Book Reviews

- Donald F. Barr, J. Noorduyn, *A critical survey of studies on the languages of Sulawesi*, Leiden: KITLV Press, (Bibliographical Series 18), 1991, xiv + 245 pp., maps, index.
- J. Boneschansker, H. Reenders, *Alternatieve zending, Ottho Gerhard Heldring (1804-1876) en de verbreiding van het christendom in Nederlands-Indië*, Kampen, 1991.
- H.J.M. Claessen, Albert B. Robillard, *Social change in the Pacific Islands*. London

This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>

BOEKBESPREKINGEN

J. Noorduyn, *A critical survey of studies on the languages of Sulawesi*, Leiden: KITLV Press, (Bibliographical Series 18), 1991, xiv + 245 pp., maps, index. ISBN 90.6718.028.9. Price: f 45.-.

DONALD F. BARR
Summer Institute of Linguistics, Sulawesi

The Indonesian island of Sulawesi (Celebes) is the homeland of more than seven million people speaking some sixty to eighty languages, depending on where the borderline between language and dialect is drawn. For years due to the scarcity of funds and linguistic experts study of Sulawesi languages was limited to a small number of that total.

In the years following Indonesia's independence an increasing amount of research has been undertaken on languages in Sulawesi, some by Indonesian scholars and other by scholars from Europe, Australia and the USA. With this increasing input into the field of Sulawesi studies, the Royal Institute of Linguistics and Anthropology (KITLV) has now published a long planned bibliography on the languages of Sulawesi, which aims at 'presenting the main lines of the history and present state of the area of linguistics research' in Sulawesi.

The languages of Sulawesi are commonly subdivided into nine sub-groups. For convenience the author organizes the bibliographic survey according to these nine groups, each group considered in a separate chapter beginning in the north and moving south as follows: The Sangiric Languages, The Minahasan Languages, The Gorontalo-Mongondic Languages, The Tomini Languages, The Kaili-Pamona Languages, The Saluan Languages, The Bungku-Mori Languages, The Muna-Buton Languages, and The South Sulawesi Languages. In each chapter works on individual languages or groups of languages are discussed together, helpfully bringing together in one location all relevant works on a given language.

Unlike some compilers of bibliographies, the author does not merely list works published on a given language. Rather he endeavors to give a critical evaluation of many of the works cited, giving a perspective on which works are most helpful and technically accurate, and which ones are of more historical interest. Unfortunately not all the works listed are given this critical evaluation.

The author has included virtually all published works including many previously little known works written in Indonesian. This is one of the most helpful aspects of the work as it successfully brings together in one

volume, works on Sulawesi languages written in Dutch, German, Russian, French, English and Indonesian. Works included are grammars, dictionaries, language survey results, linguistic analysis as well as extensive text collections and literature in the various languages.

The author has done a great service to those interested in research on the languages of Sulawesi not only in bringing together in one volume a comprehensive critical bibliography, but also in making those works available to researchers. He promises in the preface of his book that 'most of the titles listed in this bibliography apart from unreleased government reports are or soon will be available in the library of the KITLV at Leiden.'

While much research is still needed on many of Sulawesi's varied languages, this bibliography will prove an indispensable tool for those interested in pursuing such research.

H. Reenders, *Alternatieve zending, Ottho Gerhard Heldring (1804-1876) en de verbreiding van het christendom in Nederlands-Indië*, Kampen, 1991.

J. BONESCHANSKER

Jan en Annie Romein schreven in hun bekende werk *De Lage Landen bij de zee* dat 'de geschiedschrijving in het algemeen de neiging heeft stromingen die zich niet hebben weten door te zetten in haar verhaal de plaats te weigeren welke hun ondanks hun slechts tijdelijke betekenis niettemin toekomt'. Het is de grote verdienste van H. Reenders dat hij het tot dusver in de marge van de zendingsgeschiedenis beschreven projekt van de 'christenwerkman' zijn legitieme plaats in het geschiedverhaal heeft gegeven. Centraal hierin is de figuur van Ottho Gerhard Heldring, de geestelijke vader van het projekt. Zijn leven en karakter en zijn plaats in de Vereniging Christelijke Vrienden komen uitvoerig aan de orde. Enerzijds werd hij gewaardeerd vanwege zijn inzet voor het praktisch christendom o.a. in het stichten van de christelijk-sociale instellingen te Hoenderloo en Zetten, anderzijds riepen zijn impulsiviteit en te weinig doordachte reacties irritatie bij zijn vrienden uit de kringen van het toenmalige Reveil. Hij trachtte confessionelen en ethischen vanwege hun kritiek op de grondslag van het Nederlands Zendelinggenootschap te betrekken bij het zendingswerk overzee. Daartoe lanceerde hij naast het werk van het NZG als alternatief het plan voor de uitzending van christenwerkmannen, gelovige handwerkslieden die d.m.v. hun christelijke presentie temidden van een heidense omgeving een uitstralend effect zouden kunnen hebben. Het resultaat was de oprichting in 1847 van het Comité van de Christenwerkman, dat gedurende een periode van meer dan tien jaar ambachtslieden met een minimale voorbereiding op hun taak in de tropen uitzond. Heldring speelde hierbij steeds een centrale rol

ondanks vele tegenslagen: gebrek aan medewerking van het gouvernement, problemen van financiële aard, huisvestings- en vervoersproblemen en het gebrek aan levensonderhoud van de uitgezonden. Filantropische, piëtistische en comprehensief-expansionistische motieven speelden bij Heldring een grote rol. Heldring was een sociaal bewogen figuur die het ideaal koesterde ook de 'kleine man' door middel van kolonisatie een bestaan in de tropen te geven. Zijn kontakten met de Berlijnse predikant J.E. Gossner, één der vaders van de Innere Mission versterkte zijn piëtistische motief. In een latere periode pleitte hij voor de versterking van de Europees-christelijke invloed in de koloniën ter bevordering van christelijke civilisatie als voorbereiding van de bekering van enkelingen.

Reenders beschrijft uitvoerig de voorbereiding en uitzending van tientallen mannen en vrouwen en hun vaak moeizame arbeid in Nederlands-Indië. De vele mislukkingen worden geanalyseerd en niet verzwegen. Het project van de christenwerkmans bleek geen succes door onvoldoende opleiding en onvoldoende kennis van de zendingsterreinen. Na lezing van dit zeer lezenswaardige proefschrift blijven nog een aantal vragen. Heldring gold als een deskundige op het terrein van de situatie in Nederlands-Indië. Heeft hij vanuit een zekere bevoegenheid en impulsiviteit te weinig kritisch alle informatie gebruikt? Kende hij de historie van het Nederlands Zendeling-genootschap te slecht om te weten, dat dit genootschap reeds na de Franse tijd het plan tot het uitzenden van een tweetal categorieën zendelingen, handwerkslieden met een minimale algemene opleiding en academisch gevormden, al gauw opgaf?

Een vraag blijft ook waarom hij getuigde met een zekere wisselende motivatie. Had dit te maken met zijn theologisch denken of zat het meer in zijn persoonlijke karakter, levenservaringen in zijn werk en ontmoetingen met vele vrienden? De auteur heeft ons eigenlijk nieuwsgieriger gemaakt naar de persoon van deze, door zijn vele brieven, unieke figuur uit de kerk- en zendingsgeschiedenis.

Resumerend, deze goed verzorgde dissertatie is een belangrijke bijdrage tot de Nederlandse zendingsgeschiedenis, maar niet minder tot de geschiedenis van het Reveil in de beschrijving van een verwaarloosd element uit het leven en denken van O.G. Heldring.

Albert B. Robillard (ed.), *Social change in the Pacific Islands*. London & New York: Kegan Paul International. 1992, 507 pp. Maps, bibl. ISBN 0.7103.0400.5.

H.J.M. CLAESSEN

In this bulky volume, sixteen scholars present overviews of social change in various regions of the Pacific. The volume is preceded by a lengthy

introduction by the editor. This is a peculiar piece of work, for he strongly advocates here a postmodernist approach to Pacific developments, but none of the contributors follows his suggestions. They all provide thorough, traditional, historical chapters – with the exception of Chapter 13 in which editor Robillard presents a discussion of Reyn's Aloha shirt.

It is not possible in a review to do justice to the rich contents of the volume. Each of the chapters is full of well-arranged and detailed information. Only the barest hints of the contents can be given here. The volume begins with Melanesia. Ogan and Wesley-Smith give a cogent picture of the changing relations of production in Papua New Guinea, and point to the fact that for a long time the economic situation here hardly changed, colonization notwithstanding. I missed in their chapter an indication of the growing amount of unrest and violence in the urban regions. Conell describes developments in New Caledonia, where the economy changed 'from subsistence to subsidy' (1992:68). In the chapter on Vanuatu (the New Hebrides), Philibert discusses the problem of how to steer between a World Systems approach and ethnographical correctness. He finally compares those groups who borrowed ideas from Europe with those who did not do so. Problems here are augmented by the fact that about 140.000 people speak 105 different languages (1992:100). In a lengthy chapter Naidu sketches the situation in Fiji. Also, he applies a mode of production-approach and describes developments since the beginning of colonization.

The next part of the volume contains four chapters on Micronesia. Hezel describes developments in the Caroline and Marshall Islands, nowadays divided into three modern political entities: Palau, the Marshall Islands, and the Federated States of Micronesia. Over the course of time the tiny islands were successively colonized by Germans, Japanese, and Americans, but finally, in the seventies, they regained independency. The general problem here is how, without adequate resources, to maintain the high standard of living introduced by the Americans. According to Mayo, who sketches the situation in Guam, American influences there are still strong, and they provide the necessary income for the population. The Northern Marianas, described by McPhetres, resemble the other Micronesian Islands, having had successive Spanish, German, and American influences. American political and economic influences here are strong, and most inhabitants now have American citizenship, which appears to be a mixed blessing. In the last few years a growing number of foreign labourers can be found here, and connected with this, all the problems of intercultural contacts. Kiribati (the Gilbert Islands) are described by Lawrence. Here too we read of the same long and sad story of foreign influences. Decolonization did not improve the situation: the paternal British government was replaced by American and Japanese interests. The economy depends mainly on copra, and on money earned off the islands.

The part on Polynesia begins with a chapter on Samoans, mainly those living in Hawaii (Franco). There is a long historical account of Samoa and

foreign influences. Though some attention is paid to West Samoa, I miss the comprehensive approach that characterizes the other chapters. Gailey presents a chapter on the Tonga Islands. She, more than the other authors, pays attention to transformations in the position of women. She explains how, until now, Tonga has succeeded in maintaining its political and economic stability. Both continuing population growth and the limited influence of the educated commoners on governmental politics, however, threaten its future. The chapter on Tahiti is written by Finney. He points to the fact that for quite some time the economic situation there was stable, but since growing population led to pressure on the land, other sources of income were needed. In 1962 the French Atomic Energy Commission located its headquarters in Tahiti. This brought a lot of work and wealth (1992:359), but also an intensification of French cultural influences. The decline of interest in nuclear testing at the end of the eighties means to the Tahitians that the end of this period of wealth is near. The chapter on the Aloha shirt by Robillard was referred to already. It is an interesting analysis of the Aloha shirt as a status symbol, but aside from this the chapter is of limited value and lags far behind the others in terms of information on social change.

The volume ends with three more general, comparative chapters. Topping describes the role of language – in terms of literacy and education – in development. In a short chapter Kent discusses sickness and death of children, and in a final chapter Macpherson formulates some concluding thoughts. He points out, amongst other things, the fictitious character of most of the units of analysis, and demonstrates how difficult it is to reconstruct the past, even though it still influences the present. Reality is always more complex than the models designed to cope with it. Generalizations about the Pacific are dangerous.

There is much to recommend in the book. There is, crammed together into one volume and in an orderly way, a mass of data on developments in the Pacific area. There is also a lot to criticise; it is surprising, for instance, to find so many printing errors in a volume with such high academic qualities. It is also amazing that the extensive list of publications (more than 600 titles) in the end, refers to only three publications in German, and only one in Spanish (and, *pour acquit de conscience*, there are included – mainly by the only (!) French author – 35 publications in French). The volume does not present a balanced coverage of the existing literature. Aside from the previously mentioned poor coverage of Hawaii and Samoa, it must be noted that neither the Cook Islands nor the Marquesas were included and that of the Society Islands, only Tahiti gets attention. There may have been reasons not to include New Zealand, but these were not stated. All in all, however, it is a useful volume; a must for the scholar and layman interested in Pacific developments.

J.J. Ras and S.O. Robson (eds), *Variation, Transformation and Meaning: Studies on Indonesian literatures in honour of A. Teeuw*, Leiden: KITLV Press, (VKI 144), 1991, 236 pp. ISBN 90.6718.027.0. Price f 35.-.

WILL DERKS

Variation, Transformation and Meaning is a collection of papers given at a symposium to mark the 1986 retirement of Professor A. Teeuw, and which gives readers the impression that the study of Indonesian literary has entered a transitional phase. Particularly the essays of E.M. Uhlenbeck and of Teeuw himself, two contributions that are expressly presented in the introduction as the 'theoretical frame enclosing the totality of the presentations', support this view.

Teeuw mainly discusses the way the validity of philology has been undermined in the recent past. Formerly considered to be both objective and scientific, this approach held complete sway over the field of literature. Gradually, however, philologist certainties have been shaken, and the relevance of their so-called stemmatic method is now very much doubted. The search for the original text or archetype – the stemmatic method's ultimate goal – is now abandoned.

Given the cogency of the arguments against traditional philology Teeuw sums up, one would expect his suggestions for future Indonesian literary studies, with which he concludes his essay, to mark the contours of a genuinely new approach. In fact, Teeuw favours a continued search for a text's archetype and even of a text's 'proper meaning'. Not only is this somewhat disappointing, it also gives the whole essay the character of a rearguard action.

Teeuw seems especially concerned about 'all the freedom allowed to the present-day reader' by contemporary theory of criticism with its 'shocking' ideas that have relegated the philologist's work to an exercise in futility. In a sense, the same holds true for Uhlenbeck's contribution, though while Teeuw tries to make the most of the hopeless situation in which philology presently finds itself, Uhlenbeck makes an attempt to place modern literary criticism under the legal restraint of linguistics, 'a truly scientific discipline'. A profound irony here is that both scholars appear to be particularly shocked by deconstructivists like Jacques Derrida and Roland Barthes – ironic because, after all, in spite of their revolutionary zeal and bewildering statements, the ideas of these French scholars are often unoriginal and nothing but critical commonplaces with regard to the achievements of literary theory as a whole. The idea, for instance, that 'a literary work of art is not a closed, unequivocal, finished product [...] but an entity which not only needs interpretation by a reader in order to come to life, but also leaves room for several interpretations', is perhaps a 'truth', as Uhlenbeck calls it, but it certainly is not a 'discovery' made by Barthes in

1966. Rather it is evidence of an astonishing unfamiliarity with the theoretical turmoil, outside France, of the four decades preceding the midsixties.

With remarks like these Uhlenbeck unintentionally emphasizes the fact that for a long time Indonesian verbal art was studied in splendid isolation. Its students simply ignored what was going on in related disciplines, particularly in theory of criticism. Three other essays in this collection clearly demonstrate this. Much of what Sulastin Sutrisno, Yus Rusyana and E.U. Kratz say in their respective contributions would have to count as dismissably crackpot in the context of modern literary theory.

Fortunately this volume also contains essays that not only show a strong awareness of contemporary developments, but also present fine examples of how these developments can be fruitfully applied to the study of Indonesian literatures. A case in point is the essay by Henri Chambert-Loir who discusses fascinating material, namely narratives of 'The Fadli Connection'. These narratives appear to play a cheerful game with fictionality. Narrators break in on the narration, audiences are directly addressed, and even protagonists complain about cruel storytellers who make them suffer in their stories. Chambert-Loir's attempt to interpret these conspicuous characteristics of nineteenth-century Malay literature is a very meritorious one, although it is by no means certain that they 'mark modern tendencies'. It is probable that Chambert-Loir confuses 'modern' with 'modernist' here, for in European literature similar devices have indeed been used by the so-called Modernists who thus expressed their sceptic attitude towards the conventions of Realism. But the Modernists did not invent these devices. Rather they resorted to a box of tricks well known to their oral colleagues, who, in Indonesia for instance, still sing their tales today. But these considerations leave unharmed the significance of this essay, which highlights captivating aspects of Malay literature and certainly stimulates debate about them. The same can be said about H.M.J. Maier's discussion of the 'Tale of the Bearded Civet Cat', which is clearly the most daring study of the whole volume. The way Maier reads this story is probably shocking for the traditional student of Indonesian literature, who may renounce it as 'rabid literary criticism'. But such an opinion would neglect the fact that Maier's essay is a sincere endeavour to explore possibilities as yet unknown in Indonesian literary studies. When considering *Variation, Transformation and Meaning* as a whole, this scholarly discipline needs such endeavours more than ever.

In deze tijd maar nauwelijks te vinden; De Maleise roman van hofjuffer Tamboehan, Vertaald uit het Maleis en ingeleid door G.L. Koster en H.M.J. Maier, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1991, 174 pp. ISBN 90.0409.297.8.

WILL DERKS

Vertalen van literair werk is een frustrerende bezigheid. Als de vertaling mooi is, dan is zij onbetrouwbaar. En als zij betrouwbaar is, dan is zij niet mooi. Met deze verzuchting begint de Amerikaanse vertaler van Thomas Manns *Doktor Faustus* zijn inleiding tot deze 'kathedraal van een roman'. In een notedop hebben we hier het belangrijkste dilemma van iedere vertaler. Moet een vertaling zo dicht mogelijk bij het origineel blijven en in die zin 'betrouwbaar' zijn? De vertaling loopt in zo'n geval bijvoorbeeld het gevaar dat in het andere taaleigen bepaalde sterke effecten van de oorspronkelijke literaire tekst verloren gaan of zelfs onzinnig worden. De nieuwe tekst, de vertaling, zal dan waarschijnlijk niet 'mooi' worden gevonden. Anderzijds kan ook worden getracht het origineel te converteren oftewel aan te passen aan die andere taal en cultuur. In extremo kan er zelfs sprake zijn van een herschepping. Maar die heeft dan nog maar zeer indirect iets te maken met het origineel en is, hoewel misschien 'mooi' (voor het nieuwe publiek), dus onbetrouwbaar.

In de inleiding tot hun onlangs verschenen vertaling van de *Syair Ken Tamboehan* geven Koster en Maier duidelijk aan zich van een en ander bewust te zijn: 'Vertalen betekent interpreteren en keuzes maken, en ook vertalers worden dikwijls bevangen door een zekere mate van treurigheid: de perfecte vertaling blijft onbereikbaar'. Misschien nog wel meer dan de eerder genoemde vertaler van Thomas Mann hebben Koster en Maier reden tot verdriet. De *Syair Ken Tamboehan* is immers een Maleis literair werk uit de vorige eeuw; de te overbruggen kloof is dus vrijwel maximaal.

Gezien hun toelichting op de vertaling lijkt het er in eerste instantie op dat de vertalers ervoor hebben gekozen de oorspronkelijke tekst naar het hedendaagse Nederlands, en dus naar het Nederlandse publiek van nu, toe te halen. 'Het rijm [van het origineel] hebben wij laten vallen', schrijven de vertalers, 'omdat dat in de literaire conventies van het moderne Nederlands niet effectief is.' In zijn algemeenheid is dit laatste overigens zeer de vraag, zeker gezien het feit dat het rijm, na de triomfen van het vrije vers in de jaren vijftig en zestig, in de Nederlandse literatuur opnieuw een belangrijke plaats heeft veroverd (bijvoorbeeld in de poëzie van Gerrit Komrij, in de sonnetten van Jan Kal of in het onlangs bekroonde oeuvre van Elisabeth Eybers).

Hoe dit ook zij, de vertalers maken hier een keuze die verraadt dat zij, binnen het boven geschetste dilemma, eerder kiezen voor 'mooi' (in termen van vermeende *moderne* literaire conventies in het Nederlands) dan voor 'betrouwbaar'. Anderzijds blijkt echter dat op een belangrijk punt juist voor

het tegenovergestelde is gekozen: 'De taal van de syair is formulair en gestyleerd; het leek ons het beste de tekst in enigszins ouderwets Nederlands weer te geven waarbij we het formulaire karakter zo veel mogelijk hebben proberen te behouden.' Deze ingrijpende keuze staat haaks op de eerder vermelde, omdat nu karakteristieken van de oorspronkelijke taal, en niet van de 'gasttaal', als uitgangspunt worden genomen. Een ongemakkelijke ambivalentie waarmee men als het ware twee heren wil dienen. Omdat deze keuze niet verder wordt toegelicht, lijkt het er overigens op alsof de vertalers ervan uit gaan dat formulair en gestileerd tesamen hetzelfde zijn als ouderwets. Ook dat is echter nogal aanvechtbaar. We hoeven alleen maar te denken aan de teksten van de tegenwoordig immens populaire Rap-muziek om te kunnen concluderen dat de combinatie van formulair en gestileerd hypermodern kan zijn.

Maar er zijn ernstigere bezwaren tegen een keuze voor deze ouderwetse, negentiende-eeuwse stijl denkbaar. Op de eerste plaats gaat een dergelijke keuze natuurlijk lijnrecht in tegen de idee dat een oud of klassiek literair meesterwerk in een vertaling geschikt moet worden gemaakt voor een nieuwe generatie lezers. Oude vertalingen worden dan ook regelmatig vervangen door nieuwe. De oorspronkelijke teksten worden 'levend' gehouden door ze steeds opnieuw aan te passen aan de ontwikkelingen die de gasttaal heeft doorgemaakt. Vandaar dat in Nederland voor de bekende Shakespeare-vertalingen van Burgersdijk die van de eerder genoemde Gerrit Komrij in de plaats zijn gekomen. En ook kunnen we tegenwoordig genieten van Martialis, Dostojewski en Machado de Assis in eigentijdse vertalingen die eerdere definitief hebben vervangen (totdat deze zélf weer vervangen moeten worden).

Eigenaardig genoeg suggeren de vertalers elders in hun inleiding dat zij óók die opvatting zijn toegedaan. Over de vertaling van Roorda van Eysinga (1836) merken zij namelijk op, dat die voor de 'literaire fijnproevers' onder zijn tijdgenoten al moeilijk te pruimen moet zijn geweest. Wat dan de dwingende reden is om in 1991 te kiezen voor een negentiende-eeuws en niet voor een twintigste-eeuws register, is daarom raadselachtig. Het effect dat zo'n keuze in eerste instantie immers heeft, is dat het de tekst voor een hedendaags publiek eerder minder dan meer toegankelijk maakt. En dat laatste is toch de drijfveer achter iedere vertaling.

Op de tweede plaats is er het verschijnsel dat archaïsmen als 'vrouwe', 'pulver', 'voorhang', 'zich vermeien' en dergelijke, die in de negentiende eeuw wellicht hooguit als gestileerd werden ervaren, in onze tijd een uitermate plechtstatig karakter hebben gekregen. Zodoende ontstaat in dit geval dan het paradoxale effect dat, juist door dit taalgebruik, de vertaling zich ver verwijdt van het origineel dat deze plechtstatigheid in die mate nauwelijks kent. Ook zo beschouwd ondergraven de vertalers dus hun eigen bedoelingen.

En op de derde en zeker niet laatste plaats hebben de vertalers, ondanks dat zij verwijzen naar de moderne literaire conventies in het Nederlands, zich

onvoldoende gerealiseerd dat het door hun gebruikte, negentiende-eeuwse register in de Nederlandse literatuur weliswaar nog steeds wordt gebruikt, maar dan uitsluitend als middel tot *ironie*. Moderne literaire fijnproevers in Nederland, bekend met bijvoorbeeld Marten Toonder, met Wim T. Schippers, en bovenal met Gerard Reve, zullen menige passage in deze vertaling van de *Ken Tamboehan* niet meer kunnen lezen zonder te denken dat ze door de verteller in het ootje worden genomen. Dit te meer omdat in deze vertaling de plechtstatigheid regelmatig wordt doorbroken met uitermate prozaïsch, zelfs plat taalgebruik ('smoel', 'stuk ongeluk', 'smerige slet' en dergelijke). Juist deze combinatie heeft met name Gerard Reve tot literair procédé verheven en op grote schaal toegepast. Voor een Nederlandse lezer krijgt het verhaal daarom haast onvermijdelijk een ironische laag, terwijl zoiets niet eigen is aan de oorspronkelijke tekst, noch door de vertalers bedoeld is. Met andere woorden: ook in dit opzicht schieten de vertalers met hun keuze voor een ouderwets register hun doel voorbij.

Bezwaren van geheel andere aard betreffen de verzorging van het boek. Al lezende ontstaat onwillekeurig de indruk dat er zowel bij de vertalers als bij de uitgever een zekere mate van onverschilligheid moet hebben bestaan ten aanzien van het eindproduct. Zo wordt bijvoorbeeld al meteen in de tweede zin van de inleiding de Nederlandse titel van het werk – *In deze tijd maar nauwelijks te vinden* – verkeerd aangehaald. Datzelfde gebeurt nadien helaas nog een aantal malen, waarbij niet alleen het woord 'maar' uit de titel verdwijnt, maar ook het woord 'nauwelijks' zonder enig commentaar wordt vervangen door 'moeilijk'. Bovendien wordt het geheel ontsierd door een werkelijk te groot aantal tik- en taalfouten, met als treurig dieptepunt het meer dan twintig keer verkeerd spellen van het klassieke dictee-woordje 'onmiddellijk'.

Volgens de vertalers hielden hun voorgangers zich op een nogal plichtmatige manier bezig met de Maleise literatuur; men gaf nauwelijks blijk van 'diepe emotionele betrokkenheid'. Hoewel zij suggereren dat dit nu niet meer zo zou zijn, wekken zij door dit gebrek aan zorg echter precies die indruk. De manier waarop de uitgever E. J. Brill heeft gemeend dit boek te moeten uitgeven, versterkt die indruk alleen nog maar. Zeker als in aanmerking wordt genomen hoe Meulenhoff de serie 'De Oosterse Bibliotheek', die Brill met dit boek zegt te willen voortzetten, vroeger verzorgde. Daaruit bleek in ieder geval duidelijk liefde voor het vak.

De vraag dringt zich nu op wie of wat met deze uitgave gediend is. Het negentiende-eeuws register werkt averechts en werpt eerder hindernissen op dan dat het de tekst voor een modern Nederlands publiek toegankelijk maakt. En de wijze waarop een en ander is verzorgd, is niet echt een opsteker voor de verspreiding van de Maleise letterkunde. Met andere woorden: dit boek overtuigt niet. Dat is niet alleen uitermate spijtig. Gezien de staat van dienst van zowel vertalers als uitgever is dat bovendien volstrekt onbegrijpelijk.

C.D. Grijns, *Jakarta Malay: a multi-dimensional approach to spatial variation*. 2 vols., Leiden: KITLV Press, (VKI 149), 1991. ISBN 90.6718.034.3/035.1. Price: f 100.-.

MARK DURIE
University of Melbourne

This impressive and demanding 2-volume work is an account of spatial variation in Jakarta Malay, the first language of a distinct ethnic group, the *Orang Betawi*, which comprise more than 2 million people living around and also in Jakarta. Despite its title, Jakarta Malay is not an urban variety: its speakers are found in the majority only outside the urban areas of Jakarta. At the time (1970) of the dialect field work upon which this work is based they constituted less than 10% of the population in the urban areas.

This language is distinct from modern urban Indonesian as spoken in Jakarta, and it has an independent history. Grijns argues that Jakarta Malay is a development from Malay used as a lingua franca by the diverse ethnic groups that came to Batavia as immigrants, or were imported as slaves, and underwent ethnic merging, a process which began as early as the 18th century and was already far advanced by the early 19th century. Groups incorporated into the Betawi community included Chinese, Eurasians, Balinese, and diverse peoples from eastern Indonesia. Today the Betawi constitute a separate ethnicity, with their own vernacular. Speakers themselves mostly refer to their language as Malay, or, in urban contexts, as Jakarta Malay.

After a brief introduction and description of the materials used for this study, Grijns argues for the distinct status of Jakarta Malay as an independent vernacular: that is, it is i) a distinct linguistic system, ii) the first language of an ethnic group, and iii) associated with a particular geographical area. The case he presents is convincing, and valuable not only for the information it gives concerning the distinctive linguistic features of Jakarta Malay and its geographical spread, but also for its discussion of such characteristics as oral history, religious practices, folklore, and speech codes. Grijns reports (vol. 1:35) that Jakarta Malay is 'exclusively an in-group language: it never functions as a language of wider communication.' The *orang Betawi* will switch to a variety of Indonesian when conversing with outsiders, and attempts by an outsider to switch to Jakarta Malay will not meet with a positive response, unless they are 'clearly integrated or integrating into the Betawi society'. Since even the presence of outsiders can inhibit the use of Jakarta Malay among Betawi speakers, it is quite understandable that non-Betawi's do not normally acquire the ability to speak Jakarta Malay, and its systematic study had been neglected until recent decades. This section of the book is a very nice introduction to the difficulties of studying 'non-standard' vernacular varieties of Malay: parallel difficulties exist for the outsider who wishes to study colloquial Malay in Malaysia (see Koh 1990:9-11);

Having dealt with these necessary preliminaries, Grijns devotes the rest of the first volume of his book to the 'meat' of his research: the application of a mathematical computer-based technique to reveal significant patterns in his dialect survey data. The survey itself was a huge one, incorporating data from 470 localities, over 1000 respondents, and more than 650 questionnaire items, all collected in 1970. From this abundance of data, some deceptively 'simple' questions needed to be answered: What are the main dialect groupings and how can they be distinguished? Which features are distinctive for the different dialects, which are characteristic of the whole speech community, and which vary randomly, with little or no correlation to dialectal groupings? Which dialects are more neutral and which more idiosyncratic? What role have the influences of Javanese, Sundanese, Balinese and even Malay itself played in the developing sub-systems of Jakarta Malay dialects?

These questions are in fact enormously complex and difficult ones. To address them Grijns has used a mathematical method called HOMALS (Homogeneity Analysis by Means of Alternating Least Squares). Grijns' analytical procedure is especially powerful for the kind of unstructured data that he collected. This is indeed the purpose for which HOMALS was designed: 'to discover latent structures in large, seemingly unstructured data sets for which few a priori assumptions can be made.' (vol. 1:274) The mathematical techniques are hypothesis-generating, rather than hypothesis-testing. The results are impressive indeed, and well-worth the 20 years of work that went into this project. My feeling after reading this book must be rather like that of the first cartographers to gain access to photographs taken from the air.

In Grijns' analysis, localities and variants (corresponding to responses to questionnaire items) are given scores, which may be positive or negative. These scores are progressively altered by an iterative HOMALS algorithm that attempts, very roughly speaking, to minimize the overall difference (the 'distance') between the scores for localities and the scores for their distinctive variants. In doing this, HOMALS maximizes inter group score differences, and minimizes intra group score differences: villages forming a dialect group will tend to share a common set of variants, and will score similarly, whilst sets of variants that are linked together as distinctive of the same set of dialects will also tend to score similarly. An effect of this is that 'neutral' variants, that are not dialect-distinctive will tend to score close to zero, whilst variants with high negative or positive scores will be strongly dialect distinctive. At the same time 'neutral' villages will have low scores, and highly idiosyncratic villages will have high scores.

Grijns developed these scores in 5 independent dimensions (i.e. 5 distinct scores for each variant and locality), with the dimensions being constructed in such a way that each dimension represents different information. Having applied HOMALS to generate scores, further mathematical techniques of cluster analysis were then used to group scores for variants and geographic

locations. Grijns also applied a 'second order' analysis, using output from one application of HOMALS as data for further HOMALS analysis.

The final stage of the procedure was interpretation of the clusters. The 'proof of the pudding' was that particular clusters can be given quite specific interpretations. Very early on in his research it became clear that there were seven distinct dialects within the Jakarta Malay speaking community, each dialect corresponding to a cluster of localities (see. e.g. vol. 2: map 32). The cluster analysis also revealed which localities within a cluster were most characteristic of a dialect – these were the core areas of the dialect – and which were more marginal (see vol. 2: map 30). At the same time it was possible to identify links between particular clusters of localities and clusters of variants. For example, the Urban Jakarta Malay dialect (ALLSETS CLUSTER 7) is linked to a number of clusters of variants, one of which, a set of lexical variants (Cluster 2G), turns out to contain the kinship terms which are typical of this dialect (vol. 1:216). Likewise dimensions can be given particular interpretations. In the third dimension, localities having negative scores are urban, those with positive scores are rural, and variants with very high positive scores in the third dimension are of Javanese or Sundanese origin.

In this study, the interpretation of the scores and their clusters reveals a huge variety of such descriptive patterns, together with their links to each other, much more than could be easily extracted by traditional techniques, and with more 'overview' than they permit, since the emergent patterns take into account *all* the available data.

It emerges from Grijns' interpretation of the clusters that two of the most important contributing external factors determining the structure of spatial variation in Jakarta Malay are the opposition 'urban' vs. 'rural' and the influence of Javanese, Sundanese and Balinese. Grijns concludes that the development of Jakarta Malay has involved convergence between various forms of Malay, with an important role played by points of compatibility between lingua franca Malay, Javanese, Sundanese and Balinese: 'Elements common to more than one vernacular had a better chance of being taken up into [Jakarta Malay]'.

The division of the book into two volumes is very handy: the second volume includes all the data appendices, maps and some texts. The cover is attractive and effective. There were rather too many small misspellings and other typographical errors (Table *3.4.1.2a in volume 2 has misaligned headings), and occasionally an un-English expression creeps in. A more explicit presentation in the Appendix of the mathematics of HOMALS (with mathematical formulae) would have been helpful, for this reader at least: I had to attempt to reconstruct some of the formulae in order to understand the informal presentations.

Grijns' *Jakarta Malay* is a highly professional piece of work. It shows technical skill and mastery of detail, and great vision and courage from its author to persevere with such a new and demanding methodology. Despite

the practical difficulties that hampered and delayed its production, it has emerged as a monumental achievement: a model for future research of this kind in linguistics, and an outstanding landmark in Malay studies.

REFERENCES

- Koh, Ann Sweesun, 1990. *Topics in Colloquial Malay*. Unpublished PhD dissertation, University of Melbourne.

Jan J. Boeles, *The Secret of Borobudur*, Bangkok, privately published, 1985, 90 pp. + appendix, 29 pp.

JAN FONTEIN

In *The Secret of Borobudur* Jan J. Boeles, best known for his many contributions to our knowledge of Thai art, returns to a topic first taken up when he studied Southeast Asian archaeology at Leiden University with the pioneer of Borobudur studies N.J. Krom (1883-1945). Although the author addresses many of the questions posed by the great Javanese stūpa, his principal thesis concerns the interpretation of the seventy-two Buddhas in dharmacakra-mudrā, placed inside the reticulated stūpas of the circular terraces of Borobudur. Quoting the descriptions of miracles in the Saddharma-puṇḍarīka Sūtra (Ch. XI of Kern's classic translation is reproduced as an appendix) the author interprets these statues as emanations of the Buddha Śākyamuni, preaching the dharma to all creatures. This interesting hypothesis is helpful to our understanding of Borobudur in more than one way.

The often observed descending progression from the closed, solid central stūpa to the reticulated stūpas with their dimly visible Buddhas and from these to the fully exposed Buddhas of the niches crowning the galleries can indeed be considered a well-conceived representation of the unfolding of a miracle of the type described in the Saddharma-puṇḍarīka Sūtra. That Mr Boeles is indeed on the right track is evident from his novel interpretation of the never satisfactorily explained differences in the shapes of the openings in the dome and the shapes of the harmikā between the sixteen stūpas of the third and the fifty-six stūpas of the first and second terraces. His explanation of the checkerboard reticulation and the octagonal harmikā of the stūpas of the highest terrace as symbolizing the 'Checkerboard Paradise' into which the world of suffering is transformed while the miracle takes place, is both ingenious and convincing.

While the author's interpretation offers new insights on the much-

discussed topics of the terraces, it is – like most other theories about Borobudur – not without flaws. Throughout the Buddhist world the key to the identification of any visual representation of the miracles of the Saddharma-puṇḍarīka Sūtra is the appearance of the two Buddhas side by side, and these are conspicuously absent on Borobudur. The author explains this absence by the fact that the central stūpa is closed and solid and that the figures residing inside remain, therefore, invisible. The other problem is of a much more fundamental character. On p. 8 the author writes: 'In light of the developed mahāyāna, however, the figure of Vairocana as yet is of no importance and his name is not even mentioned either in the lotus sūtra or in the lankāvatīśāstra. On the contrary, the central figure of these two sūtras is the eternal Buddha Śākyamuni whose transcendental preaching is symbolized by the vitarkamudrā. Therefore, it seems, that there are no compelling reasons here to replace Śākyamuni with Vairocana, provided that the lotus sūtra yields evidence which may help to explain fully the mystery of the central and main stūpa'.

These observations disregard the essence of the contents of the Gaṇḍavyūha, illustrated in 460 narrative reliefs of the higher galleries of Borobudur and likely, therefore, to provide some clues to the beliefs held by the sect that built the monument. It is difficult to imagine how after his protracted visit to Maitreya's kūtāgāra (which the Gaṇḍavyūha calls 'the Chamber of the Adornments of Vairocana') and which is illustrated in minute detail on a long series of reliefs, the pilgrim Sudhana would enter a Realm of Reality from which Vairocana is altogether absent. It is quite likely that the architects of Borobudur were influenced by descriptions of such miracles, but whether it was the specific miracle that was described in the Saddharma-puṇḍarīka Sūtra remains an open question. It should be noted that there are several texts, including the Gaṇḍavyūha, in which similar miracles have been described.

The author briefly touches upon a number of other questions concerning Borobudur, of which I can mention only two here. On p. XIX of the introduction he states his view on the sequence in which the reliefs were viewed by the pilgrims. He assumes that the reliefs illustrating the Lalitavistara were viewed before those representing the jātakas. While it cannot be denied that such a sequence would make the entire series of prakṛakṣiṇā straightforward and orderly, it would hardly seem in keeping with the edifying contents of the jātakas to have them follow instead of precede the Life of the Buddha, i.e. the final rebirth.

In his final section the author briefly discusses the hidden base of the monument. It will come as a surprise that the author proposes the dismantling of the hidden base, disregarding altogether the other modifications that were part of the same change in building plans. In 1929 Th. van Erp already demonstrated that a partial return to the original situation, i.e. the removal of the sixteen layers of stone surrounding the base, is not a feasible option.

When Sylvain Lévi discovered the textual source of the reliefs of the hidden base in 1928 he claimed that 'Borobudur had revealed one of its last secrets'. Mr. Boeles now makes the interpretation of the circular terraces the secret of Borobudur. That is a claim that others, who still see many unresolved questions, may perhaps contest. The Secret of Borobudur, even if it does not solve the last secret of the monument, makes interesting reading and offers challenging ideas to anyone fascinated by this great Buddhist monument.

Suryadinata, L., *Military Ascendancy and Political Culture; A Study of Indonesia's Golkar*. Ohio: Ohio University, Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series, no. 85, 1989, xiii + 223 pp. ISBN 0.89680154-3. Price \$ 11.50.

M. HEINS

Suryadinata's exposé of Golkar provides captivating reading for those interested in present-day Indonesian politics. Although it is not the first publication on the growth of Indonesia's largest political organisation, the author places Golkar's development within the wider context of Indonesian history and politics.

Called *Sekber Golkar* until 1971 (an acronym for *Sekretariat Bersama Golongan Karya*), the organization was initially set up to counter the growing influence of the Indonesian communist party *PKI*. It received active support from many other Indonesian socio-political organisations and institutions, attracting members from the military, the civil service, and from labour and trade associations. From its early formation in 1964, various army-sponsored trade unions, civil servants organisations, groups of intellectuals, students, and youths, and several workers' associations all sought affiliation with Golkar. As the author shows, several leading members of the Indonesian army were directly involved in Golkar's establishment and in its subsequent development as a socio-political organisation.

In the 1950s and 1960s the Indonesian military became an important political power, partaking actively in the complex party-political developments of that period.

Both their active involvement in national politics and their control of Golkar was strengthened in the wake of the *Gestapu*, the military coup of September/October 1965, which brought acting minister of defence General Suharto to the country's political fore.

According to the author, the post-coup military had little idea how to rule the country, in spite of its doctrine of *Dwifungsi* (Dual Function), a doctrine which maintained that the military could assume leading civilian positions

in government, on national, regional and local levels. Suryadinata submits that Golkar's was successfully developed as a 'viable electoral machine' (p. 22) to ensure a political victory for the military in the 1971 elections, to further consolidate military involvement in politics. The author's analysis of subsequent reorganisations, personnel shuffles and the ascendancy of a certain group of the military, the so-called 'pro-Suharto army officers', within the Golkar leadership makes intriguing reading.

Suryadinata explains how, after the 1971 elections, Golkar changed to represent the cultural and political aspirations of non-Muslims and nominal Muslims – people who opposed political Islam and Islamic fundamentalists (p. 60). Describing the dominant theme in Indonesian politics in terms of *santri* versus *abangan* culture, however, is the weak point of this monograph. The author applies these terms as if representing two mutually exclusive socio-cultural entities. Suryadinata thus reduces Indonesian political developments after 1965 to what he sees as a 'constant struggle' between the two political cultures of political Islam (or *santri*) and Pancasila (or *abangan*), which continued even after the military became a dominant political force (p. 21). Thus, according to the author, Golkar represents the dominant Indonesian political culture, often known as the *abangan* or *Pancasila* culture, and is the Indonesian answer to the *santri* culture or political Islam. However, since the introduction of this terminology by C. Geertz in 1959 several studies have questioned such a dichotomized interpretation of *santri* and *abangan*, and several authors have since argued that *santri* and *abangan* (sub-)cultures are better seen as two components of a specific socio-cultural continuum, whereby Islamic *santri* elements are also harboured by so-called *abangan* groups, and vice versa. In my opinion, therefore, the author's view of Golkar as a political organisation 'which merely inherited the political tradition of the parties which existed before the emergence of the New Order of Suharto' (p. xi), while perceiving the Islamic and non-Islamic political cultures as two opposing forces, is a too limited vision of the complex social, political and economic developments which have shaped Indonesian realities since 1965.

Ismail Hussein, *Antara Dunia Melayu dengan Dunia Kebangsaan*. Bangi: penerbit Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia 1990, 68 pp. ISBN 967.942.184.8.

V.J.H. HOUBEN

This small book contains the text, with some appendices, of the inaugural address of Ismail Hussein as a professor of Malay studies at the Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia in January 1990. Prof. Hussein is widely known for his activities in the Institute of the Malay Language, Literature and Culture

over the past twenty years, and in various functions he took an active role in the 853 engineering of bahasa Malaysia.

In this lecture the author deals with the development of Malay studies within the Malaysian national context of the 1970s and 1980s but also comes to grip with more fundamental issues, such as the contents and historical background of the terms 'Malay consciousness', 'Malayness' and the 'Malay-Polynesian world'. These terms are interpreted within the national historical contexts of the Philippines, Indonesia and Malaysia. At the end, a plea is made for a supra-national interpretation of Malayness, which, it is hoped, will get new impetus in this Asia-Pacific age.

It is not easy for a relative outsider to comment upon a narrative that is both a short study of Malayness and also a kind of political statement in which a future supra-national Malay unity is advocated. I have read this lecture against the background of what was already summed up in earlier writings on this topic.

In the literature it has often been stated that in a distant past the Malays of South Thailand, Malaysia and Indonesia must have been united in one 'state' that matched the widest boundaries of Srivijaya. In connection with this, *bahasa Jawi* has to be considered as the language of Sumatra or Malay, spreading out across insular Southeast Asia, however without the existence or development of a standard language. Also, as far as people are concerned, the term 'Malay' alludes to someone who speaks Malay, is a Muslim and follows Malay *adat*. Racial connotations are completely irrelevant in this. The argumentation outlined here thus constitutes a very open definition of the field of study concerned.

In a certain way Hussein's observations mirror these, but essentially constitute a contemporary, personally involved response to the detached, historical-theoretical approach of the Western scholar of Malay. He looks upon the past as far as it bears meaning for the future. Malay is supposed to bridge the gap between various ethnic groups within Malaysia but is also to be connected with a transnational consciousness that should be strengthened. The study of Malay, the deeper feelings of being 'Melayu', should be instrumental in regaining a former grandeur. It will be interesting to see whether the political economies of the Southeast Asian nations at this moment will favour such specific cultural definitions of a joint identity or whether those will remain essentially a Malaysian vision of Malayness.

Aruna Gopinath, *Pahang 1880-1933: a Political History* (Monograph/Malaysian Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society, 18). ISBN 98.3996.141.1.

VICTOR T. KING

This book was originally submitted as an M.A. thesis to the Department of History at the University of Malaya in 1977, although there has been the addition of materials from 1915 to 1933 as a brief Epilogue (pp. 203-216). The study presents a relatively straightforward narrative of political and administrative changes, political personages, conflicts and events, and certain economic transformations in the Malay state of Pahang prior to and during its incorporation into a wider British imperial system. These changes must be understood, at least in part, in the context of Pahang's relations with neighbouring states, particularly Johor and Selangor, and of Britain's policies towards the Malayan Peninsula. The author provides us with this context.

Like all good political histories, interest is sustained by focussing on some of the key personalities in the drama. More especially Gopinath's book is an account of the rise to power in Pahang and the eventual demise of Bendahara (Prime Minister) Wan Ahmad, who was formally proclaimed Sultan Ahmad al-Mu'azzam Shah by his subordinate chiefs on 12 December 1884, although he had assumed the title a few years before.

Gopinath first provides a brief geographical and historical sketch of Pahang, concentrating particularly on its traditional ties with the Sultanate of Melaka and the Johor-Riau-Lingga empire. The author then traces Wan Ahmad's struggle for power during the civil wars of 1857-1863, and the political turmoil of the later 1860s and the 1870s. Of specific interest is Gopinath's examination of the 'traditional' political and administrative system of Pahang (pp. 49-66), and the potential for conflicts within this structure. This, and the consideration of external factors affecting the internal politics from 1880 to 1888, help us to understand the strengths and weaknesses of Sultan Wan Ahmad's position and the ways in which British encroachment exposed the contradictions and exacerbated political tensions.

Clearly the Sultan was a skilful political actor but he, like other native leaders, was unable ultimately to resist European pressures. In October 1887, Sultan Ahmad conceded and accepted a British Agent, Hugh Clifford, which paved the way for the establishment of a British Residential system. Gopinath examines the gradual institutionalisation of British power and the reactions of the Sultan of Pahang and the Malay elite to this process. Of special interest is the detail provided on the Mat Kilau rebellion against the British in the 1890s. Even during the first two decades of British administration Sultan Ahmad remained a force to be reckoned with, but after his death in 1914, his successors increasingly accepted the realities of British government.

Gopinath gives us a well researched study, and enlivens it with a fascinating portrait of Sultan Wan Ahmad. The Malaysian Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society are to be congratulated for continuing to publish valuable materials on Malayan history.

J. van Goor (ed.), *Generale Missiven van Gouverneurs-Generaal en Raden aan Heren XVII der Verenigde Oostindische Compagnie, IX: 1729-1737* [Rijks Geschiedkundige Publicatiën, Grote Serie 205]. 's-Gravenhage: Instituut voor Nederlandse Geschiedenis, 1988, xii + 895 p. ISBN 90.5216.001.5. Price: f 143.-.

G.J. KNAAP

Since the nineteenth century, source publications have provided historians and social scientists with important first-hand information about past developments and events. For example, the work of the famous twentieth-century Dutch historian J.C. van Leur was based almost entirely on source publications. Many academics still rely heavily on these sources. In the Netherlands, in the area of overseas, colonial or non-western history, this tradition started with such people as J.K.J. de Jonge and J.A. van der Chijs. One important source of information about Dutch expansion into Asia and to a lesser extent about the Asian societies with which the Dutch came into contact are the *Generale Missiven*. Started by W.Ph. Coolhaas some decades ago and now continued by Van Goor, this edited and published series contains the reports sent by the VOC's High Government in Batavia to the Directors at home. Due to the quality of the information, the *Generale Missiven* are worth publishing in their own right. The importance of this series may even be increasing since the General State Archive in The Hague, which keeps the VOC archives, now requires researchers wanting to see other parts of the vast collection of manuscripts to use microfilms rather than the originals. This policy is no doubt a good step in terms of the collection's conservation. The quality of the microfilms, however, leaves much to be desired, and may be a detriment to future historical research.

Volume IX of the *Generale Missiven* is the first to be produced entirely by Van Goor, who continued the task of editing and publishing after Coolhaas' death. Three governors general are covered: Diderik van Durven (1729-1732), Dirk van Cloon (1732-1735) and Abraham Patras (1735-1737). The editing style has not changed much; the indexes are still extensive and accurate and the summaries remain of high quality. The main difference between this volume and previous ones is the annotation. Clearly, Van Goor was more interested in making the basic information available than in enriching the texts with annotations. The decision is understandable, since it would have taken Van Goor many years to make annotations comparable to those of Coolhaas, which contain additional information both from libraries and from other parts of the archives. Van Goor's decision does mean, however, that researchers using this source must now be much more familiar with the subject matter. For specialized researchers this presents little challenge, but what of less experienced readers, such as undergraduate students or historians without the benefit of academic training?

John S. Furnivall, *The Fashioning of Leviathan: The Beginnings of British Rule in Burma*, edited by Gehan Wijeyewardene. Canberra: Occasional Paper of the Department of Anthropology, Research School of Pacific Studies, The Australian National University, 1991, ii+178 p. Price: Aust.\$ 20.-.

OTTO D. VAN DEN MULZENBERG

Readers of Furnivall's magnum opus, *Colonial Policy and Practice: A Comparative Study of Burma and Netherlands India* (1948), will remember references to Leviathan, but few of them ever saw that long article, published in the *Journal of the Burma Research Society* (Rangoon) in April 1939, at a time and place which doomed it to obscurity.

Gehan Wijeyewardene and the officials of the now-defunct Burma Research Society should be complimented on their initiative to make this very lively account of the first British colonization available to us. Most historiography of the British period in Burma focuses on the Lower Burma region. The great agricultural transformation that took place there made Burma one of the world's major rice exporters. The southern region of Tenasserim, on the other hand, never acquired more than a passing importance for the British. Aside from its teak wood, it served only as a staging ground from which to increase the British influence on Siam and Burma.

The province was occupied in the course of the First Anglo-Burmese War (1824-1826) and soon placed under a civil commissioner, A.D. Maingy. Furnivall's story is based on the letters that Maingy and his successor, Blundell, wrote to their superiors. In the course of their tours of duty (1825-1843) the initially loosely organized trade emporium was integrated into the Indian Empire.

Furnivall clearly sympathised with his early colleagues, both of whom were caught in the same dilemma: they accepted the political economic theory of Liberalism, but were confronted with the need to rule the newly acquired territory in a manner that took local conditions into account. That made them look like personalistic and particularistic despots in the eyes of their far-away superiors.

The author enlivens his story considerably with a metaphor: Hobbes' image of Leviathan as the ruthless 'creature of the Law' which makes no exceptions for local or personal circumstance. The author reviews the establishment of a judicial system, complete with jails and a bureaucratic police force, which replaced individual-oriented common law (and common sense, according to Furnivall) and community-enforced social control. Next he outlines the building of an infrastructure of roads and bridges, important to the consolidation not only of administrative control, but also of the trade in teak. Material progress is counterposed to 'moral progress', leading the author to a candid discussion of the difficult position of the early colonial

officers. They were both instruments of Leviathan – whose morality is ‘measured in pounds sterling or pounds avoirdupois’ – and ‘men, reluctant to treat men as machinery’. This contradiction was reflected in almost every aspect of their work and led to repeated conflicts with the colonial centre in Calcutta and with local European and Asian traders bent on making a profit. The author reviews interesting cases where rationalities conflict, such as in the use of local personnel as jail guards and town police, the use of convict labour brought in from India, or the establishment of organized education and health care.

A considerable part of state-making consists of mobilizing revenue, the more so in the case of the colonial *Leviathan Indicus*. Therefore, separate chapters deal with the organization of gambling, the use of opium and alcohol. The author also looks at a range of other revenue sources, including land, to which the author dedicates a whole chapter. The book closes with a chapter on Blundell, whose devotion to the province was beyond doubt. Nevertheless, Blundell also came to embody the penetration of Leviathan to the local level, where his actions removed local autonomy and destroyed indigenous institutions without providing satisfactory replacements. Blundell eventually left the service ‘broken by Leviathan’, a martyr because he had defended the idea that ‘man cannot live by bread alone’.

Readers of Furnivall’s later writings will recognize many of his ideas on institutional arrangements and on the relationship between individual and society in a ‘normal’ as opposed to a colonial, ‘plural’ society. He was given to unwarranted idealization of ‘western society’, probably because of his abhorrence of what he saw around him in Burma. As a civil servant who was also an organizer of co-operatives and educational efforts, and a sympathizer of the nationalist movement, the author devoted his life to making Burma a better society. In addition to the intrinsic value of this early history of southern colonial Burma and its contribution to the debate on the colonial state and society, this re-publication is a tribute to a remarkable man and Fabian socialist.

The editor obliges the reader with a glossary and a short section of biographical notes. Occasionally he makes a well-taken correction to Furnivall’s text.

Wim van Zanten (ed.), *Across the Boundaries: Women’s Perspectives*; Papers read at the symposium in honour of Els Postel-Coster. Leiden: VENA, 1991.

JOKE VAN REENEN
Centrum Vrouwen en Autonomie

This book presents the papers discussed at a 1991 symposium to mark the retirement of honorary Professor Els Postel-Coster from the Centre for Women and Autonomy in Leiden, VENA.

As the title indicates, the book's central theme is 'women's perspectives'. The authors approach it from a wide range of angles. Also, they vary in the extent to which women's perspectives have indeed become a major focus.

The first paper is by Kamala Peiris, who raises a number of issues she has come across in her work in a non-governmental organization in Sri Lanka. She discusses the dichotomy between theory and practice, the position of feminist issues in the context of Third-World perspectives, and intervention by non-governmental organisations versus fundamental and structural political changes. According to the author, non-governmental organizations are in a much better position to take women's perspectives into account than are governmental organizations.

The second paper is by Reimar Schefold, who takes up the debate in alliance theory, a debate to which Els Postel-Coster also contributed. Schefold asks: 'Are women just signs whose function it is to connect the groups that send or receive them according to collective social rules?' Schefold notes a paradox: while women – who mediate between two groups and so know most about both parties – are restricted to the private domain of one single spot, men – whose lives are bound to one group – control outward communication. Schefold analyses several versions of a myth as it is told by male and female informants in Mentawai, a group of islands in western Indonesia. Apparently, the men stress the female capacity to bear children, which guarantees the continuation of the patrilineal group, whereas the women stress their own active mediating role in establishing different kinds of alliances. Schefold points to the male fiction that political alliances belong exclusively to the domain of men.

The third paper, by Mies Grijns, is about female workers in a tea plantation in West Java. The author relays observations made during her research of the many changes in living conditions of the women there. Yet while things have generally improved, the women maintain that nothing has changed. As an explanation, Grijns points to the increased insecurity and loss of control these women have experienced, and notes that this ought to be taken into account in development policy.

Next comes a cluster of papers by four Dutch and Tanzanian women (respectively Koos Kingma, Anna Mulela, Nettie Aarnink and Idda Ikombe) who are attempting to increase the extent of female participation in an intergovernmental agricultural extension project. They report on their involvement with this development project and its provisional results.

Joke Schrijvers offers a challenging paper on autonomy titled 'Autonomy as Policy: A Matter of Boundaries?' Her answer ('of course') is yes. Schrijvers deals with boundaries in meaning and application both in the conceptual, institutional and political sense. She makes it clear that, to her,

the concept of autonomy is useful, despite certain criticisms. She is not very confident about the effectiveness of incorporating autonomy into Dutch governmental development policy; she warns that the concept – and what it implies – may lose its own autonomy.

In addition to the papers mentioned, the book contains an introduction by Claudine Helleman, the symposium's opening address by J.D. Speckmann, and an epilogue by the editor, Wim van Zanten, who recapitulates the major points raised during the discussions at the symposium.

Roxana Waterson, *The Living House; An Anthropology of Architecture in South-East Asia*. Singapore: Oxford University Press, 1990, xx + 263 pp.

REIMAR SCHEFOLD

In recent years the new anthropological interest in manifestations of material culture of South-East Asia has resulted in several spectacular monographs in the field of textiles. *The Living House* demonstrates that a similar interest is emerging in the domain of vernacular architecture; it is its special merit to present the hitherto rather scattered sources in a clear and comprehensive view. The emphasis is more specific than the subtitle suggests, as there is little treatment of technical details and most examples refer to the rural traditions of the Indonesian archipelago. The author's intent is 'to look closely at the social and symbolic aspects of indigenous architecture' (p. xv).

After a short but very instructive introduction to the history of interpreting traditional architectural forms, the book continues with a chapter on the origins of South-East Asian wooden buildings. Waterson mentions three formal features which in her view are indications of a common Austronesian heritage: the raised floor structure on piles or on crossed-log foundations, the saddle-backed roof, often with outward slanting gable ends, and the decorative gable finials in the form of crossed horns. She recapitulates the literature about possible relationships to the Dong Son culture of the Early Metal-Age in which occurrence of this type is clearly demonstrated in art, but ends with the conclusion that the roots of the, as she calls it, 'Indonesian-type' house and consequently, of its occurrence in Dong Son, must be sought in the Southeast Asian neolithic. With this line of argumentation the author follows the pioneering work of Gaudenz Domenig although in one respect she lapses into a misunderstanding of terminology: according to Domenig, the most important characteristic of Austronesian roof construction is the outward slanting gable; the frequent concave curvatures of the ridge lines (which are not an intrinsic attribute of what in German is called a 'Satteldach') are considered by Domenig to

represent later local developments. This point remaining open for discussion, the question of origins becomes even more complex when the methods of construction are taken into consideration. Waterson does not mention that a clear line can be drawn between construction methods used west of New Guinea, based on mortise and tenon techniques, and the methods used farther to the east, including (Austronesian) Polynesia, where the building elements are attached together by binding materials, e.g. rattan lianas. This boundary coincides almost exactly with the traditional borderline of the distribution of metal tools. Although there is some archaeological evidence of the application of simple mortise and tenon techniques in the neolithic traditions of Southeast Asia, it seems to me that – in contrast perhaps to the purely formal features – the very intricate methods of wood-to-wood joinery in the Indonesian-type houses can hardly be understood independently of the introduction of metal tools.

The second chapter deals with western reactions to the Indonesian-type houses. Although the Dutch themselves had created rather precarious hygienic conditions in Batavia, what they lamented in the indigenous houses were aspects they considered to be unhygienic or unpractical: the smallness of the interior rooms under enormous roofs, the lack of windows and the hilltop locations. This resulted in drastic resettlement programmes which partly continue today, and which in numerous places led to a sad decline in the local traditions.

In many vernacular houses ritual and social significance is no less important than practical use. In the following chapters Waterson presents various examples of this and examines some special structures: religious architecture, community houses, public buildings and constructions relating to gender or marital status. All buildings share certain constructional principles, such as the joinery techniques mentioned above or a post-and-beam system where walls, if any, rarely have a load-bearing function. There is much local variation in detail, for instance in the ways the curvature of the saddle roof is achieved. According to the author, constructional elements which are superfluous in terms of a building's structural viability should be given special attention as they may feature very prominently in symbolic terms. The same holds true for rules concerning the orientation of the houses. This aspect leads to the architectural impact of cosmological and sociological ideas which give meaning to the structure of houses and settlements.

The sixth chapter deals with another angle of house symbolism: the building is regarded as a living organism which must be in concordance with its occupants in order to guarantee their well-being. This view is reflected in rules for the ceremonial treatment and arrangement of building materials (particularly of the main house posts), for the application of decoration, or for the coordination of the measurements of the 'body' of a house with those of the inhabitants, and it is substantiated in the house-building ritual.

Chapter seven is devoted to the sociological dimension. In recent years

this aspect has attracted new theoretical interest through the parallel ideas of James Fox on the house as 'metaphor' and of Claude Lévi-Strauss on the 'Sociétés à maisons'. The South-East Asian 'house' is seen as a fundamental cultural category with specific features such as a name, founding ancestors, ritual functions and sacred heirloom valuables. It represents a common focus for the formation of groups in societies with ostensibly very different and, according to context, often very variable systems of descent, alliance and ranking. Waterson illustrates this with several well-chosen examples, ending with the society she knows best from her own fieldwork: the Sa'dan Toraja.

The next chapter looks at the ways in which people act out their social relationships in the use of the spaces within a house. Waterson especially considers gender relations. She offers a symmetric picture of the rights and duties of the in-marrying party in virilocal and in uxorilocal situations; on the other hand she finds a pervasive association of the woman with agricultural crops and their storage places in the granary or, alternatively, in the inner, most sacred part of the house. The author is of the opinion that in Indonesia – in contrast, for example, to North African societies – the association of the female with 'inside' does not entail any practical restrictions and does not prevent women from playing active roles at times even in political life. She refers to such populations as the Atoni of Timor with their 'immobile' lords who are associated both with inside and with the female; the reader might wonder, however, whether such a symbolic analogy is sufficient to support drawing direct conclusions about the position of women in daily life.

After a description of special constructions for the dead and for the ancestors and of the associated rituals, Waterson, in the last chapter, presents an analysis of some modern developments in the field of vernacular architecture. Arguing against a static view of the concept of tradition, she points out that in many places labour migration and ethnic tendencies have given new impulses to specific aspects of indigenous building. A case in point is the Toba Batak (with their recent boost of figurative funeral monuments) and again the Sa'dan Toraja (*tongkonan* houses). The author's results partly coincide with those of a Dutch research team (cf. R. Schefold's 'Heartless House and Painted Concrete: Aspects of Ethnicity among Sa'dan Toraja and Toba Batak' in: Ph. Quarles Van Ufford et al (eds): *Religion and Development*, Amsterdam 1988), where however, additional information is provided about the significance of local historical changes in the forms of the constructions and about the question of possible cultural factors motivating the different accentuation of ethnic symbolism in the two societies.

In spite of its broad thematic array, this book is not encyclopedic in character. *The Living House* is transformed into a lively account, pursuing a clear and well-argued line of presentation. Time and again the author finds pithy, precise wordings and poses relevant questions which will sound

familiar to everybody working in the same field. The numerous photographs in black and white and colour, many taken by the author, many others the result of exploring archival material, provide not only welcome illustrations but also serve to underline the author's concern with the preservation of these magnificent building traditions. The book will soon find its place among the standard works in the field of vernacular architecture.

Jürg Wassmann, *The Song to the Flying Fox*. Translated by Dennis Q. Stephenson. Apwitihiri: L Studies in Papua New Guinea Musics, 2. Cultural Studies Division, Boroko: The National Research Institute, 1991, xxi + 313 pp. ISBN 9980.68.018.0.*

GUNTER SENFT

In 1982 Jürg Wassmann wrote about the public and esoteric knowledge of the important men of Kandingei, a village on the Middle Sepik. This Ph.D. thesis, published in the Ethnological Seminar series at the University of Basel (Switzerland), was about totemic songs, names and knotted cords. Almost ten years later the Cultural Studies Division of the National Research Institute of Papua New Guinea (formerly the Institute of PNG Studies) has published this slightly abridged¹ version of Wassmann's monograph in English. Hopefully this will make Wassmann's seminal contribution to the Sepik ethnography available to the broad audience it deserves. What Bateson (1932 and 1936) could not achieve in his Iatmul research – that is, to find some order in what he called the 'dreadful muddle' (Bateson 1936:128) of the Iatmul system of relationship – is reconstructed and described 'as fully as possible' (p. 47) in Wassmann's monograph. His ethnography is based on 12 months of field research in cooperation with the Sepik field work of the Ethnological Seminar of the University of Basel, lead by Meinhard Schuster.

Preceding the main body of Wassmann's work are an introduction by the series editor (Don Niles), the approval of Kandingei leaders and big men to publish the formerly secret data, a foreword by Andrew Strathern, the author's preface, and 'The Song to the Flying Fox' as prologue. Wassmann

* For inquiries regarding this publication: The Publication Sales Coordinator, The National Research Institute, P.O. Box 5854, Boroko, Papua New Guinea.

¹ Unfortunately the author decided not to reproduce the texts of the songs in the Iatmul language. Thus, the interested reader, especially the (ethno-)linguist has to consult the German publication of Wassmann's study for the original text transcriptions. Moreover, only the German publication provides a detailed description of the genealogies of the various clans mentioned in the monograph.

starts with a general description of the village of Kandingei and its complex social structure. He then poses the central question of his research: 'whether there is a key to the whole system of what at first seem to be divergent parts of the culture' (p. 248). He looks at 'whether relationships... exist between spirits and genealogies, between personal names and flutes, between totems and totemic songs, between the primal creatures of myth and land ownership, and between watercourses and everyday utensils' (p. 248).

The author answers this question by presenting what he calls 'an actual theory of cultural links' (p. 248), a partly esoteric, clan-related and dynamic system that organizes and regulates the various aspects of intra-cultural relationships mentioned in the guiding question of his research.

The secret 'knotted cord' (*kirugu*) is both the key to and the cornerstone of this organizational system. Wassmann emphasizes that the *kirugu* is the 'primal migration of the clan founder and the other primal beings which is the basis of the present world order and which bears the name of the migratory crocodile which prepared the way for the clan founder' (p. 248). The knots represent names of the earth of creation, stations of the primal migration, and contain names of ancestresses who either founded the villages or who are taken to be the women of the village or of its men's house. For each name incorporated in the cord there is a short text, and these texts constitute a song cycle.

By following the cord and its song cycle, Wassmann leads the reader from creation to present times. We learn how the culture is encompassed and encapsulated in the stories in the *kirugu*'s knots, and the names and songs they represent. The system of organization coded in the cord allows the big men to interpret the present. The rights of present members of the clan – especially their rights with respect to ownership of names and land – can thus be traced back to the ancestors, the primal beings.

These beings can be called by flutes and invited to creep into masks that represent them. In mythology primal men made rattan frames or masks and crept inside if they wanted to become certain creatures. One of these acts of metamorphosis is described in the song that gave this book its title: 'Men became flying foxes and flew away from their women. After this the women lamented the departure of their former husbands in the "The Song to the Flying Fox"', which Wassmann again presents in the epilogue.

The book is well edited, provides the reader with excellent maps, plans and drawings, and has only a few marginal print errors. Four appendices provide further detailed ethnographic and linguistic information. Wassmann's monograph is a seminal contribution to the anthropology of the Middle Sepik cultures; without hesitation it can be included with other ethnographic masterpieces on these cultures, such as Bateson's *Naven*.²

² To date, Wassmann's second monograph on the songs of the village Kandingei, 'The Song to the Crocodile', is only available in the 'Basler Beiträge zur Ethnologie', in German.

Thomas John Hudak, *The indigenization of Pali meters in Thai poetry*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Center for International Studies, Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series Number 87, 1990, x + 237 pp. ISBN 0.89680.159.4. Price: \$15.-.

A. TEEUW

The introductory chapters of this book present a summary of Thai literary history; traditional Thai literature essentially consisted of poetry. The author briefly discusses the five classical verse forms *khloong*, *râay*, *kàap*, *chân* and *klɔɔn*. The general pattern of Thai poetry is stanzaic. Stanzas (*bòt*) consist of a number of lines (*bàat*), and a line may be divided into two parts, sometimes more (*wák*, hemistich). All verse forms are syllabic and the number of verses per stanza is determined by specific conventions for the different types of poetry.

The book focuses on how *chân* verse forms have been created based on the Pali metric system. Apparently Thai poets made a conscious effort to suit Pali metres to the requirements of their language. This is clear from a Thai translation of the only extant Pali treatise on metrics *Vuttodaya*, written in Ceylon in the 12th century. The oldest manuscripts of the translation date back to the 16th century, though *chân* metres were used in Thai poetry as early as the 15th century. The Thai selected the syllabic metrical system, as this was obviously better suited to their language than the Pali system of vowel length. The Pali rules for the opposition between heavy and light syllables have been adapted in such a way that only syllables ending in vowel (plus glottal stop) are considered light, whereas all syllables ending in consonants, including the semivowels *y* and *w*, are heavy. Further changes made in the Pali system include: the introduction of typically rhyming conventions, both within stanzas and between stanzas; a patterned division of the line into *wák*; a further conventional division of the *wák* into *liilaa*, a kind of metrical feet whose structure reflects Thai linguistic and aesthetic preferences; and the rule that each verse, *wák* and *liilaa* always end in a heavy syllable. Hudak also emphasizes the fact that poetry was for recitation, aesthetic criteria being defined aurally: a verse should be pleasant to the ear.

The *chân* verse became quite popular, especially under the patronage of Thai kings, several of whom were themselves poets. However, only six out of more than a hundred metres discussed in the *Vuttodaya* became popular in classical Thai poetry. In 1913 an authoritative work, written at the instruction of king Rama VI, added twelve new metres. This innovation was short-lived; traditional poetry, judged elitist and socially irrelevant by a young generation of poets, fell into disuse soon after the 1932 *coup d'état* and the ensuing socio-political and cultural changes in Thailand.

The book, parts of which were published earlier as separate articles, is

not in all respects satisfactory. It is somewhat unbalanced and not well organised, closely related data and subjects are sometimes scattered over various chapters; and in certain cases relevant information seems to be lacking altogether. Yet, the study is valuable, not least because of the wealth of examples from Thai texts. These include a long fragment from an 18th century religio-historical text, with a detailed specification of the way rules and conventions were applied.

The book is of particular interest to the student of Old Javanese, as it presents another Southeast Asian example of an Indian metric system being intentionally adapted to an indigenous linguistic structure. As in the case of Old Javanese, this foreign system coexisted with indigenous poetic forms (although in contrast with Thai literature, sources suggest that Java's *kidung* was preceded by the foreign *kakawin* style of poetry). Not only does the student of Old-Javanese easily recognize the terminological identity of heavy (*khárú?*) and light (*láhú?*) (through Pali *garu* and *lahu*) with the Sanskrit/Old Javanese opposition *guru-laghu*. He also immediately discovers that the six Pali *chān* metres preferred by the Thai poets are among the most popular *kakawin* metres in Old Javanese, where they still bear the original Sanskrit names: Indrabajra, Toṭaka, Basantatilaka, Malini/Śārdulawikrīḍita and Sragdhara. Perhaps the time has come for a comparative study of Southeast Asian verse forms and their interrelationship *and* their relation to South Asian poetics.

George Quinn, *The Novel in Javanese: Aspects of its social and literary character*. Leiden: KITLV Press, (VKI 148), 1992, ix + 330 pp. ISBN 90.6718.033.5. Price: f 50.-.

A. TEEUW

This book begins with a historical sketch of the Javanese novel in the 20th century. The author argues that the Javanese novel is not just a western import; 'in many respects [it] grew out of the travelogue', a popular genre in earlier Javanese tradition. The main characteristics of the modern novel as a literary genre are discussed in the second chapter. The author points out how strongly traditional motifs are represented in them. He also argues that the novels are basically melodramatic and romantic; the typical plot has a happy ending which usually highlights the dominant moral order. The Javanese language, itself an expression of a unique cultural identity, makes an important contribution to the generic identity of the novel, as does the 'discourse of romanticism', by which Quinn means the way these novels convey communal values and cultural solidarity, based on the awareness of a common past.

The third chapter deals with literary discourse and social reality. The

author specifies three thematic motifs which frequently function as conventional elements to forge the necessary coherence of the plot and highlight its aesthetic value: problematic parenthood; moral 'forgetting' (*lali*); and coincidence, which in this literature paradoxically asserts the holistic order in the cosmos. Chapter four is about ideology. In this respect three types of novels are distinguished: the *priyayi*, the *panglipur wuyung* and the modernist novel, each showing its own variant of Javanist ideology and catering to its own readership. The next chapter is an illuminating analysis of the semiotic function of space in the novels, as it reflects the conceptual division of space in Javanese culture, with special emphasis on domestic space, the house being 'the central image of contemporary Javanese fiction'.

In general the author has been successful in proving his main point, namely that the absence of the Javanese novel from literary history is totally unwarranted. His book is an eloquent and convincing plea for the recognition of the novel as an important 20th century Javanese literary genre. In the four analytic chapters, Quinn illustrates his analyses and conclusions with many, well-chosen examples, while also presenting a large number of summaries of the novels discussed. His book provides another amplification and enrichment of the concept and scope of modern literature in Indonesia, as did Claudine Salmon's study on Chinese Malay literature. Quinn was able to achieve this goal because, rather than starting out with prejudices and external criteria, he investigated the Javanese novel as a generic identity in its own social setting and as part of an ongoing cultural and literary tradition. Accordingly he was able to elucidate its social relevance as well as its aesthetic function within Javanese culture and society.

Quinn's study strongly supports his critical attitude towards earlier students and scholars, myself included, who (with the exception of Ras on the western side and Suripan Sadi Hutomo in Indonesia) either neglected this literature or lightly dismissed it as meaningless and of no value.¹ In the final chapter Quinn explains that the 'absence' of the contemporary Javanese novel from Indonesian literary history is the result of three ideological complexes. Firstly, European imperialism and feelings of cultural superiority made authoritative (Dutch and other) orientalist judge modern Javanese literature as socially irrelevant and aesthetically worthless in comparison to both the 'rich' classical texts and to modern western literature. Secondly, conservative *priyayi* hegemony claimed that, in comparison to the work of the traditional *pujangga*, Javanese novels could only be frivolous and superficial, due to the decline of the Javanese language

¹ Five years after Quinn's doctoral thesis, of which his book is 'a slightly revised version', that is in 1989, the well-known Indonesian poet and literary critic Sapardi Djoko Damono at the *Universitas Indonesia* defended his thesis on the Javanese novel in the fifties (*Novel Jawa Tahun 1950-an: telaah fungsi, isi, dan struktur*). So far this study has not been published.

as used by western educated writers and the ensuing loss of traditional values. Thirdly Indonesian nationalism, for which *bahasa Indonesia* was the self-evident medium of national culture, considered a regional literature by definition to be anti-modern, even feudal, and 'a threat to [...] Indonesia's hard-won and still precarious unity'.

Of course this study does not settle the problem of the value of these novels in a broader context. In Javanese literature there is no Pramoedya Ananta Toer, no Mangunwijaya, no Umar Kayam. Quinn does not explain why Javanese was an impossible literary medium for such authors. A comparison of novels by Javanese authors in Indonesian and Javanese poses intriguing questions: are there thematic differences? Is there an ideological opposition, related to the choice of language? Is the 'topos' of *menyerah*, *sumarah*, which is so dominant among novelists from a Javanese background, absent in the corpus discussed by Quinn? Would a feminist reading of these Javanese books yield results similar to those in Tineke Hellwig's dissertation on Indonesian novels? Not the smallest merit of this attractive book is that it is thought-provoking and challenging to further research.

Evert-Jan Hoogerwerf, *Persgeschiedenis van Indonesië tot 1942. Geannoteerde bibliografie*. Leiden: KITLV Uitgeverij, 1990, xv + 249 pp. ISBN 90.6718.022.X. Prijs: f 35,-.

GERARD TERMORSHUIZEN

De Nederlands-Indische pers vormt een bijzondere bron van historische kennis. Dat geldt zowel de Nederlandstalige als de inheemse kranten. De eerstgenoemde bieden vanwege hun sterk opiniërende karakter een goed zicht op wat er onder de Europeanen leefde aan opvattingen, wensen en grieven, zoals zij ons ook veel vertellen over de 'mentaliteit' van de Europeanen, bijvoorbeeld wat hun houding betreft jegens inheemsen en Indo-europeanen. Ook de inheemse bladen vormen een belangwekkende bron van informatie, in het bijzonder voor zover deze na 1900 een rol gingen spelen bij de nationale bewustwording en de opkomst van nationalistische bewegingen.

De inventarisatie en geschiedschrijving van de Indische pers heeft weinig aandacht gekregen. In Maarten Schneiders bekende handboek *De Nederlandse krant* ontbreken de in Indië verschenen kranten geheel, en de ons ter beschikking staande overzichten van de Nederlandstalige koloniale pers (b.v. die van Von Faber en Wormser) zijn behalve summier uiterst onbetrouwbaar. Vooral dank zij de (ongepubliceerde) dissertatie van A.B. Adam, *The vernacular press and the emergence of modern Indonesian consciousness (1855-1913)* uit 1984 komt de inheemse pers er beter van af, zij het dan voor een beperkte periode.

Parallel aan de in de laatste 15 jaar in Nederland toegenomen belangstel-

ling voor pershistorisch onderzoek, is de aandacht voor de pers uit de vroegere koloniën de laatste jaren duidelijk gegroeid. Het resulteerde onder meer in Hoogerwerfs – oorspronkelijk als doctoraal scriptie gepresenteerde en vervolgens aanzienlijk uitgebreide – geannoteerde bibliografie van publicaties met betrekking tot de persgeschiedenis van Indonesië vanaf de VOC-tijd tot 1942. De opgenomen publicaties – het zijn er bijna 600 – betreffen in de allereerste plaats nieuws- en dagbladen.

De door Hoogerwerf samengestelde bibliografie is een waardevol boek. Dat is het met name voor wat de publicaties betreft over de Nederlandstalige pers, waaraan de eerste drie hoofdstukken (over resp. de 'geboorte' van de Indische pers, de periode van 1856-1900 en die tussen 1900 en 1942) zijn gewijd. Minder goed ontsloten is het materiaal – vooral door de moeilijkere toegankelijkheid ervan – over de inheemse pers, dat slechts één hoofdstuk krijgt toebedeeld.

Een grote verdienste van de bibliografie is de heldere structuur ervan. Elk hoofdstuk begint met een informatieve inleiding. In het telkens daarop volgende bibliografische gedeelte is het materiaal zo veel mogelijk geordend naar thema, b.v. drukperswetgeving en -delicten, de roemruchte 'tropenstijl', Indische journalisten (met o.a. biografische informatie) en inheemse persorganen met hun 'politieke' bindingen en doeleinden. Elke opgenomen publicatie (met vermelding van vindplaats) is voorzien van een korte inhoudelijke karakteristiek. Een uitgebreid register ten slotte maakt het geheel op een adequate wijze toegankelijk.

Hoogerwerfs bibliografie levert een belangrijke bijdrage aan de ontsluiting van de Indische pers. Zij is bovendien onmisbaar voor een ieder die zich in enigerlei opzicht bezighoudt met de vroegere kolonie en daarbij de Indische nieuwsbladen wil benutten als bron van informatie. Het boek vormt daartoe de introductie bij uitstek.

Daniele C. Geirnaert and Rens Heringa, *The AÉDTA Batik Collection*. Paris, 1989, p. 81, diagrams and colour ill., Sold out. (Paris Avenue de Breteuil, 75007).

A. VELDHUISEN-DJAJASOEBRATA

The Association pour l'Étude et la Documentation des Textiles d'Asie (AÉDTA), which has over 250 Indonesian specimens in its large collection of Asian textiles, produced this brochure devoted entirely to the batiks of Java. This is the third in a series of brochures intended to highlight different aspects of AÉDTA's Asiatic textile collection. Translating the batik documentation makes AÉDTA's collection, housed in Paris, more accessible to a broader, international public.

Two Indonesian textile specialists – as knowledgeable in the materials and techniques of batiks as in their symbolism and function – collaborated with

AÉDTA; they greatly enhance the importance of this collection. The result of this co-operation is this interesting publication, *The AÉDTA Batik Collection*. This brochure provides readers with both a profound background and a clear insight into the subject.

The volume is divided into five chapters: From technique to symbolism in Javanese batik (Geirnaert), Makers and wearers (Heringa), and Basic materials and technique (Heringa), How to read a batik (Heringa), Catalogue of the AÉDTA batik collection (Geirnaert and Heringa). This fifth chapter is subdivided into three parts: square cloths; breast and shoulder cloths, and hip cloths. the part on hip cloths is further divided into five sections: Central Javanese hip cloths worn by court-related people; Central and East Javanese hip cloths worn by commoners; traditional hip cloths from the north coast; north coast hip cloths for export; and north coast Indo-European and Peranakan hip cloths.

The brochure includes a selected glossary, a bibliography and a map showing Java's main batik centres. the book contains forty-two colour illustrations.

Certain cloths were photographed more than once to highlight different details. For each of the types of cloth described, line drawings are included, which enhances one's insight into the matter.

The complex world of batik and batik patterns has much confusing terminology. While people generally agree on the principal classifications, an amazing diversity of nomenclature exists within each classification, often concerning very similar details. It seems the more work is published, the greater this diversity becomes. We need only compare Jasper and Mas Pirngadie and Tirtaamidjaja with more recent authors like S.K. Sewan Susanto (*Senbi Kerajinan Batik Indonesia*; Jakarta 1973) and Annegret Haake (*Javanische Batik; Methode, Symbolik, Geschichte*; Hannover 1984) or Nian S. Djoemena (*Ungkapan Sehelai/Batik, Its Mystery and Meaning*; Jakarta 1986) – all pioneers in the field – to be convinced that their work is by no means exhaustive. since quite a few books on javanese batik have appeared lately, both in Indonesia and in other countries, and since it is likely that information about this culture will become ever more detailed, I permit myself to pick up a few seemingly loose strands.

In future work about the meaning of the batik language, the meaning of certain frequently used drawings or symbols or pictograms (as they could even be named) could be better explained. Often, the same pictograms are given similar – but not identical – meanings on Java.

A 'dictionary' would be helpful, one which lists the various interpretations of batik by people from different groups and different regions. For example, Sewan Susanto (1973:263) identifies a certain pictogram as a *pohon hayat* or tree of life. The same symbol on headcloth AÉDTA 669 (as I read it) is described as a lotus flower. Similarly, the interpretation of a pictogram on AÉDTA 690 reads: 'a large lotus flower or *teratai*, which is planted in a vessel'. This lotus flower now looks much like what Sewan

Susanto calls 'a tree of life'. Tree of life or lotus flower, how are we to interpret this? Similar examples exist in other work, such as a pattern which has been interpreted to mean: fire flames (*lida api*) by Haake (1984:50); veins (*urat*) or possibly the roots of a tree or plant, or a rhizome, by the descendants of Surakarta court subjects of the hamlet Girirejo who use traditional Surakarta designs; or even the interred corpse of the mythological princess, Dewi Sinta, spouse of Prince Rama. In yet another example, in 1981 the late B.P. Suryobrongto, eldest brother of Sultan Hamengku Buwono IX, provided this description to the pictogram commonly known as *meru* or (cosmic) mountain: 'ah, yes, those "worms", they are the true determinants of that group of highly esteemed batik motifs we call *semen* which is reserved for special ritual occasions. Those 'worms', arranged in triplicity symbolize the Hindy-like Trimurti consisting of Brahma, Wisnu and Siva. Without those 'worms' the pattern cannot be called *semen*, but just *lung-lungan*'. According to suryobrongto, then, *lung* means tendril, *lung-lungan* in batik refers to plant motifs. Again: how are these designs to be interpreted? A single explanation simply does not suffice in every case, and a dictionary of batik motifs could facilitate the search for meaning.

On the whole, the AÉDTA interpretations are fitting and convincing. However, in light of the possible variation around the lotus flower and tree of life patterns, one is left to wonder if variations are possible in the other interpretations as well.

I also have some remarks about several specific descriptions in this brochure. The description given to the batik AÉDTA 2116 could be expanded: *partan*, named after 'a well-known batik entrepreneur, Mr Parto of Solo who produced a highly appreciated range of stamped batik during the 1950s consisting mainly of *parang* type motifs'. *Partan* is also: in the style of Parta-(ningrat), a batik entrepreneur related to the court of Mangkunagara, who produced *batik cap* (stamped on patterns) in the 1920s which gained great popularity due to their likeness with batik canting (patterns drawn by hand). The description of AÉDTA 1263, a hipcloth which includes the *obar-abir* motif, can also be expanded. As explained in the text, *Obar-abir* means 'waving banners'. The motif shows zig-zagging bars filled with different decorations such as flowers and tendrils. This motif is possibly derived from Muslim textiles from the Near East. During the 17th and 18th century textiles produced in Iraq and Turkey, for example, had the same zig-zagging bars, but these were filled with calligraphy from the Koran. Among other things, these cloths were used to cover the graves of holy men. They were replaced when worn out. The old cloth was cut into pieces and distributed among believers, who cherished their treasure for its attributed charismatic qualities. It is likely that the motif and its associations reached Indonesia. The motif became popular along the Javanese north coast, with its early Muslim contacts. In Cirebon it is known as *lengko-lengko* (with many crooks).

The description of AÉDTA 2097, a *kemben* (breastcloth) from Garut in

West Java, raises a question. Since women West Javanese women do not, as a rule, use a *kemben*, can this piece be meant as a tablecloth for Europeans?

This book has a wealth of information about Java's batik motifs and their meanings – highly recommended. The information is presented in a clear and direct way, with real examples. It gives basic, solid information, and leads to further questions.

KORTE SIGNALERINGEN

HARRY A. POEZE

E.E. van Delden (red.), *Klein repertorium; Index op tijdschriftartikelen met betrekking tot voormalig Nederlands-Indië; Deel 7, Acht algemene tijdschriften 1834-1864*. Amsterdam: Koninklijk Instituut voor de Tropen, 1993, 118 pp. ISBN 90.6832.608.2. Prijs f 40,-.

G.J. Knaap, W. Manuhutu en H. Smeets (red.), *Sedjarah Maluku; Molukse geschiedenis in Nederlandse bronnen*. Amsterdam: Van Soeren, 1992, 109 pp. ISBN 90.6881.025.1. Prijs f 32,50.

Anna Abrahamsz, *Journaal eener Oostindiesche Reis; De belevenissen van een tienjarig meisje in 1847 en 1848*. Met een inleiding en slotbeschouwing van Marc A. van Alphen. Amsterdam: Terra Incognita, 1993, 71 pp. ISBN 90.73853.04.4. Prijs f 18,50. (Te bestellen bij de uitgever, p/a Instituut voor Neerlandistiek, Spuistraat 134, 1012 VB Amsterdam.)

P.G.H. Schreurs, *Terug in het erfgoed van Franciscus Xaverius; Het herstel van de katholieke missie in Maluku, 1886-1960*. Tilburg: Missiehuis MSC, 1992, vii + 328 pp. ISBN 90.90052.56.9. Prijs f 48,-. (Te bestellen bij de uitgever, Postbus 90109, 5000 LA Tilburg.)

G. Puchinger, *Landvoogd en minister*. Leiden: Groen, 1993, 318 pp. ISBN 90.5030.335.8. Prijs f 42,50.

B.R. Immerzeel en F. van Esch (red.), *Verzet in Nederlands-Indië tegen de Japanse bezetting 1942-1945*. Den Haag: SDU Uitgeverij Koninginnegracht, 1993, 242 pp. ISBN 90.12.06847.9. Prijs f 39,90.

J.C. Uithol en J.M. van Wijk (red.), *Gods trouw in de tropen; Belevissen van een aantal oudgedienden in het voormalig Nederlands Oost-Indië gedurende de jaren 1946-1950*. Barneveld: Koster, 1993, 399 pp. ISBN 90.71420.78.7. Prijs f 59,90.

Fertility and family planning policies in Indonesia. Leiden: Werkgroep Indonesische Vrouwenstudies, 1992, 59 pp. Prijs f 10,-. (Available from the publisher, Da Costastraat 27, 2321 AJ Leiden, girorekening 5619693.)