Ilaria L.E. Ramelli


This is a remarkable book in many senses. It is voluminous (890 pages), it examines a period spanning nine centuries (1st to 9th c.), it deals with an enormous multiplicity and variety of texts, and it does so without losing its thematic unity, focus, and engagement. The book examines the Christian doctrine of *apokatastasis*, which we first find in some form in Christian texts of the 2nd century, yet the doctrine was fleshed out and defended by Origen and was further articulated by his followers and the Cappadoceans, especially Gregory of Nyssa. In nutshell the doctrine of *apokatastasis* consists in two main claims, first that all human souls will be purified from evil and sin, which amounts to their salvation, and, second, that the universe will be cleansed from all evil and that would involve the restoration of devil and the demons. The eventual *apokatastasis* in these two senses is depicted as amounting to a restoration of humanity and of the world to their original condition, or to an even better one than the initial condition, since sin and evil will be ruled out from the world and definitely defeated. The book is a systematic investigation of that doctrine. It is a systematic investigation both in the sense that the arguments advanced for that doctrine are meticulously examined and in the sense that the historical evolution of the doctrine is closely studied.

Now, the Christian doctrine of *apokatastasis* has its antecedent in Stoicism, as Ramelli points out. In Stoic cosmology *apokatastasis* indicates the periodical repetition of cosmic cycles. The Stoics maintained that the world exists eternally in a succession of cosmic phases, each of which will end with a conflagration, but this resolution into fire will be the beginning of a new cosmic cycle. The Stoics were inspired in turn by Heraclitus and possibly also by Empedocles, who, too, maintains the existence of cosmic cycles. The Christians know of the Stoic doctrine. It is indicative that a number of the relevant Stoic testimonies come from Christian sources that favor *apokatastasis*. The difference between the pagan and the Christian testimonies of the Stoic doctrine is that the Christian sources, such as Eusebius (*Preparatio Evangelica*; *SVF* II.599) and Nemesius (*De natura hominis* 38; *SVF* II.625), for instance, use the terms ἀνάστασις and ἀποκατάστασις, while the pagan ones speak of παλιγγενεσία, that is, of rebirth (e.g. Alexander, *In Generatione et Corruptione* 314.13-15). One might justifiably think that the Christians use the specific terminology in order to suggest that there are pagan antecedents of the Christian doctrine marking the continuity of Christianity with the best of the pagan philosophy.
Origen, however, the main founder of the Christian doctrine of *apokatastasis*, is concerned with distinguishing it from the Stoic doctrine, as Ramelli shows (pp. 8-10). Ramelli does not delve into the details of the Stoic doctrine, let alone its Presocratic roots. She rather moves straight to the Jewish and Christian background of the doctrine. The reader embarks on that section of the book with the impression that Ramelli endorses Origen's claim about the difference between the Stoic and the Christian doctrine of *apokatastasis*. This is not explicitly argued for, but is an inference based on the fact that the author devotes only ten pages to the treatment of the Stoic doctrine and two hundred and ten pages to the Biblical antecedents.

The first chapter entitled “The roots of the doctrine of *apokatastasis*” could be a study of its own (pp. 1-221), as is the case also with the following ones. The second chapter (pp. 223-278) focuses on Origen’s followers in Alexandria as well as his first detractors, the third studies Origen’s later followers, the Cappadocians, Evagrius, the Antiochenes, and the Fourth century Latin Origenians (pp. 279-658), while the final, fourth, chapter examines the development of the doctrine from Augustine to Eriugena including its Syriac reception of the doctrine (660-816). The conclusion summarizes the main features of the doctrine of *apokatastasis* and its theological significance (817-826).

The first chapter studies the Biblical passages that could be seen as offering some kind of justification of the Christian doctrine of *apokatastasis*, while also investigating Origen’s predecessors on this topic, such as Irenaeus (89-107), Pantaenus (107-110), the Syrian Christian philosopher Bardaisan of Edessa (107-119), Clement (119-136), with the rest of the chapter discussing Origen. Apart from Old and New Testament passages, Ramelli also considers apocryphal and Gnostic texts in remarkable scholarly detail. She summarizes all the necessary information concerning the nature, date and context of each text and discusses how these sources were exploited by the partisans of the *apokatastasis* doctrine. Regarding the early Christian thinkers before Origen investigated in this chapter, the reader is given abundant information about the context, date, and aim of the text under discussion. One wonders, however, how pioneering Origen was in establishing the *apokatastasis* doctrine, given that his predecessors, Clement for instance, not only espoused it but also associated it with Paul’s writings (pp. 133-4). Of course, as Ramelli shows, Origen argues at length and systematically in all of his works for the extinction of evil, the reintegration of the devil and the restoration of all human souls, and this doctrine is part of his cosmology, theology, salvation theory, and ethics. Almost all aspects of his doctrine, however, have been maintained by earlier Christian thinkers, as Ramelli shows. Still, one might argue, Origen is responsible for a great synthesis, and more argument would be welcome regarding the