors, everywhere a vision is found which embraces the whole Indonesian population by the "gotong-rojong" principle (p. 412-415).

The tension between Catholics and Moslems is described because the latter are still claiming an Islamic state and are in opposition against the national culture of Indonesia (p. 429-437).

The Moslems on the other hand reproach the Catholic Church that it aims at conversions and that it does not teach a belief in one God but in three gods, which is in conflict with Pantja Sila.

In the final remarks it is pointed out that the Catholic Church is fulfilling a critical function as regards a prevailing lack of appreciation for manual labour and an over-appreciation of bureaucratic values, bound up with the magical-mystic consciousness of status in Indonesia.

The author appears to be well read in the history of Indonesian culture, in particular of its religion and in the history of the development of the nationalist movement. He offers a concise yet absorbing description of it, based on an extensive study of the literature which he has carefully selected although not explicitly criticised.

In Part I emphasis is laid on the magico-religious character of Indonesian culture. This part makes the book of interest also to those who are not primarily concerned with its central problem, but who turn to it as an introduction to Indonesian culture in general. It provides a useful survey of the numerous studies which have appeared since 1950.

In order to review this book adequately in all its aspects one would really need the cooperation of a number of specialists: in history, in political science, in adat law, in the sociology of religion and in the cultures of Indonesia.

In his chapter on "Agama Djawa" the author discusses (p. 65) the failure of the colonial government in the period 1900-1940 to grant subsidies for research into contemporary Javanese culture. Research into adat law and the archeology of Java was considered useful in those days, he states, but "granting subsidies for research into living Javanese culture was considered too much of an extravagance".

Here the author seems to overlook the fact that before 1940 field research into "the living cultures" was only in its initial stage. In the so-called "Outer Islands" of Indonesia research was undertaken by Protestant missionaries, and, in a few cases, by government officials. Java was rightly considered to be a country with a high and complex civilisation which ethnologists in general were at that time still diffident to approach. Research into complex societies was only undertaken systematically after 1950. Yet before 1940 Dr. Th. Pigeaud, a government linguist, published his book "Javaanse Volksvertoningen"¹ (The Javanese popular theatre), and L. Th. Mayer his accurate sketches of the life of the Javanese people.²

In Part II an interesting description is given of political developments leading to the national independence of Indonesia, starting from the foundation of Budi Utomo in 1908. Too little attention is given in this chapter to the role of Western education on all levels, which has been such an important stimulus and source of inspiration in the struggle for independence. The action of the colonial government against the establishment of non-recognised schools (so-called "wild schools") which at the end of the thirties was part of the political struggle is almost passed over in silence. No mention is made either of the gradually developing women's movement which in that same period was so closely allied to the nationalist movement, as was pointed out by Dr. C. Vreede-de Stuers in her book "L'Emancipation de la Femme Indonésienne". (1954)

No mention is made either of the resentment caused after 1950 by the fact that the Javanese were pressing forward as government officials,

¹ *Bijdrage tot de beschrijving van Land en Volk*, Balai Pustaka, Djakarta 1938.

² "Een blik in het Javaanse Volksleven", 2 vols; "De Javaan als mens en als lid van het Javaanse huisgezin". 1894.

teachers and military in Western Java and in the islands outside Java.

No mention either of the resistance which was growing in that same period against foreign trade and particularly against foreign shipping companies, nor of the role of the New Guinea conflict and the confrontation with Malaysia as a means of diverting attention from internal strain and conflict.

The menace of the Sumatra rebellion in 1958 which threatened to divide the country into two parts is underrated.

PART III. Whilst Part I and Part II of this book are predominantly Java-centered, yet more than half of the Indonesian Catholics live on the Southeastern islands of Flores and Timor.

More than one third (56 pages) of Part III is devoted to a survey of each of the thirty odd dioceses and prefectures of Indonesia, illustrated by twenty-two maps, indicating the parishes in each one of them. We have wondered whether this rather lengthy enumeration might not have been substituted in part by some statistical tables, but we must admit that the divergent situation of the Catholic Church in each of the provinces of Indonesia would not come out as clearly as in the present survey. This survey is followed by a typology of the church on the various islands; five different situations are indicated.

Rather more attention should have been devoted to the extensive medical and educational work carried on by the church in the course of the years in schools, orphanages, hospitals and clinics, which has contributed considerably to the modernisation process of Indonesian society.

Actually more stress is laid (p. 418) on the fact that promoting education at all levels in a large country like Indonesia — although this may be of vital importance to the development of the country — may at the same time create tremendous problems. Too many young people with school-leaving certificates, competing for a place in one of the universities or for a post in government or commerce, are swelling the ranks of white collar unemployed. One observer has even called education in Indonesia "a national calamity". The Catholic community is becoming aware of this; efforts have been made in recent years to turn towards more vocational training.

Describing the situation of the Church during the Japanese occupation it is stated on page 317 that the Indonesian priests, religious brothers and sisters were allowed to continue their work during this occupation. In actual fact in the Minahasa, Northern Sulawesi, the Indonesian sisters were sent home by the Japanese. One single invalid German

sister kept in touch with them and as a result they all returned to their posts after the occupation. The author does not seem to be aware of the fact that German religious could continue their work up and down the country, as Germany was at that time a political ally of the Japanese.

The fact that hundreds of priests, brothers and sisters chose Indonesian citizenship after national sovereignty had been obtained and the effects thereof has been scarcely mentioned by the author.

It would certainly be interesting to find in this extensive work also an analysis of the integration of the other Christian Churches in Indonesian society and culture. As a matter of fact, these churches have been mentioned in passing, in particular in some general remarks at the beginning and at the end of Chapter II on "The Actual Situation" (p. 319-371) and in the survey presented in this chapter of the Catholic Church in the Batak country, Sumatra, and in the diocese of Menado, North Sulawesi. Moreover some brief references are made to ecumenical efforts of Protestants and Catholics (p. 372-373). At the end in Chapter II (p. 429) it is stated that a great deal of what has been told about the situation of the Catholics towards Islam also applies to the situation of the Protestants.

Considering their historical development, however, an adequate treatment of the integration of the Protestant churches into Indonesian culture would demand a good deal of additional time and space. A study of this kind would certainly make a welcome sequel to Dr. Muskens' book.

May we end up with a few general remarks?

This rather bulky book — nearly 600 pages — is not easy to handle. An edition in two or three volumes would have made it far more manageable, but no doubt also far more expensive.

The Bibliography is extensive, yet we miss a standard work on colonial policy such as A. D. A. de Kat Angelino's: "Staatkundig Beleid en Bestuurszorg in Nederlands Indië" (1929), Dr. Th. Pigeaud's "Javaanse Volksvertoningen" (1938), C. Lekkerkerker: "Land en volk van Java I", Batavia, 1938, and as far as Borneo is concerned, Dr. H. Schärer's: "Die Gottesidee der Ngadju Dajak in Süd-Borneo" (1946). Publications of a later date which the author might have consulted are amongst others those of Dr. Ph. Tobing: "Contributions to the study of the Indonesian identity", Makassar 1962; G. Legge: "Indonesia, Indonesia's search for identity", New Jersey 1965; Mr. Wilopo (ed.): "Tentang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia dalam Konstituante"

(The basis of the Republik of Indonesia in the Constituent Assembly), Bandung 1958.

Annotations, covering 75 pages in full, have been added, at the end of the book as is customary at present. This, no doubt, saves expenses in printing, but makes consulting them in a voluminous book a great deal more cumbersome than consulting notes at the bottom of the page.

A list of the abbreviations used for the names of political parties and other associations would have been useful.

The presence of some printing errors in a book of nearly 600 pages seems almost unavoidable. The consistent misprinting of the name of W. Stöhr in the Bibliography and the annotations and the occurrence of more than one printing mistake on page 40 are somewhat annoying.

This book was written as a thesis to obtain a doctorate in theology. The author had no historical or anthropological training. His capability in selecting, analysing, organising and summarising such a vast and diverse body of literature and working out a comprehensive theory about it is therefore the more admirable.

E. ALLARD

II

Clifford Geertz once wrote in a review of *Bali, a Study in Life, Thought and Ritual*, which he ascribed to the Leiden school, that "the virtues of this school are the classical ones: thoroughness, accuracy, concreteness, pertinacity, modesty, caution, breadth of interest, and a simply amazing control of the historical, literary and linguistic tools of Indonesian scholarship." The book presently under discussion cannot be said to have been written in this tradition, except in that it possesses breadth of interest.

The intriguing general problem it brings forward is, "Why is it that the Catholic Church in Indonesia has been so well integrated?" The answer given by the author is that the cosmological character of Old Indonesian civilization has remained the predominating trait of Indonesian culture and has made it possible for the Catholic Church to find a place in Indonesia. But this Old Indonesian civilization, tribal religion, the village in Indonesia and the former Indonesian kingdoms are dismissed in but a few pages (pp. 28-32, 57-60). Both in connection with the central theme and because the Catholic Church has taken root pre-eminently in areas which have remained uninfluenced by Hinduism and Islam there would have been every reason for going at more depth

into this Old Indonesian culture insofar as this still exercises an influence on the present-day culture in Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Flores and other parts of Eastern Indonesia. The compilation of articles entitled *Villages in Indonesia* and edited by Koentjaraningrat should, moreover, have been consulted in this connection. Although there is greater diversity than becomes apparent in Muskens' book it is undeniably true that the vigour of the traditional village structure has survived both Hinduism and Islam.

The author omits to deal with Old Indonesian culture more fully, however, concentrating as he does on the problems surrounding the relationship between Agama Djawa and Islam, which he treats as a matter of course as two separate religions. This is dismissing an old problem somewhat too easily.

He further suggests that the Dutch government unconditionally accepted Snouck Hurgronje's view that all "natives" should be regarded as Muslims. But "in spite of Snouck Hurgronje and his followers — 'a generation of scholars echoed him' (Geertz) — it did not fail to become obvious that among the *abangan* and *prijaji* Javanese in Indonesia not only did the pre-Islamic cultural pattern survive, but Islam, insofar as it was present, was integrated into the basic structures of Hindu-Javanese thought."

This testifies to a profound misunderstanding of the work of Snouck Hurgronje, and one feels inclined to ask whether the author consulted it at all, the more so as he does not quote him anywhere. This is all the more surprising as the book deals, rightly so, with Islam at great length. For on the contrary, it was Snouck Hurgronje who in a devastating, though well-founded criticism attacked the currently accepted view that Muslim law as contained in Arabic sources applied in Indonesia. It was he who showed convincingly that Islam in Indonesia possessed a distinctive character which, moreover, varied from one area to the next. While in Java there were clearly two types of Islam, one a more orthodox current orientated especially to the Fikh, and one that was centred rather more on Hindu-Javanese philosophy, with which Muslim mysticism links up perfectly well. He also pointed out that Islam was syncretistic all over the world, but went on to suggest, rightly so, that everyone who called himself a Muslim should be accepted as such.

If in fact it is true that at present there are many Javanese who no longer regard themselves nominally as Muslims, the historical fact should even so not be overlooked that at the time Snouck Hurgronje

wrote the above (i.e., the 1880's) Java was completely Muslim. It takes more than a few casual remarks such as those made by Muskens and Geertz to dismiss the work of a scholar of Snouck Hurgronje's stature.

Another point deserving criticism concerns Muskens' observations on customary law, as follows:

- a. The last few years before 1942 the authority of adat law came to be more and more generally recognized (p. 60).
- b. Around the turn of the century the Dutch began to show an increasing interest in native customs inasmuch as this was necessary for the administration (p. 85).
- c. Official recognition of Indonesian customary law was first shown in 1928, and was put into effect in the 1930's (p. 140).

This creates a rather confusing impression, while it should also be mentioned that Van Vollenhoven is not mentioned in the bibliography. It is furthermore incorrect to say that in the young Indonesian state the position of customary law has remained the same as in the last few years before 1942 (p. 60).

After all this negative criticism I should like to mention a few of the book's merits. The bibliography, in spite of the regrettable omission of the above two authors, testifies to Muskens' extremely wide reading. The second part, "The struggle around the basis for the Indonesian state" (pp. 105-300) in particular gives an excellent survey of recent developments, although the light in which Sukarno is presented is not entirely convincing. The length of this part makes the third part, dealing with the Roman Catholic section of the Indonesian population (pp. 303-454) seem to be rather summary in comparison, however. This is all the more regrettable as so little has been written on the subject to date.

In short, this is the type of book with which every Indonesia expert would like to round off his career — although he would most probably lack the necessary boldness! It is to the courage of this young author that we owe this book, the chief merit of which lies in its giving rise to so many questions. Such as, for example, whether the fact that large parts of the Archipelago lie beyond the cultural streams of Hinduism and Islam is not for the greater part responsible for the place occupied by Roman Catholics and Protestants in Indonesia, and has resulted in Christians' comprising 10 % of the population — an important minority which, moreover, supplies many intellectuals.

H. G. SCHULTE NORDHOLT

HIKAJAT ATJÉH, *Die Erzählung von der Abkunft und den Jugendjahren des Sultan Iskandar Muda von Atjeh (Sumatra)*, von Hans Penth. Veröffentlichungen des Ostasiatischen Seminars der Johann-Wolfgang-Goethe-Universität, Frankfurt/Main. Reihe A: Südostasienkunde. Band 2. Otto Harrassowitz - Wiesbaden. 1969. 207 pp. Preis DM 24.—.

This book contains a translation into German of the Malay text of the *Hikayat Atjéh* as it had been edited earlier by Teuku Iskandar (*Verhandeligen Kon. Inst.*, Vol. 26, The Hague 1959).

As such it is another useful contribution to the study of Malay historiography, which in recent years was furthered by several interesting text editions (Ras' *Hikajat Bandjar*, 1968; Amin Sweeney's *Silsilah Raja-Raja Berunai*, 1968; Siti Hawa Saléh's *Hikayat Merong Mahawangsa*, 1970; Teeuw and Wyatt's *Hikayat Patani*, 1970).

An Introduction of 60 pages precedes the translation. In the first part the author characterizes the text as a Panegyric. I think this is quite justified: the *Hik. Atjeh* is distinguished from most so-called Malay historical texts by the very fact that it is so obviously written in honour and praise of one particular sultan, the famous Iskandar Muda. However, the author to some extent confuses the issue by defining the text at the same time as a *Mythenchronik*, by which term he understands a text which "Mythen- oder Sagenstoffe mit historischen Fakten vermischt". Without denying the fact that in the *Hik. Atjeh* one finds non-historical and historical materials side by side, I think that for a panegyric, within the context of Malay culture, this distinction between myths and facts is not relevant, and that for an adequate approach of the text the term *Mythenchronik* is misleading rather than clarifying. The author himself falls into the trap which this double characterization sets when dealing in some detail with the story of the Portuguese envoys to Atjeh. First he gives a very good analysis of the function of this episode, especially its central part: the horse race, within the structure of the text as a panegyric. He correctly states: "Vom literarischen Standpunkt gesehen ist die Episode ein weiterer Baustein des Panegyrikons". And implicitly he strengthens his argument by making it plausible that the names of the Portuguese envoys in the text, Dong Dawis and Dong Tumis, are corruptions of the names of a well-known English traveller John Davis and his partner Master Tomkins which never had anything to do with Portuguese envoys. If

this is correct, it is yet another example how the author of this panegyric set to work, *prenant son bien où il le trouve* — without any concern about the historicity of his materials. But if this combat of prestige is really the literary tool of the Malay writer, it seems unwarranted to say that the Portuguese actually started this combat themselves as “eine hintergründige Veranstaltung, welche (sie) zur Durchsetzung ihrer Wünsche den Atjehern aufzwingen, und in deren Verlauf sie selbst den Kürzeren zogen”. (p. 52). Unless outside sources would prove that the Portuguese purposely played this typically Southeast Asian prestige game in presenting the sultan with such race-horses, it is much more plausible to assume that the whole story is just that — a story with very little history in it. It is the imagination of the Malay writer which created this combat, not the diplomatic tactics of the Portuguese. With a text such as this one cannot write history — at most it can serve to illustrate history. But basically it is a literary creation which can only be adequately studied by literary means and tools. In this connection I am also of the opinion that Iskandar's suggestion that the text as a whole has been directly modelled upon some Indo-Persian example is worth following up; the structure of this text is much more than the sum of the motifs, names and historical data, some of which Penth discusses in his first Chapter. To be sure, most of the details which Penth mentions are correct as far as they go; but I would like to stress the fact that an adequate analysis of this text should explain the function of all such data and elements within the framework of the text rather than pointing out their provenance.

For the rest Penth's introduction concentrates on the history of Atjeh rather than on the *Hikayat*: he discusses the sultans of Atjeh between 1500 and 1600 A.D., and adds some new data and suggestions to the already extensive literature on the period. More interesting and original is his survey of Portuguese-Achehnese relations between 1540 and 1613, even though it is based on published sources only. He specifically deals with the Portuguese embassy in the *Hikayat Atjeh*; in view of what has been said above it is not surprising that he does not reach any conclusions as to its historical identification.

The German translation of the Malay text, although in the main reliable, is not without mistakes; to mention a few of them: p. 1 (of the Mal. ms.) *apa baik* does not mean “Es wäre gut...”, but “What is the use...”; p. 3 the explanation of *daripada hari Chamis* is far-fetched; it is probably a variant of, or a mistake for, *pada hari Chamis*, “on a Thursday”, see also p. 10 *pada suatu hari Isnain*; p. 4 *mari kita*

bantuan means "Let's pull out . . .", not an imperative: "reisz . . . aus", cf. also p. 184 *Mari kita duduk*, "Let's sit down", not: "Setzt Euch"; p. 18 *Maka dalam demikian itupun (tiada djua)* is concessive: "Yet, nevertheless, in spite of all this", not "und dabei". A more serious mistake occurs on p. 19: the Malay words *Maka radja 'Inajat Sjahpun tiadalah behéna belenggara* etc. mean something like: "So Radja I.S. was no longer particularly careful with regard to the usual wartime routine, as had been his habit before", not: "R.I.S. war recht sorglos gegenüber Kriegslisten, wie sie früher üblich waren." Consequently the next sentence should not be translated as a future: it means: "Our enemy has become, or is, now our brother"; p. 34 *pada ketika malam djua* does not mean "noch am gleichen Abend", but rather "in the night-time, at night", etc.

In the bibliographical apparatus sometimes strange omissions occur, e.g. Winstedt's paper on the *Hikajat Iskandar Dzulkarnain* is mentioned (p. 7, fn. 6), but not P. J. van Leeuwen's edition of the main part of the text (1937); for a reference to Minangkabau historical traditions Senstius' *Survey* is not an obvious choice (p. 11)! For Achehnese one should consult Hoessein Djajadiningrat's scholarly rather than Kreemer's practical dictionary. On the other hand the author should be praised for using both Dutch and Portuguese sources, in addition to Malay, Thai, English, German and French ones.

University of Leiden

A. TEEUW

ANDREW SHARP (ed.), *The Journal of Jacob Roggeveen*.
Clarendon Press: Oxford University Press, Oxford 1970.
Illustrations and Maps, Bibliography, Index, 193 pp.;
price £ 2.50 net.

It is not surprising that Jacob Roggeveen's voyage has the particular interest of Andrew Sharp, who has great knowledge of Oceanic voyages and is interested in the Polynesian proa shipping and sailing, on which he has published on several occasions. It is to his credit that he does not make any effort to put himself into prominence in this excellent translation of Roggeveen's journal.

In unpretentious footnotes Sharp gives an explanation of certain paragraphs and he tries to explain the ethnographic particulars mentioned by Roggeveen and his fellow travellers. The book is divided into an introduction, the journal itself and an epilogue.

The introduction elucidates Jacob Roggeveen's personality. Probably some of us will be surprised at the fact that Roggeveen was an educated man with an academic title. Originally, he was highly interested in nautical affairs; mathematics, navigation and astronomy were all hobbies of his father, Arend Roggeveen. The foundations for Jacob's great journey were laid by his father, Arend, as early as the year 1675, when the latter made a request to the States-General to fit out a ship for the discovery of land in the Pacific Ocean, with which trade could be carried on.

At that time Jacob Roggeveen was 16 years old. When this plan could actually be finalized and the great voyage was made, Jacob was 62 years old. His father had passed away long before then. His brother John, however, was also very much interested in the undertaking.

In 1721 the request for this big voyage was made to the West India Company, who rather liked the idea. On 26th July 1721 the *Arend*, the *Thienhoven* and the *African Gale* stood out to the open sea. Somewhat hurriedly and quietly, so that competing companies could not get wind of it.

The main part of the book edited by Sharp, consists of Jacob Roggeveen's journal, ending on 18th July 1722. Between these two dates, spanning almost a year, lies a world of fascinating discoveries and misery, and much of the ocean; it is surprising to read how many variations of seas there are — a hollow sea, a cold and level sea. . . . Ports were seldom visited and hardly any fresh food was taken during the voyage. Consequently the toll was high, and during the last month of the journal alone the fatal casualties numbered twenty. The journal ends with the death of Jan Bos, caused by scurvy, the usual disease on board. Apparently Roggeveen was too much an erudite and had too little knowledge of sea voyages. Moreover, the over-hasty departure had been of influence on the supply of foodstuffs and other essentials.

In the epilogue, Sharp tells us how the unfortunate Roggeveen was badly treated by the V.O.C. on his arrival at Batavia, as if he were a citizen of a hostile state. Jacob Roggeveen's expedition had not been a sinecure and obviously had not met the expectations at that time. Still the fact remains that he was the first European to discover various atolls of the Tuamotu-group, Bora-bora and Maupiti in the Society islands, and many islands of the Samoa-group. His most important discovery was the small Easter Island of which he has given the first — very careful and sober — report. The discoverer certainly never dreamt that this island would give rise to so many

scientific theories in our days. He already wondered how people had been able to erect the great statues for which this island is famous.

Due to Sharp's excellent translation, the account of Roggeveen's extraordinary voyage will reach a wider circle of readers and this is indeed a great merit.

C. H. M. NOOY-PALM

De redactie ontving bovendien de volgende publicaties:

ERNEST E. HEIMBACH, *White Meo - English Dictionary*. Data Paper 75, Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University. Ithaca, New York 1969, 497 p., price \$ 5.—.

F. E. HOFFMANN, *The Cambodian System of Writing and Beginning Reader*. Yale University Press, New Haven & London 1970, 365 p., price \$ 5.50.

NHA-TRANG CONG-HUYEN-TON-NU, *Vietnamese Folklore, A... Bibliography*. Occasional Paper nr. 7, Center for South & Southeast Asian Studies, University of California. Berkeley, California 1970, 33 p.

AKIN RABIBHADANA, *The Organization of Thai Society in the Early Bangkok Period, 1782-1873*. Data Paper 74, Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University. Ithaca, New York 1969, 247 p., price \$ 3.—.

Berita Unicef, Madjalah Triwulan. Djakarta. Nr. 1, djuli 1970; nr. 2, oktober 1970; nr. 3, maret 1971. 17, 28, 28 halaman.

New Guinea Research Bulletin, nr. 38. Special Issue: Land Tenure in West Irian, 63 p., 4 maps, price Aus. \$ 1.50.

ERNESTO E. TABÍO, *La prehistoria*. Academia de Ciencias de Cuba, La Habana 1968, 19 p.

E. TABÍO & J. M. GUARCH, *Excavaciones en Arroyo del Palo*. Academia de Ciencias de Cuba, La Habana 1966, 82 p., 21 láminas.

Serie Antropologica, Academia de Ciencias de Cuba.

No. 4: *La dieta y el ajuar aborígenes en el sito Mejías, Mayarí, Cuba*;

No. 5: *Las peculiaridades de la desintegración de las comunidades primitivas cubanas*;

No. 6: *Exploracion arqueologica inicial en Cayo Jorajuría, Cuba*. La Habana 1970.