Konrad Eisenbichler, ed.

Collaboration, Conflict, and Continuity in the Reformation: Essays in Honour of James M. Estes on His Eightieth Birthday. Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2014. Pp. 429 Pb, \$45.

This volume honors James Estes, professor of Reformation history at the University of Toronto, director of the Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies in Toronto from 1979 to 1985, a widely published scholar on the German reformer Johannes Brenz, and a key member of the editorial team for the *Collected Works of Erasmus* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press).

This edited volume brings together seventeen contributions organized around five themes: friendship and collaboration, reforming the people and the church, the polemics of the Reformation, Catholic opponents of Erasmus and Luther, and the search for religious peace. The editor and contributors have worked to link the essays together and tie them into the research interests of James Estes, but as is the case in many festschrifts, at times the connections seem somewhat forced.

One major recurring figure in many of the contributions is Erasmus. Nine of the contributors address some aspect of Erasmus's work or influence. Among the strongest offerings is Susan Karant-Nunn's fascinating study of Erasmus's attitude towards money. She details how carefully Erasmus approached the issue of patronage, and how he negotiated financial assistance without jeopardizing what he saw as his necessary freedom from obligations toward these patrons. Readers come away with a strong sense that Erasmus would be a very wearying house-guest. For her part, Valentina Sebastiani provides a stimulating contribution on the ups and downs of Erasmus's connections with the Basel printer Johannes Froben, indicating how vulnerable Erasmus was to poorly produced, pirated editions as his popularity increased. Erasmus's often tumultuous relations with his contemporaries are examined by Erika Rummel in her article on the connections between Erasmus and the Strasbourg reformer Wolfgang Capito, and by Charles Fantazzi's contribution on the conflict between Erasmus and the Italian Augustinian Agostino Steuco. The perception of Erasmus's close ties to Luther is assessed by Paul Grendler's fine article on the Jesuit reception of Erasmus's writings in an era of increasing disquiet in the Catholic Church over the Dutch humanist's confessional convictions. Silvana Seidel-Menchi convincingly shows how the teachings of Erasmus and Luther were interwoven in Italian works focusing on Christian piety, while Amy Burnett examines Erasmus's perspective on the Lord's Supper, discussing whether he did in fact share the perspective of the Swiss reformers on that subject.

A second focal point of the volume is the work and impact of Johannes Brenz. Heinz Scheible and Timothy Wengert both offer contributions on the

relationship between Brenz and Philip Melanchthon. Both highlight the face-to-face meetings between the two men and note the tensions that emerged as Brenz found himself caught between the moderate and hard-line Lutherans. Because the two contributions cover essentially the same ground, one wonders whether it was truly necessary to include both in the volume. A third contribution, by Hermann Ehmer, looks at the organization of the Württemberg church according to the church order set up by Brenz and Duke Christopher of Württemberg in 1559, and then considers the evolution of church structures in the duchy up to the present day.

A third figure of note in the volume is Martin Luther. Indeed, several of the contributions that focus on Erasmus highlight various aspects of the complex links between the German reformer and the humanist scholar. Scott Hendrix offers a thoughtful reflection on the Erasmus-Luther debate that challenges many of the standard interpretations of the controversy between the two men on the human will. Robert Kolb provides a helpful analysis of Luther's "kingdom" language, noting the usefulness of using the German term "Reich" to better encompass Luther's meaning. Finally, Mark Crane's contribution on the French Catholic response to Luther's writings highlights the complexities that emerged as conservative Catholic theologians tried to respond to Luther and other challengers by using the medium of print.

Apart from these three main axes, a number of contributions provide interesting insights into the Reformation era on separate topics. Ray Mentzer offers a contribution on the challenges of enforcing church discipline in France, Thomas Deutscher introduces two sources used by Catholic preachers in preparing sermons from the diocese of Novara in Italy, and Irene Dingel closes the volume with a contribution on religious peace agreements in early modern Europe.

Several of the essays are translated from other languages into English—in most cases, the translations are well done, though the English version of Irene Dingel's contribution is rather labored. Across the board, the contributions offer important insights into various aspects of Reformation thought and practice. Each of the essays offers a list of manuscript and printed sources for further consultation, and a general index provides additional ways for readers to make the best possible use of the volume. Students and scholars in Reformation and Renaissance studies will surely benefit from this volume. Colleagues in Jesuit studies will gain particular insights about the interactions between sixteenth-century Jesuits and their humanist contemporaries by reading and reflecting on Paul Grendler's contribution. Many early modern Jesuits admired Erasmus's pedagogical works, and used them in their schools, but at the same time they had to take into account the condemnations of Erasmus and his

writings issued in the *Index of Prohibited Books*. The range of responses to Erasmus's works within the Society of Jesus, from hostility to admiration, illustrates the continued importance of deepening our understanding of the complex yet fascinating world of the sixteenth century.

Karin Maag

Calvin College

kmaag@calvin.edu

DOI 10.1163/22141332-00301005-04