Book Reviews

- Victoria J. Baker, Anthony Jackson, *Anthropology at home*, ASA monographs 25, London: Tavistock Publications, 1987, 221 pages.
- Thomas Bargatzky, Martin A. van Bakel, *Private politics; A multi-disciplinary approach to Big-Man systems*, Studies in Human Society, Vol. I, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1986. x, 220 pp., illustrations, maps, index., Renée R. Hagesteijn, Pieter van de Velde (eds.)
- W.E.A. van Beek, Victor W. Turner, *The anthropology of experience*, (with an epilogue by Clifford Geertz). Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1986., Edward M. Bruner (eds.)
- W. van den Broeke, H. Meyer, *De Deli Spoorweg Maatschappij; Driekwart eeuw koloniaal spoor*, Zutphen: Walburg Pers, met medewerking van F.A.J. Heckler. 1987; 152 blz.
- R. Buijtenhuijs, S. Bernus et al., *Le fils et le neveu: Jeux et enjeux de la parenté tourarègue*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge/Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, Paris, 1986, XI, 343 pp.
- R. Buijtenhuijs, Dominique Casajus, *La tente dans la solitude: La société et les morts chez les Touaregs Kel Ferwan*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge/Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, Paris, 1987, 390 pp.
- H.J.M. Claessen, Christine Ward Gailey, *Kinship to kingship; Gender hierarchy and state formation in the Tongan Islands*. Austin: University of Texas Press (Texas Press Sourcebooks in Anthropology, No. 14.), 1987. 326 pp., figs., index, bibl.
- Alfred E. Daniëls, Richard B. Davis, *Muang metaphysics*, Bangkok: Pandora Press, 1984.
- Alfred E. Daniëls, Gehan Wijeyewardene, *Place and emotion in northern Thai ritual behaviour*, Bangkok: Pandora Press, 1986.
- P.M.H. Groen, Jacques van Doorn, *The process of decolonization 1945-1975; The military experience in comparative perspective*, CASP publications no. 17, Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam, 1987, 46 pp., Willem J. Hendrix (eds.)
- Rosemarijn Hoefte, Luis H. Daal, *Antilliaans verhaal*. Zutphen: De Walburg Pers, 1988, Ted Schouten (eds.)
- W.L. Idema, Claudine Salmon, *Literary migrations; Traditional Chinese fiction in Asia (17th-20th centuries)*, Beijing: International culture publishing corporation, 1987, 11 + vi + 661 pp.
- P.E. de Josselin de Jong, Sharon A. Carstens, *Cultural identity in Northern Peninsular Malaysia*, Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Monographs in international studies, Southeast Asia series no. 63, 1986. 91 pp.
- P.E. de Josselin de Jong, Robert Wessing, *The soul of ambiguity: The tiger in Southeast Asia*. Northern Illinois University, Center for Southeast Asian studies, Special report no. 24, 1986. 148 pp., glossary, bibliography.

- G.W. Locher, Martine Segalen, *Historical anthropology of the family*, Cambridge University Press, 1986, 328 pp.
 - Bernd Nothofer, Hans Kähler, *Enggano-Deutsches Wörterbuch*. Aus dem Nachlass herausgegeben und mit einem Deutsch-Enggano-Wörterverzeichnis versehen von Hans Schmidt, Veröffentlichungen des Seminars für Indonesische und Südseesprachen der Universität Hamburg, Band 14, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1987. XIII + 404 pp.
 - J.D.M. Platenkamp, Brigitte Renard-Clamagirand, Marobo; *Une société ema de Timor*. Langues et civilisations de l'Asie du sud-est et du monde insulindien no. 12, Paris: Selafr, 1983, 490 pp.
 - H.C.G. Schoenaker, Leo Frobenius, *Ethnographische Notizen aus den Jahren 1905 und 1906*; II: Kuba, Leele, Nord-Kete; III: Luluwa, Süd-Kete, Bena Mai, Pende, Cokwe. Bearb.u.hrsrg. von Hildegard Klein. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1987; 1988. 223 S., 437 Zeichnungen, 11 fotos, 5 karten; 268 S., 500 Zeichnungen, 15 fotos, 12 karten.
 - M. Schoffeleers, I.M. Lewis, *Religion in context: Cults and charisma*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986, X + 139 pp.
 - B. Schuch, Ingrid Liebig-Hundius, *Thailands Lehrer zwischen Tradition und `Fortschritt*; Eine empirische Untersuchung politisch-sozialer und pädagogischer Einstellungen thailändischer Lehrerstudenten des Jahres 1974. Beiträge zur Südasienforschung, Band 85, Weisbaden: Steiner Verlag, 1984, 342 pp.
 - Henke Schulte Nordholt, S.J. Tambiah, *Thought and social action; An anthropological perspective*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard Univ. Press, 1985, 411 pp.
 - Nico G. Schulte Nordholt, Shamsul Amri Baharuddin, *From British to Bumiputra rule: Local politics and rural development in Peninsular Malaysia*, Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian studies, 1986. 282 pp.
 - A. Teeuw, I. Syukri, *History of the Malay kingdom of Patani - Sejarah Kerajaan Melayu Patani*, by Ibrahim Syukri (pseudonym), translated by Conner Bailey and John N. Miksic. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Center for International studies, monographs in international studies Southeast Asia series number 68, 1985. xx + 90 pp.
 - Truong Quang, Andrew Vickerman, *The fate of the peasantry: Premature `transition to socialism in the democratic republic of Vietnam*, Monograph No. 28, Yale University, Southeast Asia studies, 1986. 373 pp., incl. bibliography.
 - Adrian Vickers, H.I.R. Hinzler, *Catalogue of Balinese manuscripts in the library of the University of Leiden and other collections in the Netherlands*, vol. I: Reproductions of the drawings from the Van der Tuuk collection; vol. II: Descriptions of the Balinese drawings form the Van der Tuuk collection. Leiden: E.J. Brill/Leiden University Press, 1987.
- In: *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde*, Rituals and Socio-Cosmic Order in Eastern Indonesian Societies; Part I Nusa Tenggara Timur 145 (1989), no: 4, Leiden, 567-608

BOEKBESPREKINGEN

Anthony Jackson (ed.), *Anthropology at Home*, ASA Monographs 25, London: Tavistock Publications, 1987, 221 pages.

VICTORIA J. BAKER

Anthropologists involved in doing research in their own countries or in their own societies will be interested in this volume of thirteen papers. The papers were selected from 35 contributions to the ASA conference on the theme 'anthropology at home' held in March 1985 at the University of Keele.

In editor Anthony Jackson's own paper (p. 10) he discloses that the idea for the conference came about when Marilyn Strathern at the 1983 ASA conference in Cambridge made a chance remark that one was about to see the first indigenous anthropologist going into the field in Papua New Guinea. Would he see his own society differently from how outsider anthropologists saw it? If this allusion to the Papua anthropologist in his own society is an example *par excellence* of doing anthropology at home, then the reader is left wondering about the scope of the concept, as we read in succeeding papers of the fieldwork experiences of British anthropologists in France, Hungary and Poland, and the USSR respectively. There is also the example of a British anthropologist who did field research in Israel and ended up making that country her home. Crossing cultural boundaries to the more exotic in one's home country is also represented in the volume, e.g. a British anthropologist studying the gypsies on the M1 motorway or a Danish anthropologist among Icelandic farmers. It is further obvious that we are not talking about anthropology coming home to Europe, as we have an example of a Zimbabwe anthropologist in her own country and a Kenya-born Catholic Goan (India) Britisher going back to the Indian region of her family origins to do research.

Just what does 'anthropology at home' cover? The bias here appears heavily weighted toward European anthropology, and especially British social anthropology – not surprising for a bundle of papers for an ASA conference, at which nearly two-thirds of all the papers given were about Europe; however, Oceania, India, North and South America, Africa, the Middle East and the Soviet Union were also represented. Jackson notes that a 'grand' conference was decided on in order to allow the widest possible hearing from workers in this relatively new field, and that the papers showed how differently one could interpret anthropology at home. Though reference is made in several articles to Messerschmidt's volume on anthropology at home in North America (1981), in which different labels for anthropology at home found in the literature are mentioned (insider research, auto-ethnography, indigenous anthropology and native anthropology, to name a few), any narrowing down or specification of different varieties seems to be avoided in this collection. Jackson admits in the preface that the problems discussed in the papers

are not concerned exclusively with anthropology at home but deal with doing social anthropology in the modern world. His own paper is in great part an admonition to archaeologists and sociologists for not cooperating more with their colleagues who have come home, i.e. the British social anthropologists.

Besides the editor's essay, there are three other articles that do not primarily deal with the experiences and lessons learned from a specific field study: Marilyn Strathern's 'The limits of auto-anthropology', Edwin Ardener's '"Remote" areas: Some theoretical considerations', and A. P. Cheater's 'The anthropologist as citizen: The diffracted self?'. The first two are placed by Jackson under 'basic problems' in a grouping he provides in the preface; the third is placed under the heading 'non-European research', perhaps to help offset the European emphasis. These three papers provide the bulk of the theoretical contributions to be found in the book. Strathern addresses the matters of knowing when one is home (when the investigator/investigated share the same premises about social life), whether auto-anthropology leads both to greater understanding and to unnecessary mystification, the kinds of perceived exploitation taking place during fieldwork, the difference between 'writers' and 'authors', and the issue of contributing to both knowledge and self-knowledge. She concludes that where home is *does* matter; whether anthropologists are at home as anthropologists is determined 'by the relationship between their techniques of organizing knowledge and how people organize knowledge about themselves' (p. 31). Ardener probes the concept of 'remote areas', where geography is not the essential feature. He discusses the paradoxes and characteristics of remote areas, which feel open and unprotected from the inside while they may seem to be closed off by one-way barriers from the outside. Cheater expounds on the conflict of roles between the citizen anthropologist at home and the visiting anthropologist, which in her view is a confrontation of 'self' and 'other'. The visiting anthropologist has a fragmentation of identity (diffracted self) and will suffer less from problems of subjectivity and self-identification than the citizen anthropologist. The latter is more accountable, trackable, more likely to assume masks in the field, and perhaps 'afraid to face the problems of conducting fieldwork among equals' (p. 176).

Fortunately for those who find the discourses of these theorists intellectually rather heavy to digest, the book compensates by providing numerous enlightening accounts that share fieldwork experiences, exposing some methodological, practical, personal and political problems that can arise. Particularly constructive is Judith Okely's straightforward story of her case study among gypsies, disclosing political aspects on many levels and encouraging anthropologists at home to also devote attention to studying the powerful. Politics additionally enters the picture in accounts of fieldwork in Brittany (Maryon McDonald), Hungary and Poland (Chris Hann), and the USSR (Tamara Dragadze). Among the few contributions about research done by anthropologists in the countries they reside in are those by Orver Löfgren, who tells of an on-going historical-comparative study of Swedish culture, and by

Martine Segalen and Françoise Zonabend, who provide useful advice based on their study of kinship and the family in France. Stella Mascarenhas-Keys, who went back to the Goa (India) of her ancestors, relates her experiences of becoming a 'multiple native', while Kirsten Hastrup discusses effectively how she was blinded by knowledge, taking 'evidence' for granted while working in Iceland.

Perhaps the most penetrating account of personal experiences is provided by Shalva Weil, who recalls her fieldwork in a community of Indian Jews in Israel. She writes of her experiences and sentiments in first-person passages, which are interspersed with first-person passages written by her husband, Michael, who accompanied her and assisted in several phases. The presentation is meant to reflect 'the unfolding of a dream' – an aspect of the paper which contrasts with the frank and open, diary-like narrative. Interestingly, in A. P. Cheater's paper (p. 175) the latter refers to discussion which took place during the ASA conference regarding Shalva Weil's 'dream'. As the Weils were not present at the conference to provide an explanation, there were three different interpretations as to the meaning of the dream: 'that it referred to her original fieldwork; to her subsequent reconstruction of her fieldwork experience for the purposes of writing her paper; and to both, as part of her contemporary experience'. The example is given by Cheater to illustrate the need for effective professional communication among anthropologists. I must admit that the mystery of the dream has not been resolved by this reviewer.

Editor Jackson states that the conference served as a good sounding-board for future meetings on more specific issues. It is clear that there is much more to be said about anthropology at home, and this book is useful for provoking further discussions.

Reference

Messerschmidt, D. A. (ed.), 1981, *Anthropologists at Home in North America: Methods and Issues in the Study of One's Own Society*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Martin A. van Bakel, Renée R. Hagesteijn and Pieter van de Velde (eds), *Private Politics; A Multi-Disciplinary Approach to 'Big-Man' Systems*, Studies in Human Society, Vol. I, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1986. x, 220 pp., illustrations, maps, index. (Paperback.)

THOMAS BARGATZKY,
University of München

In the Introduction, the editors ask whether the 'Big-Man' concept can be fruitfully applied to cases of achieved political leadership outside the Melanesian culture area. Nineteen authors have devoted 20 chapters to an investigation of this problem. Historical figures as dissimilar as the pre-Christian Sri Lankan ruler Dutthagamani (Joke Schrijvers), Geoffrey

Plantagenet (Henry Teunis) and Dom Mintoff (Jeremy Boissevain) are dealt with, as well as village *caciques* in 20th-century Spain (Raymond Buve), contemporary Sri Lankan gem merchants (Victoria J. Baker), Mafia bosses (Heleen Louwe), and political leaders in the Netherlands Antilles (Franklin E. Tjon Sie Fat). The Canadian Arctic (Jarich G. Oosten) has not been omitted, nor has Africa (Albert A. Trouwborst) or Classical Greece (Edward Ch.L. van der Vliet). Archaeologists Pieter van de Velde and Tom Bloemers deal with European early Neolithic ('Bandkeramik') society and the Middle Iron Age respectively. The chapters are classified into sections entitled 'Theoretical Considerations' and 'Case Studies'. A final chapter by the editors entitled 'Conclusions' completes the volume.

The concept of 'Big-Man' was popularized by Marshall Sahlins, who used it to describe a particular Melanesian manifestation of the principle of achieved leadership. Can such a term be fruitfully applied to other times and places? Many of the authors are doubtful about this. Peter Kloos, for example, prefers the more general and more abstract term 'political entrepreneur' for comparative purposes, because the term 'Big-Man' has a 'distinctly Melanesian flavour' (p. 56). Oosten (p. 74) and Trouwborst (p. 51f.) have similar reservations. Other authors reject the familiar evolutionary band-tribe-chieftdom-state trajectory, with the concomitant notion of the Big-Man as typical of the band and tribe types of society. Renée Hagesteijn (p. 107), for example, argues that political leadership in early Southeast Asia, although commonly referred to as kingship, bears a certain resemblance to petty chieftainship or even Big-Manship. Martin A. van Bakel reaches a similar conclusion concerning Samoan leadership. According to van Bakel (p. 100f.), one must distinguish between the ideological level and the sphere of practical reality. As far as the ideological level is concerned Samoa can be described as a chieftdom, but in the practical sphere Big-Man features of indigenous leadership become apparent. Martin R. Doornbos transcends the conventional evolutionary analytical framework in his discussion of the impact of expanding and imposing state systems in the context of traditional indigenous leadership in contemporary Asia and Africa. In the same vein, Alex T. Strating and G. Christiaan Uhlenbeck deal with the influence of the colonial situation on Melanesian political processes. Sander van der Leeuw, on the other hand, constructs a theory based on concepts borrowed from information theory and tries to account for the emergence of the Big-Man by viewing him as the manipulator of information.

From the vast array of periods, places, and characters dealt with in the volume, at least three conclusions present themselves. Firstly, there is no such thing as a 'Big-Man society'. In the second place, neo-evolutionary conceptions of the Big-Man system as the precursor of more complex forms of power management are invalid. And thirdly – to quote the editors in their final chapter – 'as an ideal type "Big-Man" is virtually coterminous with achieved status – and therefore superfluous' (p. 214). However, I cannot agree with the conclusion that the concept of Big-Man should be abandoned to make room for a more meaningful definition of leadership. As long as we reserve the term 'Big-Man' for the Melanesian manifestation of achieved status and leadership, there is no need to abandon it altogether.

Finally, two critical remarks are in order here. First, since the theme of the volume is 'Big-Man systems', many authors felt obliged to begin their chapter with a – longer or shorter – account of the history of the Big-Man concept, beginning with Sahlins' familiar contribution. The reader who works his way through the entire book may find it rather boring to read this story over and over again. A little more editing would have been welcome here. Second, the volume addresses itself to the general and interdisciplinary reader. Hence a chapter like Bloemers', on a Middle Iron Age cart burial in Nijmegen, with its detailed archaeological documentation, seems to be somewhat out of place here. Again, a more energetic intervention to streamline the various contributions would have been called for. These shortcomings do not, however, detract from the volume's general value, marking as it does an important step toward the conceptual clarification of a confused issue in political anthropology.

The anthropology of experience, edited by Victor W. Turner and Edward M. Bruner (with an epilogue by Clifford Geertz). Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1986.

W.E.A. VAN BEEK
Rijksuniversiteit van Utrecht

Anthropology continues to struggle with its self-image, wavering between the (supposed) hard data of 'science' and the personal interpretations of the humanities, between registration and existential understanding. Following the lead of compelling story-tellers such as Clifford Geertz and Victor Turner, the self-conception of anthropology as a 'producer of texts' seems on the rise. Of course, the field is broad enough nowadays to accommodate permanent competition between paradigms, and hard-headed materialists or neo-marxists are in no danger of extinction. Still, an increasing realization of the constructivist character of both culture and its anthropological representation is shaping a new appreciation of the anthropologist's task, which has been dubbed the 'interpretive-performative perspective'. After the 'hausse' in fieldwork confession literature in the seventies, anthropologists have recently started pointing out the existential advantages of their scientific inadequacies. Dropping scientific pretensions has developed from a favorite pastime into a professional mainstay. As a discipline, we are re-enacting the famous Andersen story of 'the new clothes for the emperor', except that we are our own little boy who cries out that King Anthropology is wearing no real clothes at all, and now, eventually, we are coming to realize that it is more king-like to walk around like that. Thus, anthropology, through this interpretive stand, has arrived at the stage of blending of data and interpretation, common experience and cultural profundity, fact and fiction. And likewise, the old report on exotic peoples developed first into a story about other human beings and then into a story about story-tellers.

The present volume, *The Anthropology of Experience*, is part of this

emergent tradition. The book, in more than one way, is part of this tradition, as its own genesis is coterminous with the emergence of the 'paradigm'. Starting from an AAA symposium in 1980, it took six years to finish publication of this text, telling and retelling the 'stories' before many audiences. One consequence is that the contributions have gradually lost some of their novelty, as many of them have already been published in variant forms elsewhere. Still, the collection of these essays was important enough to warrant publication.

In an important way, the book is a tribute to Victor Turner as well. It attempts to scan the horizon of this conception of 'anthropology as story-telling, ethnography as text and performance' and to rethink some key issues. Turner himself does so in a short application of Dewey and Dilthey to social drama. Following Turner, Bruner makes use of Dilthey's hermeneutics in the Introduction to capture the wide scope of the contributions through the twin concepts of 'experience' and 'expression', which form the core of their approach. The former represents the way reality presents itself to the consciousness, the latter the way the individual frames and articulates this individual experience. Of course, both are culturally mediated, but are so in different ways. In 'experience' the focus is on indigenous meaning, but without the heavy formalization that earlier 'emic' approaches suffered from: it is the 'vitality' (Turner), the high times of existence, that is aimed at. In Dilthey's words: 'the moments of fulfillment punctuate experience' (p. 13). So an anthropology that declines to 'rob lived experience of its vitality' (Rosaldo) has to do three things. First, it has to concentrate on processes (in clear contrast to the structuralist or ethno-science approaches of 'emic' understanding); after all, experience itself – as a part of consciousness – is a continually floating point in time. Secondly, it has to take a constant reflexivity into account; humans inevitably experience both their environment and their own experiential reaction towards it at the same time – the double consciousness of experience Abrahams points out in his contribution. The third requirement is concentration on the high points of life, the periods of heightened activity, reflection and creativity. This is what is understood throughout the book as 'expression'. The main thesis, if one is allowed such a positivist exercise, is that both 'experience' and 'expression' mutually reinforce each other. In performing the cultural expression of individual, culturally shaped experiences, these are re-created, meaning is re-formulated and culture re-invented. Culture is seen as an emergent of a performed, collectively expressed, experience. Culture, in short, becomes a story to be re-told. So the aim of the anthropologist, in Geertz' terms, is to discover something about the hard-won meanings of culture.

Throughout the contributions, the power of this approach is especially clear in those instances where the cultures studied use a vivid imagery themselves. Thus, Rosaldo gives a fascinating account of the interaction between hunting and 'telling about hunting' in Ilongot society – one of the most convincing in the volume. The role of oral art, so widely experienced and seldom discussed by field anthropologists, has found striking expression in his analysis of hunting as a 'story to pass on'. Similarly, Fernandez shows how in 'his' African independent churches, the images

the people have of themselves (or rather, of their potential selves) generate a complicated mix of metaphors, which fashion their experience of the outer world. Acting out their image, they restore the vitality of their movement. Sinhalese healing proceeds in a similar way. Though this is not surprising within the conceptual realm of Victor Turner, Kapferer argues that the performance of such a healing ritual solves the dilemma between personal experience and social communication. The unity of text and enactment is not to be reduced to two separate aspects. The ritual moves from the separation of the client towards the re-contextualization of opposing forces, characteristically ending on a comic note. Using a different terminology for this interplay of contradictions, Boon shows how Balinese culture results from an 'ongoing cultural argument' between different 'Machineries' (this awkward term is Boon's) for status ranking. His article, which is a continuous discussion in itself, exemplifies the intricate interweaving of symbol and outer world, of 'symbolizing' and that which is 'symbolized'. Steward analyses the changing Trinidad carnival in a more 'traditional' vein, insisting on the socio-political arenas influencing the way in which participants (including spectators) experience the festival.

The other articles diverge more widely from the usual anthropological subject matter. Written texts, such as 'Hamlet' (in Gorfain's elegant contribution) and 'Walden' (in Frederick Turner's), and anthropological texts (Bruner), pottery figurines (Babcock), and a mural with a parade comprise the expressions studied. Schechner's essay on acting strategies is slightly out of bounds, though it does raise pertinent questions regarding the universality of human experience.

On the whole, this is an interesting collection, even if it rather represents a moment in the development trajectory that any new paradigm has to cover than a substantial contribution to key issues in anthropology. The strengths of the paradigm – its wide applicability and case-specific interpretation – are the weak points of the volume: its lack of focus and of terminological coherence. Many contributions make for stimulating reading, but they keep branching out. Finally, in reply to a question raised by Roger Abrahams' article, I would add that it may well be that the focus on 'extraordinary experience' that so characterizes this approach is a Western one, particularly an American one, where experience is judged by its novelty, expression by its excellence, and the quality of life by its apex. It is hard to see, then, how this 'interpretive-performance' paradigm could ever be more than one branch among many on the tree of anthropological knowledge, given the scarcity of those experiences.

Meyer, H., met medewerking van F.A.J. Heckler, *De Deli Spoorweg Maatschappij; Driekwart eeuw koloniaal spoor*, Zutphen: Walburg Pers, 1987; 152 blz., f 39,50. ISBN 90-60-11-5406.

W. VAN DEN BROEKE

Hoewel de titel weinig informatie biedt, heb ik dit boek enige tijd geleden met een zekere gretigheid ter hand genomen. Ik was geïnteresseerd in de relatie tussen de opkomst van Deli als één van de belangrijkste gebieden van de tabaks- en (later) rubbercultuur en de stijgende vraag naar goede transportmogelijkheden voor de afvoer van halffabrikaat en eindproduct. Het vervoer per spoor leek daarbij een voor de hand liggende en relatief goedkope oplossing. Het verband tussen de economische ontwikkeling van Oost-Sumatra enerzijds en de aanleg van spoorwegen anderzijds stond naar mijn mening garant voor een boeiende verhandeling.

Na eerste lezing heb ik het boek echter terzijde gelegd; zoveel 'tempo doeloe' wekte mijn irritatie. De auteur ontpopt zich als een overtuigd voorstander van het harmoniemodel. De bijdrage van zijn mede-auteur – die de periode 1951-1958 beschrijft – acht hij 'extra waardevol, omdat daar uitdrukkelijk uit blijkt hoe goed de band tussen Indonesisch en Europees personeel was en hoezeer de eersten het abrupte einde van deze verhouding in 1958 betreunden' (blz. 9). Nu moet uitdrukkelijk worden gezegd, dat de auteur ook zelf het gevaar van subjectivistische geschiedschrijving heeft onderkend. In zijn 'Ten geleide' dankt hij prof. dr. J. van Baal, die hem 'op uiterst tactvolle wijze van ondoordachte uitlatingen en politieke beschouwingen heeft weten te weerhouden' (blz. 9). Bovendien is het boek in september 1987 een zeer lovende recensie in *De Ingenieur* ten deel gevallen. Prins Bernhard schreef een prijzend 'Woord vooraf'. Dat moet een eenvoudig recensent tot voorzichtigheid manen. Ik herlas derhalve het gehele boek, maar stoorde mij opnieuw aan dezelfde zaken. Een drietal daarvan wil ik expliciet vermelden.

Op blz. 39 citeert de auteur met instemming S.A. Reitsma, die de hoofdfunctie van spoor- en tramwegen op Noord-Sumatra gelegen ziet in 'de pacificerende werking, welke van haar is uitgegaan'. Elders op dezelfde bladzijde stelt Meyer, dat een goede verbinding langs de kust paste in de opzet van generaal Van Heutz, 'geheel Atjeh' te onderwerpen. Deze uitlatingen stemmen te opvallend overeen met een passage uit het jaarverslag van 'de Koninklijke' van 1897 om deze onvermeld te laten: 'Nu het Indisch Gouvernement op zulk een flinke en voortvarende wijze het gezag vestigt en handhaaft in het Noorden van Sumatra, en ons moedig leger zijn wapenfeiten met succes ziet bekroond, is het te verwachten dat binnen korten tijd ook Tamiang geheel voor de particuliere industrie zal worden opengesteld'. Meyer komt tot een soortgelijke conclusie, maar laat het bij een blote constatering van feiten. Sommige historici (Van Tijn, Kuitenbrouwer) hebben in dergelijke passages een eerste bewijs gezien voor het Nederlands imperialistisch gedrag in Indonesië.

Een tweede kwestie betreft de contractarbeid en de daaraan verbonden 'poenale sanctie'. Bij de DSM waren enkele honderden Javaanse contractarbeiders in dienst. Zij waren vooral betrokken bij de bouw van kunstwerken en de aanleg van het baanlichaam. 'Als contractarbeiders, stonden zij onder de "poenale sanctie". Dit betekende, dat als zij zich niet aan de arbeidsvoorwaarden van hun contract hielden, zij gerechtelijk gestraft konden worden' (blz. 74). De auteur vervolgt dan: 'Op zichzelf vielen de straffen wel mee en het leven in de gevangenis was niet al te zwaar'. Dezer dagen herlas ik 'Rubber' van Mevr. Szekely-Lulofs. Zij beschrijft op

indringende wijze de barre werkomstandigheden van de contractarbeiders op de rubberplantages en hun permanente angst voor de 'gerechtelijke straffen'. Ik kan mij niet voorstellen, dat de werkomstandigheden bij de DSM zoveel gunstiger waren; de aanleg van een baanlichaam voor spoorwegen is onder gunstige omstandigheden reeds een zwaar karwei, hoe veel te meer onder een gloeiende tropenzon.

Het derde punt heeft betrekking op de eerste politionele actie van 1947. De auteur geeft daarover als zijn mening het volgende te kennen: 'Indien de eerste politionele actie nog twee dagen was doorgezet - en een eenvoudige griep van enkele ministers was daarvoor voldoende geweest - dan zou het vertrouwen in de Nederlanders en in een mogelijke samenwerking - tussen Indonesië en Nederland - evenzeer zijn gestegen als het aanzien van Sukarno bij zijn landgenoten gedaald' (blz. 101). Ik kan mij niet aan de indruk onttrekken, dat een auteur met deze uitspraak de vitaliteit en de rechtmatigheid van het Indonesisch nationalisme schromelijk te kort doet.

Ik rond af. In 1962 schreef J. Weisfelt een wetenschappelijk verantwoorde bedrijfsgeschiedenis van DSM. Meyer merkt daarover in zijn 'Ten geleide' op dat dit proefschrift hem - door zijn schat aan cijfermateriaal - veel werk heeft bespaard. 'Overigens is dit proefschrift een bewijs dat een bedrijf als DSM door cijfers alleen niet tot leven gewekt kan worden.' Douwes merkt in zijn bespreking in *De ingenieur* op, dat Meyers boek meer is dan een zuivere bedrijfshistorie, omdat de auteur het vermogen bezit 'het onderwerp van studie te plaatsen in de bredere context van de toenmalige Nederlands-Indische koloniale maatschappij'. Ik verschill met beide auteurs grondig van mening. Naar mijn opvatting is bedrijfsgeschiedenis 'een vak apart' (Joh. de Vries in het eerste *Jaarboek voor de geschiedenis van bedrijf en techniek*, 1984). Zo bezien biedt deze publikatie niet meer dan een stukje 'evenementiële' spoorweg- en techniekgeschiedenis.

S. Bernus et al. (eds), *Le fils et le neveu: Jeux et enjeux de la parenté touarègue*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge/Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, Paris, 1986, XI, 343 pp.

Dominique Casajus, *La tente dans la solitude: La société et les morts chez les Touaregs Kel Ferwan*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge/Editions de la Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, Paris, 1987, 390 pp.

R. BUIJTENHUIJS

The two publications under review undoubtedly represent the best that is currently available in the field of anthropological research on the Tuareg. The volume edited by Bernus et al. contains eleven chapters written by outstanding specialists on Tuareg systems of kinship and alliance. On the basis of recent field data they present new hypotheses that permit the renewal of a long-standing debate and also call into

question the wider assumptions of kinship theory today. The book is mainly of interest to specialists, as the language and vocabulary used are highly technical and sophisticated. Casajus' main concern in *La tente dans la solitude* is the analysis of the worldview of one specific Tuareg group and its repercussions for the structuring of social life in this society. Contrasting the life cycle of men and women, he demonstrates that the essence of Kel Ferwan social life is expressed by the paradox represented by camps of men living in tents belonging to women. In his final chapter the author expresses some interesting ideas on the problem of the Tuareg veil. Parts of his book are also accessible to the layman wanting to learn about Tuareg culture.

Christine Ward Gailey, *Kinship to Kingship; Gender Hierarchy and State Formation in the Tongan Islands*. Austin: University of Texas Press (Texas Press Sourcebooks in Anthropology, No. 14.), 1987. 326 pp., figs., index, bibl. ISBN 0292 72456.

H.J.M. CLAESSEN

Since the publication of her Ph.D. thesis, *Our History is Written ... in our Mats: State Formation and the Position of Women in Tonga*, in 1981, Christine Gailey (affiliated with the Northeastern University) has made this state, as well as the position of women, the subject of yet another monograph after a period of field work in the Tonga Islands. In certain respects this new book is an improvement on the earlier one. The author has used a wider range of literature, has had the benefit of a greater experience in field work, and has vastly improved her writing skills. In other respects, however, this new — well presented — book compares rather poorly with the earlier publication. In it the theoretical framework selected by Gailey — Marxism and feminism — is so dominant that the reader is regularly overcome with the feeling that the presentation of the theory is more important than the description of the situation in Tonga. This certainly detracts from the value of the book.

Gailey's aim is to give a historical anthropological survey of the origin and development of the state and a class society and 'gender hierarchy' in the Tonga Islands — a process taking place under conditions of continual interaction (p. xi). As a result, the book is above all a detailed source study. It does not refer to all of the well-known sources on the subject, however. So the works of Dentrecasteaux (1808), Dumont d'Urville (1842, 1846), Malaspina (1794), Maurelle (1782), Elisabeth Morey (1804), and Waldegrave (1833) appear not to have been used. It is furthermore not clear why Schouten and Le Maire have been consulted in the dated Dalrymple edition instead of the recent translation by Sharp or the Linschoten edition of 1945. Of the more recent literature, Elisabeth Bott (1981, 1982), Friedman (1981, 1982), Koch (1955), Korn (1978, 'Hunting the ramage'), Kaeppler (1978), Kirch (1984) and Rogers (1977) are missing. In particular the absence of all reference to Bott is to be viewed as a serious omission.

These defects are partly offset by Gailey's excellent insight, as a result of her field work, into the actual position of women in the Tonga Islands.

The central theme of the study is formulated in the first chapter (p. 3), as follows: 'In all state societies, femaleness is associated with lower status and women, as women, have less social authority'. Gailey adds on the same page: 'It is the view here that state and class formation cannot be understood as processes without concomitantly analyzing gender and the status of women'. One might add to this statement that the same is true for the great majority of males. Males, too, are associated with low status in state societies, while it is impossible to understand the process of class formation without considering the inferior status of men in this connection. It seems to me a rather infelicitous scientific mode of proceeding to leave half of the people involved in a particular process out of consideration. So where Gailey on p. 21 discusses the sad fate of Dahomeyan girls who landed in the ruler's harem, she omits to mention the traumatic experience of the boys who were made eunuchs to guard that harem. And when she speaks of the unhappy fate of Inca girls who were put to work in state weaving-houses or made concubines of important dignitaries, she says not a word about the boys who were taken from their home villages to be made to work for the lords of Cuzco far away — the question aside of whether the fate of a concubine in Cuzco was not more attractive than the life of a peasant girl in her own village (cf. Gailey 1987:38).

Gailey (p. 39 ff.) expresses her agreement with the views on the origin of the state evolved by Marxist anthropologists. As she seems to classify myself with this group as well (p. 30, n. 3), I have my doubts about the thoroughness of Gailey's examination of recent literature on state formation. These doubts are only strengthened by the observation of how she exclusively selects and praises the obviously Marxist authors from among the contributors to the volumes of essays edited by myself and Peter Skalník, among others.

With regard to Tongan society in the period preceding the first contacts with the West (what contacts? With Schouten and Le Maire or Cook?), Gailey asserts that the 'contradictions between the descent scheme and sibling-linked rank, coupled with shifting marriage arrangements, prevented any permanent political hierarchy' (p. 47). This statement seems to me rather too absolute. No one will deny that there were a number of mutually contradictory principles present in the kinship structure of the Tongans (as almost everywhere else in Polynesia, for that matter). But no one will find the argument that this prevented the existence of a permanent political hierarchy acceptable, either. Of course, a definitive decision about this will depend on the criteria used: how long does something have to exist to be called 'permanent' and when is the term 'political hierarchy' justified? In view, however, of the fairly long existence of a hierarchical political organization in the Tonga Islands — with thirty-six consecutive *tui tonga* at its head as rulers, assisted from the twenty-fourth on by a hereditary prime minister, the *tui haa takalaua*, who in turn appointed a hereditary deputy, the *tui kanokupolu*, during the administration of the thirtieth *tui tonga* — and considering the mostly long-sustained relations of authority between the central administration and the various groups of islands of the

archipelago, a statement to the effect that it was impossible for a more permanent political hierarchy to exist seems rather too much on the cautious side. Whether the Tongan political organization reached the stage of a (early) state prior to the first contacts with the West is a different question. The reply to this question again is dependent on the criteria chosen. Gailey rightly states (p. 55) that traditional Tonga was not a class society. As she posits elsewhere (p. 145) — obliged by her choice of a Marxist approach — that social classes are a 'prerequisite' for 'state formation', traditional Tonga consequently could not yet have possessed a state structure. It was not possible — in her view — for Tonga to become a real state until the 19th century, under the influence of the mission and firearms (chapter 10). If one applies other criteria, however — such as the degree of administrative centralization, the number of administrative levels, the possibility to push through decisions by means of violence if necessary, and the power to impose taxes — then Tonga meets the requirements for an early state in every respect. In view of the problems involved, it is to be regretted that Gailey nowhere presents a consistent picture of traditional Tonga, whether or not in terms of the state.

The book contains some valuable passages as well. The analysis of the complex connubial system of the royal family is clear and penetrating (pp. 64-79), while the chapter on 19th-century Tonga is informative and well-argued (chapter 10). There is a lucid exposition on the complex male-female relations in traditional Tonga (men are superior to women, but sisters are superior to brothers) (pp. 47-62).

Gailey's new book is controversial, provocative and well-written. No one writing about the Tonga Islands or on the position of women in (early) state structures in the coming years will be able to ignore it.

Richard B. Davis, *Muang Metaphysics*, 1984, and Gehan Wijeyewardene, *Place and Emotion in Northern Thai Ritual Behaviour*, 1986, Bangkok: Pandora Press.

ALFRED E. DANIELS

In 1984, the Pandora Press in Bangkok brought out a series of monographs on Thai ethnography. The series opened with a monograph on *Muang Metaphysics*, which was based on a revised version of a Ph. D. thesis by Richard B. Davis (1943-1981). This posthumous revision of Dr. Davis' thesis, along with his other published papers on myth and ritual in northern Thailand, is presented by Gehan Wijeyewardene on behalf of the trustees of the Richard B. Davis Fund.

Davis first took a degree in anthropology at the University of Virginia, U.S.A. He worked as a Peace Corps volunteer in northern Thailand during the mid-1960s. While he was there, he learned to speak both the national and the northern Thai regional languages. At the instigation of

Professor Geddes, he accepted a Ph.D. scholarship at the University of Sydney. Davis returned to Nan Province for six months of fieldwork in 1969, and again for another twelve months in 1972. He completed his Ph.D. in 1974. He worked for four years at the Australian National University and after that, until his untimely death, at the University of New South Wales. Wijeyewardene writes that the unpublished version of Davis' thesis was much in demand, 'for it is probably one of the most comprehensive accounts available of a South-East Asian ritual system' (p. 5).

The first hundred pages of the book comprise three chapters, namely one containing a theoretical outline of the anthropological study of ritual, the second an introduction to Muang history, residence and social organization, and the third a condensed account of the basic symbolic themes that Davis recognized in Muang cosmology. The remaining two-thirds of the book is a description and interpretation of the annual ritual cycle as observed in the village of Landing in the Saa District, Nan Province. Davis made use of the method of direct observation and interviews with the ritual specialist in whose house he lived. These observations were then supplemented with a number of written Buddhist texts as used in Muang rituals.

Davis viewed the documentation of these rituals and myths as his primary task. In this respect, he has certainly left us a work of considerable documentary value. His second task was to interpret Muang ritual by demonstrating the structural symbolic themes that he had recognized in Muang metaphysics. Ritual is seen by Davis 'as a form of art; as a projective system, giving external expression to subjective (emotional) processes. Since ritual is apparently non-rational behavior, it demands an approach which is more interpretive than explanatory' (p. 15). The symbolic themes that he recognized were the dualistic notions of high-low, man-woman, senior-junior. These can be observed in their hierarchical value as emotional expressions in a matrilineal society, which is characterized by male dominance, however.

The book is moreover quite readable as a fine introduction to Muang culture for a broader audience.

Second in this series of monographs on Thai ethnography is the book by Gehan Wijeyewardene. This work is based on fieldwork carried out in the mid-1970s. It involved a six-month stay in the monastery of the Provincial Ecclesiastical Head of Nan Province and a three-month period of fieldwork in Chiang Mai, where the author attended rituals and recorded spirit-mediums. The book gives some vivid descriptions of temple ceremonies and possession rites. Because of the empirical data presented in it, it complements the above-mentioned study by Davis.

Wijeyewardene's interpretation indicates that he struggled with the choice of a theory to explain the effects of magical acts and the sources of possession. Where the author relies on the ideas of Sigmund Freud, his interpretations of both the theory and the observed phenomena (in a matrilineal society) are rather weak. The elaborations along the lines of Weber and/or Lévi-Strauss are sociologically more illuminating. While

these scholars are mentioned in the book, references to specific works by them can hardly be found in the Bibliography. Nor does Wijeyewardene refer to, for example, Victor Turner, who has spent so much of his energy in coping with these questions.

Jacques van Doorn and Willem J. Hendrix, *The Process of Decolonization 1945-1975; The Military Experience in Comparative Perspective*, CASP Publications no. 17, Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam, 1987, 46 pp.

P.M.H. GROEN

The book *Ontsporing van Geweld* earned the authors J.A.A. van Doorn and W.J. Hendrix a sound and favourable reputation when it was published in 1970. It was the first survey in which an attempt was made to uncover the origins of the excesses of violence by the Dutch military in the conflict with the Indonesian Republic. In 1983 a second edition appeared, with a different introduction. This introduction has now been published by itself in the CASP series, issued by the Erasmus University.

The authors examine and compare military violence as used by several European countries in the course of their withdrawal from African and Asian colonies. They begin with an explanation of the different decolonization processes which took place in the French, British, Portuguese and Dutch empires. According to Van Doorn and Hendrix, the internal factors responsible for these differences were: different colonial philosophies, the varying strength and maturity of the various nationalist movements, and the differences in composition of the populations of colonial regions, while the external factor that determined whether the course of the decolonization process was hostile or peaceful was the imminent war between the super-powers.

Next, they examine the special character of decolonization wars as a struggle for authority over the indigenous population. Indigenous resistance was aimed especially at middlemen and at elements of the local population which cooperated with the colonial government. The colonial authorities tried to win the loyalty of the indigenous population by breaking its resistance by military means and with socio-economic reform programmes designed for this purpose. That colonial troops violated military law so often during the decolonization wars was, according to the authors, due to the fact that intelligence was vital to a successful contra-guerilla war. Moreover, the *guerre de renseignement* was conducted by special forces and intelligence units almost entirely recruited from among threatened colonial interest groups. Lastly, the Second World War had damaged professional military ethics and stimulated the scientification of warfare. Besides, certain kinds of excessive violence seemed functional in these guerilla wars. Finally, a statement is made, by way of tentative conclusion, about the comparatively clear conscience with which the Dutch quit Indonesia.

In this survey, Van Doorn and Hendrix continue their study of the way in which European governments and military authorities have tried to cover up excesses of violence during the decolonization wars – a subject which has enjoyed widespread coverage in the European press since the late sixties. Although they only skim the surface in this short survey, a separate edition of this introduction is justified. Its power lies in the historical links they are daring enough to establish, and the many questions they raise with respect to military decolonization processes in Asia and Africa.

Luis H. Daal en Ted Schouten, *Antilliaans verhaal*. Zutphen: De Walburg Pers, 1988

ROSEMARIJN HOEFTE

KONINKLIJK INSTITUUT VOOR TAAL-, LAND- EN VOLKENKUNDE

Net als in de boeiende televisieserie met dezelfde naam gaat het boek *Antilliaans verhaal* niet over de traditioneel breed uitgemeten helden- of wandaden van Nederlanders overzee. In boek en documentaire staan het leven en de cultuur van de Antillianen centraal. Ondanks het feit dat het papiaments de belangrijkste steunpilaar van deze eigen cultuur is, met als gevolg dat een audiovisueel medium als de televisie nog duidelijker het specifieke Antilliaanse karakter kan onderstrepen, is het boek ook een succesvolle presentatie van het Antilliaans verhaal vanuit de eigen optiek.

Het was geen gemakkelijke taak die de schrijvers Luis Daal en Ted Schouten op zich namen. Het valt immers niet mee om op een beknopte en heldere wijze '200 miljoen jaar' geschiedenis in ongeveer 160 pagina's weer te geven. (Natuurlijk behandelt het leeuwedeel van dit werk de laatste 500 jaar, maar de eerste twee hoofdstukken hebben een duidelijke functie, bijvoorbeeld om de geofysische verscheidenheid van de zes eilanden aan te geven.) In ieder geval zijn de auteurs er wonderwel in geslaagd een zeer leesbaar boek te schrijven. Ze hebben gekozen voor een chronologische en thematische opzet in twintig hoofdstukken, die ook afzonderlijk te lezen zijn.

Bij dit soort algemeen historische boeken is het haast onvermijdelijk dat de lezer niet altijd gelukkig is met de keuze der auteurs betreffende het al of niet benadrukken van bepaalde gebeurtenissen. Soms wordt de beschrijving onnodig gedetailleerd (p. 112), terwijl in andere alinea's de samenhang verloren dreigt te gaan als een iets te grove penseel gehanteerd wordt (Hoofdstuk III). Toch is het geheel evenwichtig en het werk stimuleert tot verder lezen. Daartoe is een beknopte bibliografie opgenomen die de weg wijst naar verdere literatuur.

Dit prachtig geïllustreerde boek is duidelijk bedoeld om Antillianen vertrouwd te maken met hun eigen geschiedenis. Maar ook Europese Nederlanders zouden het Antilliaanse verhaal tot de verplichte literatuur

moeten rekenen om hun Koninkrijkspartners beter te leren kennen, want 'onbekend maakt onbemind' volgens een oer-Hollands gezegde. Daal en Schouten hebben ook een belangrijke bijdrage geleverd om dit laatste gevaar te bestrijden.

Claudine Salmon (ed.), *Literary Migrations; Traditional Chinese Fiction in Asia (17th-20th centuries)*, Beijing: International Culture Publishing Corporation, 1987, 11 + vi + 661 pp.

W.L. IDEMA

Chinese vernacular fiction has exercised a great influence on the literatures of other countries in East and Southeast Asia since its inception. The *Pak T'ongsae onhae*, a Korean handbook for Chinese conversation in the fifteenth century (later revised), already contains a passage in which a Korean visitor to Peking, who would like to buy the Four Books and the Six Classics, is urged instead to buy *pinghua* because they offer a good read. In fact, many rare works of Chinese fiction have only been preserved outside China, especially in Japanese collections. In these surrounding countries, Chinese vernacular fiction was not only read and imitated, but was also translated, at times on a massive scale. Since the seventeenth century, Chinese vernacular fiction has been translated into Korean, Japanese, Manchu, Mongolian and Vietnamese. From the nineteenth century, traditional Chinese novels were also translated into Thai, Cambodian, Javanese and Malay. The editor of the volume under review, Dr. Salmon, has published extensively on the Malay translations of traditional Chinese novels; the results of her earlier research in this field are summarized in her extremely important monograph *Literature in Malay by the Chinese of Indonesia, a Provisional Annotated Bibliography* (Paris, 1981), to which many contributions in this volume repeatedly refer. The present collective enterprise, which was begun in 1981, aims at providing a general survey for each of the regions concerned and should interest not only students of vernacular Chinese fiction and the regional literatures concerned, but also especially scholars in the field of comparative literature.

The individual contributions vary greatly in length, ranging from brief notices to extensive bibliographic surveys, preceded by incisive introductions. The papers are grouped together in four sections, as follows: 'Korea and Japan', 'Mainland Northeast Asia', 'Mainland Southeast Asia', and 'Insular Southeast Asia'. This latter section contains three articles by the editor herself, entitled: 'A Note on Javanese Works Derived from Chinese Fiction' (pp. 373-94), 'Malay Translations of Chinese Fiction in Indonesia' (pp. 395-440), and 'Writings in Romanized Malay by the Chinese of Malaya: A Preliminary Inquiry' (pp. 441-96). Together with Gilbert Hamonic, Dr. Salmon further contributed 'Translations of Chinese Fiction into Makassarese' (pp. 569-87). Leo Suryadinata's 'Postwar Kongfu Novels in Indonesia; A Preliminary Survey' (pp. 623-55) is likewise very broad in

scope. The three remaining articles in this section deal with more specific themes. Eric M. Oey, in his '*Lie Sie Bin Yoe Tee Hoe: Six Malay/Indonesian Translations of a Chinese Tale*' (pp. 497-527), compares the different renditions of the chapters from the *Xiyouji* which describe Li Shimin's visit to the Underworld. Korean adaptations of this theme are also one of the subjects discussed by A.F. Trotceвич in her 'The Plots of Chinese Fiction in Korean Vernacular Novels' (pp. 85-105). The two remaining articles in this section both deal with adaptations of the same romantic legend. George Quinn, in his 'Liang Shanbo and Zhu Yingtai: A Chinese Folk Romance in Java and Bali' (pp. 530-68), points out that this tale of star-crossed lovers is quite popular in popular Javanese theatre, and that its performance often appears to be an expression of anti-Chinese sentiment. Dédé Oetomo, in her 'Sam Pek - Eng Tay, A Chinese Love Story in Madurese' (pp. 593-622), discusses a Madurese version of this legend, which turns out to be a faithful translation of a Javanese version of 1928.

The other sections consist of three articles each. In the section 'Mainland Southeast Asia', Yan Bao discusses 'The Influence of Chinese Fiction on Vietnamese Literature' (pp. 265-316), while Jacques Nepote and Khing Hoc Dy treat 'Chinese Literary Influence on Cambodia in the 19th and 20th Centuries' (pp. 321-72). These two long and learned articles are separated by a very brief note by Prapin Manomaivibool on 'Thai Translations of Chinese Literary Works' (pp. 317-20). In the section on 'Mainland Northeast Asia' the two contributions by Martin Gimm and Boris Riftin stand out. Professor Gimm contributed 'The Manchu Translations of Chinese Novels and Short Stories - An Attempt at an Inventory' (pp. 143-208), which has its counterpart in Professor Riftin's 'Mongolian Translations of Old Chinese Novels and Stories - A Tentative Bibliographic Survey' (pp. 213-62). Both articles provide a wealth of material in a highly condensed format. The section on 'Korea and Japan' suffers by comparison. Both the article by Kim Dong-uk, 'The Influence of Chinese Stories and Novels on Korean Fiction' (pp. 55-79), and that by Oki Yasushi and Otsuka Hidetaka, 'Chinese Colloquial Novels in Japan - Mainly During the Edo Period (1603-1867)' (pp. 106-140), do a creditable job in presenting a survey of the relevant developments in Korea and Japan respectively, but especially the latter article cannot claim the same measure of originality as some of the other contributions to this volume. We have already had occasion to refer to the contribution by Dr. Trotceвич; apart from Korean adaptations of Li Shimin's visit to Hell, she also briefly discusses a Korean adaptation of the legend of Liang Shanbo and Zhu Yingtai, and of the saga of Xue Rengui, a seventh-century Chinese general who fought his campaigns in Korea.

The four regional sections are preceded by a highly stimulating introduction (pp. 1-51) by the editor, in which she points out some interesting correspondences and differences in the reception of Chinese fiction in each of the countries concerned. In regions where classical Chinese was an important medium of communication like Korea, Japan and Vietnam, the introduction of vernacular fiction was facilitated by the prior popularity of classical Chinese fiction. In insular Southeast Asia, an important role in the translation of Chinese vernacular fiction was played by bilingual

native Chinese. Occasionally, a story of Chinese provenance achieved much greater popularity outside China than it ever appears to have possessed inside China. Everywhere the popularity of historical and military romances, which are usually passed over quickly in modern Chinese histories of vernacular fiction, is quite remarkable. In Southeast Asia this popularity rapidly resulted in an even greater popularity of Chinese 'cloak-and-dagger fiction' (*wuxia xiaoshuo*). Occasionally, Chinese prose fiction was translated into local narrative poetry forms.

In her introduction, Dr. Salmon discusses the popularity of certain genres of vernacular fiction with translators, with reference to Sun Kaidi's well-known thematic classification of traditional novels in his *Zhongguo tongsu xiaoshuo shumu* (pp. 10-18). While this is certainly useful, it might have been advisable to combine this discussion with an inquiry into the language of these popular works. Some fifteen years ago I proposed a broad distinction within Chinese vernacular fiction between 'literary novels' and 'chapbook fiction'. While I admit that such a distinction might be much further refined, I am still convinced it has a useful function. The translators, it would appear, largely shunned the 'literary novels' and overwhelmingly opted for works written in a very simple and straightforward idiom, usually very close to the classical language, either because their command of the living vernacular was inadequate (e.g. in Tokugawa Japan), or because the stories of 'chapbook fiction' were more popular with their potential public (this may often have been the case in insular Southeast Asia). By contrast, both the *Jin Ping Mei* and *Honglou meng* were translated into Manchu and Mongolian at a relatively early stage. If the *Sanguo zhi yanyi* was universally popular with translators, it was probably so not only because of its contents, but also because of the intelligibility of its language to any translator with a limited schooling in classical Chinese and/or limited command of the living colloquial language.

While Dr. Salmon discusses the possible existence of translations into Spanish by native Chinese in the Philippines at some length, and notes an early translation into English by Chinese in Burma (pp. 8-9), she does not mention the existence of at least one major Dutch translation of a Chinese novel, by a prominent representative of the Dutch-educated native Chinese community in the Dutch East Indies. While some of Nio Joe Lan's articles are cited in this volume, there is no reference to his Dutch adaptation of the *Fengshen yanyi* as *Feng Shen, De Verheffing tot Goden* (Batavia, 1940).

As I am barely acquainted with any of the many non-Chinese literatures discussed in this volume, I can only marvel at the wealth of material that is presented in virtually every contribution. It is clear that further research on individual translations and adaptations will not only help to bring out the national characteristics of the various non-Chinese literatures concerned, but will also aid in establishing the distinctive features of Chinese narrative. This publication provides an excellent basis for such contrastive research. Its appearance is very timely, as comparative literature is a rapidly expanding field of scholarship in China. A Chinese-language version of the volume under review is also scheduled to appear soon.

Sharon A. Carstens (ed.), *Cultural Identity in Northern Peninsular Malaysia*, Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series No. 63, 1986. 91 pp., prijs US \$ 9.—. ISBN 0-89680-116-0.

P.E. DE JOSSELIN DE JONG

In deze bundel worden vijf voordrachten gepubliceerd die de auteurs, allen Amerikaanse antropologen, oorspronkelijk hadden uitgesproken op de in 1980 gehouden jaarvergadering van de American Anthropological Association. Vijf hoofdstukken (met noten en literatuurverwijzingen) plus een Inleiding in een bundel van 91 bladzijden laat elke schrijver weinig ruimte om zijn of haar gegevens en de interpretatie daarvan voldoende uiteen te zetten. Hoewel alle bijdragen inhoudelijk van belang zijn, speelt het ruimtegebrek ook bij alle vijf een rol: in de hoofdstukken II, III en V wordt dit probleem beter opgelost dan in I en IV.

Het gemeenschappelijke thema van de hier verzamelde 'papers' wordt duidelijk aangegeven in de Introduction, door Carstens als Editor. De inter-etnische spanningen in Maleisië zijn maar al te zeer bekend, en niet verwonderlijk in een land waar Maleiers 53%, Chinezen 35% en Indiërs 11% van de bevolking uitmaken. Alleen hoofdstuk V behandelt dit probleem; de andere bespreken sociale problemen binnen de Maleise bevolkingsgroep. Regionaal concentreren alle hoofdstukken zich op de noordwestelijke deelstaat Kedah en de noordoostelijke, Kelantan. Dit zijn allebei nogal geïsoleerde gebieden met een economie die overwegend op de landbouw gebaseerd is en met een hoog percentage Maleise inwoners die zeer bewust 'local regional traditions' in ere houden (p. 4).

Verder is de wijze waarop de bewoners van die gebieden zelf hun situatie en hun problemen waarnemen een centraal thema van elk hoofdstuk.

Zo bespreekt, in Hst. I, David J. Banks de visie op de Islam van de Maleiers van Sik, een district in Kedah, aan de hand van vier romans door Shahnnon Ahmad. Wij mogen *en passant* opmerken dat textuele antropologie (d.w.z. het achterhalen van de visie der participanten in een samenleving door bestudering van de uit die samenleving voortgekomen, mondelinge of schriftelijke, literatuur) tegenwoordig ook door ingezetenen van Maleisië zelf beoefend wordt: zie bijv. zulke studies door Umar Junus.

David Banks' streven is, de visie op Sik van de romanschrijver te vergelijken met zijn eigen bevindingen als antropoloog. Helaas heeft hier het genoemde ruimtegebrek de auteur parten gespeeld, waardoor de analyse van de romans noch de confrontatie van beide visies voldoende uit de verf komt. Het resultaat van deze studie is echter duidelijk geformuleerd (p. 24): het beeld dat Shahnnon Ahmad ons geeft van de Islam in Kedah staat in tegenstelling tot wat wij hebben leren kennen van Kelantan. In het laatstgenoemde gebied komen de 'chronically underpaid and underemployed' Islamitische leiders op voor de belangen van de even arme boeren; in Kedah daarentegen is, volgens de romanschrijver, het Islamitische leiderschap zwak en 'often compromised and vacillating', maar de godsdienst zelf kan zich vormen tot een 'powerful transforming force in society' (p. 25).

Barbara S. Wright beschrijft de rol van de *dalang* in Kelantan in Hst. II. Hier komen de sterke en de zwakke zijden van de hele bundel in geconcentreerde vorm aan het licht: de informatieve en scherpzinnige tekst beslaat slechts 7 van de 16 blz., terwijl er 9 bestemd moesten worden voor de 'Notes' en 'References'.

Ten aanzien van de echt-Kelantanse *wayang*, de zg. *Wayang Siam*, wordt, helder zij het beknopt, informatie verstrekt over: de bronnen van de wayang-teksten; de opleiding van de *dalang*; zijn rol in 'traditional Kelantan' (hij is ook vaak medium, sjamaan, magische genezer); zijn verhouding tot de in deze deelstaat zeer machtige Islam (waarbij Islamitische leiders beducht zijn voor het optreden van de Semar-achtige figuur van Pak Dogol, die tevens Dewa Sang Tunggal is); en zijn ambivalente sociale rol (aan de ene kant propageert hij de norm dat gedrag *lemah lembut* moet zijn, terwijl anderzijds zijn prominente positie in het dorp zijn gedrag juist 'assertive' maakt).

Over de zoëven gesuggereerde overeenkomst tussen Pak Dogol en Semar is zeker te vermelden dat de *dalang* van de *Wayang Siam* deze figuren met elkaar identificeren, wat echter bestreden wordt door *dalang* van de *Wayang Jawa* (Note 18).

In Hst. II kwam de rol van de *dalang* als genezer ter sprake. 'Magical/medical specialists', dus genezers, zijn het onderwerp van het erop volgende, zeer korte hoofdstuk (4½ blz. tekst) door Louis Golomb. Hij constateert dat in Kelantan vooral leden van de Thai, dus Buddhistische, minderheid als genezers gewild zijn, terwijl in zuidelijk Thailand juist de Maleiers uit het aangrenzende Kelantan optreden als dragers van 'alien Malay-Arab medical knowledge', die wordt toegepast ten behoeve van genezing en liefdes-magie. Met verwijzing naar o.a. E.H. Ackerknechts *A Short History of Medicine* (1955) constateert de schrijver dat zo'n situatie ook bij andere samenlevingen en in andere tijden is geconstateerd: in het middeleeuwse Europa stonden Joodse en Arabische artsen in hoog aanzien (p. 51). Hiermee wordt een interessant en belangrijk algemeen thema aan de orde gesteld, dat echter niet verder wordt uitgewerkt wegens de meer-malen genoemde factor van beperkte plaatsruimte.

Hoofdstuk IV daarentegen, door Douglas Raybeck, is al te verboos. Het bespreekt de conformiteit en afwijking in het Kelantanse dorpsleven. Na een weinig terzake doende uiteenzetting over 'labelling theory' gaat de schrijver in op twee conclusies die hij op grond van zijn veldwerkgegevens getrokken heeft. In de eerste plaats, dat het normenstelsel op staatsniveau vaak afwijkt van wat geldt op dorpsniveau: zo is smokkelen bijv. verboden volgens het eerste, maar volgens het tweede toelaatbaar. Van meer belang is zijn bespreking van de reacties der dorpelingen op 'deviants', nl. geesteszieken, homoseksuelen en prostituées. Zijn algemene conclusie is dat afwijkend gedrag binnen het dorp geduld wordt, mits het niet zo opvallend is dat het de staat van harmonie (*sesuai*) aldaar schaadt. Tegenover *orang luar* staat men echter veel meer afwerend.

Deze conclusies zijn niet opzienbarend, maar de feitelijke mededelingen over de typering van geesteszieken en de houding tegenover de drie bestudeerde soorten 'deviants' zijn origineel en verhelderend. Dit geldt ook voor de gedetailleerde beschrijving van het verloop van een twist en het

optreden der dorpelingen om een verzoening te bereiken.

In het laatste hoofdstuk bespreekt de editor zelf interetnische contacten, en wel vanuit het standpunt der (Hakka) Chinezen in het Kelantanse dorp Pulai. De belangrijkste vragen, voor de onderzoeker en voor de participanten zelf, zijn: in hoeverre is deze Chinese groep (nog) Chinees, en in hoeverre wil zij dat blijven? Wil of moet zij Malayaans worden en met de Maleiers assimileren?

Deze vragen zijn ten dele te beantwoorden door na te gaan of zulke cultuurelementen als de huizen, de kleding, het eten, de taal en de religie van het ene of het andere type zijn, of Chinees met Maleise bijmengsels (p. 80-82). Subtieler is de beantwoording vanuit de visie der participanten die zich – zo stelt de schrijfster, en wij moeten dit, bij gebrek aan adstructie, aanvaarden – in de eerste plaats zien als bewoners van Pulai, dan als Hakka Chinezen, en pas daarna als burgers van Malaysia. (De plaatselijke Maleiers zien hen als conservatieve Chinezen, en *dus* als subversieve elementen.)

Het zo vaak, ook elders, waargenomen verschijnsel, dat de vrouwen prominent zijn in het huiselijke en de mannen in het openbare leven doet zich ook hier voor. Voor 'feministische antropologen' is Carstens' toevoeging van belang: maar de ene levenssfeer geldt niet als hoger of belangrijker dan de andere (p. 84).

Een detail-gegeven leidt tenslotte tot een constatering van ruime strekking. De vrouwen dragen thuis sarongs, maar Chinese kleding in het openbaar – en *dit* is een deel van het algemene gedragspatroon van de mannen en de vrouwen. De aan het begin van het hoofdstuk gestelde vraag naar de verhouding tussen Chinees zijn en Malayaans of zelfs Maleis worden beantwoordt de Chinezen van Pulai dus door te streven naar een middenpositie.

Dit hoofdstuk doet dezelfde vraag opkomen als de bundel in haar geheel. De inhoud is van veel belang, en de gevolgtrekkingen *lijken* gebaseerd te zijn op betrouwbaar onderzoek in het veld. Maar heeft het zin het geheel in zo'n klein bestek te wringen, dat de lezer, buiten schuld van de schrijvers, zoveel in goed vertrouwen moet aannemen?

Een kleinere, maar verwante vraag is, voor wat voor lezers-(oorspronkelijk toehoorders-)publiek het geheel bestemd is? De inhoud is specialistisch van aard; gezien de bijgevoegde vertaling van alledaagse Maleise woorden als *ibu* (p. 29) e.d. wordt echter geen kennis van Malaysia of Indonesië verondersteld. De 'message' had een beter 'medium' verdiend.

Robert Wessing, *The Soul of Ambiguity: The Tiger in Southeast Asia*. Northern Illinois University, Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Special Report No. 24, 1986. 148 pp., Glossary, Bibliography.

P. E. DE JOSSELIN DE JONG

The data in this book (the principal merit of which is the very compre-

hensive presentation of factual data) are due to extensive library research – see the 23 pages of the bibliography – and to the author's fieldwork in the Gayo area (mentioned on, e.g., p.5), the Sunda region of West Java (e.g., pp. 39, 60) and eastern Java (e.g., p. 102).

The first chapter deals with the tiger-man relationship in daily life. It sets the theme for the whole book, because this relationship is, in actual fact, 'ambiguous'. On the one hand, it is close, and even symbiotic: tiger and man occupy the same ecological niche, viz. the edge of the forest; both are fond of bathing and therefore seek water; and tigers assist man, as they hunt herbivores which would otherwise eat the crops planted by humans. They seldom attack cattle, unless forced to do so because men have been killing the game excessively. The danger of tigers, one could say, is actually the danger of *homo*, ironically nicknamed *sapiens*, to other creatures and to himself.

Next we pass from the *ordre vécu* to the *ordre conçu*, i.e., to the chapters dealing with man's attitude towards tigers, apparent in beliefs and practices, e.g. rituals. Chapter II, 'The Symbolic Tiger', is based on myths and other tales. Man and tiger have a common ancestry. Tigers were originally chased out of human society into the forest – and this explains why they still prefer to live at the forest's edge. The ambiguity theme is thus also clear in these tales: tigers are, by descent and by their habitat, close to, but not members of, human society.

The next chapter distinguishes 'were-tigers' from 'tiger familiars'. The souls of prominent ancestors (kings, shamans, heroes: p. 30) can come to help their descendants, assuming the form of tigers; these souls do not become real tigers, but can be designated as 'were-tigers'. By contrast a real tiger can have affinity with a human individual, and become that person's 'familiar' (63, 64). Later in this chapter the author discusses a special case, which he calls the 'true-were-tiger': 'real people who transform themselves into tigers through the use of magic' (74 ff.).

Chapter IV presents data on 'Tiger Villages' in several western Indonesian regions. In the Gayo village of Daya and in Kerinci members of certain families are believed to become tigers after death. This transformation is not due to magic, but is a hereditary quality. Comparable data are found in Haji Zaba's well-known article on 'tiger-breed families' in Negri Sembilan, Malaysia (38). A similar belief was encountered concerning Gunung Ledang, and in Lamongan, near Probolinggo. In the East Javanese village of Lodoyo (in Blitar), becoming a tiger 'is clearly accomplished by magic . . . Magic, however, has a price . . . which may well be . . . becoming a were-tiger after death as well as in life' (p. 103).

This leads to chapter V, 'The Soul'. Introductory remarks on the belief that a person has more than one soul bring us once more to the tiger beliefs discussed in chapter III: 'Familiars are possible because the soul continues to exist independently and has the capacity to return. Thus, rather than being a person's double . . . the tiger familiar is a manifestation of a soul that has direct links with the persons to whom it is manifested' (109).

So far we have all too briefly summarized the contents of the first five chapters, leaving out almost any mention of the rich store of ethno-

graphic data (and such fascinating interludes as the notes on the import of Tiger balm and Tiger Beer, p. 53). To remedy this, we shall devote a little more space to the final chapter, 'Conclusions'. Another reason for doing so is that here (some readers may say: at last!) the wealth of factual information is drawn together and ordered, to form a coherent picture.

The ambiguity of the tiger-man relationship in the 'natural world', discussed in the first chapter, is reflected in the stories which place the tiger in opposition to the mouse-deer (*kancil*), who purports to be acting as the representative of the king, while the tiger wants to take this role for himself. The tiger, therefore, is not within the social, human order, but neither is he entirely foreign to it. Ambiguity pervades every aspect of the relationship. The shaman, for instance, mediates between the people and the ancestors. The shaman's spirit can manifest itself as a tiger, an animal of the forest's edge, hence equally ambiguous as, in its turn, the forest itself: the forest is dangerous, a place of savagery, but 'also the source of healing herbs which the shaman needs in curing' (112).

The ambiguity – in some cases it is better to call it 'liminality' – of the tiger could be summarized as follows: within the system, he protects, guards, and guides, but outside the system he is a source of danger. We see this reflected in the means adopted by humans to contact tigers: the calling of the *ancestral* tigers is done either in the house-yard or at a grave – two marked, bounded localities – while tiger *magic* is practised in the dangerous, uncontrolled forest (115). Time and again, the basic opposition between 'the two main categories of tiger beliefs . . . is between the forest and the village, between wild and civilized' (116). Some readers would certainly add: between nature and culture.

Chapter VI, therefore, draws the various strands together. As we said at the beginning of the review, the first five chapters are principally a treasure-house of ethnographic information. They are written cautiously: the author limits himself almost entirely to giving an account of the data in the existing literature or acquired during his fieldwork. In the few instances where he voices his own opinion (e.g., pp. 45, 110, etc.), this is usually to point out inconsistencies in previous accounts.

To conclude, we should remark on one feature. The subtitle, 'The Tiger in Southeast Asia', is well chosen, for although the data are principally from Malaysia, Sumatra and Java, some also refer to East or continental South-East Asian societies, such as the Naga and others, which lie outside the Indonesian Field of Anthropological Study. These are, on the whole, random, individual items of information, which will make at least some readers wonder whether any *system* of beliefs is to be discerned in 'Southeast Asia' as a whole. The book raises this question, but does so implicitly, and certainly does not answer it. In this respect, this valuable publication itself is a *Soul of Ambiguity*: it is eminently informative for everyone, but on account of what it does not discuss, it may be irritating to some readers, while it will be stimulating for others.

Martine Segalen, *Historical anthropology of the family*, Cambridge University Press, 1986, 328 pp.

G.W. LOCHER

This book is a translation of *Sociologie de la famille* (1981), with various additions, especially to the bibliography following each chapter. It forms part of the series 'Themes in the Social Sciences', edited by Jack Goody and Geoffrey Hawthorn. The aim of this series is to publish books focused on topics of general and interdisciplinary interest in the social sciences. Segalen's book proves to be a very good choice on the part of the editors.

In his foreword, the anthropologist Jack Goody — who also wrote a book on *The development of the family and marriage in Europe* (1983) — points out that Martine Segalen combines interests of an anthropological, sociological, historical and demographic kind. Not only is the result truly interdisciplinary, but a new field seems to be established whereby the earlier boundaries between anthropology, sociology and history are cross-cut. Goody also emphasizes how the continental European background affords a perspective distinct from that of much Anglo-American sociological writing. At the same time, the author is very well acquainted with the work done in English-speaking areas, concerning both the present and the past of her subject matter. Martine Segalen occupies a central position in the so-called 'Ethnologie de la France'. In the series 'Que sais-je?' she published an informative introduction to this field of study, together with Jean Cuisenier (*Ethnologie de la France*, 1986). In the academic world she has become well-known for her book *Quinze générations de Bas-Bretons. Parenté et société dans le pays bigouden Sud, 1720-1980* (1985). It is based on long and intensive fieldwork by Segalen in Brittany, her historical study of that culture area, and the insights of a comparative anthropological and sociological approach. The author not only is specialized in the study of peasant societies, but also has an extensive knowledge of urban society. In *Histoire de la famille* (two volumes, 1986), of which she is one of four editors¹, she contributed among others an article under the title 'La révolution industrielle: Du prolétaire au bourgeois'.

Historical anthropology of the family does not have the wide range of the *Histoire de la famille*. Culture areas outside Europe, such as China, Japan, India and the Islamic world, are hardly mentioned, if at all. When she wrote the book, Segalen was, however, familiar with publications that also cover these cultures, such as William Goode's *World Revolution and Family Patterns* (1963), a book regarded by her 'as a pioneer sociology listening to history and social anthropology' (p. 8).

A better understanding of the contemporary family seems to be the main purpose of the book under review. In the first part ('The area of kinship'), the author elucidates the structural relationships between family, domestic group and kinship. It is based on anthropological concepts in particular.

¹ *Histoire de la famille*, sous la direction de: André Burguière, Christine Klapisch-Zuber, Martine Segalen, Françoise Zonabend; Vol. 1, *Mondes lointains, mondes anciens* (Préfaces: Claude Lévi-Strauss, Georges Duby), Vol. 2, *Le choc des modernités* (Préface: Jack Goody), 640 + 560 pp. Armand Colin, 1986.

The type of family pattern in our own society then comes to be seen as simply one possible variant in the whole range of cultures, although not a completely accidental kind of grouping. The second part ('The making of the domestic group') is centred on the make-up of the family, on marriage and on the birth of children. In the third part ('Domestic roles and activities') the roles and activities of spouses are dealt with, especially in modern times. The relationships between family and society are discussed in a final chapter. At the end of the book, Segalen emphasizes the changing status of women and briefly considers the question of the family and social destiny.

As was stated above, the attention is focused on Western society. Forms of marriage such as polygamy are not discussed, although in the French edition the term '*polygamie successive*' is used for the frequent remarriages in our society (the English translation has '*serial monogamy*'). In the past, the domestic group was constantly threatened by the dangers of mortality. If a spouse died, the survivor quickly remarried, since this was imperative if a household which was identical with the farm and was based on the mutually complementary work of a husband and wife was to remain in existence. Thus, in order to maintain a domestic group that was identical with the unit of production, a multiplicity of unions, to some degree reminiscent of the spate of divorces and remarriages in our time, was formed (cf. pp. 32-36).

Throughout the book it appears that the author rejects generalizing, sweeping statements about subjects like the stability of the old domestic group, the size of the traditional family, or the early age of marriage in earlier times. Discussing the family in French peasant society over the past centuries, she accentuates the differences between various areas and the need to know their cultural traditions and socio-economic structures. In her view, it is evident that in the past there was a great variety of different family structures within a wide range of different demographic, economic and cultural frameworks, as distinctive for each individual society.

We find the same approach in the treatment of the family, the domestic group and kinship in modern industrialized society. Two influential approaches to the family are vigorously criticized by Segalen. According to the one, the family is undergoing a crisis, and is seen to be 'disintegrating' and being 'impoverished' by the loss of its former multiplicity of functions. According to the other, the nuclear family is a refuge, wielding inordinate power, since it has a virtual monopoly of emotional power in an emotionally starved society. Neither does the author agree with the general statements that nowadays we marry for love, whereas in the past people married for pecuniary or other advantages, and that now we choose a spouse ourselves, whereas in the past marriages were arranged by parents.

The popular ideology of the nuclear family in our culture has for a long time prevented us from seeing the relations between kinship and urban society, including the phenomenon of kinship networks. Segalen writes: 'As was the case with urban [read: rural] environments the concept of lines and kindred groups is relevant to the analysis of kinship in urban environments' (p. 89).

In general, the author's own view on the family is as follows: 'As an

institution, the family can both resist and adapt. It has lived through all the changes, both economic and social, that have brought Western societies from the stage of a peasant to that of an industrial economy ... Instead of analyzing it in terms of a "crisis", we should try to discover how the family has lived through the economic, social and cultural upheavals of the past hundred and fifty years, how it has resisted them, and how it has contributed to them' (pp. 2-3).

At the end of this stimulating book, the plural approach is in evidence again. Today, Segalen says, family structures are tending to diversify. Then she goes on to explain how the domestic groups of divorced people are made up of one parent (most often the mother) and her children. The relationship with the new spouse or partner is usually more or less stable. This is resulting in a new, matrifocally based structural model, and it is remarkable that this is now accepted by the social norm, along with that of the classical nuclear domestic group.

Hans Kähler †, *Enggano-Deutsches Wörterbuch. Aus dem Nachlaß herausgegeben und mit einem Deutsch-Enggano-Wörterverzeichnis versehen von Hans Schmidt*, Veröffentlichungen des Seminars für Indonesische und Südseesprachen der Universität Hamburg, Band 14, Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1987. XIII + 404 pp.

BERND NOTHOFER

The dictionary consists of material collected by Hans Kähler (K) in 1937. Hans Schmidt (S), a student at the Seminar für Indonesische und Südseesprachen at the University of Hamburg, used the card indexes left behind by K, who died in 1983, to compile this book. According to the foreword by Pink, K had analysed his data to such a degree that the dictionary can justifiably be considered his work. S's task consisted in the following: 1) the collection of new entries on the basis of Kähler (1955-1964), 2) a determination of the roots of some words particularly marked by K, 3) a specification of the roots in cases in which K used stems as main entries, 4) the insertion of references to illustrations and descriptions in the ethnographic literature wherever this was considered necessary for a proper comprehension, and 5) the compilation of a German-Enggano glossary.

Besides offering a rich inventory of dialectal forms, this dictionary, which contains approximately 3400 entries, also presents valuable historical information: wherever K assumed cognate relationships, the relevant entries are followed by etyma of reconstructed languages (such as Proto-Austronesian or Proto-Malayo-Polynesian) or by cognates from other Austronesian languages. (S did not hesitate, however, to question some of these cognate relationships posited by K by adding question marks in instances which he considered doubtful.) Furthermore, wherever K posited borrowing relationships, the entries are marked accordingly and possible donor-languages are indicated. The presentation of these etymological

data constitutes one of the major merits of this book. However, in some cases the assumptions made are more than questionable. Some examples are: p. 9: En. *ʔai* 'we' is treated as continuing PAN *kami* 'id.', although **m* regularly appears as En. *b*; p. 43: En. *dio* 'tongue' is regarded as a reflex of PAN *dilaq* 'id.', although **l* and **a* regularly become En. *d* and *a* respectively; p. 211: En. *eoaba* 'vapour, smoke' is assumed to continue PMP *quab*, although **-b* regularly is lost and no explanation for the additional vowel can be given; p. 212: En. *oapo* is said to be a reflex of PAN *Suab*, although there is no explanation for the occurrence of En. *p* for **-b* and the additional vowel.

It also occurs that no etymon is mentioned even in cases where Enggano appears to have a word which directly continues a PAN etymon, e.g. En. *ekaka@etaka* (pp. 115, 276) 'human being' probably derives from PAN **qa* (R)(CtT)a 'outsiders, alien people', and En. *ebobo* 'lungs' (p. 28) should be treated as being a reflex of PAN *baRaq* 'id.'. Often Malay (Ml.) is cited as the source of a particular Enggano loan, although Minangkabau (Mi.) could also be regarded as the donor-language, e.g.: En. *ebawa* 'onion' (p. 26) is considered to be a borrowing from Ml. *bawan* 'id.', although Mi. has an identical form. Also, forms such as En. *ebeduʔu* 'boat' (p. 26) may originate from either Ml. *biduʔ* or Mi. *biduʔ* 'id.', since Mi. *uʔ* can be interpreted as having been reduced to En. *u*. A form such as En. *ebuba* 'porridge' (p. 30), which is said to originate from Ml. *bubur* 'id.', is more likely to be a borrowing from Mi. *bubuʔ*, since En. *u* can easily be explained as being an adaption of Mi. *-uʔ*. Further evidence in support of this interpretation is provided by material which shows that Ml. *-r* often becomes En. *d*, e.g.: En. *edayada* 'sail' (p. 39) probably is from Ml. *layar* 'id.'.

As has just been indicated, the book assumes Malay to be a donor-language for Enggano. The Malay dialect used in the citations is said to be the predecessor of today's Bahasa Indonesia (cf. p. VIII: 'heute BI'), i.e., a dialect which has *a* as reflex of **-a*. However, it seems more plausible, if we assume that a Malay dialect was indeed the source of Enggano words, to posit Bengkulu Malay as the donor-dialect, since it has – just like Minangkabau – *o* as reflex of **-a*. Thus, En. *emūō* 'flower' (p. 195) is treated as a loan from Malay, although it should be considered as a borrowing rather from Bengkulu Malay or Minangkabau; similarly, En. *kudo* 'horse' (p. 176) should be regarded as a borrowing from either Minangkabau or Bengkulu Malay, rather than being treated as having Minangkabau as its only possible source.

It is most interesting to compare K's data with those collected by the author of this review (N) in 1986 in interviews with an Enggano informant (29 years old) in Padang. Among the most striking differences are the following: morpheme-final vowels and morpheme-final sequences of vowels recorded by K are not found in the new data. This observation holds both for inherited and for borrowed material, e.g., 'four': (K) *ʔaopa*, (N) *ʔap*; 'possessive pronoun: 1. ps. sg.': (K) *ʔVu* (V @ final vowel of preceding noun), (N) *-ʔ*; 'to smoke': (K) *nūkōʔō*, (N) *nūkōʔ* (from Ml. *rokok* 'id.'). In sequences such as noun + possessive pronoun the final vowel of the noun appears in both K's and N's material, e.g. 'my house': (K) *eubaʔau*, (N)

yuba? Where a head is followed by a nominal modifier, however, the data do show differences: where in K's material the head has a final vowel and the modifier is preceded by *u-*, in N's corpus these two elements do not appear, e.g., 'sun (= eye of the day)': (K) *ebaka u-kahaʔo*, (N) *bakahaʔ*. A detailed analysis of the differences between the data recorded by K and by N will become available with the publication of S's Master's thesis, which will concern itself with a comparison of Enggano as recorded in 1937 and in 1986.

K's dictionary is a valuable contribution to Austronesian linguistics, since it provides information on a vanishing and rarely studied language which is useful to those interested both in synchronic and diachronic research in this field.

REFERENCES

- Kähler, H., 1955-1964, 'Ein Text von der Insel Enggano', *Afrika und Übersee* 39 (1955): 89-94; 41 (1957):153-156; 42 (1958):179-189; 43 (1960):299-312; 44 (1960):41-71; 45 (1961):205-225; 46 (1962):127-145; 48 (1964):46-58.

Brigitte Renard-Clamagirand, *Marobo; Une société ema de Timor*. Langues et civilisations de l'Asie du sud-est et du monde insulindien no. 12, Paris: Sela, 1983, 490 pp. ISBN 2-85297-123-2.

J.D.M. PLATENKAMP

When in 1935 F.A.E. van Wouden set out to demonstrate the intrinsic unity of social and cosmological representations in Eastern Indonesian societies, one of the basic problems he faced was the lack of precise ethnographic data collected by professionally trained anthropologists in the course of extensive periods of fieldwork. As regards East Timor, this gap is now being filled by, for instance, the studies of the Bunaq by C. Friedberg-Berthe (e.g., 1980), of the Tetum by D. Hicks (e.g., 1984), of the Mambai by E. Traube (1986), and of the Ema by B. Renard-Clamagirand.

Prior to the withdrawal of the Portuguese from East Timor, the approx. 50.000 Ema occupied an area between the territory of the Bunaq, the Tutukede and the Mambai. Renard-Clamagirand's study of the Ema living in the Marobo region is an important contribution to the ethnography of Timor. It provides such a wealth of data for the comparative analysis of Indonesian societies that a review can hardly do justice to it.

As George Condominas remarks in his preface, prominent social characteristics of other societies in the Indonesian field of anthropological (or ethnological, but not 'ethological', cf. p. 11, note 3) study also mark the socio-religious structure of Ema society. These include the basic concept of 'house', elaborate dual classifications, asymmetric alliance systems, and - it should be added - a marked ideological contrast between patrilineal

and matrilineal notions of descent (cf. J.J. Fox 1980, P.E. de Josselin de Jong 1984).

The study falls into two parts. Part one, devoted to the social organization, discusses the types of 'houses' and the relationships uniting these into an overall socio-political system. The second part provides an extensive description of the various rituals which punctuate Ema socio-religious life. This division reflects the two poles around which Ema life revolves.

Chapter 1 describes the village lay-out, the types of fields, and the construction and internal arrangement of village houses. The house, with its male-female axes reminiscent of those in other parts of Indonesia, encompasses both the living and the ancestors. The sacred objects of the latter provide houses with particular identities. The following chapters focus upon the two major types of relationship that connect houses to one another: that between 'elder and younger brother', and that between the wife-giving and wife-taking group. The enduring nature of Ema society is expressed in the permanent maintenance of its major houses, and a person's position within the social structure is defined by his relationship to the house's ancestors. These relationships are designated by the construct *uma ubun*, 'member of the house'. The term *ubun*, however, seems to connote intrinsically hierarchical relationships of much wider relevance, defined by the author as 'maintaining a privileged position to something', but also as 'master' (p.65). I will return to this below.

Ubun relationships between 'elder and younger' brother houses group them into 'clans'. The classification of these clans into immigrant ones (whose ancestors 'went a long way') and autochthonous ones (whose ancestors 'emerged from the earth') conforms to what may be a fundamental Indonesian, or even Austronesian, pattern. It is the chiefs of the immigrant clans who share the power in Marobo. This power encompasses ritual power as well as that over the circulation of valuables and women via asymmetric alliance relationships. However, the social structure is not a static one. Processes of fission between 'elder and younger brother' houses make for the establishment of new houses. It is significant that this is dependent upon the ability of houses to initiate new affinal relationships. In such cases the mutual exclusiveness of the elder/younger brother and the wife-giver/wife-taker relationships between houses comes clearly to the fore.

Marriage alliance is the subject of chapter 3. Any 'elder and younger brother' type of relation between houses precludes the possibility of establishing affinal relationships, and matrilinear cross-cousin marriage is the preferred marriage type, which is neatly reflected in Ema kin terminology. These rules result in sets of asymmetric ('buffalo cannot meet buffalo') alliance relationships between wife-giving houses ('male houses', 'maternal uncles and ancestors') and wife-taking ones ('new men', 'sisters and children'). The author presents copious statistical data to illustrate the irreversibility of these relationships. She also carefully describes the gifts exchanged along the lines of these relationships. This section in particular provides excellent ethnography. The gifts determine 'the extent to which the bride becomes integrated in the house of the groom' (p. 100), for the gifts passed on to the wife-giving house bring about the gradual severance

of the relation between the bride and her own ancestors. However, only in the case of brides belonging to chiefly or foreign (i.e., non-Maboro) houses is this severance immediate and complete. The detailed analyses of particular gifts reveal highly interesting characteristics of this exchange system. Thus a gift called 'to untie, to open' serves to attenuate the brother-sister relationship on the occasion of the sister's marriage, whereas the name of the gift called 'buffalo dung, dry trees' 'evokes the traces which life has left behind when it has been removed. At the moment the girl gets married one recalls that the life that she has received links her to her mother and mother's mother. This line must be recalled, for "the imprint of the steps is still moist"' (p. 104).

The gifts exchanged at death are described with similar precision, and it is this precision which would have enabled the author to pursue lines of more comprehensive analysis. To suggest one: Where names of parts of the body label the gifts transferred via alliance relations established in successive generations, an analysis of the body as a metaphor for the whole might yield further insights into ideas about 'completeness' with regard to these sets of alliance relationships.

The analysis of a large number of genealogies reveals the overall division of Marobo society into an eastern and a western part. Although both halves are exogamous, they cannot establish direct marriage relations between them. Each has its chiefly houses which, according to the author, 'control' the circulation of women. This results in a four-partner system of alliance which the author integrates into a single formal exchange model. With respect to this argument (presented earlier in a more summary form in Clamagirand 1980), one wonders how appropriate the term 'control' is, as it suggests that the political superiority of the chiefly houses makes them independent of the 'common' houses. In fact, the chiefly houses are also dependent upon 'common' houses as wife-givers. However, it may be that the immediate payment of the complete bridewealth, which was mentioned earlier, allows the chiefly houses to escape from this particular dependence.

Whenever the four-partner cycle becomes transformed into a three-partner one, conflicting attitudes arise, which are described metaphorically as 'the woman returns to her nest', i.e., her mother's mother's house, 'in order to drink the egg and eat the placenta anew'. Whereas the author concludes from these data that 'generalized exchange can only provide a norm of attitudes if there are at least four partners involved' (p. 112), this also points once more to a strong awareness of the relation between a woman and her matrilineal origin which traverses the (patrilineal) houses linked in alliance over successive generations.

In chapter 4 the focus changes from houses to Marobo society as a whole, as represented by three chiefly houses. Their 'controlling' power is expressed in both political and religious functions, and is fundamentally embedded in a cosmological dualism of 'male/hot' and 'female/cool' 'chiefs' which differentiates and unites contrasting representations of fertility and the administration of justice. Myths about the origin of these chiefly houses associate this dualism with the wife-giver/wife-taker relationship between their founding ancestors.

The second part of the study presents extensive descriptions of the actions and texts that make up the rituals of birth, marriage and death, those of house-building, and those related to cattle and the agricultural cycles. And again, this is detailed ethnography that allows further interpretation. This is particularly true of the relation between the 'ancestors' (*tatar*) and the 'masters of the earth' (*rae ubun*), and the relevance of the contrast between wife-giver and wife-taker, and that between natural and violent death in this respect. Further insights may also be yielded by an interpretation of the gifts exchanged during the death rituals as possible transformations of the constituent elements of the person, of buffaloes and of rice, and the roles of the ancestors and 'masters of the earth' in this respect. The role of the spiritual 'masters' (*ubun*) again comes to the fore in the rituals performed in connection with the reconstruction of the lineage house. Here it is the 'master of the trees and the lianas' to whom offerings are given, not only, I would say, 'out of concern for conservation which demands that one returns a part of what one takes' (p. 172), but perhaps also, or primarily, because of the particular *ubun* relationships, which place living man in a subordinate position vis-à-vis these superior spiritual 'masters'.

In part three, devoted to the analyses of Ema rituals, the author sets out to develop what van Wouden had begun: to demonstrate the fundamental unity of the social organization, myths and ritual. To that end she breaks down the rituals into separate categories of 'elements': the cadre, the ingredients, the actors and the actions. She emphasizes the tremendous importance attached by the Ema to the performance of rituals aimed at the maintenance of society as a whole ('if Marobo were to reject the ritual it would explode'). Yet, in this part the holistic approach, which the author applied so convincingly to her analysis of the system of social organization in the first part of the book, is somewhat lacking. These criticisms, however, in no way detract from the importance of this study of Ema society. The highly detailed information and the careful analyses which Renard-Clamagirand has presented here will prove indispensable for further comparative research on and understanding of Indonesian societies.

REFERENCES

- Clamagirand, B., 1980, 'The social organisation of the Ema of Timor', in: J.J. Fox (ed.), *The flow of life; Essays on Eastern Indonesia*, pp. 134-151, Cambridge (Mass): Harvard University Press.
- Fox, J.J., 1980, 'Models and metaphors: Comparative research in Eastern Indonesia', in: J.J. Fox (ed.), *The flow of life; Essays on Eastern Indonesia*, pp. 327-334.
- Friedberg, C., 1980, 'Boiled woman and broiled man: Myths and agricultural rituals of the Bunaq of Central Timor', in: J.J. Fox (ed.), *The flow of life; Essays on Eastern Indonesia*, pp. 266-289.
- Hicks, D., 1984, *A maternal religion: The role of women in Tetum myth and ritual*, Northern Illinois University, Center for Southeast Asian Studies.
- Josselin de Jong, P.E. de, 1984, 'A field of anthropological study in transformation', in: P.E. de Josselin de Jong (ed.), *Unity in diversity; Indonesia as a field of anthropological study*, pp. 1-10, Dordrecht: Foris Publications. [K.I.T.L.V. Verhandelingen 103.]

Traube, E., 1986, *Cosmology and social life: Ritual exchange among the Mambai of East Timor*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Wouden, F.A.E. van, 1968 (1935), *Types of social structure in Eastern Indonesia*, The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, [K.I.T.L.V. Translation Series 11.]

Leo Frobenius, *Ethnographische Notizen aus den Jahren 1905 und 1906; II: Kuba, Leele, Nord-Kete; III: Luluwa, Süd-Kete, Bena Mai, Pende, Cokwe*. Bearb. u. hrsg. von Hildegard Klein. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1987; 1988. 223 S., 437 Zeichnungen, 11 Fotos, 5 Karten; 268 S., 500 Zeichnungen, 15 Fotos, 12 Karten.

H.C.G.SCHOENAKER

II.

The ethnographic notes brought together here were taken by Leo Frobenius during his first field trip to Africa (1904-1906). One of the sponsors of the expedition, Tilenius, the director of the Hamburg Museum of Ethnography, had stated himself to be prepared to buy all the ethnographic objects collected by Frobenius for the museum.

The notes cover the period of July 1905 to May 1906, and contain observations on the Kuba. For Frobenius, these formed an essential part of his investigations in the Congo basin.

The publication of this second volume of Leo Frobenius' ethnographic notes represents a remarkable achievement on the part of Hildegard Klein, who has carefully made the notes accessible for future investigations.

The book comprises 45 pages of text (pp. 1-45), many pages of drawings (p. 47-223), and 11 photographs (pp. 227-236). The text and the drawings are devoted to the Bakuba (Kuba), Baschilele (Leele) and North-Bakete (Kete) respectively. The notes on the latter two groups are rather brief, the emphasis being on the Kuba.

Klein has brought together data scattered throughout Frobenius' diaries and notebooks, and has arranged these according to various themes. The text of the original books has been reproduced as faithfully as possible, which applies to the spelling of African words as well. Where necessary, Klein has added introductory remarks and, like Frobenius, refers to the drawings and diagrams of the relevant objects in the second part of the book. She likewise occasionally refers to Frobenius' travel account entitled *Im Schatten des Kongostaates* (1907). For the sake of clarifying the diary notes, pictures and field data, information from the card catalogue of the Hamburg Museum is added.

The ethnographic notes contain data on the social and political organization of the people concerned. Some myths are also cited by Frobenius, particularly where he attempts to trace the history of the royal family. The majority of the data, however, concern the material culture, focusing on aspects of this such as clothing, ornaments, hair styles, tattooing, house building, weapons, wickerwork, weaving, pottery, iron-working, cup-

board-making, coins, masks, augural figures, and musical instruments. The text constantly refers to the figures, which are arranged parallel with it. There are 437 such figures, covering 175 pages. Some of the drawings are the work of the painter Hans Martin Lemme, who accompanied Frobenius on the expedition.

These figures to a large extent determine the value of this publication. They are extremely well drawn, and confirm the supposition that objects are often portrayed more clearly by drawings than by photographs. Every museum with an African department may derive some use from them. They may also prove very useful in the context of comparative research in general. They depict fine examples of products of the material culture in the classical ethnological sense. Objects outside the area of observation, but possessing the same characteristics, are also regularly referred to. This represents a first step in the direction of an overview of the distribution of particular cultural elements. Frobenius was constantly striving to establish such areas of diffusion. His search for a 'Kulturkreis' even developed into an interest in similar cultural manifestations with a '*paideumatic*' core ('Kulturseele').

The notes on the social life of the groups visited by Frobenius are too fragmentary and often formulated in too absolute a sense to be of much value. However, the historical data obtained from the informant Michalenge, a member of the ruling family of the Bushong, represent the first elements of an oral tradition in the Kuba empire. The hammer myth and a few short etiological myths are most interesting, as is the information on the silent trade and the curious market places near the borders, and, finally, the discussion of the typical position of the Twa people in relation to Kuba groups.

The Leo Frobenius one discovers in these notes is Frobenius the researcher, for whom the German Africanist Hermann Baumann had such high regard. The other Frobenius, with his exalted historical self-consciousness, his puzzling philosophical reflections and his exorbitant formulations, will fortunately not be encountered here. Hildegard Klein's concern with the edition of these ethnographic notes serves as a guarantee for careful documentation. I have sincere admiration for the research she has carried out in Hamburg and Frankfurt-am-Main.

III.

For this third volume of the ethnographic notes of Leo Frobenius Hildegard Klein has used the same lay-out and the same arrangement as in the preceding one. My characterization and assessment of volume II of the notes, and of the figures and the editorial work by Klein are equally applicable here..

The picture one gets from Frobenius' notes on the Luluwa, South Kete, Bena Mai, Pende and Cokwe is one of people on the move. It is sometimes difficult to identify them clearly. Frobenius speaks of blurred boundaries and warns us against the devil of 'Reinrassensucht', i.e., the morbid tendency to locate pure 'races'. The present-day African 'races' are products of a cultural development. For instance, the Western Luluwa are highly mixed with the Pygmies; the Southern Luluwa with the Kete; and the

Eastern Luluwa with the Luba. Frobenius describes very vividly how the Cokwe are pushing forward by way of war raids and trade expeditions, all the time assimilating and absorbing foreign elements. He calls this a process of nationalization. It involves the notion of belonging to one particular 'people'. The Cokwe, according to him, possess the same tattoos and the same dress, as well as vitality; but that is all. Yet there is definitely also, according to him, a Cokwe-type in the physical anthropological sense. This tends towards the 'hamito-mongoloïde' type. The wives of chiefs coming from the south, the Cokwe's home territory, possess the same traits. Cokwe masks can be typified in the same way. Frobenius' attention is drawn to traditional cultural forms and their diffusion. He observes how growing Western influence is causing the old Africa to disappear and tries to document this 'dying Africa'. His notes, whatever their relative value, form a valuable contribution, together with the numerous figures, to the study of these African societies and their cultures.

I.M. Lewis, *Religion in Context: Cults and Charisma*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986, X + 139 pp. Hard cover £ 20.00, paperback, £ 6.95.

M. SCHOFFELEERS
Free University, Amsterdam

Religion in Context brings together the texts (some of them in a revised version) of four public lectures and two papers delivered or published by Professor Lewis between 1966 and 1981. They deal with such seemingly unrelated topics as spirit possession (the author's principal research area), witchcraft beliefs, cannibalism, shamanism and the notion of 'survivals' in orthodox Islamic parlance. It is the author's intention, however, to demonstrate that there is more coherence between these subjects than meets the eye. Conventional anthropology has been mistaken in treating these phenomena as totally unrelated, and even mutually exclusive, objectified 'things', characteristic of different cults and of distinct types or stages of culture and society. Instead, Lewis argues, they ought to be viewed as closely related expressions of mystical power or 'charisma', and as part of a single complex of mutually defining and sustaining elements. Seen thus, they form 'configurations of mystical energy', the composing elements of which illuminate each other, such an approach adding up to what the author aptly describes as a 'cumulative comparative analysis'. This kind of analysis is made possible not only by subsuming the phenomena to be investigated under the common denominator of religious power, but also by a rigorous social contextualization of them. The central question should always be how this or that particular manifestation of religious power (or rather, people's ideas about it) functions in relation to tensions and conflicts between individuals and social categories, such as those of men and women. With regard to social contextualization, Lewis is of the opinion that much of what passes for anthropological theory in that particular field

is actually a sophisticated repetition of interpretations picked up from key informants in the field. This is demonstrable not only with respect to Tylor's much derided theory about the origin of beliefs in spirits, but also, and even more so, with regard to the origin of the anthropological theory of witchcraft, which is generally considered to be one of the discipline's most impressive accomplishments. The orthodox genealogy takes us back to Evans-Pritchard's analysis of Zande witchcraft, but this is only half the story. For, as Evans-Pritchard himself tells us, certain Zande were just as acutely aware of the scapegoating functions of witchcraft accusations and of the explanatory convenience of the beliefs themselves. As a matter of fact, one of the chief merits of Evans-Pritchard's Zande study is precisely his exposition of the points of convergence and divergence between his own interpretations and those of his informants. As Lewis makes clear, the question then becomes one as to when belief gives way to scepticism, and scepticism to belief. It is one of the merits of this book to have drawn our attention to this question.

Ingrid Liebig-Hundius, *Thailands Lehrer zwischen 'Tradition' und 'Fortschritt'; Eine empirische Untersuchung politisch-sozialer und pädagogischer Einstellungen thailändischer Lehrerstudenten des Jahres 1974*, Beiträge zur Südasienforschung, Band 85, Wiesbaden: Steiner Verlag, 1984, 342 pp.

B. SCHUCH

In the work under review, published ten years after completion of the author's fieldwork, the author focuses on the 'democratic' attitudes of Thai students. The case-study is based on data obtained by means of a standardized questionnaire from 260 prospective teachers at five teacher training colleges and universities in Bangkok and Chiang Mai in 1974. Liebig-Hundius' choice of subject was strongly influenced by the political situation in Thailand in the early 1970s. In 1973, an opposition movement, centered on the universities, had succeeded in ending sixteen years of military rule. Afterwards, nation-wide campaigns, run predominantly by students and teachers, were aimed at achieving 'true democracy'.

Going from the assumption that institutions of secondary education exercise a considerable influence on the formation or modification of attitudes, the author attempts to answer the questions to what extent Thai students have acquired democratic attitudes, and to what extent these attitudes are to be regarded as the outcome of educational experiences. Using the ideal of a liberal constitutional democracy as a starting-point, Liebig-Hundius formulated several basic concepts which, according to her, play a crucial role in preparing students for democratic citizenship, namely self-determination, participation, rationality, tolerance of different opinions, a critical approach towards norms and values, and an appreciation of the value of equal opportunity. Although she handles these Western concepts somewhat uncritically, she considers the existing instruments

for measuring attitudes, developed mainly for use in North America and Western Europe as they are, to be inadequate for her particular study. Instead, the author evolved her own instruments to do justice to the specific Thai setting, which is characterized by a personalized conception of authority and a distaste for open discussion of controversial issues – features that seem to be in conflict with democratic requirements. ‘Progressiveness’ and ‘traditional orientation’ are defined by Liebig-Hundius as opposite poles of a continuum, and her operationalization of these concepts centres around the approach towards authority and self-responsibility, and the assessment of controversial discussion and criticism.

The study demonstrates the tensions and incompatibilities between ‘new, democratic’ attitudes on the one hand, and indigenous values and behavioural patterns on the other. Although the students claimed to be in favour of ‘democracy’, the data show that ‘democratic’ attitudes are not adopted as an integrated system, but selectively. Adoption or rejection seems to depend on the perceived relationship between different aspects of ‘progressiveness’ and traditional value orientations which tend to prevent social confrontation. The greater ‘reform orientation’ of university students as compared with students from teacher training colleges suggests that ‘democratic’ attitudes can be influenced by educational experiences.

Despite the illustration of the research results with an impressive amount of data and analyses, I doubt the value of purely statistical research methods for gaining an insight into the formation or modification of attitudes. At the same time, the delayed publication of the results leads me to question to some extent the validity and relevance of this case-study as a helpful guide for educational policy.

S.J. Tambiah, *Culture, Thought and Social Action; An Anthropological Perspective*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard Univ. Press, 1985, 411 pp.

HENK SCHULTE NORDHOLT

This book, a collection of essays written between 1968 and 1983, is divided into two parts. Part One consists of four essays on ritual, and Part Two contains five essays on cosmologies and classifications. Although the author did most of his fieldwork in Thailand, the book covers a much wider area. Apart from copious ethnographical data from the Thai culture area, case studies from, and comparisons with, Sri Lanka, India and Indonesia (plus Malinowski's Tobriand data) are presented.

What makes this an important book, moreover, is the fact that the author develops a theoretical framework which is relevant for both anthropologists and historians in general. The questions raised in these essays are complex, and any reader who hopes to find simple answers will be disappointed.

It is not easy to assign Professor Tambiah a place in any of the main-streams of anthropology. Although influenced during his early academic

career by L. Dumont and British social anthropology, Tambiah also became aware of the importance of history, and a historical dimension is seldom absent in his writings. He cannot be classified as a structuralist, either, nor as a materialist or an idealist. He successfully combined insights from various different schools and traditions in order to develop his own analytical approach.

Tambiah shows that, after several decades in which anthropology has tended to become fragmented by the rise of a rapidly growing number of sub-disciplines, each dominated by its own specialists, it is still possible to take a more or less holistic view. There are, according to Tambiah, no exclusive fields of anthropological research which can easily be separated from a wider context. Nor are there any dominant categories, such as symbolic classifications or economic structures, which ultimately determine culture. He rejects simple dichotomies, between, for instance, religion and politics, and avoids the inherent danger of reifying analytical categories into 'real things'. Instead, the author explores the possibilities of analysing cosmologies and rituals as totalities. In this respect, the interaction between symbolic systems and social structure, the ritual order and its socio-political context, in short, between thought and action, is a key concern throughout the book.

Like cosmological classifications, rituals not only are blueprints for life, but also are enacted in human practice. For, 'cultures and social systems are, after all, not only thought but also lived' (p. 211). Therefore both semantic and pragmatic features need to be analysed in order to be able to appreciate rituals and cosmologies as totalities. It is the dialectical relationship between thought and action which finally reveals the – sometimes conflicting and often puzzling – meanings and the dynamic structure of these totalities.

Some of the essays have already become 'classics' in anthropology, while others certainly deserve this distinguished status. No one who is seriously interested in ritual can ignore Tambiah's concept of 'a performative approach to ritual' which is elaborated in Part One, and especially in chapter 4. Starting with a critical evaluation of earlier anthropological writings on ritual, and especially magic, the author rejects the idea that magic should be analysed in terms of causality and direct effect. Seen from this point of view, magic often fails when it does not 'produce' health, rain or similar 'results'. Instead, Tambiah presents the idea that ritual is not, in the first place, intended to intervene in the course of nature, but to mark a social transition. As an enactment of thoughts, or cultural conceptions, ritual has a performative character because it transmits ideas and conceptions and converts them into social practice. Thought and action cannot be separated.

The dialectical relationship between cosmologies and social structure is analysed in a similar vein. This is most clearly elaborated in chapter 7, 'The Galactic Polity Southeast Asia'. Tambiah here illustrates how a political system can be analysed as a totality. For historians in particular, this 'model' offers ample opportunities for investigating the nature of pre-colonial polities in South and Southeast Asia. The Galactic Polity is a multi-dimensional 'model', for it connects a cosmological model of the

universe with geographical, political, administrative and economic structures in which the same *mandala* pattern is to be perceived. This is a pattern in which a centre is surrounded by satellites which tend to duplicate the centre. The *mandala* was not derived from any ancient cosmological ontology. Instead, it was reflected in social practice, in which a centre had to cope with unwilling satellites, and the fragmentation of agricultural surpluses and labour supplies. Therefore, the ideal of unity and fragmentation, divine order and violent rebellion, constituted different sides of the same coin and provided the system with its internal dynamics.

The use of the Galactic Polity 'model' is not necessarily restricted to Buddhist Thailand, for Tambiah shows how the same pattern is to be found in Java and Bali as well. Both concepts of a performative approach to ritual and the Galactic Polity recur in chapter 9, where Tambiah attacks Clifford Geertz's notion of the Theatre State in Bali. Geertz focused his attention almost exclusively on the interaction of the symbolic meaning of state rituals, and left matters of political power and conflict more or less aside. Tambiah demonstrates, however, that ritual and violence, order and disorder, and cosmological conceptions and social practice can be combined into a dynamic totality. This way, he convincingly connects what was left unconnected by Geertz.

Although the concept of the Galactic Polity may prove of great value for further anthropological and historical research on, for instance, Javanese kingdoms, it remains to be seen whether, or to what extent, it is also applicable to Indonesia under colonial and post-colonial rule. In that respect, Thai history differs fundamentally from that of other parts of Southeast Asia.

Shamsul Amri Baharuddin, *From British to Bumiputra rule: Local politics and rural development in Peninsular Malaysia*, Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1986. 282 pp. S \$ 47.50 (Us \$ 21.70).

NICO G. SCHULTE NORDHOLT

The analytical approach taken by Shamsul in this study is fascinating as well as unique. Using a socio-historical approach, the author offers impressive insights into the complexity of the process by which (inter)national policies, when implemented at local levels, are often deformed beyond recognition as a result of inherent tensions and contradictions in the politico-economic structure of Malayan society. In this respect, Shamsul is one of the very few anthropologists who systematically place their fieldwork within a broad context in which the interrelationships between local, regional and (inter)national policy interests are evenly treated.

Shamsul's study is unique to the social scientific literature on Malaya because the author's two years of fieldwork were carried out in a community in the state of Selangor where rubber and palm oil are the main

commodities, rather than wet-rice.

Four themes are central to this investigation:

- a) The historical dimension of contemporary local political cleavages, and the way in which British colonial policies were directed at tying the *penghulu* group (local chiefs and their extended families) to British politico-economic interests.
- b) The evolution of a local community which was shaped not only in reaction to local events, but emerged as a result of political decisions on the national and international level (i.e. world market prices of rubber, palm oil).
- c) Besides the analysis of the rivalry between the national political parties (UMNO and PAS), detailed information is presented on their intra-party politics and on the political patronage of officials (*penghulu* and the village heads) and of party representatives (*wakil rakyat*), which is viewed as having caused the emergence of a new, small class of officials-cum-entrepreneurs. In some villages this resulted in social conflicts between the 'leaders of peasants' (political patrons) versus 'peasant leaders' (those who initiated the establishment of the new local communities and who defended the interests of 'their' fellow-peasants versus the interests of 'the (colonial) state').
- d) In relation to the above (c), due attention is given to the background, causes and implementation of the New Economic Policy (NEP), which was introduced in 1970. Its impact on local communities is also examined.

While local politics constitute the primary focus of this study, 'rural development' is the second major concern. Shamsul's theoretical approach is a significant contribution both to anthropology and to the field of development which involves economic and regional planning. The book is a watershed in the social scientific literature on Malaya and is of great relevance for South-East Asian studies in general. Shamsul's study will be a source of inspiration for many anthropologists in the years to come.

History of the Malay Kingdom of Patani - Sejarah Kerajaan Melayu Patani, by Ibrahim Syukri (pseudonym), translated by Conner Bailey and John N. Miksic. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Center for International Studies, Monographs in International Studies Southeast Asia Series Number 68, 1985. xx + 90 pp.

A. TEEUW

The Malay text translated in this booklet was originally published in *jawi* script in Pasir Puteh, Kelantan, in 1962. Soon after its publication, it was suppressed by both the Thai and the Malaysian governments because of

its Malay irredentist tendencies and its strongly anti-Thai sentiments. It represents a remarkable effort by a strongly involved local historian to present his view of Patani's past and present on the basis of a number of Western as well as Malay and Thai sources, which are partly identified by the author himself. The *Sejarah Kerajaan Melayu Patani* is also discussed in the edition of the *Hikayat Patani* published as Volume 5 of the *Bibliotheca Indonesica* of the KITLV (Vol. I:46-49). It is useful to have this book (only very few copies of which seem to have survived) available now in English for a larger audience. The translation of the Malay text is reliable, and useful notes are added to the translation.

Andrew Vickerman, *The Fate of the Peasantry: Premature 'Transition to Socialism' in the Democratic Republic of Vietnam*, Monograph No. 28, Yale University, Southeast Asia Studies, 1986. 373 pp., incl. bibliography.

TRUONG QUANG

Literature (primary and secondary sources) on land reform and agricultural collectivization in North Vietnam is scarce, and the number of studies on these subjects is limited to a handful of books and articles. Another author – this time an English academic, who has been covering the subject in several publications – is therefore more than welcome to add to the short list for quite some time.

One can easily agree with Vickerman about the failure of the North Vietnam government (officially called the Democratic Republic of Vietnam, DRV) to raise agricultural output, and, consequently, the farmers' living standard, by means of first land reform (1945-1957), and later collectivization (1958-1972). It is, in fact, true that agricultural production was seriously reduced in subsequent years, despite the introduction of the collectivization mechanism (which cost the Workers' Party of Vietnam, or WPV, so much in terms of energy and resources) in all the villages in the North.

The factors responsible for this failure are classic, and are common to many socialist countries (Stalinist and Maoist alike) which chose this path towards development. They are: an over-emphasis on the role of industry in supporting the hoped-for agricultural take-off; and too high an expectation of the agricultural surplus (which in reality was never achieved) necessary for boosting industrialization.

What Vickerman tries to demonstrate throughout his 373-page study (like others before him, not surprisingly including many Party writers and officials) is that such a mechanical and inflexible introduction of the collectivization cliché as in the case of the Soviet Union and China, has ultimately suffered the same fate in North Vietnam. In his own words, it 'was inappropriate in the conditions of the DRV and failed to fulfill even the objectives laid down for it by the State' (p. 1). This failure can be blamed in part on the Party policy (which later the Party itself admitted

several times, as witness a series of adjustments and re-adjustments) and on the as yet unsuitable conditions in the DRV.

Most interesting is the view expressed by Vickerman on the problems faced by the cooperatives even before the US bombings started in 1964, viz: 'the VWP leadership had neither the strength to ensure effective collectivization by force (à la Stalin) or by conviction, while the peasantry had insufficient strength to oppose and prevent the policy altogether, or to openly manipulate cooperatives in its favour' (p. 22). With a few exceptions, the State indeed failed to provide enough 'material incentives', i.e., consumer goods and agricultural inputs, in return for food deliveries by the cooperatives to feed the urban workers. The peasants, demotivated by the inefficient and corrupt management of the cooperatives, tended to put more energy into their private plots as a primary source of income. A vicious circle thus began, which continued so long as the need for providing enough food for the population remained urgent. The more the State tried to exercise control over the collective units, the fewer results it derived from them. Except for the period of the war (1969-1972), when appeals to nationalism somehow helped to stimulate farmers' productivity, food output suffered a steady decline for a long period of time. A large number of cooperatives existed only in name, and rural differentiation was far from being resolved (p. 261). Many 'negative phenomena' had also developed in the course of the cooperatives' existence.

The book is interesting reading for every serious writer on and student of rural problems in the Third World. It would have been more valuable and convincing had Vickerman spent more time on the farmers' reaction to the mode of production which changed their life so much. Only then would 'the fate of the peasantry' have been fully illustrated, in accordance with what the title of the book suggests.

H.I.R. Hinzler, *Catalogue of Balinese Manuscripts in the Library of the University of Leiden and other Collections in the Netherlands*, vol. I: Reproductions of the Drawings from the Van der Tuuk Collection; vol. II: Descriptions of the Balinese Drawings from the Van der Tuuk Collection. Leiden: E.J. Brill/Leiden University Press, 1987.

ADRIAN VICKERS
University of New South Wales

Anybody studying Balinese art, literature and society will find this two-volume catalogue of the Balinese drawings collected by H. N. van der Tuuk at the end of the nineteenth century to be essential reading. H.I.R. Hinzler has provided a clear explanation of these paintings, together with detailed background information, all supported by excellent reproductions of the works themselves.

The first of the two volumes consists of superb photographs of the 482 drawings in 306.5 folios (of the originals three-and-one-half drawings have been lost). The quality of the drawings varies, but the majority are

a testimony to the great ability of Balinese artists, an ability still often not given due recognition in international art history. With an eye to showing this ability to its true extent, sixteen of the most beautiful drawings have been selected as colour plates, showing off the qualities of line, and the experimentation with colour and composition which characterized the work of nineteenth-century artists working on a new surface, paper. Aesthetic value aside, the drawings are very important visual sources of information on Balinese social life, iconography, and design.

The second volume provides the descriptions of the drawings. These are more than just dry details of what each drawing actually shows. Hinzler gives detailed documentation of the collection, how it came to the Netherlands, and how it related to Van der Tuuk's pioneering work on the Balinese and Kawi (Old- and Middle-Javanese) languages. She has gone to considerable length to analyse the works stylistically and identify fourteen different artists' hands, although only three of these artists are known by name: the *brahmana* artists Ida Madé Tlaga and Ida Putu Héma of Badung, South Bali, and the commoner artist I Ketut Gedé of Bulèleng, North Bali. Hinzler compensates for our inability to put names to the other artists by at least associating their work with the styles of different regions of Bali, although with 'artist number 11' I feel there is a case to be made for associating the drawings with the style of Kamasan, Klungkung.

Each drawing is described at length, the Balinese inscriptions which accompany them being translated. Following this, Hinzler provides considerable cultural background to the contents of the drawings, displaying her deep knowledge of Balinese culture, as well as giving a sense of Van der Tuuk's way of understanding Balinese language and literature. She does this particularly by relating the drawings to entries in his posthumous dictionary of Balinese and Kawi.

One would expect to be able to quibble about details in a work of this size, but in fact there is very little with which to disagree here. Perhaps in the descriptions of each work the editors could have taken the trouble to highlight the Balinese inscriptions with quotation marks or a different typeface for the ease of the reader. Occasionally one could disagree with some of the linguistic remarks. For example, on p. 91 Hinzler states that 'the term *mapalu* (to bump against) is usually restricted to chickens, cows, bulls and goats'. I have heard it used of deities (*déwa mapalu* – 'the gods bump against each other') in the name given to a violent divine possession during a temple festival in East Klungkung, and for a movement in the *gambuh* dance-drama, *mapalu jit*, where the courtiers *demang* and *tumeng-gung* humorously 'bump bottoms' by backing into each other and leaping into the air in surprise. In addition, it is surprising that Hinzler's discussion of Balinese art in her introduction to the descriptions makes no mention of many of the recent works on the subject, especially Anthony Forge's *Balinese Traditional Paintings* (Sydney: Australian Museum, 1978).

The publication of these two volumes is a significant step in Balinese studies, one which will perhaps only be surpassed by more complete catalogues of the Balinese palm-leaf manuscripts in Dutch and other collections.