Book Reviews

- Peter Boomgaard, John Robert Shepherd, Marriage and mandatory abortion among the 17th-century Siraya. Arlington: American Anthropological Association, 1995, iv + 99 pp. [American Ethnological Society Monograph Series 6.]
- Bernice de Jong Boers, Michael Hitchcock, Islam and identity in Eastern Indonesia. Hull: The University of Hull Press, 1996, ix + 208 pp.
- Dwight Y. King, Audrey R. Kahin, Subversion as foreign policy; The secret Eisenhower and Dulles debacle in Indonesia. New York: The New Press, 1995, 230 + 88 pp., George McT. Kahin (eds.)
- Han Knapen, Harold Brookfield, In place of the forest; Environmental and socio-economic transformation in Borneo and the eastern Malay peninsula. Tokyo, New York, Paris: United Nations University Press, 1995, xiv + 310 pp. [UNU Studies on Critical Environmental Regions.], Lesley Potter, Yvonne Byron (eds.)
- Niels Mulder, E. Paul Durrenberger, State power and culture in Thailand. New Haven: Yale University, Southeast Asia Studies, 1996, vii + 200 pp. [Monograph 43.]
- Peter Pels, Margaret J. Wiener, Visible and invisible realms; Power, magic and colonial conquest in Bali. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, xiv + 445 pp.
- Marie-Odette Scalliet, Annabel Teh Gallop, Early views of Indonesia; Drawings from the British Library. Pemandangan Indonesia di masa lampau; Seni gambar dari British Library. London: The British Library, Jakarta: Yayasan Lontar, 1995, 128 pp., 86 ill., 39 pl.
- Cornelia M.I. van der Sluys, Marina Roseman, Healing sounds from the Malaysian rain forest; Temiar music and medicine. Berkeley, Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993, xvii + 233 pp.
- Cornelia M.I. van der Sluys, John D. Leary, Violence and the dream people; The Orang Asli in the Malayan emergency, 1948-1960. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University, Center for International Studies, 1995, xxiii + 238 pp. [Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series 95.]
- H. Steinhauer, Darrell T. Tryon, Comparative Austronesian Dictionary; An introduction to Austronesian studies, Berlin, New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1995, Part I, Fascicle I: xxviii pp + p.1-666; Fascicle II: xix pp + p.667-1197; Part II: xviii + 749 pp; Part III: xviii + 739 pp; Part IV: xviii + 767 pp. [Trends in Linguistics, Documentation 10 (Werner Winter and Richard A. Rhodes, eds).] In: Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde 152 (1996), no: 3, Leiden, 483-508

Book Reviews

John Robert Shepherd, *Marriage and mandatory abortion among the 17th-century Siraya*. Arlington: American Anthropological Association, 1995, iv + 99 pp. [American Ethnological Society Monograph Series 6.] ISBN 0.913167.71.1. Price \$15.00 (members: \$12.50).

PETER BOOMGAARD

Abortion among Asian societies in the past is a poorly studied phenomenon, though its existence is known to anthropologists and (historical) demographers. *Mandatory* abortion, however, seems to have been extremely rare. Scholars specialized in Taiwanese history and anthropology, and/or the history of the Dutch East India Company (VOC), may have come across what might be the only well-documented instance of mandatory abortion, namely that among the Siraya, an aboriginal ethno-linguistic group of Taiwan. In fact, when a report of this one example, written by the Dutch Protestant missionary, the Reverend Candidius, reached Europe in the seventeenth century, it so shocked the learned community of those days that it attained a certain notoriety. Echoes of this are to be found in the works of scholars such as Montesquieu and Malthus. Since then, the case of mandatory abortion among the seventeenth-century Siraya has found a place in many anthropological studies, albeit often in a footnote.

To this body of literature John Shepherd, an anthropologist at the University of Virginia working on Taiwan, has now added a well-researched and elegantly written slim volume. On page 3 of his study he summarizes the main thrust of his argument as follows: 'I shall argue that in organizing their society around male age grades and matrifocal households, the Siraya delayed the creation of conjugal families until relatively late in the life cycles of Sirayan men and women. Mandatory abortion provided the means by which this delay was achieved. The Siraya themselves appear to have understood mandatory abortion as necessary to avoid supernatural danger to headhunters caused by the pregnancy of headhunters' wives.'

To many scholars the practice of abortion, mandatory or otherwise, suggests, of course, attempts to check population growth. Shepherd argues that this was not the case among the Siraya. Population density was low, the Siraya were in good health, and resources were abundant. In his own words, '[...] there is no evidence that the Siraya population was out-

growing its resources or that mandatory abortion had been adopted in response to demographic pressure' (p. 54). Several other possible explanations are also carefully reviewed by the erudite author – his copious footnotes fill almost a quarter of the book – and are equally rejected in favour of the hypothesis quoted above.

The story ends with the disappearance of mandatory abortion, at least in the village of Sinkan, some years after the arrival of the VOC. Shepherd argues that the villagers rejected the traditional taboos because they were impressed by the military victories of the Dutch, which made them receptive to the teachings of the Protestant missionaries who abhorred premarital sex and abortion.

On the whole, I find Shepherd's arguments convincing, although I am left with some lingering doubts. One of these is that, although abortion by means of massage may be relatively harmless (p. 5), and although women can, indeed, give birth to many children after they have turned 35 (p. 15), statistically speaking the combined risks of these two factors may have been more serious than the author wishes to concede. Finally I am not so sure that only societies about to outgrow their resource base would have been interested in birth control. If one is affluent, one might very well wish to remain so.

However, these considerations do not invalidate Shepherd's main arguments. His case-study presents an interesting link between abortion and headhunting (or, for that matter, hunting in general), and one wonders if such a connection may have obtained among similar South-East Asian societies in the past as well.

Michael Hitchcock, *Islam and identity in Eastern Indonesia*.
Hull: The University of Hull Press, 1996, ix + 208 pp. ISBN
0.85958.646.4. Price: £11.95.

BERNICE DE JONG BOERS

The main theme of this book is identity in relation to material culture in Bima (on the island of Sumbawa). Unfortunately this purpose does not emerge clearly from the title of the book, which creates the impression that it is principally a study of Islam and identity. The author also gives us this idea in the text. On page 19 he states that it was not his 'initial intention to write a study about Islam in Indonesia'. But, as he progressed, he became 'intrigued by the marked difference between the material culture of Muslim Sumbawa and the non-Muslim islands to the east'.

We are told that Bima shares many similarities (the so-called cultural core, or Pan-Indonesian elements) with its eastern neighbours: their lan-

guages are closely related; both have a belief in ancestral spirits and elements of socio-cosmic dualism; and both possess clan systems. Despite the fact that these linguistic and social factors may agree, their material cultures are fairly divergent.

The main factor Hitchcock adduces as an explanation of these cultural differences is Islam. Or rather, the process of Islamization which began in Bima since the beginning of the seventeenth century, but which has never really struck roots among the neighbouring eastern societies. This Islamization process strongly affected the identity of the Bimanese people and in due time was reflected in their material culture, which after all is a people's foremost means of creating, communicating, and maintaining their identity.

Though not denying Islam its due weight, there is far more to the explanation of the cultural differences than Islam alone. The author argues that other important factors, which were at work shaping and transforming the Bimanese identity and which have been virtually absent in the areas of the eastern neighbours, were Javanization and contact with Makasar and the Malay world. These influences gradually led the Bimanese away 'from their eastern Indonesian origins' (p. 177).

In the first chapters Hitchcock offers us a geographical and historical survey of Sumbawa (especially Bima). Besides these more practical points, he puts forward some theoretical considerations about race and ethnicity, Indonesian Islam, Islamic anthropology, and the field of anthropological study, reflecting the wider theoretical anthropological aim of the book. I must confess that this part of the book left me quite confused. What I make of it is that we should not take the ideas of the Dutch structural anthropological School too strictly. In any consideration of J.P.B. de Josselin de Jong's notion of 'Indonesian anthropological *studieveld*' especially, we should view (Indonesian) societies 'with reference to a wider concept of a cultural core' (p. 176).

My own impression after reading this work is that its apparent focus does not match with the contents it really offers. As I said at the beginning, it is concerned with the material culture of Bima. The chapters which treat this subject directly are the ones I found most fascinating; indeed, they were a joy to read. Among the subjects treated in them are court society, handicrafts and gender, crises, cloth, and houses. They are all very rich in anthropological detail, and they clearly reveal that the author is an eminent expert on Bimanese society and culture.

Unfortunately, the author tends to treat his sources in a rather cavalier fashion. For example, not one single source is quoted for any of the thirty-four photographs in the book. It could, of course, be assumed that the author took most of these pictures himself, during the two years or so in which he conducted fieldwork in the area, were it not that this obviously cannot be true of two of the photographs as they date back to the colonial

period. Whether he took them or not, the reader would like to know more about the background to the illustrations. Leaving aside the photographs and turning to the text, the reader is frequently left in the dark about the origins of certain parts of the author's data. In most cases, I presume his information will have come from his informants. In other cases this is by no means clear cut. To quote one example, we are told that coffee was introduced in the twentieth century and that plantations were established on the Tambora peninsula (p. 49). One is left wondering where this incorrect information comes from. The Dutch colonial sources make it abundantly clear that the Dutch were already buying coffee in the eighteenth century and, that coffee plantations were established in Tambora at the end of the nineteenth century.

I repeat, however, that the strength of this book lies in the wealth of ethnographic data which it presents. As little is known and written about Sumbawa, and ethnographic research on this island is still in its infancy, this really constitutes an important contribution to our knowledge, especially our knowledge of the Bima region. It is all the more regrettable and curious that its title in no way betrays the fact that the region of Bima is the focus of this book.

Audrey R. Kahin and George McT. Kahin, *Subversion as foreign policy; The secret Eisenhower and Dulles debacle in Indonesia*. New York: The New Press, 1995, 230 + 88 pp. ISBN 1.565.84244.8. Price US\$ 25.- (hardback).

DWIGHT Y. KING

This book blows the cover off one of the least-known and most shocking episodes of the Cold War. During the late 1950s, U.S. President Eisenhower and Secretary of State John Foster Dulles provoked a civil war in Indonesia aimed at transforming the character of the government of Indonesia and altering its foreign policy stance. Working through the Central Intelligence Agency (CIA), a substantial part of the U.S. Navy's Seventh Fleet, and a camouflaged American air force, they secretly financed, armed, and provided air power to dissident colonels, encouraging them to break with the central government and eventually forcing a disastrous civil war.

This essentially covert operation was 'an abysmal failure' (p. 18). Thousands of Indonesians – many of whom were civilians – were killed, and much of the country's air force and navy destroyed. Moreover, American intervention turned out to be highly counterproductive to the intentions and goals of Eisenhower and Dulles. Instead of successfully

coercing Indonesian President Sukarno and his government to join their anti-communist front in South-East Asia, U.S. encouragement of secessionists and covert support of rebel military factions promoted anti-American feeling and Indonesia became more firmly dedicated to a neutral foreign policy. The Indonesian Communist Party (PKI) emerged stronger and political leaders regarded as sympathetic with American interests lost their ability to play any significant roles. The resulting fragile and unstable political polarization contributed mightily to the destruction of Indonesia's fledgling democracy and to the political explosion of 1965-66 in which the Army under General Suharto ousted President Sukarno and at least half a million Indonesians were massacred.

One of the most original arguments, supported by analysis in nearly every chapter, concerns the importance of the western New Guinea (West Irian) issue for understanding Indonesian politics and (central government) policies during this era. For example, the Netherlands' retention of western New Guinea (West Irian) until 1962, backed by Australia and tacitly supported by the United States, was the crucial factor in Jakarta's continuing resolve to adhere to an independent non-aligned foreign policy.

Readers may feel a contradiction, never satisfactorily resolved, between the authors' contention in Chapter 2 that 'the system of multiparty parliamentary democracy patterned on the Dutch model, which had been taken over with little forethought or discussion, was clearly ill-suited to Indonesia's needs' (p. 39) and the overall conclusion that the American-provoked civil war was largely responsible for the destruction of that system.

Meticulously documented – notes occupy sixty-three pages at the end of the book – the Kahins' account is based on a broad range of written and interview data gathered over thirty-five years in Indonesia, Britain, and the United States, including many recently declassified documents. Particularly noteworthy is the authors' ability to outflank the CIA's 'bureaucratic stonewall' or steadfast refusal to release the most important documents that bear on American intervention in Indonesia. The absence of any attribution to 'confidential interviews' further reflects the authors' commitment to open and publicly available information.

Spellbinding to read, this book will appeal to a wide audience. Historians will greet it as the definitive study of a long-neglected and important chapter in world history since 1945.

Students of American institutions will appreciate the penetrating analysis of the CIA and Dwight Eisenhower. Foreign policy analysts will find it an extraordinarily revealing (and repugnant) case study of the conduct of America's foreign policy. Observers of Indonesian politics will gain new appreciation of importance of the civil war for subsequent political evolution, including the strengthening of both the army and the presidency and the destruction of parliamentary government.

Harold Brookfield, Lesley Potter and Yvonne Byron, *In place of the forest; Environmental and socio-economic transformation in Borneo and the eastern Malay Peninsula*. Tokyo, New York, Paris: United Nations University Press, 1995, xiv + 310 pp. [UNU Studies on Critical Environmental Regions.] ISBN 92.808.0893.1.

HAN KNAPEN

This book is the second in a series intended to study nine regions in the world where human interference is poised to threaten the sustainability of environmental and social systems. The region under discussion in this case is the 'eastern Sundaland' and the authors focus primarily on Borneo, using data on the eastern side of the Malay Peninsula as comparative material. The central theme of all the studies in the series is defined as the transition from 'impoverishment' through 'endangerment' towards a final stage of 'criticality', not only in the condition of the environment but also in the sustainability of human welfare.

Part One of the book provides the reader with an extensive geographical and historical overview of the region. For a long time most of Borneo and the Peninsula was covered with tropical rain forest, hiding from the casual observer the highly variable biophysical, climatic, and demographic conditions existing within the region. Chapter One highlights this variability and explains the specific resilience or vulnerability to environmental stress of particular areas of Borneo and the Peninsula. This is followed by a brief historical sketch of those forces that have shaped environmental change, drawing on the most important published sources. An interesting point the authors make is that 'the probability seems to be that at least some parts of the interior of Borneo, only 100-300 years ago, carried significantly more people than they do today' (p. 29). This is one example of how the authors challenge the initial set-up of the series. Apparently not always or everywhere is there a simple, unidirectional path leading to increasing levels of environmental change and criticality. Reversal of trajectories is possible when conditions change, even up to the point where almost no traces of former human interference with the forest ecosystem can be observed.

The rapid pace of modern deforestation, resulting largely from commercial logging activities since the 1960s, is the central theme of the second and major part of the book. In seven thematic chapters this is used to focus on subjects connected with deforestation, including loss of biodiversity, soil erosion, the sustainability of the timber industry, transmigrants and other settlers, the role and fate of shifting cultivators, global climatic change, the impact of droughts and fire, and the creation of grasslands. The authors find that 'endangerment' is probably the limit of present trends (p. 245), but with a few important exceptions. Due to rapid destruction of the

extremely diverse lowland tropical rain forest, for example, loss of biodiversity does present a genuine case of 'criticality'. Although the extent of actual species loss is unknown, the authors believe that rapid and concerted action is necessary to preserve a genetic pool of biodiversity in protected forest reserves. Another threatening environmental change is the creation of grassland by fire, to which the creation of litter by logging operations contributes significantly. The prospect of great tracts of the region being transformed into fire-climax grassland is nevertheless judged 'unlikely in the extreme' (p. 230), since most of the environments of Borneo and the Peninsula are relatively resilient under this kind of pressure.

The book does not attempt to treat environmental problems in isolation, but also assesses the issue of criticality in relation to the socio-economic conditions of the (former) forest people. The much-debated conflict between shifting cultivation and logging is reiterated, and it is concluded that shifting cultivation is neither inherently good nor inherently bad. 'Forest people are certainly capable of making ecologically damaging changes to their production system but, if given security and respect, they are far more likely to make sensible and more sustainable adaptations' (p. 140). If their ways of life and their rights to land and resources are guaranteed by the national governments of Indonesia and Malaysia, the forest people will adapt to new opportunities like that of conversion to sustainable agro-forestry. The critical danger to livelihoods lies not in the destructiveness of shifting cultivation and its increasing quest for land also under pressure from logging, but in the possibility that forest people will be prevented from adapting their behaviour in the necessary ways. 'Ten years hence we shall either see the forest people participating in the development of their own region, along with others, or else see them truly reduced to the status of an impoverished and abused minority' (p. 140). Interestingly, the authors conclude that it is not the shifting cultivators who are most vulnerable to logging activities, but the labourers attracted to work in the logging and timber industries. These industries are clearly contracting and will continue to do so in the next decade, jettisoning their migrant employees, who will then have little chance of returning to secure a livelihood in their places of origin.

The great achievement of the book is its very careful and pragmatic examination of the facts so far available in the literature and its avoidance of simplistic or ideological conclusions. The story it tells is almost always a complex and multi-faceted one. Large areas of forest have been totally cleared and this is a tremendous loss, yet 'there is nothing to be gained simply by bemoaning the past' (p. 72). Facing the present situation and making realistic predictions for the future is the only meaningful approach. Policy makers will continue to treat the region as a resource frontier from which to feed the increasing world demand for timber, minerals, and sources of energy. Only when a real scarcity arises is there a chance that

the path of endangerment and criticality will turn in more sustainable directions. As comparable examples from South-East Asia show, such changes are likely to take the form of 'cusp-like reversals', swift and very hard to predict (p. 242).

From the point of view of most readers it would perhaps have been better if the authors had begun by presenting the theoretical framework which they themselves favoured at the outset, instead of trying to achieve a balance between the demands of the series and their own (changing) ideas. As it is, the theoretical discussion is relegated to an appendix and the course of the argument in the main text is sometimes confusing. Especially given that the work is intended as 'a thematic book that is also a regional book', written primarily for a general rather than a regional readership (p. xi), I would have expected to see the major themes clearly worked out for this general public in the first chapter. Nevertheless, criticisms I think this well-founded and carefully edited book is still worthwhile for both groups of readers.

E. Paul Durrenberger (ed.), *State power and culture in Thailand*. New Haven: Yale University, Southeast Asia Studies, 1996, vii + 200 pp. [Monograph 43.] ISBN 0.938692.60.7 (paperback).

NIELS MULDER

This book consists of seven anthropology-inspired chapters which, in one way or another, chart the relationship between local styles of life and the state in various places throughout Thailand. Communities do not exist in isolation; whether the process be desirable or not, they are incorporated by states, that is, they are placed under external centres of power with which they have to learn to accommodate themselves. Theoretically, such adaptation may range from spontaneous acceptance of hegemony to active resistance to the impositions of the state, a variation the editor explores lucidly in the first chapter. He intends 'to move considerations of state power into ethnography, and [...] to move ethnography into state power' (p. 18). These promising intentions are then, more or less successfully, substantiated by six contributions that extend from mother's milk to the Border Patrol Police.

As with most collections of articles, some of the contributions are only vaguely 'on target', and the reader may even be forgiven for thinking that a few obligatory sentences have been added later in order to fill in the relationship to the theme of the book: 'Kathin [offerings] models the hierarchical relation between urban centre and rural periphery, paralleling the increasing dominance of the central government in regional activities'

(p. 33). While this statement is not elaborated in any way, we are regaled with four pages of presumed Buddhist logic, ranging from the illusory nature of selfhood through the abstruse *Abhidhamma* to the cessation of rebirth. What such theology adds to our understanding of village or state remains as nebulous as the connection between breast milk and an obtrusive state.

The description of popular dance drama does not help to enlighten our understanding of this relationship much either. While the editor's introduction promises that the chapter will reveal the 'hidden transcript', that is, the popular discourse regarding the state, this expectation is not borne out by the text. True, clowns comment on everyday life, and often are bawdy to boot, but in the end order, thus, hierarchy, prevails.

Similarly, the problematizing of household and village as basic units of anthropological inquiry does not add much to our understanding of state-village relationships. In the first instance because the discussion does not take us beyond the fact of the ritual embodiment of smaller units by larger ones. What is more important, because Bang Chan – that quasi-community on the outskirts of Bangkok at convenient commuting distance from the Erawan Hotel – is assumed to exemplify Central Thai villages.

These three chapters offer many interesting observations, but have next to nothing to do with the theme of the collection. This criticism is certainly not valid of the remaining three chapters, which are relevant and rich in often surprising considerations. In 'Rice, Rule, and the Thai State', O'Connor highlights the basic incompatibility of the 'rule' and wet 'rice' symbolic complexes. Rule centralizes and hierarchicizes; rice localizes and equalizes. In short, they clash. They exist in juxtaposition, and are not even complementary to each other. This thesis is worked out in a wealth of delightful, and speculative, detail.

Bowie's comments on slavery are refreshingly iconoclastic, not only because she exposes the shallowness of the scholarship stressing the benignity of the institution, but also because she shows that life for ordinary people in nineteenth-century Siam was less pleasant than ideology would have us believe. We only need to look at the current situation of the vast mass of people at the bottom of the pile, or to reflect on the conditions that prevailed under Thai 'feudalism', to realize that the land's famous smile often is strained and more than a little wry. It was and is the power from above that persisted in its callous sway; most slavery was promoted by the state.

In the same way as O'Connor, Jónsson combines arguments and intelligent speculation with deep insights into the relations between Thai Buddhist polities and upland groups. In earlier times, these were complementary and mutually beneficial. Later on, after the introduction of opium and the subsequent vicissitudes of its trade, 'state penetration at once incorporated the uplanders and highlighted the structural break between rulers and the people at large' (p. 175). Furthest from the centres – also in

the cultural sense – the hill-tribe populations have been marginalized and culturally obliterated. In a matter-of-fact tone and providing abundant detail, the author demonstrates the role of state and business in all this. Buddhist understanding will not help us here, the clink of money and the lure of power are all the more enlightening.

Four relevant chapters out of seven is not a bad score; it leaves the reader with a satisfactory list of points to ponder about the relations between state and local culture. It is a pity that the presentation is somewhat loose: the collection should have been edited more professionally. We find many misspelled names; weirdly and inconsistently transcribed Thai words; odd and faulty English sentences; not to mention a good many typing errors. The volume would have been easier to use had the various chapter bibliographies been integrated into a master list of references; the thirty-three pages devoted to the subject could probably have been reduced to eight, and the misspellings of names could have been eliminated, or avoided, had this course been adopted.

Margaret J. Wiener, *Visible and invisible realms; Power, magic and colonial conquest in Bali*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, xiv + 445 pp. ISBN 0.226.88582.8. Price: \$29.75 (paperback), \$80.50 (hardback).

PETER PELS

This is a rich, exciting, and disturbing book. It is rich in its meticulous account of the colonial conquest of Bali: in particular Wiener's account of the early moments of the colonial encounter between Dutch and Balinese (Chapter 6) captures the misunderstandings and mutual offences that carried it to such a dramatic conclusion. It is exciting in the way in which – after decades of neglect by anthropologists and historians – questions of material culture are brought to centre stage in colonial history, particularly in the discussion of *keris* (63ff.) and the magical bullets of the Kusamba War (183ff.). It is disturbing in that it upsets accepted versions of colonial history, in three related ways: first, by arguing that magic plays an important part in deciding the local course of colonial events; second, by showing that the lack of recognition for the politics of magic in Bali in colonial history is a spin off of Orientalist stereotypes that are still current in Dutch colonial history and Indonesian nationalism; and third, by reversing the direction of colonial history and showing that, from a certain Balinese point of view, the Dutch agents of colonial power are only marginal actors on the colonial stage.

This makes it an important book. Anthropologists and historians of colonialism are beginning to realize that the common tendency in colonial

history to explain magic and religion away by political or economic factors, or to reduce it to the intellectual backwardness of 'primitives' – witness the majority of publications on 'cargo cults' – is misguided. However, detailed examinations of the 'politics of magic' in present-day historical accounts and past sources are very rare. Such ethnocentrism in relation to magic (p. 72) is characteristic of a type of colonial history that, since Edward Said's 'Orientalism', is no longer self-evident, even when additional legitimacy accrues to it because 'the people themselves' – often, the first generation of a post colonial nationalist elite – have adopted it. Yet, dealing with salient issues also forces one to address important problems, and I am not sure whether Wiener's revision of Balinese history is always successful in resolving them.

Throughout the book, the account of magic is hampered because of the neglect of the problem of the reality claims of magical discourse. Wiener repeatedly mixes metaphors of sense-perception – of the visual and the oral or aural – in her attempt to recreate 'invisible' realms by undoing 'silences' in narrative (p. 12). This mix-up of sensory symbols ignores the way in which magic was (in)validated by both Dutch and Balinese on the basis of assumptions about reliable sense perceptions and the way in which they needed to be discussed. In Dutch culture, this was obviously discussed in terms of 'science' versus 'magic', and Wiener, although mentioning the intertwining of Dutch and Balinese discourse on magic (p. 363), pays little attention to their interaction. An important way by which Dutch colonial politics gradually tried to contextualize Balinese is thereby disregarded. The lack of such a discussion makes it hard to judge why the Balinese themselves regarded their world as 'finished' (p. 314), and whether or not the Dutch became the embodiment of modern (magical? scientific?) power in twentieth-century Bali – or, to put it another way, at what cost the Balinese 'marginalized' the Dutch from their account of the conquest.

This leads to other questions: In the introduction, Wiener's painstakingly faithful account of her research practice raised – even with a reviewer not familiar with Balinese history – the question of to what extent her account relies too much on a small number of informants from a specific class speaking to a specific researcher. How far did this class – related to, or ideologically indebted to, the royal house of Klungkung – want to reinvent its past by producing a self-gratifying narrative of magical prowess? It would not be the first time an indigenous elite has rewritten its past by creating a new mythology – see William Lockhart's and Rolena Adorno's unmasking of the second generation Spanish Americans' invention of Montezuma's belief in Spanish divinity. And this, lastly, suggests that Wiener's rehabilitation of a cultural difference ('Balinese magic') neglected by Dutch Orientalism may paradoxically reverse the anti-Orientalist accusations of exaggerating difference. The book's rehabilitation of Balinese narratives of magic sets it on the side of Marshall Sahlins in his

debate with Gananath Obeyesekere on Cook in the Pacific: is cultural difference a liberation from constraining European ethnocentrism, or yet another essentializing straitjacket? This in itself suffices to show that Margaret Wiener's book is worth its readers' while.

Annabel Teh Gallop, *Early views of Indonesia; Drawings from the British Library. Pemandangan Indonesia di masa lampau; Seni gambar dari British Library*. London: The British Library, Jakarta: Yayasan Lontar, 1995, 128 pp., 86 ill., 39 pl. ISBN 0.7123.0431.2. Price: f 75.-.

MARIE-ODETTE SCALLIET

The American Thomas Horsfield (1773-1859), who first visited Java briefly in 1800, in later life recalled the overwhelming impression that the island made on him from the start: 'I was delighted with the beauty of its scenery, the grandeur and abundance of its vegetation, and the richness of its production in every department of Natural History, and a desire arose in my mind to become better acquainted with it. On the termination of the voyage, I resolved to return to Batavia, and to attempt a scientific examination of the island.' (*Plantae Javanicae Rariores*, vol. II, London, 1852, *postscript*.) And indeed, no sooner had this trained physician returned to his homeland than he began actively to prepare for the fulfilment of his plan. In 1802 he again set foot in Java and was to spend the next sixteen years patiently exploring the island into whose thrall he had fallen on at first sight. So copious was the lasting harvest of this exploration, not only in every branch of natural history but also in archaeology and ethnography, that Horsfield's name stands high among all those scientists to whom we owe a breakthrough in our knowledge, not to say understanding, of the Indonesian world.

An evocation of this Enlightenment-style naturalist seems almost the inevitable lead-in to the present review, for Horsfield, who served as first Keeper of the East India Company's Museum, London, from 1820 to his death, was also an accomplished draughtsman, and his drawings are prominent in the bilingual catalogue of the exhibition held in Jakarta in 1995 under the title *Early views of Indonesia; Pemandangan Indonesia di masa lampau*.

This catalogue, or book, is divided into three sections – 'Archaeological Drawings', 'Scenes of Daily Life', and 'Natural History Drawings' – introduced by a preface and an introduction and closed by four appendices. The preface is by John Bastin, an authoritative connoisseur of, inter alia, the western iconography of the Malay-Indonesian world.

In her introduction, Gallop presents a concise historical survey of the

British presence in the Archipelago. It is often forgotten that England stole a march on Holland here: the legendary Francis Drake was on the scene in the spice race nearly seventeen years before the *Eerste Schipvaart* – the first Dutch expedition! Established in 1601, one year after the East India Company had been set up, England's, and subsequently Britain's official presence in the area continued until the signing of the Treaty of London on 17 March 1824. After that date the British presence depended on unofficial private enterprise but, as certain documents illustrated in the catalogue (p. 28) bear witness, remained important nonetheless. The most famous British figure of the colonial period remains Sir Thomas Stamford Raffles (1781-1826). It should not be overlooked that Sir Thomas was not merely the representative of British authority in Java and dependencies (1811-1816), and then in Bengkulu (1818-1824), but also a great scholar. Apart from the prodigious work he himself accomplished within the space of a few years, including the richly illustrated *History of Java* (1817) which has remained unequalled, Raffles was a master in the art of getting the best out of others, some of them talents of his own discovering. Horsfield likewise, and Lt.-Col. Colin Mackenzie (1753-1821) who followed the Raffles trail to Java, both developed their own draughtsmanship to best effect while fostering the similar talents of the Indonesians, Chinese and Europeans in their employ. The two of them assembled hundreds of drawings in the collections which eventually enriched the treasures conserved in the Oriental and India Office Library (now part of the British Library), not to mention other collections duly referred to by Gallop, and the selection presented forms more than half the drawings illustrated in the catalogue.

The greater part of the catalogue (pp. 19-110) falls into three sections, each of which is introduced and presented with clarity and precision. Indeed it is a remarkable feat on the part of Gallop that she has been able to convey the essential background of each main subject in so small a compass while reserving space for judiciously chosen documentary illustrations. Next come the 'catalogue' parts properly so called, with their captioned reproduction of drawings. Under 'Archaeological Drawings' it was pleasing to come across two drawings by the official (Dutch) government painter Antoine Payen (1792-1853), similar to two among those in the Payen collection of the National Museum of Ethnology (Leiden). In 1818 Payen and Horsfield visited Ciampea together and climbed the calcareous Mount Cibodas on the domain of the distinguished Van Riemsdijk family (Buitenzorg Residency, West Java), finding there the statues pictured in the drawings reproduced here as fig. 20-21 ('idoles' as Payen wrote in his diary on 1 July 1818), so it comes as no surprise to find these drawings in the Horsfield collection. This may seem a merely anecdotal point, but it serves to underline the importance of properly documenting statues discovered and drawn *in situ* (but subsequently removed or missing). The same requirement is no less valid in regard to the numerous temples and

architectural remains recorded and depicted by the pioneers of Javanese archaeology, who (as Gallop rightly reminds us) were working before the age of photography.

The 'Scenes of Daily Life' section presents, in addition to seven drawings by the already much-mentioned Horsfield (fig. 60-64, pl. 17-18) and a few by various hands including a spectacular watercolour by an Indonesian artist employed by Horsfield (pl. 16), the work of John Newman (ca 1795-1818), a remarkable young artist who came to Java with MacKenzie. His series of watercolours (p. 19-30) are executed with the delicacy of a miniaturist – he was an Anglo-Indian, which could account for his skill – and provide a meticulous, yet fresh and ingenuous depiction of the Javanese, their costumes, manners and customs and their surroundings.

I trust that botanists and zoologists will pardon me for finding the last section, 'Natural History Drawings', the least stimulating but, after all, we are more familiar with the specimens of fauna and flora. Nevertheless, there can be no gainsaying the artistic qualities and fine brushwork of the anonymous Chinese and Indian painters whose work is reproduced in plates 31-40, which hail from the collection of William Marsden (1754-1836) and an unknown source.

This catalogue, remarkable in its editorial standard and quality of reproduction, is not only a pleasure to look at and an excellent lay person's guide but also a mine of information for any specialist in any discipline eager to track down iconographic documents which are perfectly documented but have – for the most part – not yet been published. My one regret is that material stringency should have imposed a limit on the number of drawings selected. Following on from *Golden letters; Writing traditions of Indonesia* (1991, with Bernard Arps) and *The legacy of the Malay letter* (1994), here we owe another catalogue to Annabel Teh Gallop. It is a success, and one we trust we shall see her regularly repeat.

Marina Roseman, *Healing sounds from the Malaysian rain forest; Temiar music and medicine*. Berkeley, Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993, xvii + 233 pp. ISBN 0.520.06682.0 (hardback). Price \$ 40.–. ISBN 0.520.08281.8 (paperback). Price \$ 14.–.

CORNELIA M. I. VAN DER SLUYS

Roseman is both an anthropologist and a musicologist, accomplishments which enable her to present an in-depth analysis of the blending of musical performance and medical practices in the healing ceremonies of the Senoi Temiar, one of the groups of Orang Asli (Malay for 'original people') of Peninsular Malaysia.

With a population of about 12,000, the Temiar live dispersed in small groups (of about 25 to 150 each) in the rain forests of Kelantan and Perak, on both sides of the mountain range which bisects the centre of the Malay Peninsula. They subsist mainly on horticulture, hunting and gathering, and the trading of jungle products. Recently the Malaysian government has tried to concentrate them in resettlement areas. Their language is Central Aslian, an Austroasiatic language of the Mon-Khmer language family.

During Temiar ritual performances, mediums (mostly males) sing healing songs, each line of the song being repeated by a chorus of females who simultaneously beat a double rhythm on a log drum using bamboo stampers of disparate size.

Roseman's main research question is: Why and how can a singing ritual heal a patient's illness? In her search for an answer, she conducted field-work for twenty months (in 1981-1982), participating in the daily life of the Temiar and even undergoing the rituals as a patient, in order to gain access to their world view.

Her analysis is built in part on the work by Geoffrey Benjamin who did research in the same area in northern Kelantan during the 1960s, focusing mainly on religion and language. Roseman agrees with his description of the Temiar concepts of detachable 'head' and 'heart' souls and soul loss related to illness, and refers to the distinction he made in the major genres of ritual songs and corresponding ritual practices.

The course she chooses for her method of analysis is more integrative: she weaves together information from the various domains of the Temiar culture (such as: music, medicine, environment, and movement) to construct the indigenous meaning-value system which motivates the rituals. The book comprises seven chapters in total, six of which deal with a particular theme and Chapter 1, is used to give an introduction, consisting of several parts.

In the first section of this introduction, Roseman describes the daily life of the Temiar and their relationship with other indigenous populations in Malaysia. Moving to the second section she presents her view of the articulation between musical and medical domains, while in the third section she explains her theoretical considerations: the influence of phenomenological philosophy on her work and her aim to integrate interpretative anthropology and performance theory with ethno-medicine and ethnomusicology.

'Concepts of Being' is the title of Chapter 2, in which she points out how in the 'animistic' world view of the Temiar all entities possess multiple detachable, and permeable 'souls', be these human beings, animals, trees, flowers, or features of the landscape such as mountains and rivers. These concepts are operative in the explanatory systems of illness aetiology: a human 'head' soul wanders off, which leads to soul loss, and therefore is searched for and re-attached to the body by a medium during rituals, or: a malignant substance, such as a splinter of rotting wood, which has

penetrated the patient's body and weakened his 'heart' soul, needs to be expelled by the medium.

The role of the medium (Temiar: *halaa*) is discussed in Chapter 3 which is entitled 'Becoming a Healer'. In dreams, the detachable 'head' soul of a dreamer meets that of other entities, who may express the desire to become the dreamer's spirit-guide. Should this spirit-entity be of the opposite sex, this is expressed in the language of courtship, while in the case of a relationship between the same sexes, the spirit-guide may express a desire to become the dreamer's child. The pivotal point in becoming a medium is the reception of a song which is taught in dreams, line by line, by the spirit-guide. This song (for which the Temiar use the word *nong*, meaning 'path' or 'way') becomes the means by which the medium summons up the spirit-guide to his side during a singing ritual to assist him in healing a patient.

The process of healing is the theme of the fourth chapter, 'The Dream Performed', which begins with a description of the general performance structure of the curing rituals. However, the main part of this chapter is devoted to the discussion of various musical genres of curing songs and their history. Roseman was able to trace the development of various genres with the help of valuable, indigenous informants. One of them had worked for RTM (Radio-Television Malaysia), which broadcasts a daily two-hour programme on indigenous music, for several years. Usually a genre starts with a medium receiving a new type of song in a dream (see above). When it is used repeatedly with success during curing rituals, its fame grows and it gradually spreads to other places through inter-village contacts.

The author also tackles the problem of the levelling of any incipient stratification deriving from the degree of virtuosity of the, predominantly male, mediums. Temiar society is characterized by egalitarianism, which she defines as: a social system in which the labour or obedience of one adult cannot be coerced by another. Levelling mechanisms in the rituals include: inversions of everyday male and female roles in ritual performance, and the cultural idea that a medium cannot act independently, but obtains his healing devices (songs and an invisible spiritual liquid) from spirit-guides who have selected him to be a mediator.

'Setting the Cosmos in Motion: Sources of Illness and Methods of Treatment' is the title of Chapter 5 which deals with the Temiar aetiology of illness. This consists of two juxtaposed categories of illness agents: those who intrude into the patient's body and those who coax the patient's 'head' soul out of the body. During healing ceremonies the spirit-guides assist the healer in restoring the patient to health, either by chasing out the malignant forces or by retrieving a wandering 'head' soul and putting it back where it belongs; the soul is strengthened by an invisible watery substance (*kahyek*), which originates from the spirit-guides.

In Chapter 6, '“Remembering to Forget”: the Aesthetics of Longing', Roseman focuses on Temiar concepts of longing, considered to be a dangerous emotion which, if allowed to get out of bounds, leads to soul

loss and subsequent illness. The corollary of this belief is that uncontrolled longing has to be expressed and channelled safely and properly during special public singing and trance-dancing ceremonies, at which the afflicted can express themselves during their dance and benefit from the healing presence of the spirit-guides who are coaxed by the medium. After the dancers have gone into a trance and finally collapse unconscious, the *halaa'* balances their souls by fanning them with a whisk made of ritual 'cooling' leaves and by transmitting the spiritual liquid *kahyek*. Thus, the health of the community members is safeguarded.

The book ends with 'Songs of a Spirited World', Chapter 7, which consists of a discussion of the semiotics of body, society, and cosmos, all three closely interrelated in the Temiar world view. Roseman traces the 'web of meaning' which permeates the rituals: Temiar concepts of their rain forest environment and their settlements, of persons and social structure, of the relationship between humans and the spiritual world. These chapters are followed by two appendices: Appendix A presents transliterations of 'dream narratives', while Appendix B is a discography, consisting of two titles. The extensive notes contain a wealth of information on the topics discussed in the texts. The book is illustrated with fifteen photographs, which give a good idea of the various stages of the curing rituals and the Temiar environment.

It is only natural that such an interesting book will stimulate the reader's wish for more. It would have been interesting to know whether there are any myths about the origin of the spirit-guides. One minor omission is that Solheim (p. 18) has not been included in the bibliography. This is a very well-founded, illuminating book which will be of great value to specialists in ethnomusicology, ethno-medicine, psychological anthropology, cultural anthropology and cultural ecology as well as to everyone who has an interest in the study of world view, religion and shamanistic healing. The vivid, poetical language employed by the author makes reading this study a very pleasurable experience.

John D. Leary, *Violence and the dream people; The Orang Asli in the Malayan emergency, 1948-1960*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University, Center for International Studies, 1995, xxiii + 238 pp. [Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series 95.] ISBN 0.89680.186.1. Price: £ 23.95 (paperback).

CORNELIA M.I. VAN DER SLUYS

This interesting historical study deals with the role played by the indigenous peoples of Malaya (now Peninsular Malaysia) during the Emergency (1948-1960), the period in which the Malayan Communist

Party sought to overthrow the British Colonial Government. The author, who holds an MA degree in South-East Asian History (Monash University), had firsthand experience of the Emergency during his five years of military service in Malaya.

He recounts how, throughout this whole period, the two contestants in the struggle, namely the Communist Party's Malayan Races Liberation Army (MRLA) and the British Malayan Security Forces, competed for the allegiance of the Orang Asli, the Malay name given to the original inhabitants of the peninsula. This situation arose when, their first attempts to seize power having failed, the communists withdrew into the jungle where they depended heavily on the support of the Orang Asli, which was sometimes given voluntarily, sometimes under duress.

The communists badly needed Orang Asli assistance for setting up camps, making clearings for cultivation, carrying supplies, spying, and spreading false information to confuse their opponents. They had already been in contact with certain groups of Orang Asli during the Japanese occupation, when they patrolled the jungle as members of the MPAJA (Malayan Peoples Anti-Japanese Army).

The aim of Leary's analysis is twofold: to interpret the role of the Orang Asli during the Emergency; and, simultaneously, to refute the myth maintained by various anthropologists that the Orang Asli are basically peaceful, incapable of violence, and were unwittingly drawn into the struggle, becoming its innocent victims. He sets out to prove that indeed the opposite is true, the Orang Asli were fully capable of committing unprovoked acts of violence.

His argument is based on accounts in various archives, which are supplemented by oral statements of eyewitnesses to massacres and other violent incidents that occurred during the Emergency. These accounts do indeed contain evidence that some Orang Asli deliberately resorted to violence when they judged this to be in their interest, even in some cases when it was directed against their own kinsmen.

Leary has focused his research on the Temiar and the Semai tribes (which together comprise about 30,000 people), who were the group among the Orang Asli most affected by the Emergency. They are the two main groupings that comprise the Senoi, one of the three subdivisions of the indigenous peoples of Peninsular Malaysia. Traditionally the Senoi depend on swidden-cultivation, with tapioca as the main crop, supplemented by fishing, hunting and gathering forest products, as well as by the commercial collecting of jungle products such as rattans and damars. The author is particularly critical of the anthropologist R.K. Dentan, a researcher specializing on the Semai people, who in spite of the evidence to the contrary, still maintains that they are culturally non-violent, that killings by them were exceptions, and that after the Emergency they returned to their habitual, non-aggressive life-style.

At this point I think it would be useful to give a short summary of the Introduction and the six chapters that comprise the book.

The author uses the Introduction to give a brief description of the Orang Asli and their way of life, and to expatiate upon the myth of their alleged non-violence. He explains how, during the 1950s, the Temiar-Senoi came to be known as the 'Dream People' from the work by the British psychologist Kilton Stewart, who theorized that their way of openly discussing their dreams and advising each other about manipulating them, contributed to their outstanding mental health and peaceful attitude towards life. He goes on to say that this theory is criticized by Domhoff (1985), who considers it to be a romanticism, drawn largely from Stewart's imagination.

Leary himself also presents an example of their capability to kill as based on evidence in the travelogue by Richard Noone (appointed Advisor on Aborigines by the British Forces in 1953) and Dennis Holman *Rape of the Dream People* (1972). These authors ventured into Temiar country during the Emergency in search of Richard's missing brother Pat, a military officer appointed the first Protector of Aborigines, until an eyewitness told them that he had been shot with a dart from a blowpipe by a jealous indigenous blood-brother in an argument about Pat's Temiar wife. The final part of the Introduction is devoted to events leading to the declaration of the Emergency.

The historical background is covered in Chapter I, which gives an account of the events that affected the Orang Asli before the Emergency, dealing especially with their exposure to violence, for example during slave raids, which were still being carried out at the beginning of this century. Because many slave-raiders were of Malay origin, these raids soured relations between the Orang Asli and the Malays.

Leary also adduces other factors which made the Orang Asli vulnerable to influence by the communists. He shows, for example, how the British neglected the Orang Asli after their return to Malaya in September 1945, which paved the way for the communists to gain a psychological and tactical advantage over the British Security Forces, when it came to calling on their loyalty and support.

Resettlement is the theme of the second chapter. The author describes the initiative taken by the British in 1951 to resettle various Orang Asli groups outside the jungle in order to prevent their contacts with the communists (analogous to the so-called Briggs Plan which suggested moving the Chinese living in forest areas out of this environment). He does not give the exact number of Orang Asli who were resettled, but quotes varying estimates of the deaths which occurred during these, often chaotic, operations. The mass resettlement was stopped in 1952 when the British began to realize that disrupting the lives of the Orang Asli only led to their joining the communists as soon as they managed to abscond from the settlement and regain their forest homelands.

In Chapter 3, the author moves on to describe the violence between

1948 and 1953. An account of the brutal treatment meted out to the tribes-people by both the communists and the British and demonstrates that, at times, the Orang Asli were also actively involved in committing barbarous acts against their fellow tribesmen. The author reports an interview with the only survivor of a massacre in which thirty-four people were killed at the instigation of a notorious Semai-Senoi headman Bah Pelankin who directed the MRLA to kill his own kinsmen.

'1953 The fateful years' is the title of the fourth chapter in which Leary describes how, after 1951, the MRLA withdrew deeper into the jungle and began to organize communist-aboriginal solidarity groups, called ASAL or Protection Corps. The colonial government responded by introducing a new strategy of setting up permanent fortified posts deep in the heart of the jungle where the Orang Asli were provided with medical and other services in an effort to win their support. The first jungle fort was built in 1952 and by the end of the Emergency their number had been increased to fourteen. Leary continues his account of incidents which support his theory that the Senoi are capable of violent acts citing the killing of Bah Pelankin by two of his own kinsmen in 1953 and that of another notorious Semai-Senoi, called Chawog, a communist collaborator, who was alleged to have murdered some of his own people and was killed by pro-government Semai-Senoi in 1954. The author claims that the homicidal tendencies of these murderers and their own killings could hardly support the view of a gentle, timid people.

'The Senoi Pra'aq and the Arming of the Orang Asli' are the topics dealt with in Chapter 5, which adduces additional evidence of combative tendencies of the Senoi people, namely their eagerness to join the field forces. Indeed, there was no shortage of volunteers to join the first Orang Asli fighting unit, called Senoi Pra'aq, which was established in 1956 by R.O.D. (Richard) Noone. This force initially consisted of ninety recruits, divided up over three sections. This number swelled to 180 within a year. Taking such evidence as this into consideration, Leary finds it hard to understand how the myth of the peaceful nature of the Orang Asli can be sustained.

In Chapter 6 'Merdeka and the Bureaucracy', the author describes the ongoing effects of the policies leading up to Merdeka (Independence) on 31 August 1957, and the period immediately after the end of the Emergency in 1960, when only a few pockets of guerrillas were still holding out in the northern Central Range Area. No sooner had the communists and British forces both withdrawn from the Orang Asli areas, than other intruders appeared on the scene: missionaries, loggers, and welfare workers invaded their settlements. This new invasion provides the fuel for Leary's final statement that 'after the Orang Asli had survived the physical violence of the Emergency, after Merdeka they had to struggle to preserve their religion, their homeland and their culture' (p. 179).

Although Leary's argument that the Orang Asli of Peninsular Malaysia

are fully capable of violence is based on ample evidence, we should be careful not to jump to the conclusion that the anthropological theories about their cultural non-violence, as formulated by the social scientists like R. Knox Dentan and Clayton A. Robarchek, are fundamentally wrong. Since Leary has not investigated the world view, the indigenous value-meaning system of the Senoi peoples, he has not considered the possibility that the existence of a cultural inclination towards peacefulness under normal circumstances does not conflict with outbreaks of violence during abnormal, stressful events.

In an article by Robarchek and Dentan (not mentioned by Leary), the authors express the view that all human beings are, under certain circumstances, capable of violence. They are therefore not surprised that in the case of the Semai people, the turmoil of the Emergency, the threats made by both contestants, exacerbated by the examples of violence they perpetrated, prompted some individuals to commit acts of violence. This does not stop them maintaining non-aggressiveness as an ego-ideal and a central component of the self-image of the Semai who can therefore still be regarded as culturally non-violent (Robarchek and Dentan 1987: 356-365).

Leary's book will prove especially valuable to those who want to obtain first-hand information about a little-known aspect of this turbulent period of Malaya's history and the role played by the Orang Asli in it. The lucid style in which the book is written makes it pleasant to read, and the many anecdotes and photographs are sure to appeal to the reader's imagination.

References

- Domhoff, G.W., 1985, *The mystique of dreams; A search for Utopia through Senoi Dream Theory*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
 Noone, R.O.D., 1972, *Rape of the Dream People*. London: Hutchinson.
 Robarchek, Clayton A. and Robert Knox Dentan, 1987, 'Blood drunkenness and the bloodthirsty Semai: Unmaking another anthropological myth', *American Anthropologist* 89:356-65.

Darrell T. Tryon (ed.), *Comparative Austronesian Dictionary; An introduction to Austronesian studies*, Berlin, New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1995, Part I, Fascicle I: xxviii pp + p.1-666; Fascicle II: xix pp + p.667-1197; Part II: xviii + 749 pp; Part III: xviii + 739 pp; Part IV: xviii + 767 pp. [Trends in Linguistics, Documentation 10 (Werner Winter and Richard A. Rhodes, eds).] ISBN 3.11.012729.6.

H. STEINHAUER

The existence of the Austronesian language family has been known for nearly four centuries. Its geographical extension is larger than that of any other known language family (with the exception of Indo-European, which is the legacy of colonialism). With its estimated 1200 daughter languages it is also by far the largest language family on earth. No wonder then that linguistic knowledge of it is limited. Even full-time Austronesianists are laymen in their field. For those professionals and for all those other interested laymen who want to join their ranks the Comparative Austronesian Dictionary (henceforth the CAD) is a welcome addition to their library.

For the majority of Austronesian languages data are so few and of such uncertain reliability that they can be said to be non-existent. For a small group, reliable data *are* available, but often scattered and presented through languages not immediately intelligible such as French, Indonesian, and nineteenth century Dutch, which makes them virtually non-existent as well. Political divisions are another impediment to the study of Austronesian languages in their Austronesian context: linguists in former colonial countries tend to deal with their national or regional languages only. Academic tradition elsewhere still reflects the political divisions of the world in 1900: the borders of the colonial empires define the scholarly horizons of present-day linguists in Europe and America; Dutch Austronesianists confine themselves to Indonesia, the English to Malaysia and some Pacific countries such as Fiji, the Americans to their Pacific dependencies and the Philippines, while the French deal with Indo-China and the languages of their nuclear test fields. Needless to say the Cold War also has had its impact: Russian Austronesianists confine themselves traditionally to communist, or once nearly communist, countries such as Vietnam and Indonesia. It may be no coincidence therefore that the border-crossing introduction under review comes from a country which is currently redefining its position in the world in post-colonial terms, to wit as a part of the Asia-Pacific region. After the Language Atlas of the Pacific Area, the CAD is the second major encyclopaedic contribution to Austronesian linguistics by the Research School of Pacific Studies of the Australian National University.

The work is the product of the collective enterprise of more than 100 contributors, under the general editorship of Darrell T. Tryon, seconded by a board of four assistant editors, one editorial assistant, and eight area coordinators.

Being 'one of a series of comparative dictionaries planned to cover the major language families of the world [...], the CAD] follows broadly the design of Carl Darling Buck's *Dictionary of Indo-European Synonyms* (University of Chicago Press, 1949)'. There are intimations of 'some significant differences [... but] the lexicon very largely follows that used by Buck [...], with the deletion of some [namely some 130, H.S.] items inappropriate to the Austronesian world' (Part I:1). For unclear reasons at least

eleven items which appear to lack an equivalent in any of the eighty Austronesian languages covered by the dictionary have nonetheless been included (I noted the items 'mead', 'rye', 'oats', 'barley', 'adobe', 'beech', 'fir', 'oak', 'acorn', 'birch', and 'poncho').

It should be added that besides the editor's jokes 'poncho' and 'adobe', some 400 other items, whether or not conceptually foreign to Indo-European, have also been *added* to the list: numerals; pronouns; function words; some kin terms; musical instruments; hunting and fishing terminology; flora and fauna.

Following Buck, the items are arranged into twenty-two conceptual fields: physical world; mankind: sex, age, family relationships; animals; body parts, bodily functions, bodily conditions; food and drink, cooking and utensils; clothing, personal adornment, personal care; dwelling, house, furnishings; agriculture, vegetation; miscellaneous physical acts, specialized crafts, implements, materials, products; motion: locomotion, transportation, navigation; possession, property, commerce; spatial relations: place, form, size; quantity and number; time; sense perception; emotion: temperamental, moral, aesthetic notions; mind, thought; speech, reading, writing; social relations: territorial, social, and political divisions; warfare; law; religion and superstition.

I have already indicated that the CAD covers eighty Austronesian languages. The total number of Austronesian languages identified today, however, is estimated to be fifteen times as many, about 20% of all the languages of the world (Part I:6). For a dictionary of the same lexicological scope as the CAD covering all Austronesian languages seventy additional volumes of an average of 700 pages would be needed. One cannot blame the authors of the present volumes for their failure to materialize: academic culture does not favour documentary linguistics, political culture more readily promotes the assimilation of minority cultures than their documentation. The editors of CAD did try to represent all major Austronesian sub-families, but they indicate themselves the existence of evident gaps: the Chamic languages of mainland South-East Asia are not represented; the only language from Borneo is Timugon Murut in north-east Sabah. The numerous languages of the Central Malayo-Polynesian and South Halmahera/West New Guinea sub-families could also be qualified as under-represented. In short: one or two additional volumes would be necessary to fill the most obvious gaps for a start.

This brings me to the content of the present volumes.

Parts II, III, and IV present the actual lexical information. Each of these volumes contains the same alphabetical index of English glosses, which correspond to the entries in the dictionary.

The total number of items covered is said to be 'some 1200' (Part I:1). In fact it appears to be 1309 (including the empty 'poncho'-'barley' series). Each entry is followed by a list of the eighty languages, each with not more than one equivalent to the entry. Of the languages with 'speech

styles', such as Javanese, only the 'low' forms are presented. Given the fact that the selection of entries is based ultimately on an Indo-European perception of the world, it is understandable that – especially for the lesser studied or moribund languages – no equivalents are presented for some of the concepts, especially the 'exotic' ones, such as 'fig', 'donkey', 'step-daughter', and 'eagle'.

Loanwords are marked, their origins indicated in principle: if the equivalents to the entry for a number of languages are loanwords with the same origin, the latter are listed in a separate box at the head of the list; otherwise, the origin is given in a note. Notes also present additional information in case of alternative forms, and/or semantic mismatches. Turning to the loanwords it should be remarked that not all sources are equally obvious: a European source can usually be reduced to the language of the (former) colonial or missionary power, (other) Asian languages and especially other Austronesian languages would require some argumentation. The fact that in the etymology boxes such argumentation is only given once, namely for the Sanskrit word for 'plough' in the shape of a reference to Gonda's *Sanskrit in Indonesia*, highlights the absence of any justification in all other cases. As far as the boxes go, inter-Austronesian borrowings stem from Javanese (3 cases), Old Javanese (2 cases), 'Polynesian languages' (3 cases), and Malay (which with its forty-six cases is a good sixth after Spanish, English, Sanskrit, Arabic, and Dutch). The detail of specification in these cases of inter-Austronesian borrowings raises the question of their detectability and comprehensiveness. The CAD avoids a discussion.

The actual comparative dictionary is accompanied by two introductory volumes, constituting Part I. In this respect the CAD differs most significantly from Buck's dictionary of Indo-European synonyms. The introductory volumes contain (apart from three survey maps and lists of contributors and phonemic symbols and the like) a variety of informative sections on Austronesian languages, both individually and as a group.

The first major section is a general introduction to the Austronesian language family, its spread and its subgroups, by Darrell T. Tryon. This is followed and in some respects commented on by Malcolm D. Ross in a fascinating state-of-the-art report, in which problems of subgrouping, proto-Austronesian phonology, and possible ties with other language families are discussed.

The next section is a list of Austronesian languages taken from Barbara F. and Joseph E. Grimes' *Ethnologue: languages of the world* (11th edition), with updates especially in the language classification by Charles E. Grimes, Malcolm D. Ross and Darrell Tryon. Curiously, the classificatory detail of this list (for example LOBU, TAMPIAS: Western Malayo-Polynesian, Borneo, Northeast, Paitanic, Upper Kinabatangan) seems to clash with Ross' caution with regard to classification as expressed in his state-of-the-art report. It will be difficult to find a language the authors of

the list have missed. It is rather overcomplete, in that it also contains 'alternative language names' which appear to be inflected forms of Dutch adjectives (e.g. 'BOEGINEESCHE' for BUGIS), or Dutch names for a tribe (e.g. 'BOEGINEZEN' '(the) Buginese (people)').

The most fascinating sections of Part I are the short introductory sketches of the eighty languages covered by the dictionary. They are written by a variety of authors, and vary in length from four to twenty pages (with an average of eight). All of them contain information on phonology and morphophonemics, and are provided with a basic bibliography, and a basic but very clear map of the area where the language is spoken, with an inset showing its wider location.

Part I ends with a select Austronesian bibliography of 138 pages by Lois Carrington and Charles E. Grimes, and a glossary of Austronesian reconstructions. The bibliography contains most of the linguistic titles given in the reference lists of the 80 language introductions, and many more in addition to those, some as recent as 1992. For a select bibliography it is admirably exhaustive.

The Austronesian reconstructions are by David Zorc, whose system of proto-phonemes is somewhat different from the one Ross proposes in his report. The list contains some 1650 reconstructions of various time depths, but all reflected in Philippine languages; Zorc distinguishes Proto Austronesian, Proto Malayo-Polynesian, Proto Hesperonesian-Formosan, Proto Hesperonesian. Many of Zorc's reconstructions have no bearing on the items covered by the dictionary; those which do can be connected to them via an appended finderlist of reconstructions. For more reconstructions, and for reconstructions which have no reflection in Philippine languages the reader is referred to other sources.

This could be considered the main flaw of the book. It is not based on what is known about Austronesian languages and their history, but on Buck's list of Indo-European synonyms. The word 'comparative' in the title of the book does not mean that the data presented are compared, but that they are made comparable.

Precisely this and the orderly way in which it is done, however, could also be qualified as the major quality of the CAD.

Of course, there are misprints (such as the inclusion of Yami among the Formosan languages on the map in Part I:xxvi, whereas everywhere else (Part I:10, 24, 38, 278) it is – ultimately – qualified as Western Malayo Polynesian; the classification of Ndao as belonging to the Bima-Sumba subgroup instead of to (Nuclear) Timor (Part I:219); localization of Weyewa in Sulawesi instead of in Sumba (Part I:276)), and omissions (such as the absence of a loanword box for the item 'ice' (Part III:95) or the absence of the Tamil source of the word for 'donkey' in Indonesian and several other Indonesian languages), but these are minor and incidental. Less so is the questionable descriptive analysis of orthographic *c* and *j* as affricates instead of stops for Indonesian and most other Indonesian languages, such

as Toba Batak, Minangkabau, Javanese, Sundanese, Madurese, Balinese, Sasak, Bugis, and Wolio (but not for Acehnese). For most of these languages this may be a matter of opinion, dialect, or future phonetic specification, but for Wolio it is presented by Ch. Grimes and R. van den Berg as the late J.C. Anceaux's analysis which it is not. But still, this is an incidental lapse.

On the whole, the qualities of the CAD clearly prevail:

- the data in the dictionary have been collected by acknowledged experts on the languages concerned, and all around the same time (the late 1980s);
- their spelling is phonemic and the same phonemic font with approximately the same phonetic value is used throughout the book;
- equivalents in the eighty languages for a given concept can be compared immediately;
- nearly 50% of the data have never been published before;
- by the inclusion of loanwords a broad-brush picture of the history and scope of extra-Austronesian contacts is presented;
- thanks to extensive indexes all information can be easily retrieved;
- the maps present all essential geographical information in a very clear way;
- editing and lay-out are attractive and well-organized;
- the extensive bibliography presents easy access to further reading.

In all these respects the CAD is an asset to anyone's library, especially for those who are interested in the phenomenology of language in general and Austronesian in particular. The editor's hope that the book 'designed to serve as a resource document [...] will [...] stimulate interest and research in the Austronesian world and at the same time heighten cultural awareness of this region' (Part I:3) deserves not to be taken in vain.