Book Reviews

- R.H. Barnes, Janet Hoskins, *Biographical objects; How things tell the stories of peoples lives*. London: Routledge, 1998, x + 213 pp.
- Peter Boomgaard, Ann Kumar, *Java and modern Europe; Ambiguous encounters*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1997, vii + 472 pp.
- Peter Boomgaard, Lenore Manderson, *Sickness and the state; Health and illness in colonial Malaya, 1870-1940*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, xix + 315 pp.
- Matthew Isaac Cohen, Bambang Widoyo, *Gapit; 4 naskah drama berbahasa Jawa: Rol, Leng, Tuk dan Dom*. Yogyakarta: Yayasan Benteng Budaya, 1998, xiv + 302 pp.
- James T. Collins, Bernd Nothofer, *Reconstruction, classification, description; Festschrift in honor of Isidore Dyen*. Hamburg: Abera, 1996, xiv + 259 pp.
- J.R. Flenley, Kristina R.M. Beuning, *Modern pollen rain, vegetation and climate in lowland East Java, Indonesia*. Rotterdam: Balkema, 1996, 51 pp. + 49 plates. [Modern Quaternary Research in Southeast Asia 14.]
- Gregory Forth, Karl-Heinz Kohl, *Der Tod der Riesjungfrau; Mythen, Kulte und Allianzen in einer ostindonesischen Lokalkultur*. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1998, 304 pp. [Religionsethnologische Studien des Frobenius-Instituts Frankfurt am Main, Band I.]
- J. van Goor, Brook Barrington, *Empires, imperialism and Southeast Asia; Essays in honour of Nicholas Tarling*. Clayton, Victoria: Monash Asia Institute, 1997, v + 250 pp. [Monash Papers on Southeast Asia 43.]
- Mies Grijns, Penny van Esterik, *Women of Southeast Asia*. DeKalb: Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Northern Illinois University, 1996, xiv + 229 pp. Monographs on Southeast Asia, Occasional Paper 17; Second, revised edition.]
- Hans Hagerdal, Alfons van der Kraan, *Bali at war; A history of the Dutch-Balinese conflict of 1846-49*. Clayton, Victoria: Centre of Southeast Asian Studies, Monash University, 1995, x + 240 pp. [Monash Papers on Southeast Asia 34].
- Volker Heeschen, Jurg Wassmann, *Das Ideal des leicht gebeugten Menschen; Eine ethnokognitive Analyse der Yupno in Papua New Guinea*. Berlin: Reimer, 1993, xiii + 246 pp.
- Nico Kaptein, Masykuri Abdillah, *Responses of Indonesian Muslim intellectuals to the concept of democracy (1966-1993)*. Hamburg: Abera, 1997, iv + 304 pp.
- Niels Mulder, Ivan A. Hadar, *Bildung in Indonesia; Krise und kontinuier; Das Beispiel Pesantren*. Frankfurt: IKO-Verlag für Interkulturelle Kommunikation, 1999, 207 pp.
- Niels Mulder, Jim Schiller, *Imagining Indonesia: Cultural politics and political culture*. Athens: Ohio University, 1997, xxiii + 351 pp. [Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series 97.], Barbara Martin-Schiller (eds.)

- J.W. Nibbering, Raymond L. Bryant, *The political ecology of forestry in Burma 1824-1994*. London: Hurst, 1997, xiii + 257 pp.
 - Hetty Nooy-Palm, Douglas W. Hollan, *Contentment and suffering; Culture and experience in Toraja*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994, xiii + 276 pp., Jane C. Wellenkamp (eds.)
 - Anton Ploeg, Bill Gammage, *The sky travellers; Journeys in New Guinea, 1938-1939*. Carlton South, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1998. x + 292 pp.
 - Anton Ploeg, Jurg Wassmann, *Pacific answers to Western hegemony; Cultural practices of identity construction*. Oxford: Berg, 1998, vii + 449 pp.
 - John Villiers, Abdul Kohar Rony, *Bibliography; The Portugese in Southeast Asia: Malacca, Moluccas, East Timor*. Hamburg: Abera Verlag, 1997, 138 pp. [Abera Bibliographies 1.], Ieda Siqueira Wiarda (eds.)
 - Lourens de Vries, Ulrike Mosel, Saliba. Munchen/Newcastle: Lincom Europa, 1994, 48 pp. [Languages of the World/Materials 31.]
- In: *Bijdragen tot de Taal-, Land- en Volkenkunde* 155 (1999), no: 2, Leiden, 264-303

This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>

Book Reviews

Janet Hoskins, *Biographical objects; How things tell the stories of people's lives*. London: Routledge, 1998, x + 213 pp. ISBN 0.415. 92012.4. Price: \$ 12.99 (paperback).

R.H. BARNES

There has been increasing attention to written forms of autobiography in Indonesia, usually based on Western models. Various anthropologists working with semi-literate or non-literate peoples have sometimes found that it is impossible to elicit sequential autobiographies. Unable to get the Kodi to relate life histories, Hoskins discovered that they would reveal much about their personal histories and ambitions when discussing objects or images of concern to them. This book presents six such narratives. The objects in question are a betel bag, a cow, a cat, a hen, a shroud, a spindle, a drum and a modern green bottle.

The author's principal contention is that Strathern's argument that Melanesian selves consist of parts which can be given away does not apply in eastern Indonesia. So far as I am concerned she has made her case. Another objective is 'to escape an earlier view of Eastern Indonesia symbolism as totalizing and consensual, in which objects could be lined up neatly in two columns according to their gender attributes, and notions of "male" and "female" then deduced from the characteristics of these columns'. The problem with this statement is that through the rest of her book she demonstrates that Kodi dualisms *are* totalizing, that being what the people using them are trying to achieve. They are also consensual because they are collective representations. The statements made using them need not be agreed to by all, as follows from the fact, often demonstrated in previous literature, that they are used rhetorically in debates, arguments, law cases, marriage negotiations, and so on. Finally the use of two columns as an expository device was well hashed out in earlier discussions, none of which she cites. A telling omission is her lack of reference to Fox's discussions of recursive complementarity, precisely the topic of her book. Attributing to Fox or anyone writing on the subject the view that dualistic parallelism is a disease of language is a gross misrepresentation. Another wilful misrepresentation is her reference to 'the dualistic dichotomy between matrilineal and patrilineal societies that anthropologists have been so fond of'. Apparently anthropologists whose work is

very close to her own have been wasting their breath. There are a few other minor presentisms.

Such blemishes aside, this is an accomplished book, which achieves most of its aims lucidly. I agree that the ability of objects to be male and female is not androgyny. The stories contain many themes dear to Shakespeare: passion, jealousy, bombast, coquetry, deception, betrayal, abuse, guilt, violence. Yet, Hoskins wishes to emphasize in the end the cultural differences as seen in the overwhelming extent to which the Kodi wish to address life's concerns dualistically. Another important theme running through the book is the way these lives have been shaped through reacting to outside influences such as colonialism, Christianity and literacy. Finally the lives themselves are interesting and well told.

Ann Kumar, *Java and modern Europe; Ambiguous encounters*. Richmond, Surrey: Curzon, 1997, vii + 472 pp. ISBN 0.7007.0433.7. Price: £ 50 (hardback).

PETER BOOMGAARD

This is a book about Java between the 1770s and the 1820s. However, it is not a book about Java and (modern) Europe, as the title suggests. Of the 445 pages that constitute the main text, there are only three (!) pages (partly) dedicated to what is in effect a list of dates and names purporting to reflect the history of modern Europe around that time (pp. 18-20). In the concluding chapter the pages 432-44 are dedicated to an assessment of the influence of the VOC on Indonesian society. Rather meagre for a book with such an ambitious title.

The list mentioned here very much sets the tone of this rather peculiar publication. Basically, the book is a short encyclopaedia of encyclopaedic sources, or, if one wishes, a listing of lists. To be more specific, it consists mainly of excerpts or translations of (parts of) some 15 sources on Java in this period. Many of these sources consist predominantly of long lists of things (functions, places, products, income, expenditure). Most of them are written in Dutch, a few in Javanese, and they are often available only as unpublished manuscripts.

The sources dealt with are the following. To begin with, we are presented with passages from the diary of a lady soldier at the Mangkunegaran court dating from the 1780s. To those who know Ann Kumar's work this is not a surprise, as she has already published extensively about this very unusual and interesting manuscript. The remainder of Chapter 2 is made up of pieces

taken from the Javanese *Cabolang/Centhini*. This is followed by large sections taken from the writings of the Dutchman A.D. Cornets de Groot, dating from the 1820s and referring to the area of Gresik, at that date still an independent Residency (Chapter 3). The next chapter lists data taken from the documents written by the (Dutch) Governors of Java's Northeast Coast for their successors. The author has used the six thus-named *memoriën van overgave* ('memoirs of transfer') that were written between 1780 and 1801. Chapter 5 gives excerpts of reports written by three fairly high Dutch civil servants, namely J. de Rovere van Breugel on Banten (1780s), S.C. Nederburgh on the Priangan and some of the adjacent areas (1790s), and F.J. Rothenbuhler on Pekalongan (1790s). The final and sixth chapter, which is more about opinions than facts, presents passages from a Dutch, a (translated) Chinese and a Javanese text, thus enabling the reader to compare different points of view. It also gives excerpts of two texts written by the Surakarta court scholar Yasadipura II, namely the *Wicara keras* and the *Sasana sunu*.

This book is, as I have said, more an encyclopaedia than anything else, and as such it quite resembles the *memories van overgave* on which it is partly based. This way of writing history can be regarded as the historian's equivalent of the anthropologist's 'thick description', and apart from the many rather dull lists it is also a treasure-trove of colourful details. Its value – particularly to those who are interested in the history of Java but are not familiar with Javanese or Dutch, or are not in a position to peruse the original versions of these documents – lies mostly in the image it conjures up of 'Javaneseness' on the eve of the penetration of European influence, which, in my opinion, did not really have much impact before 1830.

My main criticism of the book is that the little analysis which it offers is not very convincing (the Javanese, according to Kumar, were modernized not by Europeans but by Islam) and has but a tenuous link with the massive data presented between introduction and conclusion. What it has to offer in this respect to those who are familiar with the history of the period would have fitted in a scholarly article. In the introduction the author, at the time of publication Dean of the Faculty of Asian Studies of the Australian National University, seems to have a number of axes to grind. On the very first page, and again on p. 7, she argues that Western scholars are not able to see that Western modernity was heavily imbued with Western tradition. These are, clearly, the words of someone who is not familiar with the (recent) literature. In the introduction Kumar also states that in her book she introduces 'a focus on society and civilization, rather than those staples of Javanese historiography to date, political events and economic statistics' (p. 2). This is a rather amazing statement, in the first place because the market is by now more or less swamped with 'cultural studies'. Once more it sounds like the opinion of

someone who is not familiar with the recent literature, and this tallies well with the fact that the bibliography hardly mentions publications dating from 1990 or later. In the second place it is a strange remark for someone who includes so many data of an economic nature in her book. Finally, Kumar seems to believe that 'subjective' descriptive material 'provides extremely valuable insights into demography, the economy, society and civilization', apparently more valuable than the figures published in the same sources. Again, a remarkable opinion for someone who then goes on and publishes (among other things) large numbers of ... figures. Besides, I would love to see a book on demography and economy based on 'subjective' descriptive material.

Lenore Manderson, *Sickness and the state; Health and illness in colonial Malaya, 1870-1940*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, xix + 315 pp. ISBN 0.521.56008.X Price: £ 40 (hardback).

PETER BOOMGAARD

This is, indeed, a book about sickness and the state, but nevertheless the title is misleading. To be more specific, it is mainly a book about the colonial state and the living conditions, including ill-health, of those people with whom the colonial state came into frequent contact. In fact, about 100 of the c. 200 pages comprising the main text of the book (that is, all chapters minus the introduction and conclusion) deal with three groups of people only: plantation workers, urban labourers and prostitutes. As Chinese and Indian immigrants made up the majority of these groups, the original Malay inhabitants of Malaya (present-day western Malaysia), constituting the majority of the population, are strongly underrepresented in this monograph.

The book, therefore, contains both more and less than the title suggests. It is more because it dwells at great length on the general living conditions of the groups just mentioned, and in that sense it is really more a social history of the immigrant lower classes than a study on health and illness. It is less than is suggested in the title because there is not much on the Malay population, and almost nothing on the Malay states, on Malay medicine and healers, and on Malay conceptions of disease and health.

Most of what one would expect to find in a book about sickness and health is touched upon in Chapters 2 and 3. However, the real medical topics are often dealt with in a few pages. Smallpox, for instance, no doubt a major cause of death at the beginning of the period dealt with here, has been allotted only two pages. Moreover, it has to share these pages with vaccination,

one of the few (if not the only) successful preventive measures contributed by Western medicine in the nineteenth century.

What I disliked most about the book is its high moral tone. Apparently colonialism has to be pilloried on every page, and in that sense the book is a throwback to the 1970s. I cannot imagine that there are still many (British?) readers who bemoan the passing of colonialism, and it is a pity that the author spends so much time, and takes up so much of the reader's attention, on what must surely be characterized as flogging a dead horse.

When the author has to admit, most reluctantly, that some 'Western' measures were effective and benefited the native population, according to her they were always taken for the wrong reasons. This was the case for example in the 1930s, when the health and nutritional status of the indigenous population improved as Malays moved from cash cropping back to domestic food consumption, which was encouraged by the British. 'But the maintenance of subsistence production', Manderson comments, 'also held down wages, and government and estate initiatives to encourage gardening, although located within a rhetoric of welfare, need to be considered in this light' (p. 93). You cannot win!

For someone who dislikes British colonialism as much as Manderson does, she is amazingly uncritical regarding British claims to fame in the medical domain, referring only to the British discoveries regarding malaria and beriberi, and not to those of their continental competitors.

Lenore Manderson is Professor of Tropical Health at the University of Queensland. If someone in that position writes a book with this title, the reader may be forgiven for expecting more than what is presented here, no matter how interesting a social history of the immigrant lower classes in colonial Malaya may be.

Bambang Widoyo Sp., *Gapit; 4 naskah drama berbahasa Jawa: Rol, Lèng, Tuk dan Dom*. Yogyakarta: Yayasan Bentang Budaya, 1998, xiv + 302 pp.

MATTHEW ISAAC COHEN

Javanologi, or neo-Javanism, took on many expressions during the New Order. Classical art forms and traditional beliefs were revived in performances and courses of instruction under state sponsorship; new fields (Javanese pedagogy, Javanese psychoanalysis) were synthesized in seminars and popular periodicals. The project to create a Javanese drama with written

playtexts concerned with contemporary themes and enacted in a realist style was part of a larger effort to establish Javanese as a 'literary' language, with novels, short stories, and free verse assessable by the same aesthetic criteria used for teaching European and American literature at Indonesian universities. Drama of this sort had existed before the New Order. A theatre known as *tonil Jawa* (from *toneel*, the Dutch word for 'theatre') was created by and performed for *priyayi* elite during the first decades of the twentieth century, presenting Javanese language versions of the sort of boulevard farces and living room tragedies enacted by Dutch professional and amateur actors in Batavia's Schouwburg and provincial theatre clubs. The meteoric rise of *kethoprak* theatre's popularity around 1925 coincided with *tonil Jawa*'s decline and eventual disappearance. Javanese language theatre scripts concerning contemporary issues and written in a realist style continued to be composed over the decades, but these were radio scripts, not ones enacted on the stage. A discontinuity thus existed. A New Order Javanese drama would have to be created anew, drawing on Indonesian realist and symbolist theatre (Teguh Karya, Arifin C. Noer), film and television, and European aesthetic models.

The process of creating the subject of 'Javanese drama' was advanced in the early 1980s through a series of script competitions, workshops, and seminars, most of them held in the Central Javanese city of Solo – a major centre for neo-Javanism – with governmental sponsorship. One paper presented in a 1983 *sarasehan* (meeting) on Javanese drama critiqued competition entries for stilted language; another spoke of the need for a well-rehearsed repertoire company; a third called for 'director's scripts', written to be performed, not read. Out of these discussions and events came Teater Gapit and the plays of its director-playwright, Bambang Widoyo Supono (known publicly by his childhood nickname, Kenthut).

Kenthut and Teater Gapit were involved in national and international arts projects and institutions from the start. Kenthut was a student in classical Javanese music at Solo's academy for performing arts (ASKI, STSI since 1988) until he dropped out in 1985. Many of Teater Gapit's actors were from the academy as well. The first play they produced, *Gandrung Kecepit* ('Constricted Desire', 1981), was a prize-winning entry in a 1980 Javanese playtext competition. The first play written by Kenthut himself, *Brug* ('Bridge', 1981), was commissioned by the wife of ASKI's director on behalf of an Indonesian society for handicapped children for presentation before a UNICEF delegation; it was subsequently written up in a UNICEF journal. Teater Gapit was a sort of resident theatre at Solo's Cultural Centre (TBS) for much of the 1980s and 1990s, until Kenthut's death in 1997 at the age of 40. Its productions were rehearsed and performed in the hothouse cultural climate of TBS before audiences largely composed of students and faculty from ASKI/STSI and Universitas Sebelas Maret (UNS). Teater Gapit began to attract international

attention in the early 1990s, discussed in essays and articles by Indonesianists including Barbara Hatley, G.G. Weix, Alan Feinstein and Tony Day. Kenthut's plays circulated in mimeographed form and were taught in Javanese literature classes in Indonesia, the United States, Australia and the Netherlands as 'modern' or 'new' Javanese theatre. The publication of this volume of Kenthut's scripts was subsidized by the Ford Foundation.

Kenthut's seven plays, four of which are presented here, focus on the urban poor. The Javanese dialogue is set mostly in what grammarians call *ngoko* and low *madya*, the type of speech used day-to-day among equals and near-equals. The scripts are rich in word play and Central Javanese colloquial expressions, including profanity. Issues facing Java's urban poor, such as forced eviction, under-employment and health problems, are dealt with in these plays with compassion and sometimes righteous indignation. The plays also have a documentary side to them, as records of 'endangered' classical arts, religious traditions and philosophical precepts in contemporary Java. (In this way, the plays are consonant with other ASKI/STSI and TBS documentary projects.) Gapit's productions featured classical *gamelan* music; *tembang* (sung Javanese verse) and other traditional poetic forms are woven into the fabric of Kenthut's texts. References to *wayang kulit* (shadow puppet theatre) and chronicle literature are frequent. *Rol* ('Roles', 1983) looks at the end of the commercial *wayang wong* theatrical tradition. The critically acclaimed *Lèng* ('Ants' Nest', 1985) concerns a shrine and its imminent incorporation into an industrial complex. *Tuk* ('Spring', 1989) focuses on the fate of a compound that once housed employees of a minor noble and now is home for society's dejecta. It features a disciple of shadow puppet theatre and an elder hoping to *mulih*, or complete a life's journey by dying in the place a life was lived. *Dom* ('Needle', 1990) portrays urban squatters. One of its characters scratches out a living doing commercial illustrations of *wayang kulit* characters.

Critics of Kenthut have accused him of writing the same play over and over again, and reading through this volume one does experience many moments of *déjà vu*. There is stylistic development to be found, however, as the playwright moves into a less realist mode over the course of his career. Some of Kenthut's earlier plays feature scenes where senile delusions and dreams are enacted. In his later plays, reality and fantasy become increasingly mixed: a picture of Kresna plays a major role in *Dom*, and there is some indication that Kenthut's unfinished play *Luh* ('Tears'), based on discussions with the renowned shadow puppeteer Gandha Dharman about portals, would have been more abstract in form and perhaps less strident in tone than his previous work.

Scholarly writing on Teater Gapit has tended to celebrate it as a bold challenge to the New Order's cultural hegemony. Such an assessment requires

moderation. Teater Gapit performed only about 100 times over its 15-year history; like a rare tropical bloom, it never really thrived outside of TBS's cultural hothouse. My own experience as an active theatre spectator in Solo in the late 1980s and early 1990s was that the TBS audience felt a pleasurable recognition in seeing their words and neighbours transposed into art, but were not mobilized into political action by seeing Kenthut's dramas of eviction and injustice enacted before them. Though appearing to closely approximate a 'community theatre' or 'theatre of the oppressed', Kenthut's indignation over society's treatment of the urban poor translated neither into making members of the upper classes more sympathetic to the poor's plight nor into galvanizing the poor themselves into acting in their class interests. His dramas are implicitly critical of societal inequalities, but never present alternate realities for the future (in marked contrast to the Islamic theatre being produced in Yogyakarta at the same time). That being said, there is still much to recommend this book of Javanese language plays to students of Indonesian culture. It stands very much as a document of its time's preoccupations with 'ethnic cultures' and 'ethnic languages'; the plays themselves are ethnographically extremely rich in observations on the peculiarities and obsessions of urban Javanese.

The volume also includes introductory essays by Sri Mulyono and Umar Kayam, as well as several pages of biographical information on Kenthut and Teater Gapit, including quotations from reviews in the Indonesian media. There are numerous typographical errors in punctuation and capitalization. The poor reproduction quality of three production stills from *Rol*, *Lèng* and *Tuk*, however, is more than compensated for by the vibrant Heri Dono collage that graces the book's cover and stands as an emblem of and commentary upon the volume. A gargantuan, multi-limbed, fanged and clawed monster, vaguely resembling a *barong* dragon, excretes low-tech gizmos. In the dragon's cavernous mouth are two little silhouettes of men with a bulb hanging over them, looking like nothing so much as shadow puppet jesters. They appear to be having a conversation, no doubt using the low Javanese of everyday discourse. The dragon's jaws might clamp down at any moment.

Bernd Nothofer (ed.), *Reconstruction, classification, description; Festschrift in honor of Isidore Dyen*. Hamburg: Abera, 1996, xxiv + 259 pp. ISBN 3.931567.04.4. Price: DM 89.90 (paperback).

JAMES T. COLLINS

Isidore Dyen's impact on our knowledge of Austronesian has been unquestionably great. While contemporary attention has focused on his publications related to lexicostatistical analysis and subgrouping arguments based on those analyses, Dyen's early, brilliant contributions to the reconstruction of Proto-Austronesian retain their value for the entire field. *The Proto-Malayo-Polynesian laryngeals* (1953) transformed the whole endeavour by integrating Formosan data into the reckoning. His 1956 study of Ngaju Dayak's so-called 'old speech stratum' demonstrated that the best traditional comparative historical linguistics has always been anchored in the social and geographic setting of the speech communities under study. Indeed, for fifteen years (1946-1962), Dyen championed and promoted Austronesian linguistics by bringing forth ten articles on diverse Austronesian topics, all published in the premier journal of linguistics, *Language*.

Fittingly, then, the collection of eleven essays which comprise *Reconstruction, classification, description; Festschrift in honor of Isidore Dyen* includes ten essays about Austronesian issues, ranging geographically from Taiwan to the Cocos Islands. As the title indicates, the book is divided into three sections of roughly equal length. The 24 pages of preliminary materials include a brief biography, a bibliography and two personal recollections written by friends. There are five maps, numerous tables (many of great complexity), appendices of texts, wordlists and reconstructions, but no index or cumulative list of figures and tables.

The *Festschrift* begins with four essays on reconstruction. Characteristically concise, clear and convincing, Mahdi follows up on Dyen's early work (1947, 1951) on reflexes of *d and *D. After a dense argument highlighted with sparse but well-chosen examples, he concludes that for the time being *d and *D should be retained as separate sounds in Proto-Austronesian phonology. Wolff discusses Proto-Austronesian morphosyntax, drawing largely on materials from Central Sulawesi languages, in particular Tolitoli and Kulawi. Greater use of resources available on languages of eastern Sulawesi (Banggai, for example) or southeastern Sulawesi might have led him to adjust his statements on the geographic sweep of his observations. Zorc readdresses the problem of *ʔ in Proto-Austronesian, by comparing (again) Philippine data with Iban and Malay materials. This essay represents an improvement over his earlier study (1982), but, by still relying almost exclusively on 'dictionary Malay', Zorc overlooks the numerous Malay dialects which also reflect /ʔ/ in the very same lexemes as Iban. So the occurrence of /ʔ/ in many Philippine items might still point to borrowing from Malay. Reference to Iban without comparing the data with Iban's closest Malayic congeners can be misleading. Building on his unique qualifications as both Brunei's and Java's leading fieldworker, Nothofer identifies ten Javanese loanwords in Brunei Malay –

almost all drawn from Brunei's court language. This etymological study sheds focused light on the almost unstudied linguistic and cultural history of the eastern archipelago.

In the section of the book dealing with classification, both authors have chosen to reconsider controversial, long-standing problems in the study of Oceanic languages. Pawley reviews the position of Rotuman, which has posed classification problems since the nineteenth century; Ross takes up the even more vexing problem of Yapese, the classification of which has caused the foundering and near-shipwreck of more than one linguistic career. Rotuman, long considered an aberrant Polynesian language, was placed by Grace (1959) in a subgroup comprising Rotuman, Fijian and Polynesian – a classification disputed by Dyen (1960). Biggs (1965) provided a procedure to delineate lexical strata in Rotuman and thus uncovered the large number of Polynesian loanwords in this language. Pawley's contribution in this volume supports Grace's initial subgrouping proposal by using the rich data available for the Fijian dialect complex (Geraghty 1983). Ross approaches Yapese in the same way as Biggs set about the task of studying Rotuman: by setting up a rigorous, systematic procedure for distinguishing lexical strata. Because of the historical role of Yap as a society mediating trade and cultural exchange between eastern Asia (the Marianas and Belau) and Micronesia's far-flung islands, the strata of Yapese are complex. Ross identifies five separate layers of Austronesian lexicon, both Oceanic and non-Oceanic. By meticulously applying the traditional methods of comparative historical linguistics, in particular by exploring shared innovations in certain bound morphemes, Ross first conclusively demonstrates that Yapese is an Oceanic language, and then tentatively points to the languages of the Admiralty Islands as its closest genetic relatives.

The final section of the *Festschrift* contains five essays of a descriptive nature. Adelaar's brief study of some aspects of Cocos Malay grammar (phonology, morphology and syntax) is based on field data which he collected in 1992. He criticizes other authors for writing about Cocos Malay from the perspective of standard Malay, but his own perspective is very much tied to a typology of Malay variants; he labels Cocos Malay as a 'Pidgin Malay Derived variety'. But despite working from that preconceived perspective, Adelaar succeeds in providing a convincing grammatical analysis of Cocos Malay as well as a 450-item wordlist and a short text. This is the first published linguistic study of this Malay variant (Gibson-Hill's 1947 notes are very limited and impressionistic). Bender's essay deals with the problem of distinguishing between derivation and inflection in Marshallese. It is instructive to note Bender's changing perception of the data in the last 30 years, as well as the acknow-

ledged changes in the language itself over the same period.

Tsuchida's contribution, on the other hand, deals with unchanging data: the personal pronouns of Siraya, a long-extinct language spoken in southern Taiwan in the seventeenth century. His data are drawn from the Gospel of Matthew as translated into Siraya by the Dutch missionary D. Gravius in 1661. The summary table (p. 232) and Tsuchida's effort to site his analysis in extensive quotations from Gravius's text are laudable. Nonetheless, we would welcome some discussion of the apparently idiosyncratic orthography of the text. Besides that, Tsuchida (p. 243) claims that the Dutch missionaries in the seventeenth century 'must have learned Indonesian' before they arrived in Taiwan. Setting aside the anachronistic reference to 'Indonesian', Tsuchida should not have made such an assumption. The history of the Dutch prosyletization endeavour in Taiwan can be recovered in great detail from existing published and archival records; guesses about background and training are not necessary. Li's essay also focuses on a Formosan pronominal system, that of the Rukai language spoken in southern Taiwan. Using data drawn from five Rukai dialects and working from a subgrouping hypothesis, Li reconstructs the Proto-Rukai pronominal system (p. 223). Moreover, he proceeds to exploit this reconstruction in order to delineate the innovations of the Mantauran dialect, concluding that this dialect is 'the first offshoot of Proto-Rukai'. The concluding essay in this collection is a study by Uhlenbeck which reviews the treatment of the perennial cranberry problem. His survey of the analyses of four theorists – Bloomfield, Aronoff, Bauer and Spencer – is a deadly critique of structural and post-structural morphology, but more tellingly it demonstrates the painfully slow pace of the development of an adequate theory of word meaning. Surely, most of us would agree with Uhlenbeck that discussion of meaning in contemporary linguistics is often ad hoc and intuitive.

These eleven essays are all solid studies written by scholars well-known in Austronesian linguistics. However, the essays by Pawley and Ross on classification shine out as contributions of especially high quality. They reflect not only the personal academic achievements of these two distinguished scholars, but also the advances and achievements of the whole field of Oceanic linguistics. Of all the branches of Austronesian linguistic studies, Oceanic has emerged as the best-known and best-studied. There are, of course, political and cultural factors that have influenced this turn of events, but most of all it is the serious, lifetime-consuming, often collegial work of the Oceanic specialists themselves that has advanced their branch to a level that can only be envied by linguists working on other branches of the family.

Bernd Nothofer did a predictably excellent job in collecting and editing all

eleven essays into a handsome, sturdy volume with only a few typographical or grammatical infelicities. This book constitutes a tribute to a scholar who has worked with great success in Austronesian linguistics for more than 55 years of his 85-year lifespan. It is no wonder that a second edition of this Festschrift is already in preparation.

Kristina R.M. Beuning, *Modern pollen rain, vegetation and climate in lowland East Java, Indonesia*. Rotterdam: Balkema, 1996, 51 pp. + 49 plates. [Modern Quaternary Research in Southeast Asia 14.] ISBN 90.5410.629.8. Price: f 120,- (hardback).

J.R. FLENLEY

Modern pollen rain studies have been the Cinderellas of palynology. Not many people want to spend their time on this kind of work when the great unknown of the Pleistocene is there waiting to be explored. Nowhere is this more true than in the tropics, where the pollen diversity makes work very slow, and the vegetation survey which goes hand-in-hand with modern pollen studies is laborious, expensive, taxonomically difficult and sometimes physically dangerous.

This situation is not logical. Without modern pollen rain studies, the interpretation of Quaternary fossil pollen results is highly subjective and often open to argument. It is this kind of situation which has sometimes brought Quaternary palaeoecology into disrepute, and has allowed palaeoclimatologists to downplay its conclusions compared with those of other techniques such as oxygen isotope measurements which are seen as more 'precise'.

The work described here represents a slightly unusual approach to modern pollen rain studies, because it is a study of surface samples from ten lakes in the lowlands of East Java. A large number of pollen taxa is recorded, although many remain unidentified. These are illustrated by photographs which have come out rather dark. The nature of the sediment is also described in some detail, as well as the characteristics of the lakes themselves, which are mostly volcanic maars. The pollen source area for each lake is calculated (depending on lake size). There are no detailed studies of the surrounding vegetation, which is secondary in all cases. It would have been interesting to see a sketch map of the vegetation around each site.

The pollen data are presented in a diagram of 42 pollen/spore taxa or taxa groups, in which some taxa are presented as indicators of wet, dry and very dry climates respectively. These divisions relate to the length of the dry season at the various lakes. Nevertheless, the author concludes that the rela-

tionship with climate is too obscured by human impact to permit much optimism about palaeoclimatic interpretations from core studies in these lakes. It is argued that studies of the history of human impact will be much more likely to succeed. This may be true, but groupings of pollen taxa to illustrate this point would have been of interest.

Altogether, this is a careful, useful and interesting contribution, although I found it somewhat reserved in its approach. Surely the exciting thing about these sites is that they have abundant pollen, well preserved, and in great variety? The potential for palaeostudies (of both climate and human impact) is thus tremendous. Hopefully we shall not have to wait too long for data from these lakes.

Karl-Heinz Kohl, *Der Tod der Reisjungfrau; Mythen, Kulte und Allianzen in einer ostindonesischen Lokalkultur*. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1998, 304 pp. [Religionsethnologische Studien des Frobenius-Instituts Frankfurt am Main, Band I.] ISBN 3.17.015410.9. Price: DM 79.

GREGORY FORTH

Karl-Heinz Kohl is Professor at the Institute for Historical Ethnology and Director of the Frobenius Institute at the University of Frankfurt. His monograph is the latest of a series of comprehensive ethnographic accounts of eastern Indonesian societies. It is also the first modern book-length work dealing with a Lamaholot-speaking community, and in this respect supersedes Vatter's *Ata Kiwa* (Leipzig, 1932). Based on field research conducted during several visits over a number of years, and focused on the village of Belogili in the Lewolema district, not far from the historically important eastern Flores coastal settlement of Larantuka, the book begins with a brief introduction discussing the author's initiation to fieldwork. This is followed by a chapter on the history of Flores. Giving particular attention to the development of the rajadom of Larantuka and its myth of origin, Kohl reviews the various external influences to which the East Flores region has been subjected over several centuries, including Portuguese and Dutch colonialism, Catholic missionary activity, and an expanding Islam.

While useful in its own right, the historical review provides a backdrop to the author's more general purpose of demonstrating how the people of this part of Flores have succeeded to a remarkable degree in integrating foreign elements and maintaining fundamental elements of an indigenous social and religious order. In defining this order, 'history' gives way to 'myth'. For, as the

book's title should suggest, Kohl frames his monograph with reference to a mythical tradition that is widespread in Indonesia: the fraternal sacrifice and life-giving death of the Rice Maiden, here named Tonu Wujo. Following the second chapter, entitled *Vom Ursprung der Welt* and concerned with creation narratives, cosmology and spirit categories, the author devotes two further chapters to a detailed analysis of patrilineal clan organization, land tenure, asymmetric affinal alliance and marriage prestations, as well as ritual activity associated with these several aspects of local society. The final and by far the longest chapter (pp. 193-278) directly addresses the myth of the Rice Maiden and narratives describing her journeying through various parts of Flores island. Analysed in this context are detailed accounts of the annual agricultural cycle and ritual hunt. Here especially, Kohl records a wealth of material, together with German translation, exemplifying the parallelistic ritual language in which mythical texts are conveyed. The chapter concludes by contrasting an eastern Indonesian culture informed by the myth of a mystically powerful female figure who provides for the material well-being of humans, with the Christian tradition in which a male saviour is sacrificed to ensure human spiritual survival. This comparison underscores the complementarity of local and Christian traditions, thereby demonstrating the possibility of their mutual accommodation in the modern society.

Kohl ends his book by addressing several, by now well-rehearsed, issues raised by postmodernist critics of empirical anthropology. While acknowledging the experiential limitations of any ethnographic study, Kohl provides a cogent defence of what opponents of studies such as his would call a 'realist' position. From reflexive commentary included throughout the study, one is allowed insight into the reactions of Kohl and his family life in East Flores. Thankfully, however, from the book as a whole one learns considerably more about the people of Lewolema, a fact that attests to the author's ethnographic and expository skill. This is an excellent book, beautifully produced and illustrated with over twenty splendid photographs. The assessment is only slightly qualified by the annoying absence of chapter and section numbers, and by the circumstance that nowhere are paragraphs indented or otherwise clearly separated.

Brook Barrington (ed.), *Empires, imperialism and Southeast Asia; Essays in honour of Nicholas Tarling*. Clayton, Victoria: Monash Asia Institute, 1997, v + 250 pp. [Monash Papers on Southeast Asia 43.] ISBN 0.7326.1153.9. Price: A\$ 34.95 (paperback).

J. VAN GOOR

The title of this Festschrift for Nicholas Tarling, the well known professor of history from the University of Auckland, covers the fields in which Tarling has made his name. His impressive list of publications started in 1957 with an article on British policy in the Malay peninsula and the archipelago around 1800. Twelve books, six books edited (among which the massive two-volume *Cambridge History of Southeast Asia*), 66 articles and an uncounted number of academic reviews are an impressive token of his ongoing scholarly activity. For those who do not know him personally, it must come as a surprise that his list of writings also includes a long series of programme notes on operas performed by Australian and New Zealand opera companies.

Tarling's research may at first sight look a little bit old-fashioned because of the recurring use of the word 'empire' in his titles, and certainly did so in the days when the battle between Asiacentrism and Eurocentrism was fought. Yet his standpoint that all parties in a historical process should be taken into consideration, and that interaction is at least as useful as whatever-centrism, still holds true. Now that the centrism debate seems to have been only a passing phase in the study of Southeast Asia, we should be grateful to those who went their own way, far from the modes of the day.

The twelve contributions in this volume deal with a wide field of topics, ranging from 'Raiding cultures and inter-coastal migration in early modern Southeast Asia' (Barbara Watson Andaya) to a forecast of what will be the legacy of British rule in Hongkong after the takeover by the People's Republic (John Wong). The first two chapters, Barbara Andaya's 'Raiding cultures' and Dianne Lewis' 'British policy in the Straits of Malacca to 1819 and the collapse of traditional Malay state structure', focus on the European impact on traditional society. Lewis concludes that the Dutch system of cooperation with traditional rulers did not end with the fall of Riau in 1784, but was a consequence of the founding of Singapore.

In Chapter 3, Anthony Reid investigates the career of the merchant imperialist W.H. Read, who was Dutch consul in the Straits Settlements during the outbreak of the Aceh war. In his memoirs Read plays down his role considerably, due to his falling out of favour with the Dutch in later years. In the following chapter Khoo Kay Kim reconsiders the rather turbulent term of office of Sir John Anderson as governor of the Straits Settlements and High Commissioner of the Malay States (1904-1911), and concludes that Anderson 'certainly deserves to be much better known in Malaysian history'.

Greg Bankoff, in 'Europe's expanding resource frontier; Colonialism and environment in Southeast Asia', tries to explain European expansion 'in terms of an attempt by societies to circumvent the limitations of their own resource base by expropriating that of others'. European imperialism is also the subject of John Legge in Chapter 6, 'A new imperialism in the late 19th

century? Revising an old debate', in which he establishes Tarling's place in the discussion.

In 'Overseas Japanese, Overseas Chinese and British justice, 1931', Ian Nish examines the policy which the British government in Hong Kong developed between September and December 1931 in order to contain the Chinese demonstrations and boycotts caused by the Japanese military actions in Manchuria. A comparable topic is dealt with in C.F. Yong's article 'Law and Order: British management of Malayan communism during the interwar years, 1919-1942', showing the development of a whole array of instruments for maintaining law and order, instruments later bequeathed to the independent states of Malaysia and Singapore.

The last four chapters deal with more recent politics. Brook Barrington analyses 'British regional policy and Southeast Asia, 1944-1954', and agrees with Tarling that Empire, to British policymakers, was 'an exceptional, even an undesirable, political configuration'. W. David McIntyre, in 'The Commonwealth and Southeast Asia', looks at the position of the region within the Commonwealth between the postwar years and the present. Leonard Andaya tackles a touchy problem in his 'Writing a history of Brunei', a problem that does not seem easy to cope with given the opposition between the hegemonic state and the presence of ethnic minorities. The final chapter was written before the takeover of Hongkong by Beijing; in it John Wong investigates the question of why things went wrong under Chris Patten. Whereas most authors who are apt to emphasize the position of the people of Hongkong, Wong highlights the possible effects of Patten's actions on mainland China, and in this way makes Beijing's policies more understandable.

Many reviewers complain that writing on a Festschrift is a hard job: the contributions diverge too much to offer a common theme. I would like to end by saying that although this may seem to be true here too, there is another way to look at it. Considering the fact that almost all articles took their starting point from the work of Nicholas Tarling, the book is a real homage to his broad interests.

Penny Van Esterik (ed.), *Women of Southeast Asia*. DeKalb: Center for Southeast Asian Studies, Northern Illinois University, 1996, xiv + 229 pp. [Monograph Series on Southeast Asia, Occasional Paper 17; Second, revised edition.] ISBN 1.87797.917.1. Price: \$ 15(paperback).

MIES GRIJNS

It is difficult to imagine how it used to be to study gender relations in Southeast Asia in the late seventies, when this was still a largely unexplored field. *Women of Southeast Asia* gives us a glimpse of the field in that era by presenting a collection of eight papers first published in 1982. What has this second edition to offer?

The first thing that strikes modern readers is how fast terminology and theoretical assumptions can become outdated. As Penny Van Esterik points out, 'sex roles', 'status of women', 'patriarchy' and 'traditional values' are no longer foci of research. A typical approach of the late seventies was to look into a number of 'facets of society' (p. 77), such as ideology, economy and social organization, with politics and human reproduction as additional facets, in order to analyse the position of women. Research was often restricted to fact-finding and a rather formalistic listing of aspects which contributed to women's status (see for instance Neher's article on 'the ambiguous Cebuana' in Cebu, the Philippines). To the modern taste this approach is too shallow and does not explain the dynamics underlying gender inequality.

A central struggle in the 1970s was to unravel the link between ideology (as mirrored in religion, but also in state directives) and patriarchy. Three papers (Kirch, J. Van Esterik and P. Van Esterik) focus on the evaluation of women by Buddhism and the potential constraints which this places on their activities. Two papers take their examples from an Islamic context: Laderman mentions the domains of law, customs and ideology, including the symbolic content of reproduction, which put Malay men in a superior position. Hull analyses the impact of class differences and the values promoted through education and state-sponsored women's organisations on women's positions in Java, Indonesia. Two other papers (Neher and Blanc Szanton) deal mainly with the Roman Catholic Philippines, although Blanc Szanton also describes the pre-Spanish period.

The selection of articles for this volume is rather unbalanced, presumably because the choice was rather limited two decades ago. The three Thai chapters deal with closely related subjects and make possible some nice comparisons, but the other chapters are very diverse: monographs on Malaysia, Indonesia and the Philippines, one diachronic contribution (Blanc Szanton on Iloilo in the Philippines), and one (Winzeler) which deals with sexual status in the whole of Southeast Asia using the Human Relations Area Files. The last two are actually nice exceptions to the general tendency of narrow regionally focused studies.

If one wonders what has withstood the test of time, the importance of good ethnography is notable. The articles by Laderman, Hull and Blanc Szanton are still interesting to read because they provide us with a lot of ethnographic details, and this makes them worthwhile as sources for com-

parison. As a whole, however, the volume is more a kind of curiosity, a reminder of the 1970s, than the central reference book it claims to be. It reminds us of how much we used to limit our studies to women as wives and how much we focused on the dominant (national) cultures, on class as a determining factor, and on simple fact-finding. Recent studies of women in the region are much more contextualized, dynamic and historically specific. They also cover a much wider range of women's roles, opinions and relationships.

For this revised version, Penny Van Esterik wrote an overview of scholarly trends during the 1980s and early 1990s. There is also an updated bibliography, which unfortunately is restricted to English-language publications (for Indonesia, for instance, hardly any new publications are mentioned) and which is quite sloppily printed.

In conclusion, I would have preferred the publishers to spend their resources on a new volume based on Penny Van Esterik's suggestions for further research – on indigenous models of Asian feminism, for instance, or applying new approaches pioneered by non-Asian feminists, or including papers translated from the languages of the region – than on this reprint.

Alfons Van der Kraan, *Bali at war; A history of the Dutch-Balinese conflict of 1846-49*. Clayton, Victoria: Centre of Southeast Asian Studies, Monash University, 1995, x + 240 pp. [Monash Papers on Southeast Asia 34]. ISBN 0.7326.0598.9. Price: A\$ 19.95.

HANS HÄGERDAL

The story has been told before. The tragic and pointless struggle between the aggressive Dutch and the Balinese rajas in 1846-1849, which ended in a half-victory (at the very most) for the Dutch, already had its chroniclers in the last century, when authors like Weitzel and Nijpels wrote detailed descriptions of Dutch manoeuvres and viewpoints during the three expeditions of 1846, 1848 and 1849. Later accounts have largely consisted of the recycling of these near-contemporary printed reports. In English, we thus have the mediocre compilations by E.S. de Klerck (*History of the Netherlands East Indies*, 1938) and Willard Hanna (*Bali profile*, 1976), besides the judicious but brief study by Henk Schulte Nordholt (in *Indonesia*, 1981) and the nationalistic narrative of Anak Agung Gde Agung (*Bali in the nineteenth century*, 1991). It is clear, therefore, that this, the first major confrontation between a Western power and the people of Bali, deserves something more. What we need is a study that is not simply Dutch colonial history but also takes into account Balinese viewpoints

and conditions. The setting in itself is a most interesting one, not least because some of the worst military setbacks in Dutch colonial history were suffered at the hands of Balinese troops – Surapati in 1686, the rajas of North and East Bali in 1848, the Balinese and West Sasaks on Lombok in 1894.

Alfons Van der Kraan embarks on this promising enquiry with the aim of studying not only why the war broke out and took the course which it did, but also what it tells us about Balinese society. In general, I would say that he succeeds better with the former question than with the latter. He has undertaken a valuable and painstaking work with the original sources, including letters in private collections hitherto untapped. He attempts to view the escalation of the Dutch-Balinese conflict in its larger economic and strategic context. He shows how the commercial importance of the hitherto rather neglected islands of Bali and Lombok dramatically increased in the 1830s, and how Anglophobic sentiment encouraged the Dutch on Java to ensure their suzerainty over these peripheral islands which had previously been left to their own devices. The various local rajas on Bali seem to have been persuaded to sign contracts of which the real meaning was obscure to them. When Dutch and Balinese perceptions of these contracts turned out to be incompatible, conflict became inevitable given the aggressive and uncompromising stance of the then governor-general, Rochussen.

Perhaps the account would have benefited here from a discussion of the development of colonialism and imperialism in a global context. After all, there is a wide array of theories regarding these phenomena, and such a discussion could have made the work more valuable for the purpose of historical comparison. As it stands, the text risks giving the impression of a conflict conditioned more by the personalities of the leading colonial officials than by the prevailing colonial discourse – an interpretation which, for me at least, is unsatisfactory.

The bulk of the book consists of a blow-by-blow account of the three expeditions, with ample data on who did what when, how many people were involved, and how many were killed and injured in the various actions. As such it will surely serve as a useful and critical reference text for the foreseeable future (although an index would have been useful). The major drawback of the work is that it gives no more than fifty percent of the story. The second aim of Van der Kraan's enquiry, to examine what the war tells us about Balinese society, can hardly be said to be fulfilled. The author tries to approach Balinese conceptions via Dutch materials, a procedure which, as the work of scholars like Barbara Andaya has shown, is certainly feasible. He finds an important explanation for the Dutch setback in the second expedition of 1848, for instance, in the resentment which the reckless behaviour of

the soldiers had generated among local people. What is problematic, however, is his unwillingness to take any Balinese texts into the discussion. What interesting results an analysis of indigenous traditions may yield has been demonstrated by Margaret Wiener in her recent work on Klungkung (*Visible and invisible realms*, 1995), where Balinese accounts of the killing of the Dutch commander Michiels, in 1849, are extensively discussed.

If, for technical or other reasons, Van der Kraan has taken the decision to stick only to contemporary Dutch sources, then he should at the very least have discussed and justified this decision, but no such discussion occurs. His chosen approach means, among other things, that the reader finds himself transposed to Bali in the 1840s without the necessary knowledge of the historical background. The rapid change of loyalties which took place among the North Balinese population when the local raja was forced out of power in the face of Dutch aggression in 1849, for instance, does not make sense as it stands in Van der Kraan's text. In order to understand this event, one must know that the kin group which held royal power in the area was an upstart family which had first expelled and later massacred its predecessors. It is surprising that Peter Worsley's translation and discussion of the *Babad Buleleng* (1972) has not been used here; for sure, this gives little substantial information on the 1846-1849 war, but it does provide information on indigenous concepts of legitimacy and royal power. Nor does Van der Kraan discuss the valuable near-contemporary Balinese account of the war rendered by P.L. van Bloemen Waanders in the *Tijdschrift voor Nederlandsch-Indië* of 1868.

That Balinese accounts, in spite of their reputation to the contrary, may show a degree of factual accuracy is nowadays well established. An appendix of the text *Sara samuscaya pakenca* (C.C. Berg collection 118:3, Leiden University Library), for example, gives a chronologically very precise enumeration of the principal events of the 1849 War (the defeat of Jagaraga was followed after 28 days by the Dutch occupation of Padangbai; the death of the Karangasem raja occurred seven days later; the Dutch defeat at Kusamba after another four days; the renewed Dutch march into Kusamba after 16 days, and so on). In addition this text provides evaluations of some of the Balinese persons involved, giving us an interesting corrective to European texts. A recent Indonesian-language work, Soegianto Sastrodiwiryono's *Perang Jagaraga (1846-1849)* (Denpasar, 1994), has taken full advantage of local accounts and documents, including original letters exchanged by the rulers, and of the study of topography and physical remains. Though many details included in this book are open to debate, its approach points to new ways of dealing with the Dutch Bali campaigns.

The last few years have seen a minor explosion of works on Balinese history, generally of a very high quality; one may mention those of Geoffrey Robinson,

Margaret Wiener, Henk Schulte Nordholt and Samuel Wälty. Alfons Van der Kraan's monograph is certainly a welcome addition to the accumulating body of knowledge regarding an island that used to be the preserve of anthropologists, art historians and writers of tourist guides. The style of the book is clear and very readable, and the author takes great care to see through (though hardly 'deconstruct') the thick layers of chauvinism and Euro-centrism in which the Dutch accounts are embedded. It is not the definite account of the 1846-1849 War, but it has at least succeeded in providing a reliable standard text summarizing the relevant corpus of European materials.

Jürg Wassmann, *Das Ideal des leicht gebeugten Menschen; Eine ethno-kognitive Analyse der Yupno in Papua New Guinea*. Berlin: Reimer, 1993, xiii + 246 pp. ISBN 3.496.00436.3.

VOLKER HEESCHEN

This work results from an interdisciplinary research programme in which ethnology, the psychology of cognition and other disciplines like (ethno)-medicine and (ethno)botany are not just aware of each other, but really cooperate 'in order to grasp, as far as possible, the cultural knowledge of a whole culture' (*um das kulturelle Wissen einer ganzen Kultur möglichst vollständig zu erfassen*, p. 10). Instead of investigating 'small themes' like limited taxonomies or strategies in a shopping centre, as was done in the cognitive sciences, research in the context of the project 'Ethnographisch-kognitive Erforschung der Yupno in Nordost-Neuguinea' was carried out in four comprehensive core areas: the conception of sickness, the meaning and classification of cultural plants, and everyday cognition (*Alltagswissen*). The sub-projects were realized by P.R. Dasen, V. Keck, Ch. Kocher Schmid and J. Wassmann, and the work under review is one of a good number of already published books or articles.

The Yupno live in a remote corner of the Finisterre mountains of Papua New Guinea at altitudes ranging from 2,000 to 2,500 metres. Their high valley opens to the north, toward the coast, but was not easily accessible in the past. The fact that this is a barely known cultural group makes the data presented by Wassmann and his colleagues doubly valuable. The introductory chapter of Wassmann's work justifies the research methods followed by sketching their theoretical background and the ideas which lead him 'to say goodbye to the omniscient informant' (the translated title of an article by Wassmann

which is thematically related to this book). So far ethnologists have tended to portray cultural systems as independent of the individuals who put them into practice, in the same way as linguists have described *la langue* as a system independent of the speaker, but having prescriptive power over *la parole*, that is over individual speakers (a theme actually developed by Durkheim, one of the founding fathers of modern ethnology, and handed over to linguistics). Having located omniscient informants, and relying on specialists pretending to be able to speak for a whole culture, they neglected acting systems. Cognitive ethnology, by contrast, works with 'just plain folks' – individuals whose limited, specialized, emerging or fragmentary knowledge directs and shapes behaviour, plans and actions. This everyday cognition (*Alltagswissen*) is not part of an abstract cultural meta-system which shapes individual knowledge in the same way as *la langue* prescribes and stipulates *la parole*. It can only be discovered in processes, it is procedural knowledge (*prozedurales Wissen*) in non-verbal behaviour and mental activities. The shift from the ideal omniscient informant 'leads away from the culturally handed-down and linguistically coded system of knowledge toward the acquisition and use of knowledge in everyday life' (p. 18). Wassmann's study exemplifies, and tolerates, the tension between traditional ethnology and fieldwork on the one hand, and psychology and methods of testing and interviewing on the other. It does so in an honest, intelligent, sensible and fruitful manner, casually challenging traditional ethnology and systematically leading to a new research paradigm in the field.

Four different areas of cognition are described: the number and counting system of the Yupno, their classification of the environment, their classification of food and their conception of the settlement area as social space. All four are tackled by interview, observation and experiment. Only a few of the results can be mentioned here. The use of the counting system is highly variable and task-specific, affected by the characteristics of the objects to be counted and the status and gender of those who count them. The Yupno classify all features of the natural and social environment according to the criteria 'hot', 'cool' and 'cold', 'cool' being the ideal state. In rituals, magic and healing ceremonies, classifications are manipulated in order to transform objects into a cool state. As far as food is concerned only two general categories are distinguished in everyday life, food which 'helps the blood' and food which 'strenghtens the bones'. The opposition between 'wild' and 'domestic', between forest and garden is not significant. The conception of space is variable depending on the degree of schooling and experience of the world beyond the home. In this area, however, the connection between mythology and individual world-views generally seems to be a close one. A static conception of the world delimits one's own area, identifies a centre and a periphery, and establishes an order which ensures social and intellectual security (p. 218).

The state of being safely placed, moving around only within accepted limits and in permitted ways, is symbolized by the *koŋgap* melody. Each person owns a short melody, which is sung by those who enter the proprietor's 'territory'.

Wassmann convincingly portrays cognition and culture as actions moved and directed by functions, interests, special tasks, individuals, age and gender groups. The reader can readily reconstruct an overall picture of Yupno culture, yet that culture is not presented as an overly coherent system and always remains close to actors and everyday life. The fact that nothing is lost, and that generalizations appear in a coloured, individualized, coherent and enriched manner, speaks in favour of cognitive ethnology.

I found only two inconsistencies in the text. The kabutnjap tree, surely, does not grow at an altitude of 4,000 metres (p. 103); this is above the timber line, and in fact only a few mountain tops are so high. The plan of the hamlet (p. 164), secondly, is drawn from the same point of view as Photo 13, not Photo 15 (p. 165). I think that quotations from the works of non-English authors should refer to original publications, not to English translations (Durkheim and Mauss, 'social space', and Cassirer, 'mythic space', on pages 205-6). The preface by M. Schuster competently evaluates and concisely summarizes Wassmann's work. Following the Yupno's own terminology, I believe that this book deserves a *leicht gebeugten* (slightly bent) reader: one who bends slightly towards others in order to listen to their words, and is open-minded, attentive, competent and 'cool'.

Masykuri Abdillah, *Responses of Indonesian Muslim intellectuals to the concept of democracy (1966-1993)*. Hamburg: Abera, 1997, iv+ 304 pp. ISBN 3.931567.18.4. Price: DM 59.90 (paperback).

NICO KAPTEIN

This interesting book is the commercial edition of a 1995 University of Hamburg PhD thesis prepared under the supervision of Professor Albrecht Noth (Department of Middle Eastern History and Culture, University of Hamburg) and Professor Bernhard Dahm (University of Passau).

Governments have used the term 'democracy' in countless ways. In the Muslim world, as everywhere, many governments use it to characterize (and partly legitimize) their regimes, and this has led to the question whether or not Islam and democracy are compatible. The book under review here focuses on the discussion of this issue in Indonesia. After the introduction,

Chapter 2 gives the historical setting of this discussion by presenting an overview of the policy of the government towards Islam, and of the relationship between Islam and the Indonesian state philosophy, Pancasila. Chapters 3 and 4 present the responses of a large number of intellectuals to the concepts of democracy, human rights, and the democratic values of equality, liberty and pluralism. The main problem for Muslim intellectuals in coping with these ideas is that according to the most current interpretation of democracy by political scientists, the will of the people, which is secular in nature, can be fully implemented, while in the Islamic view this will can only be put into effect as long as it does not contradict God's commands. Chapters 5-7 are more geared to the specifically Indonesian situation. Chapter 5 deals with responses to the concept of Pancasila democracy, and to the democratization process as this manifests itself (or does not manifest itself) in the general elections, the functioning of the MPR (People's Consultative Assembly) and the DPR (House of Representatives). Responses to political organizations (three only, until recently) to the position of the president, to the rule of law, to freedom and openness, and to social inequality are also discussed. Chapter 6 looks at how Muslims tried to give shape to their aspirations within the political structure of Indonesia, in particular from the mid-1980s onward, when Pancasila was made the compulsory 'sole foundation' (*asas tunggal*) – to the exclusion of Islam – for all political and mass organizations. Chapter 7, finally, treats the role of the Muslim intellectuals in the democratic process, which role is mostly accommodative in nature.

As appears from its title, the book is mainly concerned with democracy as a concept, and therefore deals with the political culture in Indonesia from a conceptual, or better, from a Islamic theological perspective. Despite this theoretical approach, however, the book also contains sections which observe how these theological reflections are used on an operational level, in order to legitimize or criticize the existing political system in Indonesia. In my view these are the most interesting parts of the book, particularly the sections in Chapter 5 on the democratization process (pp. 158-78).

The book is based on the analysis of all kinds of publications, including academic writings, newspaper articles and pamphlets, as well as interviews with Amien Rais, Abdurrahman Wahid, Nurcholish Madjid, Ahmad Syafii Maarif, Ali Yafie, Dawam Rahardjo and others. As the book was written in, and deals with, the period immediately prior to the dramatic political events of May 1998 which formed the start of a new era in Indonesian politics, it constitutes an interesting account of how Indonesian intellectuals tried to give shape to their aspirations within the very constrained intellectual climate of the late New Order, when open opposition to the government was not possible.

All in all, I can recommend this well-researched, well-structured and

clearly written book to anyone who is interested in Islamic theological reflections on the 'Struggle of democracy in Indonesia' (to paraphrase the title of Boland's well-known book).

Ivan A. Hadar, *Bildung in Indonesien; Krise und Kontinuität; Das Beispiel Pesantren*. Frankfurt: IKO-Verlag für Interkulturelle Kommunikation, 1999, 207 pp. ISBN 3.88939.419.1. Price: DM 29.80.

NIELS MULDER

This book's title, 'Education in Indonesia; Crisis and continuity as exemplified by the *pesantren*', raises the expectation that it provides first-hand information about the state of the Indonesian educational system in general, and that of the *pesantren*, the informal Islamic religious boarding schools, in particular. This expectation, however, is only most scantily fulfilled. What the book is basically about is proposing the thesis that education in relational societies should and must be different from schooling in industrial societies. Indonesia is relational, person-focused and situational. European systems are industrial, product-focused and individualized. Because education is culturally determined, the transplantation of Western practice to Third World countries will be problematic and dysfunctional.

Western social evolution is the measure against which other styles and practices are contrasted. The second chapter, therefore, tackles the history of modern education in Europe, and the problem of transferring it to non-industrial, non-European environments. This results, as may be expected, in two typologies, or caricatures, of knowledge: dynamic and practical in the West, requiring endless exploration, versus sacral knowledge elsewhere, requiring memorization and imitation. The relevant discussion is exclusively based on the schemes and speculations of theory-oriented German professors.

The next chapter proposes to outline the history of education and pedagogical practice in Muslim Java. It begins with a treatise on Islamic views of man and education, followed by a highly stereotypical (*rukun, gotong royong, musyawarah*) sketch of 'traditional Javanese education'. This brings us to the ideas behind the colonial introduction of modern schooling and early Indonesian reactions to it, such as the Taman Siswa movement. Beginning with independence, the school system expands very rapidly. This erodes its quality, and diplomas become the goal of schooling. At present, schools merely serve the requirements of economic development, and have lost their educative role. The current practice of formal education imitates Western

models, while the race for certificates creates a highly competitive environment destructive of the harmony which the Javanese value. Because much of the chapter pretends to be historical, the many errors regarding dates and names are distinctly irritating. We also learn the curious fact that 45 percent of Germans are illiterate (p. 102) and, further on, that Yogyakarta was the centre of Majapahit (p. 138).

Almost two-thirds of the way through the text, we finally arrive at the *pesantren*. Here too, the discussion is conducted in the most general and platitudinous terms. Java is presented as it was recently invented by anthropologists, but how the Javanese deal with the present remains unclear until we come to the summary description (four pages) of a modern *pesantren* – in which pupils are supposed to follow the state curriculum and learn English well – that is presented as a model for the rural religious schools.

We hear nothing about the origins and motivations of the students, but we are supposed to acquire insight into their behaviour through a most ingenious device, the analysis of popular stories. In a 16-page discussion, European stories said to be relevant to understanding concepts of time, work, expectations and social mobility are contrasted with Indonesian and Javanese lore. Needless to say, the contrasts fit the industrial/relational model perfectly. The problem of the modern world, however, is that the Western industrial way of being has become the norm and blindfolds us for the realities of other people. As a result, Western ideas first unsettled Indonesian formal education and now threaten to upset the *pesantren* as well.

Jim Schiller and Barbara Martin-Schiller (eds), *Imagining Indonesia: Cultural politics and political culture*. Athens: Ohio University, 1997, xxiii + 351 pp. [Monographs in International Studies, Southeast Asia Series 97.] ISBN 0.89680.190.X. Price: \$ 30 (paperback).

NIELS MULDER

This collection of eleven essays grew out of papers presented at a 1991 interdisciplinary conference entitled 'Indonesian culture: Asking the right questions'. It is premised on the ideas that Indonesian culture is complex and dynamic, and that no single understanding of what constitutes it is possible or desirable. This results in the tracing of alternative ideas that can be juxtaposed with the hegemonic indoctrination of the Indonesian state.

To this purpose, Liddle presents us with the ideas of the social critic Goenawan Mohamad, the economist Sjahrir and the neo-modernist Muslim Nurcholish Madjid. Frederick dwells on the relevance of Armijn Pané's ideas

on a modern Indonesian culture shaped by a good measure of individualism, popular culture and global inputs. Hatley explores the plethora of gender-bound characterizations in Indonesian *belles-lettres*. Moelyono writes on the possibilities of art in service of society, Kuntowijoyo on Javanese bureaucratic culture in the early twentieth century. Bouchier traces the idea of the integralistic state and why it made a forceful comeback in the 1980s. Ali writes about the competition between state and local cultures, and newly emerging urban critical thought. Eldridge examines the contributions made by certain NGOs to the public discourse. Lucas describes the clash between a cynical, corrupt bureaucracy and petty landowners threatened with expropriation and eviction, and Widodo how the same apparatus tries to force the Samin community into the New Order straitjacket. Acciaioli's contribution is on the state's manipulation of language in enforcing its development programmes.

Not much sympathy is wasted on the ideology and practice of the New Order regime. It is unfortunate that the regime's own ideas in defence of its cultural politics and political culture – to which Indonesians have been massively subjected for at least twenty years – are not explicitly presented. Since Liddle alludes to the power of the corporatist ideology over the minds of the emerging middle classes, and Ali even regards it as congruent with a revitalizing Javanese culture, official ideas should have been given their place in this collection. The multifarious voices expressing contemporary Islam are almost totally absent, while the opinions and discussions promoted in the press are only scantily referred to.

No monograph or collection, of course, can aspire to be complete in itself, and I think that *Imagining Indonesia* gives, albeit with the above mentioned omissions, an interesting picture of the public discourse of the late 1980s. Most of the positions taken have been lucidly argued, and the book provides a useful background against which to understand current debates in Indonesia.

Raymond L. Bryant, *The political ecology of forestry in Burma 1824-1994*. London: Hurst, 1997, xiii + 257 pp. ISBN 1.85065.283.X.

J.W. NIBBERING

The political ecology of forestry in Burma is a comprehensive and well-documented study on forest politics in Burma between 1824 and 1994. Two forest guards measuring a teak tree appear on the front cover, a scene which aptly symbolizes forest management geared to long-term commercial timber production. The colonial forest service established in Burma in 1856 adopted this

type of management in order to put an end to a period in which timber traders had competed fiercely over diminishing forest resources. Bryant's study points out that the creation of the forest service and the adoption of scientific forest management had far-reaching political consequences. The demarcation of reserved forests required by scientific forest management greatly restricted the access enjoyed by local forest users such as peasants and shifting cultivators, giving rise to constant resistance. Indigenous and European timber traders, and at times even the civil service, which was concerned about the welfare of the local population, also opposed forest service policies. After independence, the emphasis on commercial, scientifically managed forest as opposed to subsistence forest use has continued despite the nationalization of the timber industry. The country's development policies, nevertheless, sometimes entail accelerated deforestation.

A short summary such as this cannot do justice to Bryant's detailed analysis of the way in which forest politics evolved over time, concurrently with changes in the power bases, levels of organization, perceptions and technical capacities of the contesting parties, in general economic and political conditions, and in the state of the forests themselves. Forest politics involved not only the forest service and the rural population, but also a wider range of actors competing with each other in different arenas. The forest service itself did not necessarily operate in accordance with the interests of European private enterprise, but often followed a course of its own. Forest politics often became entangled with wider political issues such as territorial integrity, colonial solidarity or nationalism. The state, it is true, has never abandoned scientific forestry as a central management concept, and forest users, for their part, have constantly opposed this policy. Conflicts and alliances in forest politics, like the forests themselves and the specific techniques used to manage them, have nevertheless been subject to constant change. The same picture emerges from a brief comparison with India, Thailand and Indonesia at the end of the book.

Not surprisingly, this book is most detailed when it comes to the development and internal dynamics of the forest service, and less so regarding the other forest stakeholders. The forest service-centred perspective adopted in the book is, of course, conditioned by the nature of the historical material available in the colonial records. These records look at the forest service from the inside, but at other stakeholders from the outside. At the same time forest politics in Burma are explained here very much in terms of a dichotomy between state-led, scientific management and open access, and between commercial exploitation and subsistence forestry. This may well be a valid paradigm as far as the past is concerned, but the author presumes, in keeping with this dichotomy, that in the future Burma's forestry politics are bound to produce the same conflicts as in the heyday of colonial forestry. Recent ex-

perience from countries such as Nepal, Sri Lanka, Pakistan and India, however, shows that other forms of management, based on joint approaches incorporating forms of common property management, may also be possible. If such approaches could be adopted successfully, future forest politics in Burma might develop along quite different lines.

Douglas W. Hollan and Jane C. Wellenkamp, *Contentment and suffering; Culture and experience in Toraja*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994, xiii + 276 pp. ISBN 0231.08423.4. Price: \$ 15.50 (paperback).

HETTY NOOY-PALM

Not being a psycho-cultural anthropologist, but simply a cultural anthropologist, it was with some hesitation that I accepted the invitation to review this book. I have to say, however, that I enjoyed reading it, not least because the authors deal with their central subjects of 'contentment and suffering' among the Toraja people of Sulawesi in a fascinating way.

The book is classified as an ethno-psychological study. The approach is original: interviews are used, and the respondents are introduced to us as personalities, each with his or her specific character and characteristics. In the introduction the authors give an exposé of methodological developments in psychocultural anthropology, commenting on and criticizing existing publications. Their guru is R.I. Levy, author of *Tahitians; Mind and experience in the Society Islands* (1973).

Although we deliberately sought to encourage spontaneity and personal reflection – in order to illuminate shared and individual patterns of personal experience as well as to generate 'experience-near' concepts of thought, emotion and behavior – we loosely structured the interviews around a checklist borrowed from Levy (1973:509-77) (pp. 8-9).

Rorschach tests and TAT (Thematic Apperception Tests) were also administered to each respondent, complemented by free-form interviews.

The methodological explanation is followed by a review of Toraja culture and history. On the latter subject, the authors should have been more careful in their account of the first two decades of Dutch colonialism in Toraja country. After their arrival in 1906, according to this account, 'the Dutch killed or imprisoned many of the most powerful Toraja nobles and froze land holdings' (p. 17). In fact only about half a dozen chiefs were involved here, most notably Pong Tiku (later proclaimed a national hero) and the brothers

Bombing and Ua Saruran, who opposed the Dutch in 1907. Once defeated, Pong Tiku was shot (according to the Dutch, when he tried to escape – the easiest way to get rid of someone, but hardly a chivalrous one). Not mentioned specifically by Hollan and Wellenkamp is the uprising in 1917 by the chiefs Pong Tandibua, Ne Matandung and Pong Masangka. This revolt was caused by resentment at the abolition of warfare, cockfighting and gambling and the introduction of taxes and compulsory labour services. Interference by missionaries in traditional rituals also played a part. It was after the missionary Van de Loosdrecht was murdered that the Dutch took action. The three chiefs were imprisoned (Pong Masangka subsequently became a Christian). For a detailed and correct account of these events, see T. Bigalke, *A social history of Tana Toraja, 1870-1960* (Madison, Wisconsin 1981).

The concise introductory review of Toraja religion and society is generally very satisfactory, although some statements are rather contradictory. 'Today', we read on p. 14, 'status differences continue to be very important and status continues to be marked in a number of ways'. On the next page, however, it is revealed that 'since even commoners and dependents have alternative sources of income, the status system is in flux'. The introduction also discusses the 'interview situation'. Paku Asu (the name is fictitious) is an elevated village in Northwest Toraja with a population of about 800. The main means of subsistence are wet-rice farming and gardening. The research took place in 1982, when Toraja culture had already changed rather profoundly. The status of traditionally high-ranking people was on the wane, although their influence was still felt in village affairs. Over 50 percent of the inhabitants still adhered to the traditional religion (*Alukta* or 'our way'), but the remainder were Christians (Protestants, including a Pentecostal minority). No survey or qualitative description of the age structure of the population is given. The youngest respondents, strikingly, are in their mid-thirties. In the Afterword it is noted that many young people have left the village for several reasons including the pursuit of employment elsewhere in Indonesia (p. 224), an observation which should have been mentioned in the Introduction. The people left behind, apparently, were not interviewed on this subject, and any allusion to how they are coping with the situation is lacking.

The means of communication used in the interviews was 'Bahasa Indonesia' (why not simply refer to 'Indonesian' or 'the Indonesian language?'). Pains were taken to select a 'representative' sample of the population in terms of status, creed, education and age. One of the strongest parts of the book, as already noted, is that in which the respondents are introduced. A brief profile of each respondent is presented; these 'portraits' are delightful, and together they give a lively picture of Paku Asu people. The reader becomes

acquainted with the villagers: aristocrats, dividers of meat at rituals (an important job), a priest of the Alukta religion, a Protestant minister, a clerk with modern views, and housewives of diverse character:

After the introduction the book is divided into two parts, entitled 'Basic psychocultural orientations' and 'Suffering'. The first comprises four chapters: 'Religious, moral and philosophical orientations', 'Aspects of interpersonal relationships', 'Aspects of identity and self', and 'Mental states and processes'. The topics of Part 2 are anxieties, mental disturbances and dysphoria. My own comments will be confined to a limited number of themes which appear in several different chapters of the volume. The religious attitudes of Alukta adherents and Christians, for instance, are discussed repeatedly in the book (Part 1, Chapters 1 and 3; Part 2, Chapter 7). Members of each group judge those of the other, and scrutinize themselves, with regard to how well they meet their respective religious observations. Christians, apparently, have difficulty sorting out which of the traditional prescriptions and taboos still have to be observed. Most villagers – Christian and Alukta alike – see conversion to Christianity as a liberation from the more exacting demands of the traditional religion (p. 40). Spiritual beings are still meaningful to the villagers regardless of faith. *Deata* (gods, ancestors, spirits) are encountered both in dreams and in reality. They are not entirely benevolent, and rules must be observed in dealings with them. Alukta priests attribute at least three deaths in the village to violation of these rules. The *maro*, a ritual which serves many purposes, is one occasion on which the *deata* manifest themselves. During this ritual people become possessed, hurting themselves with knives and swords, walking on burning embers and suchlike. Hollan and Wellenkamp give a vivid description of these performances, which are 'viewed as strange and extraordinary and as evidence of the presence and power of the spirits' (p. 125). The audience (not all of those present fall into trance themselves), Christians and Alukta alike, accept the authenticity of these performances. *Nene* are another category of ancestors, manifesting themselves in dreams, conferring special talents and giving advice.

Another important theme is the slaughtering of livestock and the division of meat, which takes place mostly at funerals. The views and experiences of the respondents on this subject are complemented by statements and explanations from the authors. Slaughtering seems to play a traumatic role (Part 1, Chapter 3). In dreams, respondents envision themselves being killed and butchered like buffalo. At funerals, Alukta adherents and Christians alike show an intense interest in the slaying of these animals. 'Our photographs of such events', the authors note, 'show people staring intensely or grimacing, with some women holding a hand cupped over an open mouth' (p. 87). Division of meat at funerals is 'a highly elaborate, time-consuming, and dramatic event, involving special meat dividers' (p. 14). Several of the

respondents were meat dividers, *to mentaa*, a task involving considerable responsibility. Some of these express anger at the greediness of those among whom the meat is distributed. Such anger, however, is often theatrical and differs from the real anger which is manifested, for instance, in disputes over land. Real anger and aggression are also displayed, and indeed encouraged, at kickfights (*sisemba'*), in which many pairs of combatants engage simultaneously. This sport has links with rituals, and must in olden times have been an exercise for war. Normally speaking, aggressive behaviour is condemned. The well-known aggressive state of *amok* is unknown among the Toraja. Auto-aggression, occurring in several rituals, has already been discussed. It is absent from Pentecostal trance behaviour, which closely resembles the wailing at traditional funerals (some Pentecostalists become possessed by the Holy Spirit).

Part 2, 'Suffering', deals among other things with the fear of being robbed or becoming a victim of black magic, with disturbing dreams, depressive feelings and somatic complaints. Magic can be used in harmful ways, and according to one respondent many Toraja possess such magic, for instance the power to poison others or make them ill. Dreaming, in accordance with the importance attributed to it in the psychological sciences, is a subject often discussed in this volume. Disturbing dreams or nightmares described by respondents include dreams of a dead father trying to take away his son, and of being slashed through the throat like a slaughtered buffalo. The authors place these unconscious imaginings in their ethnological context.

The book is meticulously organized and provided with an interesting Afterword, maps, notes, a glossary, references, an index, a bibliography and photographs. The photos, unfortunately, have lost some quality in the process of reproduction; the originals must have been much finer. With regard to the bibliography, it is striking that nearly all of the publications listed are in English. The works of French anthropologists who have done fieldwork in Tana Toraja are not mentioned, and while some Indonesian works are included (for instance, the 1983 anthology *Manusia Toraja* edited by T. Kobong and others), one misses an interesting article by the young Toraja anthropologist Paulus Tangdilintin, 'Padang bombo, the heaven of the Torajanese' (*Indonesian Magazine*, Nov.-Dec. 1981, pp. 43-9).

Hollan and Wellenkamp view Toraja culture from what is in many respects an innovative angle. Their book is strongly recommended to all those interested in the Toraja and their culture. It is not only a contribution to the field of ethno-psychology, but also, in its way, a *document humain*. It is with warmth, feeling and a real love for the people whom they study that the authors have introduced us to the Paku Asu villages.

Bill Gammage, *The sky travellers; Journeys in New Guinea, 1938-1939*. Carlton South, Victoria: Melbourne University Press, 1998, xx + 292 pp. ISBN 0.522.84827.3. Price: A\$ 39.95 (hardback).

ANTON PLOEG

The metaphor which Gammage employs in the title of his book refers to a belief among New Guinea people that the sky was populated with beings much like themselves who occasionally visited the earth. When, in the 1930s, Australians and Europeans with their New Guinean companions, police, private armed guards and carriers, started patrolling the Central Highlands of what was then Australian New Guinea, some Highlanders thought that they were being visited by sky beings. Gammage deals with one such patrol; the largest with regard to participants, the longest in duration and the last which explored large areas of unknown and little-known country. It was an administrative patrol, organized and led by officials. Three Australians took part from beginning to end: the leader, Jim Taylor, the second in command, John Black, and a medical assistant, Pat Walsh. Gammage focuses on Taylor and Black. Both left writings about the patrol: Taylor a voluminous official report and Black a personal diary. Gammage started the research for his book when both were still alive. He got to know them, came to regard them as his friends and expresses his admiration for them (p. 5). In his book he refers to them by their first names.

The subtitle of the book contains a second metaphor: the 'journeys' it mentions are not only geographical, but also emotional and intellectual ones, since what they experienced in the course of the patrol made both Taylor and Black change their views of New Guineans and their ways of life. Gammage writes little about the impact the patrol had on the New Guinean participants.

The exploration of the Central Highlands of eastern New Guinea had progressed from the eastern seaboard where white settlements were most numerous. The Taylor-Black patrol was to explore the country between Mount Hagen and the border with Irian Jaya. So, in March 1938, it started from Mount Hagen, then close to the very frontier of colonial control, and proceeded due west. Apart from the three Australians there were 20 police headed by a sergeant, Lopangon, and 233 carriers, five women (wives of policemen), six servants (for the Australians) and four guides. The Administrator of Australian New Guinea had initially denied Taylor air support, and although he did eventually get some, the patrol had to rely on buying food from local people, which added to its problems. After about two months, the patrol split into three sections, two of them commanded by Taylor and Black respectively and the third staying at a base camp in Wabag.

In November Black got close to the border with Irian Jaya via another base camp at Telefomin, in the heartland of the Ok peoples. From there he returned to Wabag where he arrived in April 1939. Taylor searched for an easy access route to the western Highlands from the Sepik basin, which he did not find and which, in fact, does not exist. He had returned to Wabag a few weeks before Black. From Wabag the two made a few shorter treks before, spurred on by the Administrator, they finally returned to Mount Hagen in June 1939. Taylor had until July 1940 to write his report, with a map produced by Black. Given the uncertain political outlook at that time, report and map were suppressed with the result that the patrol never gained the publicity it deserved. *The sky travellers* makes up for this neglect, belatedly but valuably.

Gammage pays a lot of attention to how the perceptions of both Taylor and Black changed in the course of the patrol. Black especially revised his racist ideas, becoming convinced that New Guineans were people much like himself, living in a civilization of their own (p. 117). During his stay at Telefomin he acquired a New Guinean partner and although he ended the relationship when he moved on to Wabag, it apparently had a lasting and deep effect. After World War II both men were among the progressives in the colonial administration. They were rapidly promoted. Black commented that he thought his post-war work to be far more important than his pre-war patrols (p. 19). Taylor, however, was reprimanded for not reporting killings of New Guineans by an official, and then resigned his job. Black also resigned, for reasons which Gammage does not quite make clear (pp. 228-9). Taylor married a New Guinean and lived in the Highlands until his death. Black had married an Australian, and he returned to Australia, although New Guinea and New Guineans remained a major concern for him.

That Taylor failed to report killings was not uncharacteristic. He had done this before, possibly also during his 1938-1939 patrol (p. 67). It was his conviction that a few killings might sometimes be unavoidable in the process of establishing the Pax Australiana (pp. 11, 143). Black also opined that this could not be done without killings (pp. 128, 188). Gammage reports that in the 81 days of Black's trek from Telefomin back to Wabag he and his party shot and killed eight New Guineans. Nevertheless Taylor reported to the Administrator that there had not been any casualties – referring, it seems, exclusively to the patrol and its members. Taylor's views, as reported by Gammage, differ sharply from what Griffin, Nelson and Firth have written in their *Papua New Guinea; A political history* (Richmond, Victoria 1979). They state that Taylor 'thought that he had failed if he was forced to shoot' and that the 1938-1939 patrol had been 'a model of humane patrolling' (1979:52). Gammage considers that Taylor and Black were mistaken. He points to the

example of Ivan Champion, who carried out his patrols in Papua, south-eastern New Guinea, with an absolute minimum of bloodshed. At least part of the reason for this was that he was less in need of food since he let the patrol grow part of the food it needed (p. 218). The areas which he patrolled were later no more troublesome to the colonial administration than those covered by Taylor and Black (p. 218). Regrettably, Gammage does not record what the men themselves, late in life, thought about the way they had conducted the patrol.

Gammage devotes a lot of attention to relations between the Australian officials, police and carriers. This subject was, for me, the most revealing in his book. He describes the police as warriors and sorcerers, or both, in colonial guise. Two of the policemen on the patrol he calls 'bandits' (p. 127). Regarding another, a 'deadly shot', he writes that the carriers, unarmed, were grateful to him since 'he shot people all over the place' (pp. 41, 43). Gammage states that the police saw exploration as conquest, a point of view which he endorses, but which for the police meant acquiring loot (p. 218). Some, if not all, engaged in a power struggle with their Australian superiors, often by magical means. Illnesses and other misfortunes were explained as results of this struggle. Police and carriers were out of control. They took food from gardens and attempted to steal pigs. Gammage quotes a senior policeman on the patrol telling Black that 'men joined the police mainly to get women on bush work' (p. 186). The Australians did not necessarily notice this aspect of police activity. Police also took their own retaliatory measures. On at least one occasion Lopangon, the sergeant in charge, and a constable furtively arranged to shoot with bow and arrow a New Guinean belonging to a group which they considered 'truculent'. Had they used their rifles, Taylor would have heard the shots and probably taken action against them (p. 151).

An unsatisfactory aspect of the book is that the text is completely devoid of references. These are grouped together by chapter, which makes many statements untraceable. The reason for this is probably is that *The sky travellers* seems targeted at a wide public, which I suppose is also why the words and expressions in Tok Pisin, the local lingua franca, are Anglicized to make them more understandable. The book seems to sell well: my review copy is part of the second printing, published in the same year as the first one. This is fortunate, since the book is an important one. Papua New Guinean historiography is clearly much more advanced than its Irian Jaya counterpart. It would be fruitful, for instance, to apply Gammage's analysis of the careers of Taylor and Black to that of Van Eechoud, a failed salesman who did a lot of patrolling in Irian Jaya, also in the late 1930s, and who after World War II invested a tremendous amount of energy in the administration of the colony, first in

the civil administration branch of the armed forces, and later as resident commissioner. Also very welcome would be a study of the 1939 Dutch Geographic Society expedition into the western section of the Irian Jaya Highlands. For the time being, however, such research is not likely to come about.

Jürg Wassmann (ed.), *Pacific answers to Western hegemony; Cultural practices of identity construction*. Oxford: Berg, 1998, vii + 449 pp. ISBN 1.85973.159.7. Price: £ 17.99 (paperback).

ANTON PLOEG

With the exception of the introduction, the 18 papers in this volume were presented at the second Conference of the ESfO, the European Society for Oceanists, held in Basel in 1994. A companion volume, *Common worlds and single lives; Constituting knowledge in Pacific societies*, edited by Verena Keck, has been published simultaneously by Berg. Wassmann has subdivided the papers into four categories: 'Constituting historical knowledge'; 'Ways of constructing identities'; 'Australia after Mabo' and 'Questioning Western democracy?' The papers in the latter two categories, especially, show more coherence than one might expect from a set of conference papers. And in line with the reputations of the contributors, the papers are of a high quality.

The four post-Mabo papers complement each other nicely. Tonkinson analyses the impact which the Mabo verdict has had on Australian national identity and the way it contributed to reconciliation between Aborigines and white Australians. Borsboom, in a case study, describes what the Mabo case was about: Aboriginal land tenure, which he characterizes as part of a total social phenomenon also embodying religious, moral and cosmological aspects. Glowczewski deals with the contrast between Aboriginality at the national level and its various regional and local variants. She concludes that the existence of Aboriginal agents at the national level and also at the regional and local levels is likely to lead to varied alliances between Aborigines and non-Aborigines at those levels. Finally, Morton dissects the debate among white commentators about how to contribute to scholarly knowledge about Aborigines and Aboriginality without attributing to that group an 'essence', whether conceived in terms of pre-colonial traditions or in terms of resistance against white colonial domination. However, damning essentialism is for him a red herring. What matters is rather the difference 'between prescribing and informing judgements about what and who Aboriginal people might care or not care to be' (p. 379), a not very startling conclusion at

the end of a long paper.

The two papers in the section 'Questioning western democracy?' are also complementary. Van Meijl discusses participation by Maori in the institutions of parliamentary democracy in New Zealand – that is, participation by a Polynesian minority of a population dominated by the descendants of British settlers. Tcherkézoff, by contrast, reports on a Polynesian state, Western Samoa, specifically on the debate among Samoans about the relative merits of the Western system of universal suffrage and Samoan methods of reaching consensus by communal deliberation. In accordance with Morton's conclusion, he informs us about the debate rather than prescribing a desirable outcome.

The other two sections show less coherence. 'Constituting historical knowledge' contains a paper by Friedman dealing with his recent field research in Hawaii, and one by Douglas about Western perceptions of Kanak socio-cultural organization (as apparent from written historical sources) and their later reinterpretation and deployment in both scholarly work and colonial politics. Burt documents his collaboration with Kwara'ae (of Malaita, in the Solomons) in their attempts to write their own, local history. In the last paper, Senft writes on Western knowledge about the Trobriands, usually mistaken and often sensationalist.

Finally, the seven papers in the section 'Ways of constructing identities' include studies of the redefinition of rights to resources in the context of new economic opportunities in Lavongai and Tivak (New Ireland Province) and Roviana, New Georgia (papers by Otto and Schneider respectively); the role of sport in the redefinition of groups in Manus Province (Gustafsson); efforts by the Warengeme, a Sepik group, to integrate itself into the modern world, as evidenced by the course of a conflict (Stevenson); the experiences of a man from Porapora, in the lower Sepik, as a worker in colonial enterprises (Peltier); film-making in Temotu Province, Solomon Islands, involving a dialogue with the peoples concerned (Pinholt); and the ways in which second generation Cook Island migrants in New Zealand maintain a separate identity (Fitzgerald).

Wassmann's introduction sets the shifting socio-cultural scene for the papers: globalization of markets (as against the partition of the world into separate state entities), and growing national and international migration of people. He briefly summarizes each paper and bravely attempts to place it in the overall scene. More striking than the variety of topics discussed in the papers is the greater variety in analytical approaches, notwithstanding the frequent use of 'identity' as a 'metatropé', to use Douglas' characterization. Friedman, with his use of the concept 'conjunctive knowledge', returns to the sociology of Karl Mannheim. Borsboom uses Mauss' 'total social phenomenon' as his

master concept. Van Meijl analyses Maori participation in New Zealand governance by means of the diachronic model of democratization developed by De Tocqueville to analyse political changes in France. Fitzgerald problematizes the concept of 'culture' and its use as an emic concept with a variety of meanings. For his analysis of changing resource rights, Schneider uses a Marxist perspective, while Otto, contrary to my expectations, does not apply an explicit theoretical model. The dialogic approaches of Burt and Pinholt contrast with Peltier's choice for a commentary on the life history which he elicited. This theoretical diversity seems symptomatic of the present state of our discipline. For me it makes the book the more intriguing and interesting.

Abdul Kohar Rony and Ieda Siqueira Wiarda, *Bibliography; The Portuguese in Southeast Asia: Malacca, Moluccas, East Timor*. Hamburg: Abera Verlag, 1997, 138 pp. [Abera Bibliographies 1.] ISBN 3.931567.14.1. Price: DM 59.90 (paperback).

JOHN VILLIERS

This bibliography is competent enough as far as it goes. The trouble is that it does not go nearly far enough. It suffers from numerous limitations, most of them self-imposed, which seriously reduce its comprehensiveness and consequently its usefulness. Firstly, it is confined to works that are held in the Library of Congress, although this only becomes apparent from a reading of the acknowledgements and the foreword. Secondly, the compilers have 'concentrated on the works published before 1975', the year in which Portuguese rule in East Timor ended. Thirdly, they have attempted, even within these limitations, not to achieve completeness, which they maintain is impossible, but rather 'to be as exhaustive as possible as far as monographs (books, in common parlance) and very selective in terms of serials (in common parlance, articles and entries that pertain to journals, periodicals, newspapers)'. It would have been helpful if, instead of patronizingly explaining what monographs and serials are 'in common parlance', they had indicated on what criteria they have based their selection of serials, and why, apart from 'concentrating on' works published before 1975, they have apparently adopted no criteria at all in their selection of monographs. They cheerfully admit that their sole concern with regard to the latter was to be 'as broad as possible' and to include a book even if it only had a 'map or a chapter on Southeast Asia and the Portuguese' or if 'significant mention appeared on Timor Timur' in it. It is hard to place much confidence in the compilers' judgement if they seriously consider that all that is needed to qualify a book

for inclusion in this bibliography is a map of the area which it covers. Confidence is further undermined by their warning that their work has suffered from a lack of 'continuity and attention' as a result of their failure to obtain the services of an editor and their having had to rely upon 'many volunteers, often laboring for short periods of time'.

The mixture of selectivity based on unknown criteria with regard to serials and apparently total absence of selectivity with regard to monographs is all the more unfortunate given the lack of even the most minimal analysis or description of any of the works listed, while the index is so full of errors, inconsistencies and omissions that it is more often a hindrance than a help when searching for an entry.

Under these circumstances it is perhaps not surprising that out of a list that this reviewer drew up of 30 scholars who over the last 20 years have published a significant number of substantial books and articles on the Portuguese in Southeast Asia, only eleven have been included in this bibliography. One of the more curious of the many omissions is in the entry for *Os Lusíadas* of Luís de Camões, of which only the French translation of 1725 by M. Duperron de Castera is listed; it seems unlikely that the Library of Congress possesses no copies of this poem in either Portuguese or English.

It is clear from a reading of the acknowledgements and foreword, from which the quotations in this review are taken, that the compilers are aware of all these limitations. They envisage this bibliography as the first stage 'of a much larger project that will focus on the Library of Congress holdings on the Portuguese world, particularly as they pertain to that world's Asian dimensions', and express the hope that they will be able to produce 'a more encompassing and up-to-date bibliography eventually'. This is a hope that all scholars interested in the Portuguese in Southeast Asia will share. There certainly seems little point in producing this work now when it encompasses so little and is so far from up-to-date, and in sending it into the world, like Shakespeare's Richard III, 'scarce half-made up'.

Ulrike Mosel, *Saliba*. Munchen/Newcastle: Lincom Europa, 1994, 48 pp. [Languages of the World/Materials 31.] ISBN 3.929075.33.4. Price: \$ 28.75 (paperback).

LOURENS DE VRIES

This short sketch of the Saliba language appears in the series 'Languages of the World/Materials', an inexpensive and low-threshold forum for grammatical sketches and language documentations. Saliba is an Austronesian

(Western Oceanic) language spoken by fewer than a thousand people on the island of Saliba in Milne Bay Province, which consists of the eastern tip of Papua New Guinea together with its many surrounding islands.

This description is based on data collected from one Saliba informant during a field methods course at the Linguistics Department of the Australian National University in which the Saliba informant participated as a student. She wrote a few texts and was used as a source of elicited data by the other students and by their teacher, Ulrike Mosel. The scarcity of information on the languages of New Guinea justifies this somewhat shaky database. Unfortunately, no information is given on the single key informant in terms of age, background and exposure to the Saliba language.

After a sketchy phonology, the monograph describes a number of clause types and word classes, the noun phrase and possessive constructions, the verb phrase and a number of syntactic phenomena like nominalization, subordination and chaining of clauses. The description shows us an Austronesian language with many typological features that struck me as very Papuan: clause chaining, verb serialization, a topic marker occurring with both noun phrases and whole clauses, and an SOV order in the clause. Saliba has both prepositions and postpositions.

The description tells us very little regarding the sociolinguistic and historical context of the Saliba language: is there bilingualism on Saliba, is the language eroding under pressure from other languages? What is the role of Suau, the mission *lingua franca* of the area, on Saliba island? Is Saliba indeed a case of Austronesian-Papuan language convergence?

The description is well-written and since it is the only grammatical description we have on the Sauic language family (to which Saliba belongs), the scientific importance of this publication is beyond doubt.