Zu Prom. 448 f. verdient Peeks Vorschlag, hier ἐσφραγισμὸν zu lesen statt ἐσφραγισμὸν (Anm. 160, S. 257), Beachtung. Unglaubhaft ist die Auffassung, welche die Menschen vor dem Auftreten des Prometheus als nur geträumt, abhängig von dem Träumer Zeus, vorstellt: man beachte Groenebooms Kommentar zur Stelle!


BILTHOVEN, Groenlinglaan 52

A. H. M. Kessells


It is greatly to be welcomed that Professors Andrewes and Dover have undertaken to complete the unfinished monumental historical commentary on Thucydides by the late A. W. Gomme. Gomme had left a draft of the commentary on the remaining part of book V, from c. 25 onward. So Andrewes, who edited this part of the work, could confine himself to revising and supplementing G.'s text, marking his own (rather numerous) additions by square brackets. Dover, who undertook the commentary on books VI and VII, had only a number of stray notes by Gomme at his disposal and had therefore to write ab initio his part of the commentary, indicating where he had drawn upon a note of Gomme.

From the many illuminating notes contained in this volume, which will be helpful and stimulating, I single out, only exempli gratia, the useful topographical appendix, Andrewes' arguments supporting the view that the popular assembly in Sparta was called ekklesia and not, as is often supposed, apella (134), and p. 288, where Dover rightly emphasizes that the proposopographical method should be used with caution and restraint in Athenian history (cp. also A. B. Breebaart, Tijdschr. v. Geschied. 82, 1969, 508 ff.). Probably one will not always find in this book what one is looking for, and sometimes one will be inclined to disagree with the authors. That does not detract from the merits of this work: nobody will ever write a commentary that satisfies all the needs of its users, nor one which, with regard to rather thorny questions, will meet with the agreement of all scholars. Let it suffice to say that this book is in keeping with the high standard set by Gomme in the previous

Mnemosyne, Vol. XXVI, Fasc. 4
volumes. It is a reliable guide and will be for many years an indispen-
sable companion for Hellenists and for historians who study
Thucydides and the events described by him. Scholars all over the
world will look forward with eagerness to the publication of the
final volume with the commentary on book VIII.

I append some additional remarks, not in order to cavil, but by
way of a tribute to the authors who have put all of us heavily in
their debt.

V 111,6: The emendation of κατορθώσαν into κατορθῶσαν by
J. de Romilly in her Budé edition from 1967 deserves serious consid-
eration. — VI r8,7: Contending that the maximum of safety is
reached by a community that sticks to its laws and customs, even if
they are rather bad, Alcibiades may be using a (sophistic?) com-
monplace (cp. Aristot. Polit. 2, 1269 a 13 ff.; 4, 1296 b 10 ff.). But
one wonders whether the striking application of this maxim in
favour of a restless and aggressive foreign policy is not a rhetorical
trick contrived by Alcibiades himself. — VI 39,1 δημοκρατίαν οὔτε
ξυνόπτων οὔτε θυσείν εἴναι is reminiscent of Herodotus III 81 (the speech
of Megabyzus) ὁμόλογο γὰρ ἄχρηστον οὐδέν ἐστι οὐκετῶτερον οὐδὲ
عبارة τακτερα, and δὴμον ἰδίατα ὁνομάζει corresponds with Herod.
III 80 (Otanes' plea for democracy) ἐν γὰρ τῷ πολλῷ ἐν τὰ πάντα
(cp. now also H. Barth, Ἐν γὰρ τῷ πολλῷ ἐν τὰ πάντα. Eine Inter-
pretation von Herodot III, 80, 6, in: J. Harmatta (ed.), Studien zur
Geschichte und Philosophie des Altertums, Amsterdam 1968, 24-27).
It seems that in this passage Thucydides has condensed some
commonplace arguments about democracy. — VI 61,7: Alcibiades
went from Sicily to Thurii in a ship of which he himself was the
owner, but fled to the Peloponnese in a merchant vessel. This implies
that his own ship formed part of the Athenian navy and was manned
by ordinary Athenian sailors who could not be expected to be
willing to desert to the Peloponnese.

VII 78,2: Dover's opinion about the disposition of the Athenians
during their retreat from Syracuse is corroborated by Diod. XIII
r8,6. — VII 80,2: Thucydides says expressis verbis that Cat-
tane was not the objective of the retreating Athenians. No doubt
he is polemizing against a tradition which said so, and which is
reflected in Diod. XIII r8,6 and XIII r9,2. — VII 80,6: Professor
de Romilly in her Budé edition supposes that the Athenians after
having reached the Kakyparis continued their march along the
Helorian road (on the advice of their guides, as says Thucydides)
and did not go inland along the Kakyparis, as they had intended to
do, because they feared that other Syracusan detachments there
would bar their way. The Athenian commanders were clearly acting
more or less in a terrain they did not know and without

Mnemosyne, Vol. XXVI, Fasc. 4