Jennifer Mara DeSilva, ed.

The Sacralization of Space and Behaviour in the Early Modern World: Studies and Sources. Farnham; Burlington: Ashgate, 2015. Pp. 344. Hb, \$129.95.

Particularly since the publication of two volumes from a conference held in Exeter in 2003 (and issued as: *Sacred Space in Early Modern Europe*, eds., W. Coster & A. Spicer, 2005 and *Defining the Holy: Sacred Space in Medieval and Early Modern Europe*, eds. S. Hamilton & A. Spicer, 2006), the “spatial turn” in scholarship has forced us to recalibrate our understanding of the sacred not only in early modern studies. By considering space, place, and other ideas about location and territory as not neutral, objective concepts but, in the words of William B. Taylor: “[realising that] they have to do with how people perceive and encounter places and territory,” we now are much better placed to appreciate that space is “a verb” rather than a “noun” in that it is made not natural and, more often than not, becomes a live issue invariably as the result of contestation and rivalry. The cross-confessional and transnational scope of the essays in this collection usefully complements that co-edited recently by Giuseppe Marcocci, Aliocha Maldavsky, Wietse de Boer, and Ilaria Pavan (*Space and Conversion in global perspective* [Leiden: Brill, 2014]). As the editor writes in her substantial (and imaginatively illustrated) introduction: “The crucial issue in this volume is not space, but the behaviour and the communal beliefs that spaces prompt or witness” (19). In her own contribution, the editor uses a treatise on the “Institution of the Chaplain’ (1524) by the master of papal ceremonies, Paris de Grassis, as a way into considering how he imagined that liturgical ritual and prudent financial management might form the firm foundations of the church which he was patron of: ss. Celso e Giuliano, in the rione Ponte, not far from the Ponte S. Angelo in downtown Rome. Mara DeSilva’s careful discussion is followed by a transcription of the treatise in full, though untranslated (55–80). Although this is undoubtedly a service to scholarship, I personally found the treatise too legalistic about the duties of chaplains and their maintenance of the church’s fabric to convey much sense of the liturgical and devotional arrangements of this particular sacred space. In her examination of how French funerary sculpture not only expressed their patrons’ personal piety but also sanctified and legitimised political behavior, Rebecca Constabel takes three diverse case studies to make her case with elegant clarity. Pamela Stewart’s focus is Bernardino Luini’s passion cycle in the church of S. Giorgio al Palazzo Milan, which she convincingly shows: “instructed confraternal viewers in the nature of the Eucharist and wed specific ritual behaviours through which they were to effectively engage with Christ’s sacramental body” (137). An integral role here was played by the cycle’s Latin inscriptions “which took up the imaginative

and participatory strategies of popular meditational texts to activate corporate devotion in the chapel, cuing affective responses in viewers and encouraging them to take part in the suffering of Christ" (104). Stewart's fine (and intelligently illustrated) chapter is a model of how careful deployment of art historical evidence can shed light upon how sacred space was conceived and used. Annick Delfosse looks at the Jesuit campaign to build a culture of spectacle (rather than a "spectacular culture"—here and on a few other occasions contributions by non-native speakers would have benefited from more careful proof reading). In her discussion of the celebrations in the Southern Netherlands in the aftermath of the canonization of Saints Ignatius Loyola and Francis Xavier in 1622, she reminds us of the crucial role played by such rituals in such borderland regions. Despite the Jesuit general Muzio Vitelleschi's desire that his Belgian colleagues act with moderation, the uses of spectacle as both "a social and emotional outlet" to sustain local Catholics in the face of their Calvinist neighbours and to bring the triumphalism of the "centre" to the "periphery" were too strong. Abel Alvez focuses on the Dominican Narciso Camós's *Jardin de Maria plantado en el principado de Cataluña* (1657) to explore the sanctification of nature by means of Marian shrines in Catalonia. Interestingly, no fewer than sixty-two of the foundation legends (rather than "foundational legends") involved animals discovering an image of the Virgin and out of ninety-five human intermediaries sixty-seven were male herders (and ten female). My only criticism in this valuable treatment of what is a seriously understudied dimension of sacred space is that I only wish that the author had spent less time discussing (and quoting from) secondary sources and had devoted more space to his fascinating primary material. John Hunt's vigorously argued chapter examines the ritual assaults directed against the pope's memory in the interim period between the death of one pontiff and the election of his successor (known as the *sede vacante*). He focuses both on attacks on papal statues up on the Capitoline Hill and on the scurrilous verses, known as "pasquinades," which were posted on the pedestal of a mutilated Roman statue of the Greek hero Menelaus that was located (then as now) in Piazza del Pasquino, heart of the district of printing shops located at the sw corner of Piazza Navona. According to Hunt, these two spaces served as "lightning rods of popular and noble criticism" and as such, to borrow from E.P. Thompson's famous article from 1971, represented the "moral economy" of the Roman people. Although much of the material will be familiar to students of early modern Rome and the papacy, Hunt offers what must surely be the most detailed account in any language of the violence committed over several days to the statue of the much hated Paul IV Carafa in August 1559. Despite, such sacrilegious rituals, however, Hunt concludes that the popes never suffered the "desacralisation" that their royal

counterparts suffered from over the same period. Eric Nelson's case study is a very rich one; so rich that one wonders why no-one (at least since local antiquarians of the nineteenth century) has bothered before now to examine it. This relates to the systematic spoliation by Huguenots, during their one-hundred day occupation of the city of Tours in 1562, of the abbey church of St. Martin. However, Nelson is not simply content to provide a chronicle of destruction but also discusses how the monks went about rebuilding and, in particular, memorializing their founder, who was now venerated not only so much as a confessor saint but as one who had suffered (posthumously) the most brutal martyrdom. Celeste McNamara shows how even a well-intentioned reforming prelate such as Gregorio Barbarigo from a wealthy diocese, such as late seventeenth-century Padua, was unable to impose his regime of respect upon his parishioners. The latter were perfectly willing to accord the priest respect through their presence, but were altogether less prepared to moderate their behavior once in church: where sword-wearing males conducted their business (including flirting with unveiled and handsomely dressed females of the congregation) even during Mass. When it came to cemeteries, the bishop found he had even less control. Here communal priorities—including use of the land for common pasture—trumped ecclesiastical decorum. Out of the twenty parishes in McNamara's sample, only eight "experienced partial or complete improvement" (227) and as many again completely ignored Barbarigo's injunctions. Emily Winerock's account of attempt to control secular use of a church yard in early seventeenth-century Devon is the only contribution dealing with Protestantism. However, what strikes the reader is the similarity between the attempts by reformers of both confessions to exclude profane activities from sacred space; in this case dancing (including around the May pole, which in this case was located within the church yard). The final chapter, by David Stiles, is a bit of a chronological and as well as geographical outlier and, as such, feels a bit out of place in the volume. It deals with how the Spanish crown became fearful that the Jesuit of the "reductions" was also moulding the behavior of the indigenous peoples "in a manner that was neither loyal to or compatible with the crown's broader political and economic aims" (257). The volume closes with a useful consolidated bibliography and index, which includes themes as well as names thereby ensuring that this essay collection of consistent quality will take its rightful place in academic libraries for those interested in how sacred space was thought about in the period.

Simon Ditchfield

University of York

simon.ditchfield@york.ac.uk

DOI 10.1163/22141332-00302006-07