CHAPTER 3

The Meaning of Kalāla is Hidden

The undefined traditions evolved from asserting the complete indeterminacy of kalāla to suggesting that the meaning of the term was somehow known to ʿUmar b. al-Khaṭṭāb. The trend towards clarifying the conception of kalāla is evident in the second group of traditions, which I term ‘intermediate.’ Like most of the undefined traditions, the intermediate traditions focus on the figure of ʿUmar b. al-Khaṭṭāb. Unlike the late undefined traditions, which only intimate that ʿUmar understood kalāla, the intermediate traditions unequivocally state that he knew the meaning of the term. Moreover, these traditions usually describe the caliph as eager to divulge his knowledge; ominous events, however, thwart his intention. The intermediate traditions were treated in part by Powers, but he did not consider them as a separate group between the undefined and the definite narratives. In the present chapter, I analyze four clusters of intermediate traditions.

3.1 Cluster 9: ʿUmar’s Suppressed Statement about Kalāla

The tradition to be analyzed in the present section brings us once again to the last moments in the life of ʿUmar b. al-Khaṭṭāb. The earliest key figure in Cluster 9 is Ibn Ṭāwūs (d. 132/750), but all isnāds that converge on him are single-strands (see isnād diagram KR-1). To identify the CL, I analyze the transmissions of ʿAbd al-Razzāq (d. 211/827) and Abū ʿUbayd (d. 224/838), and consider the evidence of the single-strand isnāds.

3.1.1 ʿAbd al-Razzāq’s Traditions

The most important evidence in C9 is ‘Abd al-Razzāq’s tradition no. 19186.1 Owing to its peculiar features, I cite it as a separate witness:

---

1 ‘Abd al-Razzāq, Muṣannaf x, 302–3, no. 19186.
The meaning of *kalāla* is hidden.

*Al-Muttaqī al-Hindī*, d. 975

*Ibn Ḥazm*, d. 456

*Al-Khaṭṭābī*, d. 388

*Muh. b. Hāshim*

*Al-Dabarī*, d. 285

*Abū Ubayd*, d. 224

*Ibn Zanjawayh*, d. 251

*Ibn ʿAssān al-Baṣrī* or *Qatāda*: *Makana kulli ʿabdūn ʿabdūn*: For each male slave there stands a male slave.

ʿĀbd al-Razzāq no. 19186: (1) *Qāla* [Ibn ʿAbbās]: “Qāla li-Umar ‘ārīn ‘aṭīna: (2a) ‘Iqal an-nī thalāthā’ (2b) al-imāratu shūrā (2c) wa-fi ḫārā ‘l-ʿarab’ī makānī ʿabdūn ʿabdūn (2d) wa-fi l-ʾamāt’ ʿabdānī (2d) wa-fi l-kalālaṯāʾ mā qulta.” (3) *Qāla* [Maʿmar]: “Qultu li-Ibn ʾĀwās: ‘Mā qāla?’ fa-ḥā an yuḥbiru-nī.” (1) *Ibn ʿAbbās* said, “When ʿUmar was stabbed, he said to me, (2a) ‘Know from me three [things]: (2b) leadership is [determined] by consultation, (2c) and with regard to the ransom of the Arabs, for each male slave there stands a male slave (2d) and for the son of a slave girl [there stand] two slaves (2d) and about *kalāla* [you know] what I said.” (3) Maʿmar said, “I said to Ibn ʾĀwās, ‘What did he say?’ but he refused to inform me.”

*AL-ḤASAN AL-BASRI OR QATĀDA B. DĪʿĀMA*: *Makana kulli ʿabdīn ʿabdīn*: For each male slave there stands a male slave.