The Bessarion Chapel

Questions of Influence and Visual Culture in Early Renaissance Rome

Stefania Vai

Doctoral student, Department of Art History, University of Edinburgh,
Edinburgh, Scotland, UK

stefy.vai@hotmail.it

Abstract

The Bessarion chapel in the church of Santi Apostoli represents a new chapter in the study of the Roman Quattrocento. Its frescoes, painted by Antoniazio Romano between 1464 and 1467, are a fundamental example of the Roman artistic taste in the early Renaissance. This essay examines unexplored aspects surrounding the origin of the chapel by understanding how Romano obtained this commission and how much he used visual solutions borrowed from the past. In addition, this investigation sets out to reconsider the artistic influence of the Bessarion commission, focusing on the paintings which have recently been discovered in the Orsini church of Saint Michael the Archangel in Formello (Italy). The questions concerning the Bessarion chapel raised in this study will lead to a more exhaustive understanding of this commission and will shed light on the complexity of the early Renaissance in Rome, where tradition and innovation masterfully coexist.

Keywords

Bessarion chapel – Antoniazio Romano – innovation – tradition – Roman Renaissance

In 1959, the discovery of the chapel of ss. Michael and Eugene in the church of Santi Apostoli began a new chapter in the study of the Roman Quattrocento.¹ Its frescoes, painted between 1464 and 1467 by Antoniazio Romano (1430s–1508),

¹ Busiri Vici, 'Un ritrovamento eccezionale'.

are a fundamental example of the Roman artistic taste on the threshold of the significant cultural change beginning in the Sistine era (1471–1484).

This funerary chapel was commissioned by the archbishop of Nicaea, Basilios Bessarion (1403–1472), who, since 1439, was the titular cardinal of Santi Apostoli.² The analysis of the chapel's pictorial decoration offers insight into the problematic artistic context of the papal city. Rome, on the verge of becoming one of the most important Renaissance centers, underwent conflicting cultural and political changes provoked by a group of patrons searching for a new synthesis between tradition and innovation. The Angelic Hosts and Saint Michael the Archangel's apparitions painted on the apse of the Bessarion chapel expresses this artistic antithesis, perfectly combining medieval iconographies with the new quest for modernity (Figs. 1–2).

The Bessarion chapel has been the focus of thorough research, which has underlined the artistic significance of these frescoes. However, there are still aspects concerning the origin of this commission which remain unexplored.³ In fact, no attention has been devoted to how Antoniazio Romano obtained this commission and to how much he used visual solutions borrowed from the past to create the iconographic program of this chapel. The specific aim of this essay is to address these issues: first, by investigating the social and cultural factors in which this commission was designed; and second, by analyzing prototypes, both visual and textual, which may have influenced the artist during the invention process.

There is a lack of research regarding the impact of the Bessarion chapel on the contemporary Roman artistic scene. Thus, this analysis intends to examine the circulation of the visual ideas designed in the Bessarion frescoes, focusing on the paintings that have recently been discovered in the Orsini church of Saint Michael the Archangel, in Formello. This investigation will also expand the purview brought to the study of the Bessarion chapel, reconsidering its artistic influence in Rome and paving the way for further studies on patronage and visual culture in the second half of the Roman Quattrocento.

1 The Early Antoniazio Romano and his Patrons

To understand why Cardinal Bessarion asked Antonio di Benedetto Aquili, known as Antoniazio Romano, to paint his funeral chapel, it is necessary to

² L. Labowsky, 'Bessarione'.

³ Tiberia, *Antoniazzo Romano*.

investigate the historical context in which this local painter, in the early stage of his career, obtained this prestigious commission.

Despite the artistic renewal promoted by Popes Martin V (1417–1411), Nicholas V (1447–1455), and Pius II (1458–1464), who invited celebrated artists such as Masolino da Panicale, Masaccio, Beato Angelico, and Piero della Francesca to Rome, many patrons were reluctant to fully accept artistic innovations coming from outside Rome. These viewers came from the ancient local nobility, strictly bound to the Capitoline Municipal administration, which endeavored to keep its privileges, as they were being weakened by the increasing papal power.⁴ This conservative attitude remained and gained further support following the election of Pope Paul II (1464–1471), who was strongly in favor of this municipal nobility, reversing the artistic renewal started by his predecessors.

This cultural scenario seems to have been one of the main contributors to the rise of local workshops and artists like Antoniazio Romano. Nevertheless, there are other factors which may have encouraged Cardinal Bessarion to employ Romano. First, he came from a Roman family workshop that had been strongly rooted in the city since 1428.⁵ Second, before the Bessarion chapel commission, Romano was recorded at work in Saint Peter's Basilica.⁶ Moreover, his workshop painted flags and banners for various official ceremonies of the Apostolic Chamber since 1451. This continued until 1492, when Romano worked under Perugino's supervision on the occasion of Pope Alexander VI's election.⁷ Therefore, it could be assumed that his workshop was quite prestigious in the 1460s and that Cardinal Bessarion may have come into contact with the Roman painter in the Vatican artistic context.

However, it is noteworthy to mention that the Bessarion chapel was not the first important Roman commission that Antoniazio Romano acquired. Indeed, Giovanni Russo's recent studies have demonstrated that between 1463 and 1464 the artist worked in Lelio Della Valle's chapel in Santa Maria in Aracoeli (south of the Capitoline Hill in Rome), where he painted figures dressed *all'antica* for the significant sum of forty and a half *scudi* (now destroyed).⁸ The Della Valle family was bound to the Roman Curia, and Lelio, who commissioned Romano for the chapel, was a famous consistorial lawyer and an important Pla-

4 Rossi, 'Tradizione e innovazione'; Cavallaro, 'Antoniazzo Romano'.

5 Rome, State Archive, *Collegio Notai Capitolini*, 939, c. 25.

6 Rome, State Archive, *Camerale I, Mandati Camerali*, 838, c. 936v.

7 Vatican City State, Secret Archive, *Tesoreria Segreta*, 1451, c. 39; Muntz, *Les arts à la cour des papes*.

8 Russo, 'Antoniazzo Romano', 390.

tonist humanist.⁹ This learned scholar of Greek and Latin literature became the protector of the Greek copyist and translator Giovanni Sofiano. Later, Sofiano became *familiare* of Cardinal Bessarion, to whom he dedicated a second version of Heron of Bizantium's *Poliorcetica*, previously dedicated to Lelio Della Valle himself.¹⁰ This evidence demonstrates that there was a connection between these two erudite men who, interestingly, commissioned their chapels from the same artist. Therefore, it might be argued that Romano may have met Cardinal Bessarion in this cultural context, which gave him the opportunity to create an important social network amongst prestigious commissioners.

The presence of a number of painters working in the Bessarion chapel under his supervision suggests that, by 1464, the Roman artist had reached a certain level of fame. Indeed, although Antoniazzo Romano personally signed the contract as 'magistro',¹¹ the differences in the quality of the frescoes demonstrate that this chapel was the product of a workshop of considerable size. The discordance amongst experts, who have tried to identify the assistants by exploring the possibility of Melozzo da Forlì and Lorenzo da Viterbo's involvement, proves the existence of a well-organized workshop that was able to not only comply with Romano's requests but also satisfy a significant level of demand.¹²

In addition to all of these factors, it is worth taking into account that Cardinal Bessarion may have chosen Antoniazzo Romano because he was the only painter of a certain prestige available in Rome after Paul II's election. Surprisingly, Bessarion's choice was not Piero della Francesca, who in the 1450s worked in the Vatican Palace. In fact, the artist had left Rome by 1459 to work in Borgo Sansepolcro. Benozzo Gozzoli also left the papal city in the same year to work in Florence. Thus, lack of competition may have contributed to Romano's artistic rise. In essence, all of the above-mentioned circumstances may have to some extent influenced Cardinal Bessarion's decision to employ this Roman artist, increasing his success in the local artistic scene.

2 Invention and Tradition in the Bessarion Chapel

Vitaliano Tiberia's research provides an accurate overview of the iconographic program of the Bessarion chapel.¹³ However, he does not take into account

9 Gatta, 'Lelio Della Valle', 757–758.

10 Bianca, 'Un Messale "ritrovato" del cardinale Bessarione', 490.

11 Tiberia, *Antoniazzo Romano*, 121.

12 Cavallaro and Petrocchi, *Antoniazzo Romano pictor urbis*, 23.

13 Tiberia, *Antoniazzo Romano*, 18–25.

what Antoniazio Romano may have inherited from the past, failing to mention visual prototypes that may have inspired him. Thus this present analysis intends to investigate the sources that seem to have influenced the iconography designed by the Roman artist in order to examine to what extent he might or might not have contributed to the invention of a new visual formula.

As suggested by the contract, the main subject in the Bessarion 'Capelle sancti Angeli' is Saint Michael the Archangel.¹⁴ The frescoes of the apse show the representations of the miraculous apparitions of the saint in two geographic locations: the Italian Monte Gargano (Foggia, Apulia, southeast *Italy*); and the French Mont Saint Michel (Normandy), which subsequently became significant places of pilgrimage.

According to the second contract signed in April 1465, Saint Michael's stories were extended not only to the upper register of the apse wall but also to the lower register, where a third scene of the Archangel was painted, perhaps Saint Michael killing and expelling Lucifer, which now appears to have been lost.

Antoniazzo Romano combined the Italian and the French legends of the cult of the Archangel by giving the narrative a strong sense of continuity interrupted only by a painted Roman candelabrum. Both episodes are accompanied by Latin captions, which indicate the name of the mountains. On the left side, he designed Monte Gargano, where the Archangel in the guise of a runaway bull miraculously avoids the arrows thrown by the archers, who try to capture him. On the right, he depicted a procession of cardinals, monks, and noble people guided by the French bishop Saint Auberto, heading to Mont Saint Michel. Like in the Italian legend, the bull standing on the French sacred mountain indicates the exact location where the monastery would be built.

Although the French apparition on Mont Saint Michel does not seem to have visual prototypes circulating in Italy, this legend was widely known thanks to a famous textual source, Jacopo da Varazze's *Golden Legend*, certainly kept in Cardinal Bessarion's rich library.¹⁵ Without a doubt, Antoniazio Romano knew this hagiographic anthology, which between the fourteenth and the fifteenth centuries became extremely popular amongst artists. Interestingly, this celebrated text seems to be the only one that described both legends painted by Romano in the Bessarion chapel.¹⁶ Consequently, this must have been his primary source of inspiration.

The episode on Monte Gargano designed by the Roman painter, despite some variations, respects the traditional iconography, which is suggested by

14 Tiberia, *Antoniazzo Romano*, 121.

15 C. Labowsky, *Bessarion's Library and the Biblioteca Marciana*.

16 Da Varazze, *Legenda aurea*, 2:1104–1107.

the miniatures found in various manuscripts of the *Golden Legend*. In these manuscripts, the Italian miracle is sometimes painted alongside another apparition set on Mont Saint Michel, the miracle of the pregnant woman saved from the sea by the Archangel. However, there is no trace of miniatures showing Saint Auberto's procession to Mont Saint Michel.

Apart from miniatures, Antoniazzo Romano's episode on Monte Gargano has painting prototypes as well. For instance, a similar visual formula showing the bull and the archers is found in some late fourteenth-century predella panels produced in Florence. Cenni di Francesco's panel painted in 1369 for the Florentine Guild of the Medici Speziali (Museum of Art, Philadelphia) and Agnolo Gaddi's late fourteenth-century predella (Yale University Art Gallery, New Haven) are the most significant examples.¹⁷ A remarkable fresco prototype is also preserved in the Velluti chapel in the Basilica of Santa Croce in Florence, which attests to the circulation of this sacred narrative by the early fourteenth century, immediately after the first edition of the *Golden Legend* (Fig. 3).¹⁸

Despite the differences in style and composition, all of these prototypes have two important features in common. First, they all belong to the Tuscan tradition, confirming Antoniazzo Romano's often-overlooked awareness of the Florentine artistic solutions. Second, all of these paintings show the bull attacked by the archers on one side and, on the other, the procession of Bishop Saint Laurence of Siponto on the way to build the sanctuary on Monte Gargano.

Antoniazzo Romano did not invent *ex abrupto* a new iconography for the French procession to Mont Saint Michel but, rather, adapted a renowned visual solution borrowed from the past. Indeed, he simply introduced a variation to the iconography of Monte Gargano by replacing Saint Laurence of Siponto with Bishop Saint Auberto. To satisfy Bessarion's request, he cleverly recycled the formula of the procession, painting it in a new geographical context, the French coast of Normandy, as suggested by the shells on the sand and the ships in the background.

In light of this, one may wonder how the Roman artist might have come into contact with these iconographic prototypes, given that Antoniazzo Romano never left the papal city. In all likelihood, he did not see them directly; however, he may have taken these formulas from some Tuscan artists active in Rome. Amongst them was Benozzo Gozzoli, who certainly had the largest influence on Romano's early style, as suggested by Anna Cavallaro.¹⁹ The impact of Gozzoli's style on the Bessarion frescoes is evident in the physiognomies

17 Strehlke, *Italian Paintings*; Seymour, *Early Italian Paintings*, 39–40.

18 Ladis, 'The Velluti Chapel'.

19 Cavallaro and Petrocchi, *Antoniazzo Romano pictor urbis*, 22.

of the figures and in the volumes of the bodies. In particular, similarities can be seen in the frescoes painted by Gozzoli between 1450 and 1452 at Montefalco (Umbria, Italy), which are considered his first autonomous works after a long apprenticeship in Beato Angelico's workshop. Romano's convergence of style with Benozzo Gozzoli's episode of Saint Francis's renunciation of worldly goods, although subtle, is remarkable. Romano's figures in the procession to Mont Saint Michel clearly call to mind the marked trace of the contour lines, the pronounced lineaments and aquiline noses of the portraits, the volumes of the bodies underneath the vestments, and the golden damask cape worn by the bishop in the Montefalco fresco. Moreover, examples of subtle naturalism inspired by Benozzo Gozzoli are expressed by the guardian of the bull, who looks with curiosity at the miracle on Monte Gargano from the side or the child in the procession to Mont Saint Michel observing the gesture of his father in awe (Fig. 2).

Although it is not likely that Antoniazio Romano went to Montefalco, he most probably saw the paintings by Benozzo Gozzoli around 1455 in the Albertoni chapel in the Roman church of Santa Maria in Aracoeli, when he worked in the Della Valle chapel nearby. Gozzoli's fresco of Saint Antony of Padua is still visible on the altar, which shows Romano's same prudent quest for modernization found in the Bessarion chapel, where the devotional hieratic figures are enriched by a new physical construction, visible underneath the vestments (Fig. 4).

Some authors have given attention to Benozzo Gozzoli's impact on Antoniazio Romano's style.²⁰ Nevertheless, no research has investigated the degree to which the Tuscan artist may have influenced the specific iconography of Saint Michael the Archangel designed for Cardinal Bessarion. Vitaliano Tiberia, in his extensive research, attributes this particular iconography completely to Romano and his continued patron Cardinal Bessarion, explaining it to be the refined product of political propaganda.²¹ Indeed, Saint Michael, patron of the Byzantine empire, was considered the greatest defender of the Christian army against the Turks, who had just conquered Constantinople and Trebizond, hometown of the Greek Cardinal. Bessarion strongly supported the political initiative of a new crusade to Jerusalem, with the hope of reconciling the Latin and Greek churches. According to Tiberia, Bessarion decided to associate the Italian legend of Monte Gargano with the French miracle on Mont Saint Michel because he firmly believed that the French king, Louis XI, may have supported

20 Cavallaro and Petrocchi, *Antoniazzo Romano pictor urbis*, 22; Rossi, 'Tradizione e innovazione', 26.

21 Tiberia, *Antoniazzo Romano pictor urbis*, 18–25.

the pope's cause in this military campaign. Despite this political analysis, there are reasons to believe that Romano may have been influenced, at least partially, by a previous iconographic formula created by a Tuscan artist.

It does not seem coincidental that Benozzo Gozzoli, between 1453 and 1459, painted stories of the Archangel in the basilica of Santa Maria Maggiore in the chapel of ss. Peter *ad vincula* and Michael the Archangel commissioned by the archpriest of this Roman church, Cardinal of Rouen Guillaume d'Estouteville (1403–1483).²² Surprisingly, this famous cardinal was one of the leading supporters of this Christian crusade. Moreover, he was Bessarion's close friend and collaborated with him, under Paul II's papacy, to administer the funding destined for the campaign against the Turks. Unfortunately, the paintings in the d'Estouteville chapel are seriously compromised; however, Benozzo Gozzoli's intervention, recorded by several textual sources, is still attested by the surviving lunettes depicting the dead Christ and Saint Michael killing the dragon.²³

Despite the uncertainty regarding the iconography designed by Benozzo Gozzoli, it is highly probable that the pictorial program included the French apparition of the Archangel in Normandy, given that, since 1444, Cardinal d'Estouteville was the abbot of the sanctuary of Mont Saint Michel, where he promoted several works of renovation.²⁴ Consequently, the Cardinal of Rouen may have asked Gozzoli to create a new iconographic formula, which emphasized the French tradition of the cult of Saint Michael, perhaps combining it with the Italian legend of Monte Gargano. It is quite possible that the iconography commissioned by Cardinal Bessarion for the chapel was influenced by his friend and colleague, Cardinal d'Estouteville.

As pointed out by Meredith Gill, Antoniazzo Romano most definitely saw the d'Estouteville chapel, since he was an active member of the Confraternity of the Gonfalone, which had custody of the Marian icon in the Basilica of Santa Maria Maggiore.²⁵ Moreover, in 1470 he painted a copy of this sacred image of the Virgin, becoming *camerlengo* of this important confraternity.

The Roman painter, then, was aware of the artistic innovations circulating in Rome and sought to find his personal synthesis between visual tradition and invention. It is impossible to show to what extent Antoniazzo Romano was inspired by the d'Estouteville chapel; however, it is fundamental to highlight

22 Di Benedetti, 'La Cappella d'Estouteville'.

23 Vasari, *Lives of the most eminent painters, sculptors & architects*, 3:122; Biasotti, 'Affreschi di Benozzo Gozzoli'.

24 Esposito, 'Estouteville, Guillaume'.

25 Gill, 'Where the Danger was Greatest', 517.

the often-overlooked relationship between these two iconographic programs. First, it demonstrates that Cardinal d'Estouteville may have been the inventor of this unusual representation. Second, it also proves the circulation of a renewed visual solution related to the cult of Saint Michael in the papal city.

3 Impact and Interaction of Antoniazio Romano's Workshop in the Orsini Fiefdom

To understand the impact of the Bessarion chapel on the Roman artistic scene, it is crucial to find evidence of the circulation of its iconography. Despite the success achieved by Antoniazio Romano and his workshop in late fifteenth-century Rome, there was no trace of a possible distribution of the Bessarion iconographic program. However, in 2019, the discovery of the frescoes in the apse of the Orsini Romanesque church of Saint Michael in the village of Formello (Rome) revealed that there was a definite circulation of the Bessarion visual idea, at least in the outskirts of Rome.²⁶

The cleaning of these frescoes, which is still in progress, has brought to light the apparition of Saint Michael the Archangel on Monte Gargano between Saint Michael expelling Lucifer and the apparition of Saint Michael the Archangel on Castel Sant'Angelo (Fig. 5). Samples have also revealed that, like in the Bessarion chapel, the Angelic Hosts are painted on the upper part of the apse, which still needs to be cleaned. Without a doubt, the artist who designed this iconographic program knew the Bessarion commission. Indeed, the composition of the miracle on Monte Gargano carefully followed the iconography of the Bessarion paintings, although in the Orsini church Saint Auberto's procession to Mont Saint Michel is replaced by the more traditional procession of Bishop Saint Laurence of Siponto, on the way to build the sanctuary on Monte Gargano. The figures are distributed in the space following the same narrative order articulated by specific spatial elements, such as the sacred mountains and the gulf in the background. Nevertheless, the marked graphic linearism of the portraits and the bidimensional bodies reveal the lower quality and accuracy of the execution.

By the second half of the fourteenth century, Formello was included in the Orsini fiefdom. The presence of the Orsini shield quartered with the coat of arms of Aragon on the top of the apse of the church proves that the decorative

26 We are grateful to Archeoclub di Formello for providing the images of the frescoes in the Orsini church of Saint Michael the Archangel in Formello (Figs. 5, 6, 7).

program was commissioned by Gentil Virginio Orsini (about 1445–1497).²⁷ Gentil Virginio Orsini was definitely the most influential member of this powerful baronial family, due to his political and cultural program that widely increased the prestige of the Orsini, who were deeply rooted in the papal curia. In 1487, thanks to his military accomplishments, Gentil Virginio gained the high honor of adding the Aragon heraldic symbol to the Orsini coat of arms, providing an important *terminus post quem* for the frescoes in Formello (Fig. 6). In addition, the presence of the eel in the Orsini blazon proves that the frescoes were painted after 1492, when the Orsini purchased the county of Anguillara. There are reasons to believe that the decorative program promoted by Gentil Virginio Orsini in Formello may have been influenced to some extent by the social and political entourage of his uncle, Cardinal Latino Orsini (1411–1477), who, as commander of the papal fleet, had strongly supported Cardinal Bessarion and d'Estouteville's Christian crusade project. He had shared their political orientation and, like them, had been an influential member of the conclave that led to Pope Sixtus IV's election.²⁸

It is also significant that Cardinal Orsini had hosted Cardinal Guillaume d'Estouteville in Formello in the summer of 1465, while Cardinal Ammannati Piccolomini, a humanist close to Cardinal Bessarion, was in the nearby village of Campagnano. This record seems to be a clear sign of friendship amongst these patrons, who shared political and cultural ideas.²⁹ Moreover, the Orsini and d'Estouteville families were joined in a historical alliance against the Colonna. Taken together, all these factors may have partially influenced the patron of the paintings in the church of Formello.

Although no hypothesis regarding the attribution of the frescoes in Formello has been formulated, there seem to have been at least two hands at work in the decoration of the apse. Thus, it is possible that the iconographic program was designed by a local workshop, to some extent related to Antoniazio Romano. Indeed, the motif of the pomegranates painted on the golden vestment of the bishop and on the tapestries of the lower part of the apse wall is reminiscent of the decorative element found in many of Romano's commissions, including the Bessarion chapel (Figs. 7–8). This motif is so frequent in the draperies designed by the artist that it is easy to believe that it may be a characterizing element of his workshop, as seen in the famous *Madonna del Latte* in Rieti and *Madonna with Child* in the Vatican Library. Amongst all of these commissions, it is worth mentioning the *Madonna with Child* painted in 1497 for the church

27 Camilli, 'Orsini D'Aragona, Gentil Virginio'.

28 Becchetti, *Istoria degli ultimi quattro secoli della Chiesa*.

29 Piccolomini, *Lettere*, 2:749.

of Santa Maria del Prato in Campagnano, as it records Romano's presence in the Orsini fiefdom (Fig. 9).³⁰

In the early 1490s, Antoniazzo Romano also worked in the Orsini Castle and in the church of San Sebastiano in Bracciano.³¹ It is highly probable that he was in contact with some local artists, influencing their production significantly. This may confirm the theory proposed by Sergio Rossi, who assumes that Romano dominated the artistic Roman scene, taking advantage of a series of local artists.³² This theory is based on the records of temporary societies signed by the Roman artist with local painters such as Pietro Turini and Pier Matteo D'Amelia.³³ Romano's collaboration with a network of local workshops may also explain the evident discrepancy in quality and style found in many of his works. Although the lack of documents does little to support this theory, the office of consul held by Romano since 1478 in the corporation of the painters, Compagnia di San Luca, is definite evidence of the influential power achieved by the artist in the papal city.³⁴

Only in-depth archival research may reveal the authorship of the Orsini commission, which at this early stage remains anonymous. However, the discovery of the frescoes in the church of Formello proves the circulation of the Bessarion iconographic program in the Roman outskirts, where Sixtus IV's artistic renewal, which gradually dismissed Antoniazzo Romano's timeless atmospheres, arrived more slowly.

In conclusion, the questions surrounding the origin and the impact of the Bessarion chapel raised in this study may lead to a more exhaustive understanding of this commission and show the complexity of the early Renaissance in Rome. The insights provided in this research shed light on the artistic context of the Bessarion commission, paving the way for further studies on Antoniazzo Romano's early career. The Bessarion chapel is a symbol of the persistence of a visual culture of medieval taste partially influenced by the Tuscan artistic tradition. This investigation highlights how, in this era of cultural and political transition, Antoniazzo Romano impressed prestigious patrons with his personal style, which cleverly combined tradition and innovation. This analysis has shown some traces of this countercultural trend, which mainly survived in the outskirts of the papal city, powering the complexity of the overtones of early Renaissance Rome.

30 Mazzotti and Sciarra, *Santa Maria del Prato in Campagnano*, 270–271.

31 Cavallaro, 'Considerazioni su due lettere'.

32 Rossi, 'Tradizione e innovazione', 29–30.

33 Regesto di Nardo XX–XXII, in Russo, 'Antoniazzo Romano', 48.

34 Cavallaro, 'Antoniazzo Romano', 171.

Bibliography

Archival Sources

- Rome, State Archive, *Collegio Notai Capitolini*, 939, c. 25.
 Rome, State Archive, *Camerale 1, Mandati Camerali*, 838, c. 936v.
 Vatican City State, Secret Archive, *Tesoreria Segreta*, 1451, c. 39.

Primary Sources

- Becchetti, Filippo Angelico, *Istoria degli ultimi quattro secoli della Chiesa*, Rome, Antonio Fulgoni, 1792.
 Da Varazze, Jacopo, *Legenda aurea*, ed. G.P. Maggioni, Florence, Sismel Edizioni del Galluzzo, 1998.
 Piccolomini, Ammannati Iacopo, *Lettere*, ed. P. Cherubini, Rome, Archivi di Stato, 1997.
 Vasari, Giorgio, *Lives of the most eminent painters, sculptors & architects*, 3 vols., London, Macmillan and Co., Ltd. and the Medici Society, Ltd., 1912.

Secondary Sources

- Bianca, C., 'Un Messale "ritrovato" del cardinale Bessarione', *Rivista della storia della chiesa in Italia* 44 (1990), 4488–4493.
 Biasotti, G., 'Affreschi di Benozzo Gozzoli in Santa Maria Maggiore in Roma', *Bollettino d'arte* 7 (1913), 76–86.
 Busiri Vici, C., 'Un ritrovamento eccezionale relativo all'antica basilica dei ss. Apostoli in Roma', *Arte e Fede* 13 (1960), 70–83.
 Camilli, S., 'Orsini D'Aragona, Gentil Virginio', *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani* 79 (2013), 723.
 Cavallaro, A., 'Antoniazio Romano', in: Bernardini, M.G., and M. Bussagli (eds.), *Il '400 a Roma*, Milan, Skira, 2008, 169–173.
 Cavallaro, A., 'Considerazioni su due lettere di Antoniazio Romano', *La festa delle arti* 1 (2014), 232–237.
 Cavallaro, A., and S. Petrocchi (eds.), *Antoniazio Romano pictor urbis*, Milan, Silvana Editoriale, 2013.
 Di Benedetti, P., 'La Cappella d'Estouteville in Santa Maria Maggiore a Roma', in: Toscano, B., and G. Capitelli (eds.), *Benozzo Gozzoli*, Milan, Octavo Ed., 2002, 238–245.
 Esposito, A., 'Estouteville, Guillaume', *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani* 43 (1993), 456–460.
 Gatta, B., 'Lelio Della Valle', *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani* 37 (1989), 757–758.
 Gill, M.J., 'Where the Danger was Greatest: A Gallic Legacy in Santa Maria Maggiore, Rome', *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte* 4 (1996), 498–522.
 Labowsky, C., *Bessarion's Library and the Biblioteca Marciana*, Rome, Edizioni di storia

- e letteratura, 1980. (It was impossible to consult this book due to the COVID emergency.)
- Labowsky, L., 'Bessarione', *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani* 9 (1967), 686–696.
- Ladis, A., 'The Velluti Chapel in Santa Croce, Florence', *Apollo* 120 (1984), 238–245.
- Mazzotti, L., and M. Sciarra, *Santa Maria del Prato in Campagnano*, Rome, Gangemi, 2009.
- Muntz, E., *Les arts à la cour des papes*, Paris, Hachette BNF, 1898.
- Rossi, S., 'Tradizione e innovazione nella pittura romana del Quattrocento', in: Rossi, S., and S. Valeri (eds.), *Le due Rome del Quattrocento*, Rome, Lithos Editrice, 1997, 19–39.
- Russo, G., 'Antoniazio Romano', PhD Thesis, Federico II University, 2013.
- Seymour, C., *Early Italian Paintings*, New Haven, Yale University Press, 1970. (It was impossible to consult this book due to the COVID emergency.)
- Strehlke, C.B., *Italian Paintings 1250–1450*, Philadelphia, Penn State University Press, 2004. (It was impossible to consult this book due to the COVID emergency.)
- Tiberia, V., *Antoniazio Romano per il Cardinale Bessarione a Roma*, Todi, Ediart, 1992.

FIGURE 1 Antoniazio Romano, *Procession to Mont Saint Michel*, 1464–1467. The Bessarion Chapel, Church of Santi Apostoli, Rome
WIKIMEDIA COMMONS

FIGURE 2 Antoniazio Romano, *Apparition of Saint Michael the Archangel on the Monte Gargano*, 1464–1467. The Bessarion Chapel, Church of Santi Apostoli, Rome
WIKIMEDIA COMMONS

FIGURE 3 Anonymous, *Apparition of Saint Michael the Archangel on Monte Gargano*, Velluti Chapel, early fourteenth century. Basilica of Santa Croce, Florence
WIKIMEDIA COMMONS

FIGURE 4
Benozzo Gozzoli, *Saint Antony of Padua*,
around 1455. The Albertoni Chapel, Church
of Santa Maria in Aracoeli, Rome
WIKIMEDIA COMMONS

FIGURE 5 Anonymous, *The Apparitions of Saint Michael the Archangel*, 1492–1497.
Church of Saint Michael the Archangel, Formello
PHOTO CREDIT: ARCHEOCLUB DI FORMELLO ARCHIVE

FIGURE 6 Anonymous, *Orsini Coat of Arms*, 1492–1497. Church of Saint Michael the Archangel, Formello
 PHOTO CREDIT: ARCHEOCLUB DI FORMELLO ARCHIVE

FIGURE 7 Anonymous, *Pomegranate motif*, 1492–1497. Church of Saint Michael the Archangel, Formello
 PHOTO CREDIT: ARCHEOCLUB DI FORMELLO ARCHIVE

FIGURE 8
 Antoniazio Romano, *Procession to Mont Saint Michel* (detail), 1464–1467. The Bessarion Chapel,
 Church of Santi Apostoli, Rome
 WIKIMEDIA COMMONS

FIGURE 9 Antoniazio Romano, *Madonna with Child*, 1497.
 Museo Civico, Viterbo
 WIKIMEDIA COMMONS