than once (101, 105). Jerónimo Xavier, a seventeenth-century Jesuit missionary to Mughal India and grand-nephew of Francis Xavier, had written in Persian a critique of Islam that still provoked rebuttals in the eighteenth century, one by a Portuguese former Augustinian converted to Islam, António de Jesus, who had been renamed 'Alī Qulī Jadīd al-Islām (266–73). Nādir Shah, a Turkman who had seized the Iranian throne in 1736 and had also conquered Mughal India, promoting interreligious tolerance, had as his personal physician a French Jesuit brother (293). King Philip V of Spain in 1744 asked the sultans of Sulu and Maguindanao, Muslim controlled areas of the Philippines then and now, to accept Jesuit preachers in their sultanates (589). Eusèbe Renaudot, a French Jesuit and liturgical scholar associated with the court of Louis XIV in France, had also developed proficiency in Arabic. In 1718, he edited and translated into French a late twelfth-century edition of the travel account by two tenth-century Arabs who had visited India and China, as well as an eleventh-century Arabic commentary on these travel narratives. Eighteenth-century Jesuit writers with experience in China, Jean Joseph Marie Amiot, Pierre-Martial Cibot, and others, published sixteen volumes of letters about China. These volumes were produced in France between 1776 and 1814, a period when the Jesuit mission in China and, indeed, the Society itself had been suppressed (666–86).

If all the volumes in this bibliographical history of Christian-Muslim relations are as scholarly as volume 12, no serious university library should neglect buying them. Although Jesuits are not central to this volume, the references to them suggest subjects for future scholarly research in Jesuit historical studies.

Patrick J. Ryan, S.J.

Fordham University

ryansj@fordham.edu

DOI:10.1163/22141332-00602008-17

Stefania Tutino

Uncertainty in Post-Reformation Catholicism: A History of Probabilism. New York: Oxford University Press, 2018. Pp. xx + 564. Hb, \$99.00.

Readers of Stefania Tutino's nuanced treatment of probabilism in her *Uncertainty in Post-Reformation Catholicism: A History of Probabilism* will hesitate to offer a monolithic definition of this early modern Catholic phenomenon. Nevertheless, it has traditionally been regarded as a form of moral theology intended to help individuals assess the moral "safety" of an action. Its salient feature was the notion that if one could find a single, well-reasoned argument in support of one's position, then one was morally "safe," and under no obligation

to follow alternative positions enjoying greater support. Consequently, both early modern opponents and modern scholars have criticized probabilism as a theological “fig-leaf” obscuring wanton moral laxity. More recently, Ilkka Kantola, Julia Fleming, and Robert Maryks have challenged this view. In the same vein, Tutino also seeks to reject these caricatures and evaluate probabilism on its own terms.

The first half of Tutino’s volume traces the development of probabilism, extending back to its Aristotelian underpinnings. These chapters outline probabilism’s emergence among the Dominican and Jesuit theologians of Spain in the sixteenth century, and its maturation in the late seventeenth century. Her outline of probabilism’s theoretical development, offered in the first three chapters, adopts the complex language used by the theologians she studies. This requires deliberate, close reading. Helpfully, Tutino includes periodic summary paragraphs, recapitulating the argument and offering necessary signposting to the reader. Methodologically, Tutino relies on both early lecture notes and printed output to sketch the development of the thought of individual probabilist theorists, such as Francisco Suárez. This has the benefit of demonstrating probabilism’s vitality and flexibility in this period.

During the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, probabilism became closely associated with the Jesuits. Those interested in Jesuit studies will be well served, as one of the benefits of Tutino’s diachronic approach is to highlight the enduring significance of probabilism from sixteenth-century Spanish reformatory movements preceding the Reformation, to the eighteenth-century suppression of the Society. In chapters six to eight, Tutino considers how anti-probabilist movements coalesced in opposition to the idea of probabilism and to the order with which it became associated. Particularly valuable here is the discussion of the emergence of Jansenist anti-probabilist opinions in France in the mid-seventeenth century and the consequences this created for French Jesuits, such as Honoré Fabri, who had to juggle multiple identities.

Chapters nine through eleven cover the application of probabilism to three particular challenges in a rapidly expanding Catholic world. Chapter nine examines how Catholic theologians addressed the difficulties of introducing Catholic teachings on marriage to East Asian societies that accepted bigamy. Tutino discusses how the church used probabilism in navigating its jurisdictional dispute with Roman civil authorities over the confiscation of possessions of converted Jews in chapter ten. In the final chapter, Tutino examines the evolution of Catholic teaching on when life begins in the womb, which had implications for the morality of abortion and the baptizing of still-born fetuses. Her discussions are highly nuanced and precise. They help put some “flesh on the bones” of the theoretical structures of probabilism.

Tutino's rejection of the earlier caricatures of probabilism is salutary, but perhaps not the most significant aspect of this project. Her examination of probabilism's broader implications to the epistemological and hermeneutical problems of early modernity marks Tutino's discussion out as distinctive. Tutino powerfully argues that probabilism had the potential to be implemented virtually everywhere in early modern life: in business, in science, in the family, and in politics. In calling attention to the broad applicability of probabilism, Tutino is also making a bigger historiographical claim about the importance of understanding moral theology in the study of early modern history—something she rightly observes has been lacking.

Tutino's examination of how probabilism became a means of approaching the problem of uncertainty should be considered alongside important scholarship about how early moderns confronted "information overload" such as Ann Blair's *Too Much to Know* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010). Tutino sensitively demonstrates how probabilism interacted with other epistemological frameworks, but also brought unique features to bear. A prevalent central question of moral theology was "what *should* one do in a particular instance?" Tutino's discussion of Juan Caramuel y Lobkowitz illustrates how such concerns were applied to uncertainties created by diverse intellectual advances such as heliocentrism and time-keeping. For instance, Caramuel suggested that the technical limitations of clock making might create burdens on scrupulous consciences. How was a penitent to know for sure when to commence or break a fast? Might they be sinning, should their clock be wrong? Caramuel proposed that any individual clock should be taken as a probable opinion. If one timepiece suggested it was time to eat, the penitent might do so without fear of sinning.

Precisely because probabilism was a way of dealing with complexity, it can elude neat summation. One potential impediment to Tutino's aim is that her outline of the intricate complexity of probabilism might alienate readers who think of Catholic theology as a byzantine irrelevance. Some of Tutino's discussions can skew toward the theoretical. While she asserts that she has intended to demonstrate how probabilism applied to the "personal lives of Catholic people" (356), this is mainly achieved through the *implications* of her scholarly subjects' arguments. One can certainly see from Tutino's explanations how the reliability of clocks *could* have implications for some Catholics' lives, but examples of situations in which they *did* affect them are minimal.

To overemphasize this point would be to do Tutino's work a disservice. Other scholars have offered interesting analyses of how probabilism was applied "on the ground." A systematic analysis of the development of the phenomenon and its implications more broadly was needed. Tutino has provided it. Her volume

is a remarkable contribution that will hopefully inspire new scholarly interest in the subject. It is sophisticatedly argued and well-researched, and offers a valuable resource for considering the application of probabilism to a legion of different challenges brought about by increases in both new information and uncertainty in the early modern world.

Christopher P. Gillett

The University of Scranton

christopher.gillett@scranton.edu

DOI:10.1163/22141332-00602008-18

Catherine O'Donnell

Elizabeth Seton: American Saint. Ithaca: Three Hills, an imprint of Cornell

University Press, 2018. Pp. XIV + 508. Hb, \$36.95.

For years I have dutifully lectured about Saint Elizabeth Bayley Seton, “Mother Seton,” in my upper-level theology course, “History of the Catholic Church in the United States” at Loyola University Maryland. I must confirm, however, I did so more perfunctorily than with any genuine fervor. Thanks to the outstanding scholarship of American Catholic historian Annabelle McConnell Melville's groundbreaking biography, *Elizabeth Bayley Seton*, I did, of course, grasp Seton's pioneering work in Catholic education in America, especially for young women, and her singular role in the development of religious life in the new nation, but I never felt drawn to her as a person, either intellectually or spiritually. I am pleased to report that diffidence in me has been set aside by Catherine O'Donnell's outstanding 2018 biography of this extraordinary woman.

Whether it concerns Seton's early adult life as an Episcopal trend setter in Manhattan seeking spiritual solace at Trinity Church; her complex, but solicitous, relationships with her husband, William Magee Seton, and five children, or her roles as “Mother and mother” in the community's life at Emmitsburg, Maryland, this volume peels back layers of a reflective life, that of a vocation that we Jesuits would refer to as a “contemplative-in-action,” the rich intricacy of which I have been, up to this time, regrettably unacquainted.

To cite only one instance, I was riveted by O'Donnell's scrutiny of Seton's association with John Henry Hobart, a Protestant Episcopal Church divine, spiritual director and author assigned to Trinity Church, Manhattan, who first stirred in Elizabeth a learned attentiveness to the subtleties of Christianity. Her subsequent correspondence with Hobart, a clergyman of prodigious spiritual acumen, as well as a future Episcopal bishop of New York and founder of the General Theological Seminary in New York City, at the time of her election of