Gill K. Goulding, C.J.

A Church of Passion and Hope: The Formation of an Ecclesial Disposition from Ignatius Loyola to Pope Francis and the New Evangelization. London: Bloomsbury, 2016. Pp. viii + 330. Pb, \$29.95.

What does *sentire cum ecclesia* imply in the context of the contemporary church? Gill Goulding seeks to answer that question in her book. Goulding builds her study around the “Rules for Thinking, Judging, and Feeling with the Church” that St. Ignatius finalized after 1537.

Since Ignatius’s rules are the product of their own time, Goulding’s first task, one that she carries out thoroughly, is to exegete the rules, locating them against the backdrop of what Ignatius experienced in the church of his own day. The chapter that reviews the rules is perhaps the most helpful of the book. The chapter is especially worthwhile when considering Ignatius’s discussion of marriage in comparison to “religious institutes, virginity and continence,” a discussion that, as Goulding acknowledges, “can cause offence to our contemporary sensibilities” (29). Goulding’s endeavor in the chapter is to illustrate the ways in which Ignatius’s emphases are still relevant for Catholics, and particularly Catholic theologians, in the twenty-first century. While an argument could be made that the differences between Ignatius’s time and our own open the door to more divergences than convergences, to more discontinuities than continuities, the chapter is a thoughtful and enlightening one.

The book as a whole has a strong focus on the effects that biography has on our perceptions and engagement with “the church.” That emphasis is evident not only in Goulding’s extended analysis of Ignatius’s background, but in her later chapters that profile a range of saints, theologians, and popes.

The chapters on Pierre Favre (1506–40) and Mary Ward (1585–1645) are especially engaging; the analysis of the ecclesial spirituality of the two figures provide valuable insights into the early efforts of followers of Ignatius to appropriate his rules for discernment in relation to the church. Similarly, the chapters on Henri de Lubac (1896–1991) and Avery Dulles (1918–2008) take up the appropriation of Ignatius, but this time in the context of the late twentieth-century world.

In reviewing de Lubac and Dulles, Goulding’s aim is to show continuities from Ignatius to modern practitioners of his spiritual principles. Since part of Goulding’s desire for the book is that it provide some pathways beyond polarization in the contemporary church, it would have been good to see how the author may have seen Ignatius’s principles at work in, for example, Karl Rahner (1904–84) or Jon Sobrino (b.1938). That comparison would have been desirable not only because Rahner and Sobrino would both be regarded as to the “left” of

Goulding's two protagonists, but also because Rahner was often in dialogue with the insights of Ignatius—indeed, that dialogue was far more evident in Rahner's writing than in either de Lubac or Dulles.

The final section of the book, that dealing with the Popes John Paul II (r.1978–2005), Benedict XVI (r.2005–13), and Francis (r.2013–), tends to be different in tone from the earlier sections, largely because only Pope Francis of the three contemporary popes has an explicitly Ignatian frame of reference. Goulding compensates for this lacuna by reviewing John Paul II and Benedict XVI through the lens of their Christological approach to the church, an emphasis in which Goulding detects resonances with the Ignatian interpretation. For Goulding, those resonances are especially evident in, for example, John Paul's *Last Testament* with its pervading spirit of gratitude to God (252–53), and in Benedict's efforts to recover devotions abandoned after Vatican II, a recovery that Goulding parallels to Ignatius's rebuttal of the Reformers (256).

In this final section, some of Goulding's choices are puzzling: in her analysis of the "context" of the popes, John Paul II receives only a tiny number of pages (221–23), while Benedict's career as theologian and bishop is treated more expansively (223–33). Likewise puzzling is the absence of any sustained reference to Jorge María Bergolio's history in the Jesuits before becoming a bishop. It may be that the background of John Paul II and Francis is far more familiar than that of Benedict, and so able to be taken as known to readers, but Goulding does not explain why she treats the three differently.

As Goulding does with the other figures she discusses, her emphasis in the material on the three popes highlights their continuity both with Ignatius and with each other. While Goulding's treatment thus accomplishes a portrait of the seamlessness of the church's life, some discussion of the discontinuities would also have been welcome. One obvious place to focus on discontinuity would have been in comparing Pope Francis's understanding of evangelization with that evident in the *Instrumentum laboris* and *Propositiones* of the synod held in 2012. Above all, Francis's stress on "joy" in *Evangelii gaudium* (2013) stands in marked contrast to the focus on "duty"—and the absence of "joy"—that was evident in the synod's texts.

As already noted, Goulding highlights the centrality of Christ as a primary theme for the ecclesial disposition that flows from Ignatius. While there are references throughout the book to Christology in its Trinitarian framework, the Holy Spirit does not emerge as a significant figure in the ecclesiologies that Goulding surveys. Given both the "recovery" of the Spirit initiated by Vatican II and the increasing pneumatological emphasis in much current ecclesiology, some greater treatment of the place of the Spirit in the ecclesial disposition would have enriched the book. One possible portal for the Spirit may have

been through the notion of “hope,” which appears in the sub-title and in the last few pages of the book, but is not explored in any expansive manner.

While the text of the book is generally accessible, the footnotes, which are vast and detailed, become a distraction, especially when they repeat biographical information already given in the text. There are small errors in spelling and notation—“Kasper,” for example, appears in the index as “Kaspar” and Cardinal Sean O’Malley (b.1944) as “OFM” rather than “OFM.Cap.”—but they are infrequent.

Overall, the book is a welcome contribution to the retrieval of “ecclesial disposition” as an aspect of ecclesial faith. Readers may not always agree with Goulding’s interpretation of the present reality of the church or her assessment of the figures on whom she focuses, but the text will reward close engagement and contribute positively to the project of contemporary ecclesiology.

Richard Lennan

Boston College—School of Theology and Ministry

lennan@bc.edu

DOI 10.1163/22141332-00402008-21