Commentators on popular religion in the twentieth century often bracket Pentecostalism and the Charismatic Renewal. For example, the editors of the *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* outline the focus of their work by referring to two movements, but then present them as composing "... a twentieth century religious phenomenon." Prima facie, the movements do appear to share an approach to God, but the similarity is more superficial than substantial. In this paper I will focus on the interaction between Classical Pentecostalism (CP) in Canada in the 1960s and 1970s and the Charismatic Renewal (CR). My basic argument is that the CR had a significantly negative influence on CP. However, the negativity is to be understood primarily in terms of factors within Pentecostalism which shaped its responses to the CR. My geographical focus is Canada, but I suspect that similar observations would apply in other parts of the western world.

My argument is directly related to the natures of the two movements. As I will underline, they had quite different histories, but they also differed fundamentally with reference to their natures as corporate entities. Bruce Reed of London, England has developed an interpretive model which is very useful here.

Reed based a theory of human behavior on feelings of dependence and on an oscillation which people go through between two modes of experience. Reed argued that when people individually or corporately are in the first mode to be considered, they see themselves as dependent on objects or persons outside themselves for shelter, affirmation and encouragement.3 Feelings of weakness and disorientation are parts of this experience. Reed called this a "regression to extra-dependence."

---


2 For an earlier discussion of these movements in Canada, see my "Pentecostals, Charismatics and the Canadian Denominations," *Église et Théologie* 13 (May 1982): 211-231.

The second mode of experience is quite different. Once people have found sustaining relationships, they begin to feel "reordered." Confidence grows, and they start to think that their futures and their general well-being are in their own hands. This is "intra-dependence." These modes of experience can also be thought of as "periods of autonomous activity [the second] and periods of physical or symbolic contact with sources of renewal [the first]." Reed theorizes that the normal flow of life involves repeated oscillation between these two modes of experience or types of dependence. The relevance of this model will become apparent as we proceed.

In this paper, I will, first, examine the two movements as they were seen in Canada in the 1960s and 1970s. Secondly, I will attempt to measure the impact of the CR on CP.

The Movements

Starting with the older of the two movements, we can bypass the early American history of CP which is adequately treated elsewhere, and move directly to the less well-known Canadian story. Without going into detail, suffice it to note, first, that by 1911 there were larger or smaller Pentecostal enclaves from the east coast to the west coast of Canada and, second, that American influence had been important. In a paper read at the 1991 conference of the Society for Pentecostal Studies, Prof. David Reed of Wycliffe College, Toronto, applied this theory to the Anglican Church of Canada in an attempt to account for developments within the Charismatic Renewal in that denomination. He argued that the church goes through periods of "extra-dependence," when it feels a profound weakness and a need for help from outside itself, and periods of "intra-dependence" following times of renewal, when it is conscious of wholeness and power and is eager to help others. On the individual level, David Reed observed a "shift among Anglican Charismatics from an 'experience mode' (extra-dependence phase) to a 'ministry mode' (intra-dependence phase)." ("From Movement to Institution: a Case Study of Charismatic Renewal in the Anglican Church of Canada," paper presented at the 21st Annual Meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies (Lakeland, FL: November 7-9, 1991.), 9.)


Thomas William Miller discussed this period extensively in Canadian Pentecostals: A History of the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada, ed. William A.