On reading this book, one is struck by the richness of the materials available to write a critical history of the man and his age, and Soto's reluctance to engage beyond the most basic and narrow presentation of the facts. One has so many points of intersection with modern scholarly inquiry, whether it was the Spaniards' proto-anthropological interest in the peoples of the New World, including linguistics, the issues of first contact and the reception of missionary work, Barzana's own understanding of himself and his faith, or the Jesuits' place in the imperial scheme of dominating and converting South America. In the seventeenth century, the materials gathered to launch a beatification process were lost, so missing from the record are the materials that ordinarily would document the beginnings of a cult to the humble and fearless apostle to the Indians, although one can detect in some of the primary sources some referencing of the typical saintly topoi, which could have gone into making a hagiographical tradition. Thanks to Soto's efforts, the biography and primary source materials provide a wonderful jumping off point for scholars to pursue new avenues of research into a little-appreciated but towering example of the Jesuit evangelical mission in South America.

Sara T. Nalle

William Paterson University, Emerita

NalleS@wpunj.edu

DOI:10.1163/22141332-00701009-01

Miguel Lop Sebastià, S.J., ed. and trans.

Apologías de los Ejercicios Espirituales. Colección Manresa 69. Madrid and Bilbao: Universidad Pontificia Comillas and Ediciones Mensajero, 2018. Pp. 233. Pb, €19.23.

Spanish readers interested in the early history of the Society of Jesus have long been indebted to Miguel Lop Sebastià for reliable editions and translations of key documents. Over the last few decades he has published the first directories of the *Spiritual Exercises* (1540–99), the autobiography of Pedro de Ribadeneyra (1527–1611), the conferences and talks of Jerónimo Nadal (1507–80), and a selection of the correspondence of Alfonso Salmerón (1515–85). All have appeared in the prestigious Colección Manresa. His new book, in the same series, brings together eleven documents about the *Spiritual Exercises*, and specifically their orthodoxy. This was hotly contested for most of the sixteenth century. The bone of contention was the alleged influence on them of the Spanish *alumbrados*, who were thought to have believed, among other things, that one could rely on direct divine guidance in the decisions of everyday life. Their practice of this

precept appeared to sideline the role of reason, Scripture, and church authority in the discernment of God's will, and to leave them open to self-deception, sin, and heresy. Two of the documents assembled here accuse the *Exercises* of being illuminist in this sense. Both were penned by Dominicans. The first, by a distinguished theologian, Melchor Cano (1509–60), was composed in the mid-1550s and intended for the eyes of Pope Paul IV (1476–1559), who was himself a stern critic of the Society. It was published in 1900 by Miguel Mir, who included it in a book that was later placed on the Index. He did not give the provenance of the manuscript he transcribed, but it may have come from the library of the Duke of Alba. About 1990, Simon Tugwell O.P. drew my attention to a copy in the British Museum, that I published, with a commentary, in 1996 and again in 2017. Lop Sebastià does not refer to these editions of the text, nor to the discussion of its significance in John O'Malley's *The First Jesuits* (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1993), 292–94. Instead, he provides an edition of Cano's diatribe based on a manuscript in Barcelona University Library (its date, condition, and precise location are not detailed). This version does not appear to differ substantially from the other two, but it would be worth comparing them all with a further manuscript of the work, held in the Roman archives of the Society (ARSI, *Hisp.* 144), which remains unpublished (On the history of Cano's text and the manuscripts in which it survives, see my article "Melchor Cano and the Spirituality of St. Ignatius Loyola: The *Censura y parecer contra el Instituto de los Padres Jesuitas*," *JJS* 4, no. 3 [2017]: 365–94).

The other Dominican document is of even greater interest. It was written in the early 1550s by Tomás de Pedroche (d.1565) and submitted to the archbishop of Toledo, Juan Martínez Guijeño or Silíceo (d.1557), who was hostile to the Jesuits in the belief that many of them were of Jewish descent. Pedroche based his criticisms of the *Exercises* on a close examination of the Latin translation (the *Vulgata*) that had been printed in Rome with papal approval in 1548. His critique is reproduced here, along with a lengthy response to it composed by Nadal. Sebastià has assembled Nadal's response from fragments published separately in the *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu*, and in addition to translating both texts he has combined them: Pedroche's criticisms are inserted at appropriate points into Nadal's response, and the parts of the *Exercises* that Pedroche attacked are quoted in both Latin and Spanish. The reader, as a result, can follow in detail the argument between the two men. This document is the most intriguing in the entire collection, and Sebastià deserves our gratitude for assembling and presenting it so carefully. My one caveat about the volume as a whole is that the bibliography at the end of the Introduction (36) is not up to date. The authors listed were fine scholars, but the works of theirs

that are cited were all published in the first half of the twentieth century. Since then our understanding of St. Ignatius, the Spanish *alumbrados*, and the *Exercises* has developed and changed (See, for instance, the essays collected in Robert Aleksander Maryks, ed., *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence* [Leiden: Brill, 2014]). It is to be hoped that this significant book will focus attention on the early history of the *Exercises* in Spain and prompt others to explore it.

Terence O'Reilly
University College Cork
Terence.oreilly@ucc.ie

DOI:10.1163/22141332-00701009-02

Radu Mustață

Sermon on Saint Thomas, the Beloved Apostle: A Syriac Catholic Panegyric from Seventeenth Century Malabar. Piscataway, NJ: Gorgias Press, 2019. Pp. 112+viii. Hb, \$65.00.

Radu Mustață's critical edition and translation of an early seventeenth-century Syriac sermon celebrating the Apostle Thomas is a window into the accommodative practices of early modern missionary Catholicism on one hand and the rich continuities of Syriac Christianity on the other. As Mustață explains in the introduction, little is known of the Christian communities of India, commonly called Malabar Christians or the Saint Thomas Christians, before the arrival of the Portuguese. These communities, which see their origins in the arrival of the Apostle Thomas, had slowly integrated themselves into the wider Syriac Christian community that constellated around Syria and Iraq. Their first contact with the Portuguese in the fifteenth century, so Mustață contends, had the potential to radically alter the future of these Christian communities.

Yet, as scholars such as Pamila Gupta, Ângela Barreto Xavier, Ines Županov, and others have shown, Portuguese missionaries, almost invariably Jesuits, who arrived in Malabar were quite acculturative in their approaches. The result was not a thorough Latinization of Malabar Christians, but a Catholicization that hinged on the preservation of their traditions and the ossification of Syriac as a spiritual, literary, and liturgical language. It is in this context—the constellation of early modern global Catholicism, Portuguese empire building, the missionary efforts of the Society of Jesus, and Syriac Christian cultural preservation—that this sermon on Saint Thomas came into being.